P802.1AB/D12
November, 2004

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46

Proposed **DISPOSITION OF BALLOT COMMENTS ON** IEEE *Draft P802.1AB/D12*

DRAFT IEEE Standard for Local and Metropolitan Area Networks: Station and Media Access Control Connectivity Discovery

Sponsor
LAN MAN Standards Committee of the IEEE Computer Society

Prepared by: **Bill Lane, Project Editor**

8320 Woodman Ln., Newcastle, CA 95658; e-mail bill_lane@ieee.org

Commentary:

This Proposed Disposition of Ballot Comments documents the ballot comments received during the sponsor confirmation ballot on P802.1AB/D12 and records the resolutions of those ballot comments that will be discussed and agreed upon at the 802 plenary meeting to be held in San Antonio, Texas, during the week of November 14 through 19, 2004. The document contains:

1) A table of responses received during the initial sponsor ballot on P802.1AB/D10 as well as ballot comments reconfirmed or changed during the two reconfirmation ballots.
2) Listings of voter comments received during P802.1AB/D12 reconfirmation balloting. Each comment is accompanied by a disposition.

When approved, this document will constitute a record of the Instructions to the Editor for the preparation of P802.1AB/D13.

1. Table of Responses

The following table indicates the status of each ballot response received in the P802.1AB/D10 confirmation ballot. The Status column indicates the voting status of the responder. *V(oting)* indicates an eligible voting member of the ballot pool at the start of the ballot period. *C(oordination)* indicates a coordination response. The *Vote* column indicates the vote cast; Y = Approve, N = Disapprove, A = Abstain, C = Comment only.

Table 1 lists the eligible voters and coordinators in the ballot pool. Votes received during the draft 12 confirmation ballot are shown with a right arrow. The comment column indicates whether or not comments were received from the associated voter during draft 12 balloting.

Table 1—Table of responses

STATUS	VOTE	NAME	COMMENTS
V	Y	Butch Anton	
V		Hugh Barrass	
C		Bruce Barrow	
V		Clint Chaplin	
V	Y ==> Y	Keith Chow	
C	C	Michelle Turner, IEEE Editorial Coordinator	
C		D. C. Mohla, IEEE SCC10 Coordinator	
V	Y	Dr. Guru Dutt Dhingra	
V	Y	Wael Diab	
V	Y	Thomas Dineen	
V	Y	Dr. Sourav Dutta	
V	Y	Clint Early, Jr.	
V	Y	Will Foulds	
V	Y	Samuel Fryer	
V	Y	Yukihiro Fujimoto	
V		Devon Gayle	
V	Y	Mike Geipel	
V	Y	Patrick Gonia	
V		Robert Grow	

Table 1—Table of responses

STATUS	VOTE	NAME	COMMENTS
V		Stuart Holoman	
V	Y	Atsushi Ito	
V	Y	Peeya Iwagoshi	
V	Y	Raj Jain	
V	N ==> N	David James	Y
V	Y	Neil Jarvis	
V	Y	Tony Jeffree	
V	Y	Peter Jones	
V		Junghong Kao	
V	Y	Piotr Karocki	
V		Stuart Kerry	
V		Patrick Kinney	
V		John Lemon	
V	Y	Randolph Little	
V	Y	Nikolai Malykh	
V	Y	Jonathon McLendon	
V	Y	David Mitton	
V		Denish Mohan	
V	Y	Mike Moreton	
V	Y ==> Y	Narayanan Murugesan	N
V	Y	Jeremy Newberry	
V	Y == Y	Nick S. A. Nikjoo	N
V	Y	Donald O'Connor	
V	Y ==> Y	Bob O'Hara	N
V	Y	Satoshi Obara	
V	Y	Chris Osterloh	

