

Tentative Minutes of the IEEE P802.11

Full Working Group Plenary Meeting Maui, Hawaii July 6 to 11, 1997

Monday 7, 1997

1.0 Opening Meeting called to order by Vic Hayes at 15:30, Agenda of 41st session of 802.11 is in doc.:IEEE P802.11-97/45-R1. George Fishel, secretary¹⁾ is present and ready to take the notes.

Objectives for this meeting, all groups

- to prepare the documents for future work in the High Speed Study Group including submitting the 5 GHz PAR to SEC
- to start work on the new PHYs
- to set up a maintenance procedure

1.1 Roll Call: People in the room were invited to introduce themselves.

1.2 Voting rights:

¹⁾T The officers of the Working Group are:

Mr. VICTOR HAYES
Chairman IEEE P802.11
Lucent Technologies
Phone: +31 30 609 7528
Fax: +31 30 609 7498
E-Mail: v.hayes@ieee.org

Mr. GEORGE FISHEL
Secretary IEEE P802.11
AMP Inc.
Phone: +1 717 592 6161
Fax: +1 717 592 6179
E-Mail: grfishel@amp.com

Mr. BOB O'HARA
Editor IEEE P802.11
Informed Technologies Inc.
Phone: +1212 645 4317
Fax: +1 212 645 6719
E-Mail: bob_ohara@informed-technologies.com

Mr. STUART KERRY
Vice Chairman IEEE P802.11

Phone: +1 408 267 4680
Fax: +1 408 267 4680
E-Mail: stuart@ok-brit.com

Mr. CHRIS ZEGELIN
Vice Chairman IEEE P802.11
Symbol Technologies Inc.
Phone: +1 408 369 2667
Fax: +1 408 369 2740
E-Mail: chrisz@psd.symbol.com

Mr. GREG ENNIS
Editor IEEE P802.11

Phone: +1 408 358 5544
Fax: +1 408 358 5541
E-Mail: gennis@mindspring.com

Mr. DAVE BAGBY
Chair IEEE P802.11-MAC group
Advanced Micro Devices
Phone: +1 408 987 2423
Fax: +1 408 987 2800
E-Mail: david.bagby@amd.com

Mr. DEAN KAWAGUCHI
Chair IEEE P802.11-PHY group
Symbol Technologies Inc.
Phone: +1 408 369 2629
Fax: +1 408 369 2740
E-Mail: deank@psd.symbol.com

Participation in debates, moving and seconding is only permitted by voting members, in all 802.11 meetings (at all levels). The subgroup chairs may permit observers to participate in debates.

Voting at the working group level is by voting members only. Chair may permit observers to participate in debate. To become a voting member:

- participate in at least 2 out of 4 consecutive plenary meetings. Voting rights start at third meeting
- participation in at least 75% in meetings, in the room
- one interim may be exchanged for a plenary
- Voting members will get a token to be used at votes

Voting rights can be maintained:

- by participation in 2 plenary meetings within 4 consecutive plenary meetings
- one interim may be substituted for a plenary

Voting rights may be lost:

- after failing to pay the conference fee
- after missing two out of three consecutive letter ballots

Current state of member status:

- 58 - Voting members
- 4 - Aspiring voting members
- 39 - Nearly voting members

1.3 Attendance list, Regis

1.4 Administration: The attendance list was circulated, Chris Zegelin supervising - 75% attendance according to the attendance list is required to qualify for participating in the meeting as a whole, so make sure to sign the book. Copies of the attendance list are handed out before the end of each meeting.

- important for administration of voting rights that the attendance book is used properly.
- sign per meeting (morning, afternoon, evening). Do not sign ahead.
- place initials. Do not cross or underline.
- circle the letter corresponding to the meeting you attend when signing (F=full 802.11, P=PHY, M=MAC group).

Check e-mail addresses in the book:

- some addresses have been struck, or have a \$-sign added to the right - those received complaints from the reflector
- please strike your e-mail address if you do not use it
- if you do not disagree to receiving very long files, mark bulk e-mail with yes

Logistics: Document distribution is done using pigeon holes - you will find your copies and messages in the referenced location in the expanding file folders in the slot *in front of* your name.

Document distribution:

- sign in for a slot, remember the letter and number
- pigeon holes are file folders with a letter id on each folder and a number on each slot
- in each folder are numbered slots, each of which is 'owned' by a person
- each person owns slot in front of number

Conference fee to be paid through registration office.

