

**Comments on Policy & Procedures (April, 2002)**  
**P1616 Draft Standard Motor Vehicle Event Data Recorders (MVEDRs)**  
**Barbara Wendling**

<b>CURRENT</b>	<b>RECOMMENDED</b>	<b>RATIONALE</b>
2.1 Member status will be revoked if member misses more than two of the four immediately previous meetings. The Secretary will be responsible for determining any person's Membership status at the beginning of each meeting.	2.1. Member status may be revoked if a member misses more than two of four consecutive meetings (exceptions will be made for illness or emergency at the discretion of the Co-Chairs). The Secretary will be responsible for monitoring membership status and reporting the same at the beginning of each meeting.	Exceptions made under special circumstances at discretion of Co-Chairs.
2.2. Member status may be placed in jeopardy if either of the following occur: 2.2.1. Failure to return two of the last three ballots. 2.2.2. Returning ballots marked "Abstain" without listing a reason for the abstention.	2.2. Member status may also be placed in jeopardy if a member: 2.2.1. Fails to return two of the last three ballots, or 2.2.2. Returns (one? two?) ballots marked "Abstain" without listing a reason for the abstention.	Clarification – is the intention to allow more than one abstention without providing a reason?
3.2. In order to receive credit for the meetings, a member shall attend at least 50 percent of the meeting day. (Either in person, or my mail or teleconference: see section 3.4).	3.2. In order to receive credit for the meeting attendance, a member shall attend at least 50 percent of the meeting. (Either in person, or my mail or teleconference: see section 3.4).	Clarification
3.4. <b>Attendance by Mail or Teleconference:</b> If individual members are unable to attend meetings, they may participate either by mail correspondence or teleconference, when available. Correspondence shall include significant, written contributions that are technically relevant to P1616 or state a position regarding an agenda item where a meeting vote is scheduled. These contributions shall identify the agenda item and be submitted to the WG Co-Chairs at least two weeks before the scheduled meeting where it is to be discussed. At the discretion of the Co-Chairs, a mailed-in (or e-mailed) contribution for a given meeting may be considered attendance there at. The WG Co-Chairs shall distribute the contributions to the WG in advance of the meeting and the documents identified to the agenda item by the secretary.	3.4. <b>Attendance by Mail or Teleconference:</b> If individual members are unable to attend meetings, they may participate by teleconference, when available (teleconference capability will normally be provided). Members may also be considered to have attended a meeting via written correspondence if such correspondence includes significant contributions that are technically relevant to P1616, and/or states a position regarding an agenda item where a meeting vote is scheduled. These contributions shall identify the agenda item and be submitted to the WG Co-Chairs at least one week before the scheduled meeting where it is to be discussed. The WG Co-Chairs shall distribute the contributions to the WG in advance of the meeting and the documents identified to the agenda item by the Secretary.	Clarifies that attendance via teleconference is always allowed, unless technically unavailable on an exceptional basis. This is reasonable, given the attendance requirements and the fact that most WG members are employed full-time and must manage competing obligations for their time. Also removes discretion of the Co-Chairs for accepting written correspondence in lieu of attendance, which is not needed, given articulated criteria. Also shortens the advance notice to the Co-Chairs to one week before the meeting in recognition of the fact that the agenda may not even be available two weeks before the meeting.