Table 1—Table of responses

STATUS	VOTE	NAME	COMMENTS
V	Y	Stephen Palm	
V		Glenn Parsons	
V	Y ==> Y	Vikram Punj	N
V	Y	Maximilian Riegel	
V	A	John Roese	
V	Y	Floyd Ross	
V	Y	Marco Scorrano	
V	A	Vaughn Sheline	
V	Y	Gil Shultz	
C	Y	John C. Scott, IEEE SCC14 Coordinator	
V	Y	Matt Squire	
V	Y	Adrian Stephens	
V	Y	Joseph Tardo	
V	Y	Mark-Rene Uchida	
V	A	Scott Valcourt	
V	Y	Karl Weber	
V	Y	Derek Woo	
V	Y	Oren Yuen	

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46

Table 2—Results

CATEGORY	TOTAL	PERCENTAGE
Yes	45	
No	1	
Abstain	2	
Coordination	2	
No. of Voters	59	
Voters responding	46	

2. Ballot Comments

The comments and their dispositions are separated into two categories:

   a) Comments from one voter who voted no on draft 11. These include:

      1) 78 T
      2) 59 E

   b) New comments from voters who voted yes draft 11. These include:

      1) 8 T
      2) 4 E

2.1 Ballot comments from the voter who voted "No" on draft 12

Comment 1　　**David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: T

CLAUSE: 3

PAGE: 5

LINE: 3

COMMENT START:

I like to define shall, should, and may, since these are normative and not uniformly/consistently defined by IEEE.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Include definitions from associated FrameMaker text. These were used in 802.17 and have been carefully reviewed by IEEE Editors.Terms, definitions, and notation

3. Terms, definitions, and notation

3.1 Conformance levels

Several key words are used to differentiate between different levels of requirements and options, as described in this subclause.

3.1.1 may: Indicates a course of action permissible within the limits of the standard with no implied preference ("may" means "is permitted to").

3.1.2 shall: Indicates mandatory requirements to be strictly followed in order to conform to the standard and from which no deviation is permitted ("shall" means "is required to")

3.1.3 should: An indication that among several possibilities, one is recommended as particularly suitable, without mentioning or excluding others; or that a certain course of action is preferred but not necessarily required; or that (in the negative form) a certain course of action is deprecated but not prohibited ("should" means "is recommended to").

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 1

Discuss

<<Editor's note: The IEEE style guide also includes thr following definition for the use of *can*. I recommend *can* also be considered:

"The word *can* is used for statements of possibility and capability, whether material, physical, or casual (*can* equals *is able to*)." >>

Comment 2   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 5.1

PAGE: 8

LINE: 35

COMMENT START:

Break leaves isolated number on next line.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Use nonbreaking space within:

  Clause 11

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 2

Accept -- place cursor in the word and select Esc/n s

Comment 3   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 7.2

PAGE: 11

LINE: 59 (should be 49)

COMMENT START:

A line break within key word is confusing.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Use a nonbreaking space

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 3

accept - see comment 2

Comment 4   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 8.1

PAGE: 15

LINE: 55 (should be 45)

COMMENT START:

I think there is an unnecessary space before the em dash.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

eliminate the space

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 4

accept

Comment 5   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: T

CLAUSE: 8.1

PAGE: 15

LINE: 50

COMMENT START:

If "MAC Bridges" has a special meaning, then this meaning should be included in the glossary.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Either:

1) Add glossary term: MAC Bridges: (whatever)...

2) Make this lower case, here and throughout

If the definition of MAC Bridges happens to be Bridges that conform to IEEE Std 802.1D

then, that aside can be deleted here.

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 5

Withdrawn

Comment 6   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 8

PAGE: 15

LINE: 35
COMMENT START:

The meaning of header is standard, not special.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Header ==> header

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 6

this comment is related to comment _____

Comment 7   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: T

CLAUSE: 8.3

PAGE: 16

LINE: 39 (should be 33)
COMMENT START:

Leave out the subscript here, when hex numbers have digits
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Drop hex here, insert text in glossary, as was done in RPR.