Copying and collection of files is managed by George Fishel assists in the pigeonhole stuffing.

Coffee breaks at 10 AM and 3 PM. Noon to 1:00 PM lunch

1.5 IEEE Patent Policy Vic Hayes explained the IEEE Patent Policy as per Clause 5 of the IEEE Standards By-Laws and per Clause 6.3 of the IEEE Standards Operations Manual. He specifically asked for notification from members of patents applicable to the draft standard and that patent holders submit the requested statement.

1.6 Other announcements

- A financial report from the January and May meetings.
Meetings hosted by Harris and AMD at no charge to the 802.11 Working Group

2. Approval of the minutes of previous meetings

Minutes of the Irvine meeting approved by acclamation 11-97/24

Minutes of the Sunnyvale meeting approved by acclamation 11-97/40

3. Reports

3.1 the Executive Committee ExCom meeting report made by Vic Hayes

- CD ROMs of all standards will be distributed on Wednesday to all members of record.
- IEEE Standards Association
- Some concerns expressed over the meeting location of the Acapulco meeting and additional locations will be considered for that meeting
- Electronic distribution of standards
 - \$650 per year for individual
 - \$6500 for corporate
 - A survey will be circulated to get your views on how you want to receive standards
- Report from the standards board meeting and the approval of the draft 802.11
- Report from George Fishel on IISP participation in Nomadcity roundtable and an overview of IISP. Paper copies of the presentation will be circulated tomorrow on the subject as a submission to IEEE 802.11.
- Report by Vic Hays on the ISO/IEC JTC1/SC/6 meeting and how the

4. Review of Contributions

Document 802.11-97/57 List of contributions for the Maui Meeting

5. Adoption of Agenda

Some additions made to agenda. Johnny Zweig added a under New Business 7.3 Global Regulatory Issues for 802.11.

Motion 1: "To adopt agenda as amended"

Dean Kawaguchi/Tom Siep 27-0-0 Agenda adopted motion 1 passes.

6. Unfinished Business

7. New Business

7.1 Liaison for WinForum No representative available to make presentation at this time. A presentation will be made later. Later in the meeting a report was made by NAME. The WinForum Sharing Rules Development Committee (SRDC) is pleased to learn that the IEEE 802.11 working group is considering the development of an interoperability standard for use of the 5.2 GHz unlicensed National Information Infrastructure (U-NII) band in the US. The SRDC is working on regulatory matters and spectrum coexistence rules concerning this band and we invite the IEEE 802.11 working group to cooperate in establishing spectrum access rules that will permit the efficient operation of the 802.11 MAC. Discussion followed on how the liaison statement .

Motion 2: "Move that no liaison statement be returned to WinForum before a PAR has been approved."

Bob O'Hara/Johnny Zweig

Discussion Followed.

Motion 3: "Move to postpone vote on Motion 2 till Wednesday afternoon"

Johnny Zweig/Anil Sanwalka Vote: 26-0-1 Motion 3 passes. Vote on Motion 2 postponed.

7.2 Liaison from ETSI Introduced by Jan Boer. Discussion followed on ETSI Hiperlan 2 PHY and how the ATM Forum has adopted the ETSI PHY. What are the differences of Hiperlan 2 and 3. Jan has been elected to be the Liaison to ETSI. Naftali Chayat made the observation that the chair of 802.11 and also the liaison to ETSI are from Lucent. An additional volunteer was requested for an additional liaison person to ETSI and Al Petrick volunteered.

7.3 Global Regulatory issues for 802.11

Johnny Zweig requested that we

8. Adjourn at 6:15 PM

Motion 4: "Move to Adjourn"

Dave Bagby/Anil Sanwalka unanimously approved. Motion 4 passes meeting adjourned.

Wednesday 9 July 1997 Special Meeting 1:00 PM

Champaign toast provided by the chairs: Vic Hayes, Lucent, David Bagby, AMD, Dean Kawaguchi, Symbol Technologies in honor of the completion of the IEEE 802.11 standard.

9. Approval of Agenda

Motion 5: "Motion to accept agenda for the day"

Bob O'Hara/John Fakatselis

Motion 5 passes 22-0-1

10. Old business

Revisit of a motion that was tabled on Monday. Debate continues on the following Motion:

Motion 2 from Monday: "Move that no liaison statement be returned to WinForum before a PAR has been approved."