<p><b>5.2. Discussion on motions:</b> All discussion on motions shall be through the designated Chair for the meeting session. In order to provide for orderly discussion on motions, the Chair or secretary shall keep a queue of speakers on the motion and determine if there is anyone who has not yet spoken on the issue before letting someone who has already spoken do so again. The only exception is that the person that made the motion can respond to questions to clarify the motion – which should be controlled by the Chair. After a motion has been in front of the group for a long while, any member of the committee can “call the question”. This is a motion to stop the discussion and go to a vote. The Chair can ask if there is no objection to calling the question. If none, the original motion must be voted on immediately with no further discussion allowed. If there are a few who object to calling the question, then the Chair will ask for a vote on calling the question. If that vote is positive, then the original motion is voted on immediately without further discussion. If that is not successful, the discussion on the original motion continues. At any time the maker of the motion with the acceptance of the seconder may withdraw the motion and then the committee is ready to propose a new motion. Where there is a procedural issue regarding discussion of motions, <i>Robert’s Rules of Order</i>, current edition, applies.</p>	<p><b>5.2. Discussion on motions:</b> All discussion on motions shall be through the designated Chair for the meeting session. In order to provide for orderly discussion on motions, the Chair or Secretary shall keep a queue of speakers on the motion and determine if there is anyone who has not yet spoken on the issue before letting someone who has already spoken do so again. The only exception is that the person who made the motion can respond to questions to clarify the motion – which should be controlled by the Chair. If a motion has been discussed by the WG for more than one hour without significant progress toward resolution, any member of the WG can “call the question.” This is a motion to stop the discussion and go to a vote. The Chair must ask if there is an objection to calling the question. If none, the original motion must be voted on immediately with no further discussion allowed. If there is one or more objection to calling the question, then the Chair will ask for a vote on calling the question. If that vote is approved by 75% or more of a quorum present at the time of the vote, then the original motion is voted on immediately without further discussion. If that is not successful, the discussion on the original motion continues. At any time the maker of the motion with the acceptance of the seconder may withdraw the motion and then the committee is ready to propose a new motion. Where there is a procedural issue regarding discussion of motions, <i>Robert’s Rules of Order</i>, current edition, applies.</p>	<p>Defines “a long while” and clarifies that the intent is to overcome a stalemate, rather than to truncate otherwise productive debate. Clarifies that objections must be addressed and requires that overruling an objection be done by a strong, rather than a simple, majority vote. This is consistent with the “five imperatives of p1616” (due process, openness, consensus, balance, and right of appeal).</p>
<p><b>5.5.1 Consensus</b> is an imperative principle by which WG members may resolve contentious issues. Consensus means the majority of WG members agree on an issue. Consensus positions shall be sought by a show of hands of all WG members. Meeting votes may be taken when less than a quorum is present, but a ballot will be issued as soon after the end of the meeting to obtain the remainder of the ballots. The Chair may choose to conduct the entire vote via a mail/e-mail ballot.</p>	<p><b>5.5.1 Consensus</b> is an imperative principle by which WG members may resolve contentious issues. Consensus means the majority (simple or strong, depending on the type of vote in question) of a quorum of WG members agree on an issue. Consensus positions shall be sought by a show of hands of all WG members. Meeting votes that require only a simple majority to pass may be taken when less than a quorum is present, but can be challenged and recalled for formal ballot if objections are subsequently raised by a member(s) not present at the time of the vote. Balloted issues that require a</p>	<p>Distinguishes between votes that require only a simple majority approval to pass and those that require a strong majority approval to pass and makes the procedural requirements for the former less stringent than those for the latter.</p>

	strong (i.e., 75% approval of a minimum 75% quorum) must be issued in writing to all voting members, who must be given a minimum of four full weeks to respond. The Chair may choose to conduct the entire vote via a mail/e-mail ballot.	
5.5.1. <b>Required number of votes:</b> A motion is considered to have passed if approved by a majority.	<del>5.5.1. <b>Required number of votes:</b> A motion is considered to have passed if approved by a majority.</del>	Deleted; covered in section 5.5.1. (NOTE: numbering sequence needs to be corrected in this section.)
5.5.3. <b>Abstentions:</b> The outcome of a vote is based on a majority of approvals, including abstentions.	5.5.4. <b>Abstentions:</b> The outcome of a vote is based on a majority (simple or strong) of approvals among a voting quorum. Abstentions by voting members will count toward establishing a voting quorum, only.	Clarifies that abstentions count only toward establishing a quorum, but not toward the negative or affirmative tally. Also corrects numbering (assuming above deletion).
