IEEE 802.17 RPR Working Group Meeting Minutes
Plenary Session, March 11-14, 2002
Sheraton City Center, St. Louis, MO

Reporter: BJ Lee, Mannix O'Connor, and Martin Green

Note: Attendance list is attached as an Appendix.
Note: All the presentations are available on the RPRWG Web:
http://www.ieee802.org/17/documents/presentations/mar2002/index.htm

----
March 11, Monday

1:00pm: Seating, Everyone
1:05pm: Welcome Slide, Mike Takefman

 - Mike introduced administrative rules and procedures, including the
   section and technical editors, and goals of the meeting and future
   meeting plans.

 Q: Has T1X1.5 liaison letter regarding GFP been ratified by the working
    group yet?
 A: Will verify with George Young who was responsible for the liaison.

 - May 6-9, Interim in Ottawa, Crown Plaza Hotel, sponsored by Cisco
 - Mannix O'connor will be stepping down as the secretary, and another
   volunteer is needed.
 - Server Address for the download is 192.168.0.3
 - Goals of this meeting:

        o Presentations
        o Vote to confirm the motions made in January 2002 Interim
        o Comment resolutions
        o Meeting with 802.1

1:33pm: Approval of Agenda, Mike Takefman
 - Approved without objections

1:35pm: Approval of Meeting minutes of November 2001 and January 2002
 - Approved without objections

1:37pm: **P802.17 Draft and Comment Status, Tom Alexander, Chief Editor**

 - Tom goes over the status of Draft 0.1 and submitted comments, future
   plans, and the draft creation process
 - A brief description of a proposed layer diagram for the draft D1.0
   is presented. This proposal will be voted on later in the session.
 - Goals of this March meeting:
        o Ratify January Task Force decisions to adopt proposals for
           D0.1 clauses
        o Resolve comments on D0.1

o　Produce instructions for generation D1.0 from D0.1

Q – What if the commenter cannot be in the section comment review
　　meeting?
A – Commenter should arrange alternatives with the section editor as
　　best as he/she can.

2:30pm: **Requests for Voting Rights and Membership, Mike Takefman**

 - Mike goes through the present attendance list to confirm the
　　requests for the voting and membership rights.
　　 - 33 new members have been identified

2:40pm: **Presentation - Topology Discovery Proposal, John Lemon**

 - Gave a presentation on the proposed draft clause text,
　　clause10_topology_jl.pdf

 Q: Why the broadcast needs to be periodic and not by hop-by-hop?
 A: To avoid processing overhead at each station, including delays.
 Q: Topology discovery and protection are two separate protocols for
　　 different purposes. As a result, combining two is not a good idea?
 A: The proposed text itself does not explicit mention such mandate.
　　 It is one of the contentious discussion items.
 Q: Have you considered the cases where there are failure conditions
　　 under topology broadcast?
 A: Yes, for example, TTL is not decremented under the wrap condition.
 Q: Why is the "back off" necessary?
 Q: Why is "wrapping" needed in addition to "steering?"

3:05pm: Chair and Vice Chair Election, Mike Takefman

```
Motion 2002-03-11-01 (Time 3:05pm)

To affirm Bob Love as Vice Chair of 802.17

     M: Jim Mollenaur
     S: Khaled Amer

Passed by Acclamation.
```

```
Motion 2002-03-11-02 (Time 3:08pm)

To affirm Mike Takefman as Chair of 802.17

     M: Steve Wood
     S: Yong Kim

Passed by Acclamation.
```

3:10pm: Break

3:30pm: **Presentation – Critical Review of All MAC Proposals, Harmen Van As, Vienna University of Technology**

 - Presented an analysis of all the existing MAC protocols, pointing out that proper performance evaluations for informed decision has yet to be done.

4:10pm: **Presentation – Cyclic Demand Advertisement Boosts RPR MAC Performance, Jon Schuringa, Vienna University of Technology**

 - Presented simulation results of the cyclic demand reservation MAC algorithm.

4:30pm: **Presentation – Achieving High Performance with Darwin's Fairness Algorithm, Ed Knightly, Rice University**

 - Presented a reference model (RIAS – Ring Ingress Aggregated with Spatial reuse) for MAC fairness algorithm benchmarking, and also proposed that the fairness algorithm feedback be made general for any enhancement algorithm to be also compliant. Similar example for such liberal compliance is ATM ABR where both the explicit rate and FECN/BECN algorithms are considered compliant.