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 7

This comment is related to comment 44

Comment 8   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 9.2

PAGE: 17

LINE: 50 (should be 42)
COMMENT START:

Two periods at the end of the sentence
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Use only one

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 8

Accept

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46

Comment 9   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 9.2

PAGE: 17

LINE: 37 (figure 9-1)
COMMENT START:

I believe your convention was TLV names are caps, fields are not.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

In that case, this should be: Time to live TLV ==> Time To Live TLV

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 9

Accept

Comment 10   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 9.4.1

PAGE: 19

LINE: 35
COMMENT START:

Should be an en dash, not an em dash
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Change to an en dash
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 10

accept

Comment 11   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE:

CLAUSE: 9.4.1

PAGE: 19

LINE: 27

COMMENT START:

Fill empty cells with something, preferably an em dash, so it doesn't look like a typo.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Insert an em dash
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 11

Accept -- do global search and insert in all blnak cells

Comment 12   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 9.4.1

PAGE: 19

LINE: 27

COMMENT START:

shold be an en dash, not an em dash
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

em dash ==> en dash
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 12

accept

Comment 13   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 9.5.2.2

PAGE: 21

LINE: 15

COMMENT START:

Fill in balnk cells with something (I prefer an em dash)
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Insert an em dash
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 13

Accept - see comment 11

Comment 14   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 9.5.2.2

PAGE: 21

LINE: 14
COMMENT START:

Center the left column better; his looks like manual spacing. Applying a paragraph center works better.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Use centered paragraphs
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 14

Accept - do global search and center

Comment 15   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 9.5.8.1

PAGE: 26

LINE: 36
COMMENT START:

Fill in the blank cell with an em dash, or something that doesn't look like a typo.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Insert an em dash, here and all blank table cells
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 15

Accept- see comment 11

Comment 16   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 9.5.8.1

PAGE: 26

LINE: 36
COMMENT START:

Center the numbers in the left column; something looks not centered.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Center the paragraphs properly
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 16

Accept - see comment 14

Comment 17   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 9.5.8.1

PAGE: 26

LINE: 31 (table heading)
COMMENT START:

Postion doesn't seem to be a proper noun, since its not defined in the glossary.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Bit Positon ==> Bit position
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 17

Accept -- do global search for all table headings

Comment 18   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: T

CLAUSE: 9.6.1

PAGE: 29

LINE: 47
COMMENT START:

Field names be spelled the same, whether in a figure or in text. What is less clear is whether you want to adopt the same convention within subclause headings, where its more consistent but looks a bit funny.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Don't capitalize field names in figures, unless that is how they are normally spelled in the middle of a sentence. Changes apply here and everywhere.
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 18

Discuss

Comment 19   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: FYI

CLAUSE: 9.6.1

PAGE: 29

LINE: 47 (figure field name)
COMMENT START:

This hyphen is unnecessary and (in fact) is wrong
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Eliminate the hyphen
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 19

Accept - global search for hyphen use

Comment 20   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 9.6

PAGE: 29

LINE: 28

COMMENT START:

A reference is missing
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

==> see F.6 and ?? (fill in the ??)

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 20

Accept - the missing reference is G.6

Comment 21   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: T

CLAUSE: 9.6.1.4

PAGE: 30

LINE: 15

COMMENT START:

A shall requirement on maintaining listings seems hard to quantify. I suspect there is some
sort of implied requirements that might need to be stated. Are there backup copies, what is
the penalty for not doing so, is this public or private, etc.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

change shall to should

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 21

discuss -- consider removing the entire 2nd sentence - how an organization ensures that its TLV subtypes are unique is an implementation issue

Comment 22   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 10

PAGE: 32

LINE: 8 (table 10-1
COMMENT START:

blank cell falsely implies a typo
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

fill with an em dash
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 22

Accept - see comment 11

Comment 23   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 10.1.1

PAGE: 33

LINE: 9
COMMENT START:

The straight single quotes are different from the curly ones (different font or character).
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Use the same character (cut and paste from above).