Comment by Bob O'Hara that we can not represent the 802.11 interest at WinForum before our Par is approved.

Motion 6: Move to Modify the motion by adding the word "official" before be inserted before the word liaison in the motion

David Bagby/ Dean Kawaguchi Motion 6 accepted without opposition.

Motion 7: call the question

David Bagby/Dean Kawaguchi No opposition to calling the question.

Motion 2 as amended: "Move that no official liaison statement be returned to WinForum before a PAR has been approved."

Vote: 19-0-1 Motion 2 passes from Monday as amended.

12.2 5Ghz PAR 97/63 and 97/65

Motion 8: “Motion to forward 97/63 and 97/65 to the EX-COM.”

Naftali Chayat /Keith Amundsen

22-0-4 Motion 8 passes to forward PAR to Ex-ExCom.

12.3 2.4 GHz PAR 97/59r2

Naftali presented the new PAR document to the group and explained the mistake that had been made and the reason for r2 designation

David Bagby requested the vote be included in the minutes from the study group. The vote was 36-0-1 to forward the motion to the full working group.

Naftali handed the chair to Dean and made the following Motion in the study group:

“To prepare separate PARs for DS and FH extensions if the 2.4 GHZ bands. The vote was: 15-11-13. The motion passed in the study group.

David Bagby requested a ruling from the chair and Vic Hayes ruled the passed motion from the study group was in conflict with 97/59r2 and will go back to the study group for additional work.

Motion 9: A motion to appeal Vic’s decision that the two PARs were in conflict with each other was filed on the ruling .

Dean Kawaguchi/ Anil Sanwalka

Heavy discussion followed.

Motion 10: “Call Question”

Dean Kawaguchi/ Anil Sanwalka No opposition to calling the question.

Vote on Motion 9: 15-9-2 Appeal passes the PARs are not in conflict.

Additional discussion follows.

Motion 11: "Motion to accept 97/59r2 for submission to EX-COM."

Naftali Chayat/Chris Zegelin. Discussion follows.

Motion 12: A motion to call the question.

Chris Zegelin/ Anil Sanwalka. Question called with no opposition.

Motion 11 passes 25-0-2 Document 97/59r2 for submission to EX-COM.

The 3 Mbit FH PAR was not completed in study group and was not forwarded to the full working group.

Vic proposed a schedule for the work on the 5GHz PAR and a co-located meeting with ETSI BRAN in London in September. Discussion followed.

Vic asked for a straw vote on a joint meeting with ETSI BRAN in London 9 to 12 September.

Vote: 18 people supported this item. (This was not an official vote) Vic will check with ETSI on this topic.

Motion 13: Motion to adjourn passes unanimously at 2:40 PM.

Thursday, 10 July 1997 IEEE 802.11 Closing Plenary 1:00 PM

Meeting called to order by Vic Hayes at 1:15 PM.

14.1 Announcements

14.1.1 How will the standard look in the future? Vic gave an overview of the appearance of the new standard and the color of the cover.

14.1.2 Schedule of work would like a working group ballot for the 2.4 GHz standard by the end of July 1998. A recirculation ballot by March 1999 and a sponsor ballot by July of 1999.

14.1.3 letter form the IEEE 802.9 working group

14.1.4 Proposed organization for future IEEE 802.11 Vic showed a chart of how the future structure of the working should look. Task group A(5 GHz) will be chaired by Naftali Chayat Task group B (2.4 GHz) will be chaired by John Fakatselis. John was nominated by Anil Sanwalka and seconded by Joseph Kubler

14.1.5 Standards Distribution Vic took a survey of all present and the overwhelming majority of the members wanted standards delivered on a CD ROM and only enough bound copies for members of the

15 Approval of the Agenda:

Agenda approved as presented by unanimous consent.

Motion 14: “Jan Bore was nominated to be the Liaison to the ETSI BRAN project .”

Naftali Chayat/John Fakatselis Vote: 19-0-4 Jan is elected as liaison to BRAN motion 14 passes.

Motion 15: “To accept 97/67r1 as the letter to be sent to ETSI Project Bran Manager.”

Naftali Chayat/Jan Boer Vote: 18-0-6 Motion 15 Passes.