Comment: The performance result showing throughput oscillation is that of Gandalf, not of Darwin.
A: Yes, correct. We do not have a complete Darwin model yet.
Q: Have you thought about the interoperability issue between different MAC fairness algorithms, if you allow more general feedback specification?
A: It needs more investigation, of course.
Q: How could you accurately estimate the dynamic input rates with or without smoothing?
A: It turned out that within link delay of 0.1ms, no smoothing was necessary.

5:20pm: **Presentation – Performance Comparison of MAC Proposals, Jon Schuringa, Vienna University of Technology**

 - Presented performance results comparing various MAC fairness proposals.

5:40pm: **Presentation – Proposal for Alternate Text for Clause 7, Rhett Brikovskis**

 - Briefly mentioned that there is a proposed alternative text for clause 7 (took 2 minutes without a slideware!)

5:42pm: **Presentation – Setting Bandwidth Allocations, David James, Cypress**

 - Presented a discussion on bandwidth allocation issues.

6:00pm: RPRWG Adjourns for the day.

March 12, Tuesday

8:00am: Seating, Everyone
8:05: Agenda Scrub, Mike Takefman

8:10am: **Presentation – Developing State Machines for 802.17, Anoop Ghanwani, Lantern Communications**

8:40am: **Presentation – Time of Day Synchronization, David James, Cypress**

- Presented a proposal to use the time of day information for clock synchronization.

9:10am: **Presentation – 802.17 MAC and Station Identification Analysis, Marc Holness, Nortel**

- Presented an observational analysis of using station ID for bandwidth efficient bridging, and proposed not to support the station ID in the 802.17 MAC, or to support in the MAC client only.

10:00am: Break

10:40am: **Requests for Voting Rights and Membership, Mike Takefman**

- Mike goes through the present attendance list to confirm the requests for the voting and membership rights again.

10:45am: **Motions Approving Task Force Motions Passed During January Interim Meeting, Mike Takefman and Bob Love**

- All motions with voting results are also captured in a separate document:
  http://www.ieee802.org/17/documents/presentations/mar2002/index.htm

- A blanket motion is made as follows not to go through all the motions separately.

```
Motion 2002-03-12-01 (Time 10:50am)

Move that Draft 0.1 be accepted by the RPR 802.17 Working Group as the
base document for development of the 802.17 standard.  (Technical)

     M: R. Love
     S: Necdet Uzun
```

```
Yes: 47      No: 32      Abstain: 1
Motion Failed.
```

11:00am: Roll-call vote is requested on the motion 2002-03-12-01 by
        Harry Peng.

        Yes: 52   No: 32   Abstain: 1
        Motion still failed.

 - Refer to the motions document for the voting result of each of
    January motions.
 - All January motions up to "motion 29" are passed without objection.
 - Some comments on January Motion 30 regarding MAC data path and Media
    Access Control:

        o Description in the current draft D0.1 contains
           implementation details – also captured in the comment #118
        o If there is no alternative text for this section, this
           section should be kept and issues to be resolved through
           comment resolution process.
        o Process issue: Comment resolution process is only to resolve
           the comments regarding the current MAC clause in the draft
           D0.1. As a result, if this motion is not passed, other
           proposals for this clause cannot be accepted through the
           comment resolution process.

    Roll-call vote is counted on the January Motion #30, and the motion
    is failed.
        Yes: 51   No: 34   Abstain: 4

 - Some comments on January Motion 36 regarding the MAC fairness
        o Performance of Darwin fairness algorithm has not been fully
           addressed yet.

    January Motion #36 Passed.
    Yes: 41   No: 2   Abstain: 29

    Roll-call vote is counted on Motion 36, and the motion passed
    without change in vote counts.
 - Motion 42 is passed without objection.

Comment from the chief editor – Since the motion 30 failed, there are no
    clauses 6 and 11 against which the motion resolutions would take
    place. In other words, all the comments on clauses 6 and 11 are
    not valid.

Announcement: Bridging Ad Hoc group will meet at 6:00 – 7:00pm.