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 23

Accept - do global search and for quote font replace with one style

Comment 24   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 10.3.2

PAGE: 35

LINE: 37

COMMENT START:

Space is missing

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

add space

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 24

accept - global search of cross references for similar instances

Comment 25   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 11.3.2 (should be 10.3.2)

PAGE: 35

LINE: 58 (should be 35)

COMMENT START:

Key word hyphenated

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Don't hyphenate

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 25

accept - see comment 2

Comment 26   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 11.3.2 (should be 10.3.2)

PAGE: 35

LINE: 48
COMMENT START:

Key word hyphenated
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Don't hyphenate
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 26

accept - see comment 2

Comment 27   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 11.3.2 (should be 10.3.2)

PAGE: 35

LINE: 47
COMMENT START:

Key word hyphenated
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Don't hyphenate
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 27

accept - see comment 2

1
2
3
4

Comment 28   David V James

5
6

COMMENT TYPE: E

7
8

CLAUSE: 11.3.2 (should be 10.3.2)

9

PAGE: 35

10

LINE: 41

11

COMMENT START:

12
13

Key word hyphenated

COMMENT END:

14

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

15
16

Don't hyphenate

17

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

18
19

Disposition of Comment 28

20
21

22

accept - see comment 2

23
24

Comment 29   David V James

25
26
27

COMMENT TYPE: E

28
29

CLAUSE: 10.3.2

30

PAGE: 35

31

LINE: 42

32

COMMENT START:

33
34

These lists are hare to follow, with follow-on sentences within.

35

COMMENT END:

36

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

37
38

Use the third level number listing, with i, ii, iii, to list the actions taken with steps a1, a2,

39

etc.

40
41

If these don't work well in the IEEE templates (which I hear is the case), then format them

with indents or other things, and send a note to the IEEE to fix these before publication.

42
43

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

44
45
46

Disposition of Comment 29

Accept - applies to a1, a2, b1, b2, c1, and c2 -- do gobal search and correct other similar instances

Comment 30   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 11.3.2 (still is 10.3.2)

PAGE: 36

LINE: 11
COMMENT START:

confusing hyphenation
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Don't hyphenate

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 30

accept - see comment 2

Comment 31   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 11.3.2 (10.3.2)

PAGE: 36

LINE: 6
COMMENT START:

confusing hyphenation
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Don't hyphenate

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 31

accept - see comment 2

Comment 32   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 11.3.2 (10.3.2)

PAGE: 37

LINE: 61

COMMENT START:

confusing hyphenation
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Don't hyphenate

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 32

accept - see comment 2

Comment 33   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: FYI

CLAUSE: 11.5.1

PAGE: 51

LINE: 63
COMMENT START:

did you mean for the list to continue? These seem like different lists
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

none supplied
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 33

Accept in principle - convert to 2-level lists

Comment 34   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 11.5.1

PAGE: 52

LINE: 8
COMMENT START:

did you mean for the list to continue?
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Reset list numbering
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 34

Accept in principle - convert to 2-level lists as in comment 33

Comment 35   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 11.5.3.2

PAGE: 52

LINE: 63
COMMENT START:

I like to do cross-references as "(see 9.5.3.3)" uniformly throughout. Otherwise, (9.5) can sometimes look like a decimal number.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Add "see" to all (x.x) references.
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 35

Accept

Comment 36   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 11.5.4

PAGE: 54

LINE: 4

COMMENT START:

Could you swap the left two columns? That would avoid the need to interpolate between rows on left and right.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Swap the columns

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 36

accept

Comment 37   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 11.5.4

PAGE: 54

LINE: 1

COMMENT START:

Could you swap the left two columns? That would avoid the need to interpolate between rows on left and right.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Swap the columns

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 37

accept- this refers to the same table as comment 36

Comment 38   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 11.5.4

PAGE: 55

LINE: 34
COMMENT START:

Esidual reg underscore.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

remove it
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 38

accept

Comment 39   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: 12.1

PAGE: 58

LINE: 4
COMMENT START:

Widen this column, to avoid the wrap in the header.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Widen the column
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 39

Accept

Comment 40   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: A

PAGE: 95

LINE: 10
COMMENT START:

The typing seems to list "C2" as a language.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