802.1 Liaison Victoria Poncini is appointed as the alternate to Vic Hayes as liaison.

Motion 16: The approved 97/59r2 seems to be missing some items as presented to the full working group. A sentence was omitted in the drafting that should read “The scope of this project is to develop a higher speed PHY extenuation to 802.11 operating in the 2.4 GHz band.” and will replace a sentence on page 5 of the PAR form “compatible with 802.11 PHY”.

David Bagby/ Naftali Chayat Motion 16 accepted by unanimous consent and will go to ExCom as r3.

Report by Naftali Chayat on the finding of the study group. Report on the IR PHY that at this time the working group will not work on a IR PHY. The Study group will be disbanded.

16 Unfinished Business

16.1 Documents Output.

- PAR for 5 GHz band 97/63.
- PAR for extension of 2.4 GHz to high speed 97/59r3

16.2 Next Meeting

Dean Kawaguchi had a proposed agenda item for the September interim meeting in London 9 to 12 September 1997 working group with ETSI BRAN as a joint meeting. The purpose of this meeting is to

determine if a common PHY can be used by both groups. The meeting will be in London at the Radio Agency. Dean also requested a volunteer to set up hotels and Simon Black said he would check. 25 people said they would attend the meeting in London. Dean also showed a proposed agenda (-97/70) for the meeting and also proposed an alternate location as Toronto Canada as a second location the week following with Aironet hosting the meeting. The final location for the meeting will be posted by mailing ASAP.

16.3 Other Interim Meetings Required

Monday morning interims start together and then parallel TGa and TGb

17 New business

18 Close of meeting at 3:20 PM. Without opposition.

Appendix 1 Attendance List

First name	Last name	status	Company	comms
Mr. Jeff	Abramowitz	voter	3Com Corporation jeff_abramowitz@3mail.3com.com	+1 408 764 5974
Mr. Keith B.	Amundsen	voter	Raytheon Company keith_b_amundsen@raytheon.com	+1 508 470 9483
Mr. Carl F.	Andren	voter	HARRIS Corporation candren@harris.com	+1 407 724 7535
Mr. Kazuhiro	Aoyagi		Showa Electric Wire & Cable Co. Ltd. 73 7211 k860822@sntl.swcc.co.jp	+81 427
Mr. David	Bagby	voter	Advanced Micro Devices david.bagby@amd.com	+1 408 749 5425
Mr. Phil	Belanger	voter	Aironet pbela@aironet.com	+1 330 664 7953
Mr. Simon	Black	voter	Intalk simonblack@intalk.com	+44 1223 421250
Mr. Jan	Boer	voter	Lucent Technologies WCND janboer@lucent.com	+31 30 609 7483
Dr. John H.	Cafarella		Micrilor Inc. johncafarella@worldnet.att.net	+1 617 246 0103
Mr. Dean S.K.	Chang		Proxim Inc. dean@proxim.com	+1 415 526 3689
Mr. Naftali	Chayat	voter	BreezeCom naftalic@breezecom.co.il	+972 3 645 6262
Mr. Wim	Diepstraten	voter	Lucent Technologies WCND wdiepstraten@lucent.com	+31 30 609 7482
Mr. Peter	Ecclesine		Cisco Systems Inc. petere@cisco.com	+1 408 527 0815
Mr. John	Fakatselis	voter	HARRIS Corporation jfakat01@ccmail.mis.semi.harris.com	+1 407 729 4733
Mr. George	Fishel	voter	AMP Inc. grfishel@amp.com	+1 717 592 6161
Mr. Tim	Godfrey		Digital Ocean Inc. tgodfrey@digoocean.com	+1 913 888 3380
Mr. Victor	Hayes	voter	Lucent Technologies WCND vichayes@lucent.com	+31 30 609 7528
Mr. Robert	Heile		BBN Corp bheile@bbn.com	+1 617 873 4835
Mr. Masa	Hirayama		LTEL Corp masachan@ppp01.infopepper.or.jp	+81 48 660 1771
Mr. Dean M.	Kawaguchi	voter	Symbol Technologies Inc. deank@psd.symbol.com	+1 408 369 2629
Mr. Joseph J.	Kubler	voter	Norand Corporation kublerj@norand.com	+1 303 442 1850