12:05pm: Lunch Break with some work continued

```
Motion 2002-03-12-02 (Time 12:35pm)
```

```
Move to continue work on comment resolution for comments received on
unapproved text currently present in Clause 6 of P802.17, to result in a
proposal to be placed before the group on Thursday March 14th 2002 for
Clause 6 of P802.17 D1.0. (Procedural)

     M: Tom Alexander
     S: Bob Love

Yes: 61    No: 1       Abstain: 2
Motion Passed.
```

12:50: Break before the parallel comment resolution sessions.

1:30 – 6:00pm: Parallel Comment Resolution Sessions.

6:00pm: RPRWG adjourns for the day

March 13, Wednesday

8:00am – 5:30pm: Parallel Comment Resolution Sessions all day.

5:30pm: RPRWG adjourns for the day

March 14, Thursday

8:00am – 10:00am: Comment Resolution Sessions Continues.

10:30am: Seating and Agenda Scrub, Mike Takefman

 - RPRWG common session resumes

10:40am: Editors Report and Motions, Tom Alexander

 - Tom presented a progress report on previous comment resolution
   sessions, and proceeded resolving the remaining and outstanding
   comments for the final acceptance for the Draft 1.0.
      (Refer to Tom's slide for details.)

 - Each section editors detailed the comments resolved/unresolved as
   follows.

 11:00am: Comment Resolution Report on Section F, Marc Holness

```
Motion 2002-03-14-01 (Time 11:05am)

Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on Section 7, as resolved by
comment resolution ad-hoc including requests for contributions and
requests to form ad-hoc groups as necessary. (Technical)

      M: Marc Holness
      S: Bob Love

Y: 999      N: 0  Abstain: 0
Motion Passed by acclamation.
```

 - Mike briefed on a hallway discussion with 802.1 group on potential
    issues of transparent bridging in interactions with 802.17 ring
    selection, protection steering, and wrapping, etc.

11:10am: Comment Resolution Report on Section 3, Rhett Brikovskis

```
Motion 2002-03-14-02 (Time 11:38am)

Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on Section 3 (PHY), as
resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc including editorial license
granted, requests for contributions and requests to form ad-hoc groups
as necessary. (Technical)

      M: Rhett Brikovskis
      S: Bob Love

Y: 999      N: 0  Abstain: 0
Motion Passed by acclamation.
```

11:40am: Comment Resolution Report on Section 1 (Introduction), Bob
         Sultan

```
Motion 2002-03-14-03 (Time 11:58am)

Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on Section 1 (Introduction),
as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc including editorial license
granted, requests for contributions and requests to form ad-hoc groups
as necessary. (Technical)

      M: Bob Sultan
```

```
     S: David James

Y: 999      N: 0  Abstain: 0
Motion Passed by acclamation.
```

12:10pm: Administrative Motions, Mike Takefman

  - RPRWG authorizes the response letter to be sent to the ETSI DTM
    Project liaison letter received in November 2001
  - Mike presented a liaison request letter from ITU-T SG17 on "Request
    for Comments on draft Recommendation on Multiple Services Ring."
    The ITU draft recommendation X.msr is available on the RPRWG web.
  - RPRWG officially authorizes the response letter to T1X1.5 GFP group
    composed back in September 2001 Interim meeting.

12:40pm: Comment Resolution Report on Transit Buffer ad-hoc, David James

1:00pm: Comment Resolution Report on OAM&P- Clauses 12/13/E, Glenn
        Parsons

```
Motion 2002-03-14-04  (Time 1:35pm)

Move to adopt all remaining resolutions to comments on Sect 6 (OAM and
Mgmt) as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc, including editorial
license, requests for contributions and requests to form ad-hoc groups
as necessary. (Technical)

     M:  Glenn Parsons
     S: Peter Jones

Y: 999      N: 0  Abstain: 0
Motion Passed by acclamation.
```

1:40 pm: Comment Resolution Report on Topology/Protection Comment
Resolution Summary – Clause 11, Jason Fan

```
Motion 2002-03-14-05 (Time 2:30 pm)

Move to adopt all remaining resolutions to comments on Sect 5 (OAM and
Mgmt) as resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc, including editorial
```

```
license, requests for contributions and requests to form ad-hoc groups
as necessary. (Technical)

      M:  Jason Fan
      S: John Lemon
Y: 999     N: 0  Abstain: 0


Motion Passed by acclamation.
```