C2 ==> C
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 40

Accept

Comment 41   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: B.3

PAGE: 96

LINE: 58
COMMENT START:

Force a page break before B.3, so heading and first text are on the same page.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Force a page break
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 41

accept

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46

Comment 42   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: B.3.4.2

PAGE: 98

LINE: 63

COMMENT START:

Nonstandard terminology
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

NA ==> N/A, as described previously
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 42

Accept

Comment 43   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: B.4

PAGE: 100

LINE: 6

COMMENT START:

Shouldn't be a period here
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Clause 8. ==> Clause 8

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 43

accept

Comment 44   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: D.1

PAGE: 103

LINE: 23

COMMENT START:

No subscript
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

1) Remove subscript in hyphen separated addresses.

2) Add notation description, as per provided FrameMaker text.

3) Do this throughout.

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 44

Discuss

<< Editor's note - the provided FrameMaker text would add the following to definition to Clause 3:

3.3 Numerical representation

Decimal, hexadecimal, and binary numbers are used within this document. For clarity, decimal numbers are generally used to represent counts, hexadecimal numbers are used to represent addresses, and binary numbers are used to describe bit patterns within binary fields.

Decimal numbers are represented in their usual 0, 1, 2, … format. Hexadecimal numbers are represented by a string of one or more hexadecimal (0-9,A-F) digits followed by the subscript 16, except in C-code contexts, where they are written as `0x123EF2` etc. Binary numbers are represented by a string of one or more binary (0,1) digits, followed by the subscript 2. Thus the decimal number "26" may also be represented as "$1A_{16}$" or "11010_2".

MAC addresses and OUI/EUI values are represented as strings of 8-bit hexadecimal numbers separated by hyphens and without a subscript, as for example "01-80-C2-00-00-15" or "AA-55-11".

>>

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46

Comment 45   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: D.1

PAGE: 103

LINE: 25
COMMENT START:

Center numbers under the blocks
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Center numbers
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 45

Accept

Comment 46   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: F.2.1

PAGE: 107

LINE: 68
COMMENT START:

Odd page should never be on the left.

Odd page numbers should be on the right.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Either:

1) Fix this.

2) Add to list for IEEE Editors to fix.

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 46

Accept - instruct the IEEE editors to do it

Comment 47   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: F.2.1

PAGE: 107

LINE: 61
COMMENT START:

Force a page break before header, so header and text are on same page.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Force a page break
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 47

accept

Comment 48   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: F.1

PAGE: 107

LINE: 32
COMMENT START:

Blank space looks like a typo
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Fill with an em dash
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 48

Accept see comment 11

1
2
3
4
Comment 49   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: F.3.1

PAGE: 108

LINE: 43
COMMENT START:

I think this should be a en dash, not an em dash
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

em dash ==> en dash
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 49

accept

Comment 50   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: F.5.3

PAGE: 110

LINE: 35
COMMENT START:

Space after i.e.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Add a space
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 50

Accept in principle -- replace with "for example"

Comment 51   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: F.5

PAGE: 110

LINE: 9

COMMENT START:

If the field is called: "protocol identity" then it should not be capitalized. That's because:

1) Its not a heading

2) Context-dependent caps makes it hard to determine what is the real field name.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Make this lower case. Similar changes for other field names.

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 51

See comment 18

Comment 52   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: F.7

PAGE:113

LINE: 56

COMMENT START:

Blank cell looks like typo.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Fill in with an em dash, here and throughout.
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 52

Accept - see comment 11

Comment 53   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: FYI

CLAUSE: G.1

PAGE: 132

LINE: 33

COMMENT START:

Fill in with an em dash, here and throughout. I normally put an em dash in such empty table cells, so its clear that its intended to be nothing.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Fill empty cell with em dash, here and throughout.
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 53

Accept - see comment 11

Comment 54   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: G.2.1

PAGE: 133

LINE: 6
COMMENT START:

Here it is bit-0 and bit-1, elsewhere its bit 0 and bit 1
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Be consistent - Preference is "bit[0]".