6.1. <b>Letter or e-mail Ballots:</b> Ballots shall be used to approve major documents produced by the WG and to forward WG products for sponsor (IEEE Vehicular Technology Society) ballot.	6.1. <b>Letter or e-mail Ballots:</b> Ballots shall be used to approve major documents (i.e., those that will be published as part of the permanent record of the P1616 activity) produced by the WG and to forward WG products for sponsor (IEEE Vehicular Technology Society) ballot.	Clarifies (or at least attempts to) what is meant by the term “major document.”
6.2. <b>Duration and results of ballot:</b> The Chair shall determine the duration of the balloting period, issue the ballot, and tally the results.	6.2. <b>Duration and results of ballot:</b> The Chair shall determine the duration of the balloting period (subject to a minimum of four full weeks), issue the ballot, and tally the results.	Adds a minimum ballot period in recognition of the fact that most members are employed full-time and must have sufficient flexibility to manage competing demands on their time
7.1 <b>Co-Chairs:</b> It is the role of the Co-Chairs to provide leadership and guidance during the standards development process, helping move towards completion of the finished standard. The Co-Chair will also serve as a point of contact for people who have technical questions or comments about the content of the standard. The WG Co-Chairs will plan the meetings and organize the work. It also helps if the chair delegates assignments for developing parts of the standard to members of the working group. The chair may also choose to have other officers in the working group, such as a vice chair, secretary, or technical editor. All of these roles could aid the chair and the group in moving their project forward.	7.1 <b>Co-Chairs:</b> It is the role of the Co-Chairs to provide leadership and guidance during the standards development process, helping move towards completion of the finished standard. The Co-Chairs will serve as a point-of-contact for people who have technical questions or comments about the content of the standard. They will also plan the meetings and organize the work. The Co-Chairs may delegate administrative tasks, such as technical editing and the locating of documents and citations, to members of the working group. However, substantive tasks, such as developing technical and/or policy direction and documentation can only be delegated with the agreement of the WG membership according to a simple majority vote. All members who wish to participate in the completion of a substantive task will be allowed to do so as part of a subcommittee.	Distinguishes between administrative tasks and substantive tasks and recognizes that the latter falls within the purview of the WG to delegate only if a majority of members believe it is appropriate to do so.

<p><b>7.2 Vice-Chair:</b> A vice chair can assist the chair in all areas, including running the meeting when the chair is absent or wishes to recuse himself or herself. <i>Recuse</i> means that the chair, who must be neutral during all discussions, wants to speak for or against an issue and must step down from the chair role in order to do so. The vice chair would run the meeting in this case, allowing the chair to speak.</p>	<p><b>7.2 Temporary Recusal by a Co-Chair:</b> One of the two Co-Chairs present during a meeting may recuse himself or herself temporarily from the role of Chair. This means that the chair, who must be neutral during all discussions, wants to speak for or against an issue and must step down from the chair role in order to do so. The remaining Co-Chair would run the meeting in this case, allowing the other C-Chair to speak in the role of a WG member.</p>	<p>Removes references to a Vice Chair, given that this WG is being constituted with two Co-Chairs already (nor has a nomination for Vice-Chair been sought). Also clarifies and focuses the point, which is recusal by one of the Co-Chairs during a meeting.</p>