2:45: Break

2:55 pm: Comment Resolution Report on Fairness Comment Resolution
Summary – Clause , Anoop Ghanwani.

```
Motion 2002-03-14-06 (Time 3:25 pm)

Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on Sect 4 (Fairness) as
resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc and not forwarded to the WG,
including editorial license, requests for contributions and requests to
form ad-hoc groups as necessary. (Technical)

      M:  Necdet Uzun
      S: Jim Mollenauer
Y: 999     N: 0  Abstain: 0


Motion Passed by acclamation.
```

4:30pm: Editor's Report and Motions, Tom Alexander

```
Motion 2002-03-14-07 (Time 4:45 pm)

Move that the Chief Editor be given license to resolve and deal with the
global Section 0) Editorial comments. (Technical)
      M:  Tom Alexander
      S: Jim Mollenauer
Y: 999     N: 0  Abstain: 0
Motion Passed by acclamation.
```

```
Motion 2002-03-14-08 (Time 4:47 pm)

Move that the C code annex editor be given editorial license to resolve
the editorial comments against the C code annex and to update the C code
annex to conform with the changes adopted for the other clauses.
(Technical)

      M:  Tom Alexander
      S: Necdet Uzun
Y: 999     N: 0  Abstain: 0
```

```
Motion Passed by acclamation
```

```
Motion 2002-03-14-09(Time 4:50 pm)

Move to authorize Chief Editor and Editors to create D0.2 based on D0.1
and the instructions contained within those comment resolutions that
have been formally adopted by the WG.

      M: Nader Vijeh
      S: Bob Love
Y: 999      N: 0   Abstain: 0

Motion Passed by acclamation
```

```
Motion 2002-03-14-10 (Time 4:55 pm)

Move to authorize chief editors to continue work on comments for Clause
6 (MAC Datapath) that were resolved and accepted by the Section 2
comment resolution ad-hoc group, with a view to presenting an updated
proposal for this clause at the May 2002 meeting. The proposed text will
be posted to the web site at least 1 week before the close of the
comment submission period as a separate document from D0.2.

      M: Raj Sharma
      S: Jim Mollenauer
Y: 999      N: 0   Abstain: 0

Motion Passed by acclamation.
```

```
Motion 2002-03-14-11 (Time 5:09 pm)

Move Request the SEC to reconfirm Mike Takefman as Chair of the IEEE
802.17 Working Group. The working group motion to reconfirm him was
approved unanimously.

      M: Mike Takefman
      S: Tom Alexander
Y: 999      N: 0   Abstain: 0

Motion Passed by acclamation.
```

```
Motion 2002-03-14-12 (Time 5:11 pm)

Move Request the SEC to reconfirm Bob Love as Vice-Chair of the IEEE
802.17 Working Group. The working group motion to reconfirm him was
approved unanimously.

      M:  Mike Takefman
```

```
        S: Tom Alexander
Y: 999       N: 0   Abstain: 0


Motion Passed by acclamation.
```

5:17 pm: Comment Resolution Report on MAC Comment Resolution Summary –
Clauses 5,6. Jim Mollenhauer.

```
Motion 2002-03-14-13 (Time 3:25 pm)

Move to adopt all resolutions to comments on Sect 4 (Fairness) as
resolved by comment resolution ad-hoc and not forwarded to the WG,
including editorial license, requests for contributions and requests to
form ad-hoc groups as necessary. (Technical)

      M: Necdet Uzun
      S: Jim Mollenauer
Y: 999       N: 0   Abstain: 0

Motion Passed by acclamation.
```

```
Motion 2002-03-14-14 (Time 5:47 pm)

Move to adopt all remaining resolutions to comments on WG-approved text
for Section 2(presently consisting of Clause 5, Mac Reference Model, and
Clause 8, Frame Formats) as unanimously resolve by comment resolution
ad-hoc, including editorial license, requests for contributions and
requests to form ad-hoc groups as necessary. (Technical)

      M:  Jim Mollenauer
      S: Lauren Schlicht
Y: 999       N: 0   Abstain: 0

Motion Passed by acclamation.
```

```
Motion 2002-03-14-15 (Time 5:54 pm)

Move to grant the editors license to resolve and implement all editorial
commeonts on Section 2(presently consisting of Clause 5, Mac Reference
Model, and Clause 8, Frame Formats) (Technical)

      M:  Raj Sharma
      S: Bob Love
Y: 999       N: 0   Abstain: 0
```

Motion Passed by acclamation.