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 54

Accept - global search and replace

Comment 55   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: G.2.1

PAGE: 133

LINE: 20

COMMENT START:

I normally put an em dash in such empty table cells, so its clear that its intended to be nothing.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

blank cell ==> em dash

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 55

Accept - see comment 11

Comment 56   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: G.2.1

PAGE: 133

LINE: 20

COMMENT START:

I normally put an em dash in such empty table cells, so its clear that its intended to be nothing.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

blank cell ==> em dash

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 56

This is a duplicate of the previous comment
Accept - see comment 11

Comment 57   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: G.2.1

PAGE: 133

LINE: 19
COMMENT START:

this should be an en dash, not an em dash
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

em dash ==> en dash
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 57

accept

Comment 58   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: G.2.1

PAGE: 133

LINE: 13

COMMENT START:

a) Nonstandard line widths in table.

b) The "Bit" column should be centered.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Include this in a list of "to-be-fixed", so its not missed by the IEEE editors.
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 58

accept

Comment 59   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: G.3.5

PAGE: 134

LINE: 61

COMMENT START:

I think two different size fonts are being used here (usage rules seems big)

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Use uniform font size

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 59

accept

Comment 60   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: G.3.1

PAGE: 134

LINE: 38

COMMENT START:

I normally put an em dash in such empty table cells, so its clear that its intended to be nothing.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Blank cell ==> em dash

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 60

accept - see comment 11

Comment 61   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: G.3.1

PAGE: 134

LINE: 45

COMMENT START:

The G.3.2 in front of the second note appears erroneous.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Delete it
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 61

Accept in principle - change the line format to "note" and add the number "2" to the line

Comment 62   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: G.3.1

PAGE: 134

LINE: 24
COMMENT START:

a) Nonstandard line widths in table.

b) The "Bit" column should be centered.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Include this in a list of "to-be-fixed", so its not missed by the IEEE editors.
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 62

Accept

Comment 63   **David V James**

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: G.4.1

PAGE: 135

LINE: 36
COMMENT START:

I think this would be clearer if split into four subcells, so that

      a) 0 and 1 are on separate rows

      b) 0/1 and descriptions are on different columns.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Split into subcells
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 63

Accept

Comment 64   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: G.4

PAGE: 135

LINE: 12
COMMENT START:

I think we can drop the subscript 16 here, if defined properly in the glossary (see example)
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Hyphenated addresses: delete the subscript 16. Here and throughout.

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 64

accept

Comment 65   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: G.4.1

PAGE: 135

LINE: 36
COMMENT START:

Blank cells look like a typo
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

insert an em dash
SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 65

accept - see comment 11

Comment 66   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: G.7.1

PAGE: 140

LINE: 63
COMMENT START:

don't break URL
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

force a line break before the URL

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 66

accept

Comment 67   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: E

CLAUSE: G.7

PAGE: 140

LINE: 7
COMMENT START:

An em dash in the empty cell would make it clear this was intended to be blank. An n/a
would also work.
COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

blank ==> em dash

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 67

accept - see comment 11

Comment 68   David V James

COMMENT TYPE: T

CLAUSE: 9.6.1.3

PAGE: 30

LINE: 7

COMMENT START:

The mapping of the OUI must be accurately defined, in terms of the IEEE/RAC supplied values, expressed in the format-assignment letter. The current reference is bit-oriented (not hex oriented, vertically oriented (not horizontal oriented), puts LSB on the left (not right), described different things (40-bit and 48-bit), which makes the reference difficult to understand in this context.

COMMENT END:

SUGGESTED CHANGES START:

Replace text with:

9.6.1.3 Organizationally Unique Identifier (OUI)

The Organizationally Unique Identifier field shall contain the organization's OUI. For example, when using the 802.1 OUI value of 00-80-C2, 00 and C2 bytes correspond to the first and last of these three transmitted bytes, respectively (see F.2).

SUGGESTED CHANGES END:

Disposition of Comment 68

discuss