<p><b>9. Balance of Interests: Balance.</b> The goal of balance is to have representation from all interested parties, but to avoid an overwhelming influence by any of those parties. Balance is achieved by placing potential balloters into one of four categories: 1. Producers, 2. Users and 3. General Interest and 4. Government. No category can contain 50% or more of the P1616 balloting group. The sponsor (Vehicular Technology Society) then examines these requests to see if balance has been achieved. If not, they will work with the balloters to see if it is possible to shift them into another category. Once the balloting group is formed the composition of that balloting group cannot change until the close of ballot. For P1616, the principal emphasis of membership is individual technical expertise.</p>	<p><b>9. Balance of Interests: Balance.</b> The goal of balance is to have representation from all interested parties, but to avoid the formation of dominant voting blocks. Balance is achieved by placing potential balloters into one of four categories: 1. Commercial Users, 2. Non-Commercial Users, 3. Primary Producers 4. Secondary Producers. No category can comprise more than 35% of the P1616 balloting group. The sponsor (Vehicular Technology Society) then examines these requests to see if balance has been achieved. If not, they will reduce by lottery the number of balloters in each category that exceeds the 35% limit in order to achieve reasonable voting balance. Once the balloting group is formed the composition of that balloting group cannot change until the close of ballot. For P1616, the principal emphasis of membership is individual technical expertise.</p>	<p>Revises categories to better reflect this particular subject matter. EDRs are not designed for a commercial end-user, but are installed in another product for a specified, unalterable purpose, and are sold to a commercial end user as part of the vehicle. Therefore, distinguishing between primary and secondary producers is appropriate, as their perspectives and corresponding interests are not aligned. Breaking the other two categories into commercial and non-commercial users also more accurately fits the EDR paradigm, as the EDR output data, rather than the device itself, is what is “used”—and then for very different purposes, depending on whether the use supports commercial or non-commercial aims. Again, the interests of commercial and non-commercial users are not aligned. Also decreases the maximum percent per category for voting purposes to 35%. If balance is the goal, 50% is too high for any one potential voting block (particularly knowing that most WG members will fall into the Secondary Producer and Commercial User categories, whose respective interests are likely to have the greatest degree of overlap among categories).</p>
<p><b>10.1. Users:</b> the buyer of vehicles that include OEM MVEDRs or the buyer of MVEDR devices for installation after purchasing the vehicle. Public agencies, safety-related entities, statistical entities.</p>	<p><b>10.1. Commercial Users:</b> Private companies, other than Primary and Secondary Producers, that plan to use data that may be gathered from EDRs (this includes for-profit accident reconstruction services,</p>	<p>Clarifies the definition of each category as discussed above.</p>

<p>10.2. <b>Producers:</b> The manufacturer of the MVEDR device and major components that may be interchangeable by the consumer or vehicle manufacturer installing the device as a vehicle OEM.</p> <p>10.3. <b>General Interests:</b> Government Regulatory Agencies: SEC, FCC, FTC, regulatory agency within NHTSA but not NHTSA as a whole. Materially affected person or interest. One who gives professional advice or services regarding matters in the field of his/her special knowledge or training. Academic and researchers.</p> <p>10.4. <b>Government:</b> Highway and Vehicle safety organizations other than regulatory sections of these organizations.</p>	<p>crash notification/emergency response services, other than those directly administered by a state or municipal employees, and data gathering services, such as statistical publishers or a company serving as “universal” or “third-party” repository for EDR data collection generally.</p> <p>10.2 <b>Non-Commercial Users:</b> Non-governmental safety and consumer advocates, academia, non-profit research organizations, governmental agencies and bureaus (federal, state, and/or local), and interested members of the public at large, such as those materially affected (e.g., former accident victims and litigants) or professionally interested (e.g., privacy or liability litigation specialists).</p> <p>10.3. <b>Primary Producers:</b> Manufacturers of motor vehicles into which MVEDR devices will be installed prior to vehicle sale, and their designated EDR suppliers.</p> <p>10.4. <b>Secondary Producers:</b> Manufacturers of an MVEDR device designed for aftermarket use (such manufacturers will become Primary Producers if they become a direct supplier to a vehicle OEM); manufacturers of MVEDR sub-components (such as microprocessors and software), and manufacturers of related systems and devices, including software (such as equipment needed to retrieve data from an EDR).</p>	
--	--	--