Date – 11/20/2012
Attendees: CJ Clark, Adam Cron, Adam Ley, Bill Bruce, Bill Tuthill, Brian Turmelle, Carl Barnhart, Carol Pyron, Craig Stephan, Ken Parker, Jeff Halnon, Peter Elias, Wim Driessen, Li Hui,

Missing with pre-excuse: Dave Duberke

Missing: Lee Whetsel, Matthias Kamm, Mike Richetti, Neil Jacobson, Ted Cleggett, Brian Erickson, Scott Wilkinson, Jason Chodora, Roger Sowada, Kent NG, Sam McMillan, Sankaran Menon, Ted Eaton, Heiko Ehrenberg, Rich Cornejo, Roland Latvala, Bill Eklow, Brian Turmelle, Dharma Konda, Francisco Russi, Hugh Wallace, John Braden, John Seibold, Josh Ferry,

Agenda:

1) Patent Slides and Rules of Etiquette
2) Use LiveMeeting “Raised Hand” to be recognized and take the floor
3) Ballot re-circ. Comments have been answered. Draft has been updated.

Meeting Called to order at 10:41 am EST

Minutes:
Solicited input from anybody who is aware of patents that might read on our standard.
No Response
Review of Working Group Meeting Guidelines
No Objections

The Chair would like to see the ballot re-circulated and ready for RevCom by December 1st.

Carl – all valid comments have been responded to.
Last few changes have been made and sent out a PDF of changes
Feels that ballot comments are done and changes that were needed are in

CJ – the working group may have liked to see full draft and not just the updated sections.
Carl – sections were pulled straight from the draft.

Carl – clean draft will be ready to go and can be used for recirculation
Carl – will have updated draft posted today (Tuesday)
CJ – can you use the comma to separate definitions per Ken’s input?
Carl – yes
CJ – are you comfortable with the changes to the draft?
Carl – comfortable enough to go to ReCirc

Adam L - Concerning how to communicate changes in the draft, can send you reference to a document for the responsibilities of the sponsor. Track Changes is allowed.
CJ – Lets do track changes. Email the link
Carol – what does the ballot group do when the ballot is re-circulated? What is the task of the ballot group?
CJ – you can do nothing, which means that your vote doesn’t change or you can revote yes. Or you can vote no to the new material
    Suggests that you read through all the changes.
    We are really trying to turn the no votes into yes votes.
Carol- do you still do comments?
CJ – not sure. Would imagine you can still provide comments.
    Would expect the original commenter would check the changes made for them
Carol – had a question regarding a comment that was rejected (one of Carol’s).
    Item 616 in the spreadsheet.
    Section 8.15.1 rule g

Cj – when we retrieve an ECID we should haven’t interrupt the operation of the chip
    Means that like device ID we don’t want the system to be shut down to retrieve the value.
Carol- Ok.
    So for the all 0’s and all 1’s encoding. Do we have a definition of all 0’s?
Carl – no.
    Not sure what the objection was, but doubt that there will be an ECID that is all 0’s and all 1’s
Carol – are we requiring that TRST or POR value of ECID to be all 1’s?
Carl – we are requiring that if the ECID value is not ready than you capture all 1’s
    Doesn’t matter if it is reset or not.
CJ – don’t have to reset, can have any other mechanism to clear those values.
Ken – back to register keywords.
    No descriptive material that describes what these things are about. Doesn’t explain why we care
    Shouldn’t we have this in the descriptive material?
Carl – B.8.24 User extension clause

Ken – now that we see it in the full context it helps.
    A way for someone to put in new information along with standard stuff?
Carl – yes. just like BSDL extensions?
Ken – would this get used by dot6?
Carl – yes
Ken – this is more of a tool issue and not something for an IC vender.
CJ- have seen IC vendors use BSDL extensions.
Ken – you as the tool vendor would edit the BSDL?
Carl – tool vendor would put out a package. Would be coded by the user who intended to use it.
Ken – can we add Use Models?
CJ – don’t want to paint ourselves into a corner with use models.
Ken – 1 explanation is better than zero explanations.
Carl is adding some text to the draft to help with this

