

APPROVED

**IEEE
802.16 Session #29
12 – 15 January 2004
Vancouver BC**

Source: Task Group d (TGd) Chair

Title: TGd minutes

Date: 15 Jan 2004

Document for:

Approval	X
Discussion	
Information	X

Agenda item: Minutes

<i>Registered Contributions</i>	2
<i>Session #29 Schedule</i>	2
<i>Monday January 12, 2004</i>	2
Review of Comments; 80216-03_51r7	2
<i>Tuesday January 13, 2004</i>	3
Review of Comments; 80216-03_51r7	3
<i>Wednesday January 14, 2004</i>	4
Review of Comments; 80216-03_51r7	4
<i>Thursday January 15, 2004</i>	5
Review of Comments; 80216-03_51r7	5

Registered Contributions

The following is a list of registered contributions to TGd as of the publication of these minutes.

? C80216d-03_84r1.pdf	? C80216d-04_03.pdf
? C80216d-03_85.pdf	? C80216d-04_04.pdf
? C80216d-03_86.pdf	? C80216d-04_08.doc
? C80216d-03_87.pdf	? C80216d-04_08r2.pdf
? C80216d-03_88.pdf	? IEEE C80216d-03_86r1.pdf
? C80216d-03_89.pdf	? IEEE C80216d-03_87r1.pdf
? C80216d-03_90.pdf	? IEEE C80216d-03_84r2.pdf
? C80216d-03_91.pdf	? IEEE C80216d-03_84r4.pdf
? C80216d-03_92.pdf	? IEEE C80216d-03_84r5.doc
? C80216d-04_01.pdf	? IEEE C80216d-03_84r6.pdf
? C80216d-04_02.pdf	

Session #29 Schedule

All meetings are held in the Enchantment E & F.

Subject (number of sessions)	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday
TGd sessions (8)		8:00-12:00	8:00-12:00	
	15:45-18:00	13:15-18:00	13:30-18:00	15:00-17:00
	19:00-22:20	19:00-22:30		
802.16 WG Plenary (2)	13:00-15:25			17:00-21:10

Monday January 12, 2004

Session convened at 15:40 hr.

Commentary database 80216-03_51r7 formed the basis for comment resolution for recirculation Ballot #13a.

Minutes of session #28 were reviewed and approved by unan

Review of Comments; 802.16-03/51r7

- Comment 490; definition if the term 'user' needs clarification. Vladimir and Carl to develop text for definition of the term 'user'.
- Comment 499; Require updated figure for resolution. Yigal to provide a figure on Tuesday.

- c) Comment 504; Contribution IEEE C802.16d-03_86, Change in RNG-REQ Format, was presented as part of this comment. Resolution of this comment is deferred to allow Vladimir time to rework text and submit revision to contribution.
- d) Comment 512; Resolution of this comment deferred to allow Yigal and Barry to agree on the resolution.
- e) Comment 513; Resolution of this comment deferred to allow Barry to develop text.
- f) Comment 520; Resolution of this comment deferred to allow Bob to revise contribution C802.16d-04/04.
- g) Comment 523; Resolution of this comment deferred to get opinion on the use of 2-11GHz and <11GHz in the standard.
- h) Comment 520; Resolved. Contribution C802.16d-04/04r1 provided

Monday session recessed at 19:00 hr.

Tuesday January 13, 2004

Session convened at 8:00 hr.

Review of Comments; 80216-03_51r7

- a) Deferred comment 490; Text for term 'user' provided. Comment resolved.
- b) Comment 551; Deferred to allow Bob to locate all occurrences of text of interest and provide proposed text.
- c) Comment 557; No consensus. Carl Eklund calls the question. Vote required on calling the question
In favour of calling the question: 8, opposed 10; discussion continues. Still no consensus, vote required:
To accept as modified: 19, opposed: 1. Vote passes and comment is accepted-modified. Roger Eline to provide copy of presentation used in discussion.
- d) Comment 560; Deferred to afternoon session to allow further development of the resolution. Yossi, Rainer, Brian, and Ron to develop.
- e) Comment 560; Revised resolution provided. No consensus. Vote required:
Infavor of accepting the modified resolution: 13, opposed 0. Motion passes, comment is accepted-modified.
- f) Comment 566; Deferred to Tuesday pm due to originator not being present.
- g) Comment 562; Deferred to allow review of related comments.
- h) Comment 571; Deferred until all comments related to compressed MAPs are identified and ensure consistency in the resolutions across all PHY specifications.
- i) Comment 578; Deferred
- j) Comment 581; Deferred to allow David and Naftali to provide text.
- k) Comment 587; Deferred so similar/related comments can be discussed off-line and a coherent resolution provided.
- l) Comment 596; Deferred to confirm references.
- m) Comment 604 Deferred.
- n) Deferred comment 560; Contribution IEEE C802.16d-04/08r0 presented. No consensus. Vote required.
Those in favor to accept as modified: 13. Against 0. Vote passes, comment is accepted-modified.

Tuesday session recessed at 17:50 hr.

Session reconvened at 19:30 hr.

