IEEE 802.11
Wireless Access Method and Physical Specification

Title: TGa Report

Date: May 4-8, 1998

Author: Dean Kawaguchi

Symbol Technologies, Inc.
2145 Hamilton Ave
San Jose, CA. 95125
Telephone: (408)369-2629
FAX: (408)369-2737
e-mail: deank@psd.symbol.com

Opening
Introduction - temporary chair
Secretary - Geert Awater
Volunteers to update the matrix and prepare a list of questions - none, remains with proposers

Procedure
I propose that the selection process for TGa follow the well thought out TGb selection procedure as documented in 98/54. John Fakatselis has done a great job in defining it, keeping the TGb process fair and very orderly up to this point. Since there are only 3 remaining modulation proposals in TGa with the merging of 4 proposals into 2, the TGa process will not perform any downselection (elimination) voting prior to the final selection voting.

By TGb rules, the group will vote for their favorite modulation type of the 3 remaining proposals, eliminating the proposal with the least votes, then voting for the favorite of the 2 remaining. The selected modulation will then go the full 802.11 which will require 75% for ratification.

Of course if we do not end up with a 75% supported modulation type, the agenda will be modified as needed.
**Agenda**

**Mon** 14:00-14:45 Agenda, docs, presentation and approval of selection process
  14:45-15:30 Presentation of proposal 1
  15:30-16:15 Presentation of proposal 2
  16:15-16:30 Break
  16:30-17:15 Presentation of proposal 3
  17:15-18:00 Presentation of non-proposers material considered critical for selection
  18:00-19:00 Discussion, resolution of matrix issues

**Tue** 13:00-14:00 Presentation of Comparison Matrix
  14:00-15:00 Q&A to a panel.
  15:00-15:15 5 minute summary of each proposal, vote
  15:15-15:45 Break, vote count
  15:45-16:15 Discussion, vote
  16:15-16:45 Break, vote count
  16:45-17:00 Results, discussion, adjourn
  17:00+ Social event

**Thurs** At plenary - approval of the selection
  10:00 - Discussions, text modifications

**Friday** Approval of finalized text, preparations for Ballot
Motion:

*Adopt TGb selection process with exception that all votes happen at Tuesday afternoon.*

Naftali/Roy 35 0 1 Motion passes

---

**Voting Results**

**Ballot #1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Votes</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Breezecom/NEC</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lucent/NTT</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>41.07%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radiolan</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7.14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>56</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Ballot #2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Votes</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Breezecom/NEC</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>42.11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lucent/NTT</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>54.39%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>None</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.51%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstain</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.75%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>58</td>
<td>(57 for %)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: % values shown above were recalculated for 57 non-abstention votes

**Lucent/NTT selected by >50% per motion.**

Motion to 802.11:

*To accept the recommendation of TGa to adopt the OFDM proposal from Lucent and NTT as the basis for the 5 GHz PHY.*

TGa/Bruce. 28/15/6....... 65 % Fails
Motion:
**to adopt an open comment resolution process on any concerns of anybody with the objective of getting to 75%**.

Vote on Main motion: 19-4-13

Written ballots by those voting NO on OFDM proposal.
Discussion of comments.

Motion:
**to recommend to the plenary to approve the document 98/72r3 as a Draft TGa standard and forward it to a WG ballot.**

Naftali/Hitoshi  19 - 19 - 4

After IP discussion……..

None willing to reopen.

Agenda Item:

Responses to Ballot questions

Motion – to add an agenda item :
A discussion to ask what would it take to agree on a single carrier proposal
Jim/Kazu

Motion to amend
Add an agenda item before the previous:
Vote on acceptance of OFDM proposal.
Anil/Carl 31-0-6

Amended Motion – to add an agenda items :
Vote on acceptance of OFDM proposal.
A discussion to ask what would it take to agree on a single carrier proposal if the vote fails
Jim/Kazuhiro

Reza/Anil amended to add (if vote fails), accepted by acclamation
Naftali/Anil CQ no obj

Main motion – 27-11-3 passes.

**Agenda for July 1998 meeting**
- Responses to Ballot questions
- Vote on acceptance of OFDM proposal.
- A discussion to ask what would it take to agree on a single carrier proposal if the vote fails

802.11 Plenary Motion:
That if TGa has to re-open their selection process that they be directed to use non-secret voting, and achieve a 75% or greater acceptance before forwarding to 802.11.

Keith/Anil
43/0/4