Adam L – would like to clarify some issues of the recirculation process
CJ – can hold if you can
Adam L – it is a point of information
   Comments in the ReCirc are permitted. Votes can be maintained or changed, and responsibility of the ballot pool to make sure the changes were made correctly
CJ – can only vote no to the changes that are there. Can’t change the vote to material that is already submitted.
Regarding BSDL extensions/Register fields
Wim – user packages between tools could be different.
Carl – would be a documented difference if you got different results.
   The fact that it is documented and there is not opportunity for a finger pointing.
CJ – This issue can not be resolved at this time to satisfy Wim

Carl makes a motion to send the updated draft to recirculation
Brian Seconds

Adam L – thinks we would do well to take more time to ensure that all the i’s are dotted and t’s are crossed. Dead line for this revcom was Oct 15. Next Revcom is Jan 24th.
CJ – we are on the schedule for the Oct 15 RevCom
Adam L – see that 1149.1 is on the Agenda. It is quite possible that given they receive the final package they will approve it. However, Adam perceives that there will be issues that arise and a there will be open issues and will be rejected.
Cj – can vote not to approve if they don’t have enough time. We should still try. But that is the purpose of the ballot ReCirc. We can comment on the new material. There is not going to be published. Recirculation will allow us to have a formal review.
Adam L – have to get in comments and resolve them in time. Will be difficult.
CJ – Understood.
Ken – if we approve and the ReCirc goes well. What will be the date on the front of the document. Should we change the key words to have the 2013 on them.
CJ – that will be done editorially. IEEE can tell me what they are.
Ken – so that is an option.
Adam L – date that is on the standard is the date it is approved by the standard board. Would be the 6th is RevCom approves it on the 5th

Motion passes
Yes
Bill T  Carol P
Brain T  Craig S
Carl B  Jeff H
No
Adam L
Abstain
Bill B. Ken P. Peter E.

6Yes/1No/3Abstain

CJ - Lets get comments in from the working group
Carl - ok.. but just starting to print the PDF.
CJ – give the PDF and put it on the website. And deal with further comments and rectify they before you send the draft to ReCirc tomorrow.
Carol – what is ReCirc period?
CJ – 10 days
Ken – when does it start?
Carl – ten working days or calendar days
CJ – calendar days
Ken – puts this out in the thanksgiving weekend.
CJ – have to cut off at some point. We have a really good standard and whatever issues that we have are minor.
CJ –This is a complex standard with lot of material. There will always be stuff to tweak and we may never be done. It is important to give the industry something to use now..
Nothing prevents us from opening another PAR to fix things. Errata can be done without opening a PAR

Carol – feels we have done a good job the draft over the last few years.

Happy Thanksgiving everyone.

Meeting adjourned: 11:55pm EST.

Summary of Motions Voted on
1 Motions voted on
Motion to end the updated draft to recirculation
Motion passes
6Y/1N/3A

Next Meeting: 11/27/2012 10:30 AM EST

NOTES:

1149.1 working group website - http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/1149/1/
To Join the meeting  
https://www.livemeeting.com/cc/intellitech/join?id=2CQ2PQ&role=attend&pw=n%26%d%5DNqX%2B84

Meeting time: Tuesdays 10:30 AM (EST)  (Recurring)

**AUDIO INFORMATION**
-Computer Audio (Recommended)  
To use computer audio, you need speakers and microphone, or a headset.  
-Telephone conferencing  
Use the information below to connect:  
  Toll: +1 (218) 862-1526  
  Participant code: 11491

**FIRST-TIME USERS**
To save time before the meeting, check your system to make sure it is ready to use Office Live Meeting.

**TROUBLESHOOTING**
Unable to join the meeting? Follow these steps:  
1. Copy this address and paste it into your web browser:  
   https://www.livemeeting.com/cc/intellitech/join  
2. Copy and paste the required information:  
   Meeting ID: F9R6S6  
   Entry Code: k/d6<@M6j  
   Location: https://www.livemeeting.com/cc/intellitech  
If you still cannot enter the meeting, contact support.

**NOTICE**
Microsoft Office Live Meeting can be used to record meetings. By participating in this meeting, you agree that your communications may be monitored or recorded at any time during the meeting.