- a) Comment 609; Deferred to allow Yigal to see if this can be applied to OFDMA as well.
- b) Comment 610; Deferred to be discussed in conjunction with comment 615 and other related AAS issues.
- c) Deferred comment 609; Resolved. Accepted-modified.
- d) Comment 613; Contribution IEEE C802.16d-03/83r1, "Congestion control mechanism for interworking between WLAN and WMAN". No consensus. Vote to accept changes prescribed in C802.16d-03/83r1: Approve: 2 Disapprove: 15, vote fails, comment rejected. This is a technical binding comment.
- e) Comment 614; Chair feels this comment and related contributions are "out of scope" of this recirculation. The presenter, John Liebetreu, agrees to table resolution and defer this to Wednesday morning's session to allow TGd chair to consult with Working Group Chair.
- f) Comment 615; There are several related comments, on the topic of AAS in OFDMA, and these will be deferred for resolution on Wendes day am.

Session recessed at 22:20 hr

Wednesday January 14, 2004

Wednesday session convened at 8:00 hr.

Review of Comments; 80216-03_51r7

- a) Deferred comment 614; The Chair presents alternatives derived from discussion with WG Chair on the 'out of scope' ruling; a) Stay with the ruling and push for a vote at the TG level on the ruling, b) Withdraw the ruling, express the opinion of the TGd chair, and that the reasons for the ruling are still valid. Based on the options presented, John Liebetreu agrees to withdraw comment but informs the group that the concept is important to the success of the standard and that this should be further studied. The chair agrees with the opinion that the concept is important but it is not ready to be included; requires more work. Comment is withdrawn.
- b) Comment 524; Deferred to later since commenter is in TGe.
- c) Comment 615; Deferred.
- d) Comment 616; Deferred pending resolution of comment 571.
- e) Comment 623; Contribution C80216d -03_85 presented to the group. No consensus. Vote required. Those in favour to accept: 10, Opposed: 6. comment rejected.
- f) Deferred comment 499; Figure is provided and comment resolved.
- g) Deferred comment 504; Deferred again to later this morning.
- h) Deferred comment 523; Deferred to allow additional time to dicuss the issue of 2-11GHz or <11GHz.
- i) Deferred comment 571; Contribution IEEE C802.16d-03_84r2 presented to the group. Yossi feels this comment is out of scope of the PAR. Second by Zion. Vote put to the Task Group to decide whether this is within the scope of the PAR. Vote:
Those that feel the comment is within the scope of the PAR: 12, those that feel the comment is outside the scope of the PAR: 3. Majority deems the comment within the scope of the PAR. No consensus. Vote needed:
Vote to accept suggested comment remedy: 10, Opposed: 7. Comment rejected.
- j) Deferred comment 572; Rejected, since it relies on the acceptance of comment 571.
- k) Deferred comment 578; Resolved.
- l) Deferred comment 581; Deferred to Thursday pm session. Requires text from David Castelov.
- m) Deferred comment 584; Text provided and comment resolved.

- n) Deferred comment 587; Resolved.
- o) Deferred comment 596; Resolved.
- p) Deferred comment 604; Resolved.
- q) Deferred comment 610; No consensus. Carl calls the question. Vote required:
Those in favour of calling the question: 9 opposed 10. Fails, discussion continues.
Naftali / 2nd Ofer Kelman. Motion: To consider the two suggested changes separately (Changes listed starting on page 3, and changes listed starting on page 5): those in favour: 12, opposed: 7. Motion fails.
Yossi / 2nd by Zion. Motion to defer first part to Thursday session; those in favour: 2, opposed: 16. Motion fails.
Naftali / 2nd by Ofer. Motion: To implement changes starting on page 3 through 4: those in favour: 7, opposed: 16. Motion fails. First part rejected.
Naftali / 2nd by Ofer. Motion: To implement changes starting on page 5 through 6: those in favour: 7, opposed: 13. Motion fails. Second part rejected.
- r) Deferred comment 615; Resolved. Obtained approval from Tal Kaitz to change to “Technical (satisfied)”.
- s) Deferred comment 615; Resolved.
- t) Deferred comment 504; Resolved.
- u) Deferred comment 523; Resolved.

Wednesday session recessed at 18:20 hr.

Thursday January 15, 2004

Thursday session convened at 15:00 hr.

Review of Comments; 80216-03_51r7

- a) Deferred comment 559; resolved.
- b) Deferred comment 615; resolved.
- c) Deferred comment 581; resolved.
- d) Deferred comment 624; resolved.
- e) Late, late, late comment 660; resolved.
- f) Late, late, late comment 661; resolved.

This concluded the comment resolution part of the current Task Group d session.

DJ/ 2nd Yossi: Motion – to put forward the following motion to the working Group “To accept IEEE 802.16-03/51r9 as the resolutions of the Recirculation Ballot #13a comments and initiate a recirculation”
To accept the motion:26 To reject:0 Abstain:0. Motion passess

Discussed the possibility to forward the following motion to the Working Group: “To authorize a Task Group d Ballot Resolution Committee to resolve any resulting comments and conduct additional recirculations if necessary”.
Resolution of the task group was to defer this to the Working Group at the closing plenary of this session.

Gordon / 2nd Naftali – to put forward the following motion to the Working Group: “To request conditional approval from the 802 EC to forward the final balloted P802.16-REVD draft for Sponsor Ballot”.
To accept the moion:29, To reject: 0, Abstain:0. Motion passes.

Ofer / 2nd Bob – “To adjourn the Task Group d meeting for this session”.
Motion passes by unanimous voice vote.

Session recessed at 17:20 hr.