Appendix 1 Attendance List 2

First name	Last name	status	Company	comms
Mr. Ray	Martino		Symbol Technologies Inc. raymj@psd.symbol.com	+1 408 369 2646
Mr. Hideki	Matsumoto		Showa Electric Wire & Cable Co. Ltd. 74 8230 k820359@sntl.swcc.co.jp	+81 427
Mr. Jim	McDonald		Motorola Inc. cjm015@email.mot.com	+1 847 576 3169
Dr. Akira	Miura	voter	Panasonic Technologies Inc. miura@tadw.research.panasonic.com	+1 415 858 1000
Dr. Masahiro	Morikura		NTT Wireless System Labs. morikura@mhosun.wslab.ntt.co.jp	+81 468 59 3132
Mr. Tets	Morita		LTEL Corp morita@ltel.co.jp	+81 48 660 1771
Mr. Hiroyuki	Murakami		Kokusai Electric Co Ltd. X3325 hmurakami@hw.kokusaidenki.co.jp	+81 123 48 6111
Mr. Ravi P.	Nalamati	voter	Digital Equipment Corp. nalamati@irocz.enet.dec.com	+1 508 486 5189
Mr. Colin	Nayler		AMD colin.nayler@amd.com	+1 408 749 5884
Mr. Bob	O'Hara	voter	Informed Technology Inc. bob@informed-technology.com	+1 212 463 7937
Mr. Tomoki	Ohsawa		NEC Corporation ohsawa@nwk.cl.nec.co.jp	+81 44 856 2242
Mr. Mitsuji	Okada	voter	NEC Electronics Inc. mokada@asic.mtv.nec.com	+1 408 588 6549
Mr. Richard H.	Paine	voter	The Boeing Company richard.h.paine@boeing.com	+1 425 865 4921
Mr. Al	Petrick	voter	HARRIS Semiconductor apetrick@harris.com	+1 407 729 4944
Mr. Bob	Pham		NEC America Inc. phamr@hn.va.nec.com	+1 703 834 4486
Ms. Victoria M.	Poncini		The Boeing Company victoria.poncini@pss.boeing.com	+1 425 865 5342
Ms. Miri	Ratner	voter	BreezeCom mirir@breezecom.co.il	+972 3 645 6262
Mr. Barry	Reinhold		UNH IOL bbr@unh.edu	+1 603 862 4532
Mr. William	Roberts	voter	American Microsystems Inc. x6514 wroberts@poci.amis.com	+1 208 233 4690
Mr. Kent G.	Rollins	voter	HARRIS Corporation krollins@harris.com	+1 407 729 5133
Mr. Chandos	Rypinski	voter	LACE Inc. rypinski@microweb.com	+1 415 389 6659

Appendix 1 Attendance List 3

First name	Last name	status	Company	comms
Mr. Anil K.	Sanwalka	voter	Neesus Datacom Consultants anil@neesus.com	+1 416 754 8007
Mr. Mike	Shiba		Symbol Technologies Inc. mikes@psd.symbol.com	+1 408 369 2695
Mr. Masanori	Shibayama	voter	NTT Corporation shibayama.masanori@nsc.cae.ntt.jp	+81 43 211 3137
Mr. Thomas	Siep	voter	Texas Instruments siep@ti.com	+1 972 480 6786
Mr. Doug	Smith		Aironet Canada Ltd. dsmit@aironet.com	+1 905 475 7171
Mr. Mack	Sullivan	voter	Prevail Communications mackisd@pacbell.net	+1 415 599 9260
Mr. Hitoshi	Takanashi		NTT Wireless System Labs. takanasi@pcs.wslab.ntt.co.jp	+81 468 59 3471
Mr. Satoru	Toguchi		JVC +81 462 78 1871 toguchi@krhm.jvc-victor.co.jp	
Ms Cherry	Tom		AT&T Laboratories ctom@attmail.com	+1 973 386 4192
Mr. Mike	Trompower	voter	Aironet Wireless Communications Inc. 664 7920 mtrom@aironet.com	+1 330
Dr. Nien C.	Wei	voter	AT&T Laboratories ncw@mailnet.ho.att.com	+1 973 386 2053
Mr. Michael C.	Wu		Z-COM Inc. cywu@zcom.com.tw	+886 3 5777364
Mr. Chris	Zegelin	voter	Symbol Technologies Inc. chrisz@psd.symbol.com	+1 408 369 2667
Mr. Timothy M.	Zimmerman	voter	Norand Corporation zimmermt@norand.com	+1 319 369 3471
Mr. Johnny	Zweig	voter	Netwave Technologies Inc. zweig@netwave-wireless.com	+1 510 737 1600