5:57PM : Adjourned.

6:00pm: End of March 2002 Plenary Meeting.

Appendix: Attendance List (Total: 123)

#	(Attendees)	
1	Jai P.	Agrawal
2	Saleh	Al-Araji
3	Thomas	Alexander
4	Nigel	Alvares
5	Khaled	Amer
6	Siamack	Ayandeh
7	Vinay	Bannai
8	Constantinos	Bassias
9	Med	Belhadj
10	Prasenjit Biswas	
11	Mark	Bordogna
12	Richard	Brand
13	Rhett	Brikovskis
14	Andrew	Brown
15	Leon	Bruckman
16	Collier	Buffingtion
17	Italo	Busi
18	Robert	Castellano
19	James	Chan

#	(Attendees)	
20	Babu	Chilukuri
21	Prminder	Chohan
22	Joseph	Cordero
23	John	Coulter
24	William	Dai
25	Spencer	Dawkins
26	Nick	Edwards
27	Igor	Erceg
28	Jason	Fan
29	Amin M.	Farvez
30	Chris	Garner
31	Anoop	Ghanwani
32	Stein	Gjessing
33	Martin	Green
34	Vicki	Griffiths
35	Samuel	Hall
36	Richard	Harvey
37	Asif	Hazarika
38	Tricia	Hill
39	Shawn	Holiday
40	Marc	Holness
41	Russ	Homer
42	Bob	Hott
43	Chunhua	Hu
44	Chang	Huang
45	Wai-Chau	Hui
46	Hiwshi	Iwamitsu
47	Raj	Jain
48	David	James
49	Yeonkwon	Jeong
50	Pankaj	Jha
51	Peter	Jones
52	Fumikazu	Kanenhara
53	Jim	Kao
54	Vasan	Karighattam
55	Michael	Kelsen
56	Yongbum	Kim
57	Ed	Knightly
58	Paritosh	Kulkarni

#	(Attendees)	
59	Kenneth	Lancaster
60	Byoung-Joon(BJ)	Lee
61	Kangbok	Lee
62	John	Lemon
63	Jeremy	Lin
64	Lai-Chin	Lo
65	Robert D.	Love
66	James	Markevitch
67	Vittorio	Mascolo
68	Takashi	Matsuoka
69	Derek	Mayweather
70	Dave	Meyer
71	Li	Mo
72	Jim	Mollenauer
73	David	Moore
74	Gal	Mor
75	Ajit	Ninan
76	Mannix	O'Connor
77	Fredrick	Olsson
78	Gary	O'Neal
79	Fredrik	Orava
80	Joerg	Ottensmeyer
81	Ken	Owens
82	Glenn	Parsons
83	Chip	Paryzek
84	Diane	Patton
85	Harry	Peng
86	Stevan	Plote
87	Tim	Plunkett
88	Paul	Quesenberry
89	Lars	Ramfelt
90	Komal	Rathi
91	Mike	Reynolds
92	Gady	Rosenfeld
93	Luis	Rovira
94	Nirmal	Saxena
95	Lauren	Schlicht
96	Jon	Schuringa
97	Raj	Sharma

#	(Attendees)	
98	Jae Cheol	Son
99	Donald	Sorenson
100	Bob	Sultan
101	Jun	Takagi
102	Michael	Takefman
103	Frederic	Thepot
104	Ali	Tohidi
105	Gary	Turner
106	Necdet	Uzun
107	Harmen R.	Van As
108	Kanaiya	Vasani
109	Nader	Vasseghi
110	Link	Verstegen
111	Nader	Vijeh
112	Stephan	Vogt
113	Peter	Wolff
114	Steven	Wood
115	Donghui	Xie
116	Steven	Yang
117	Yiming	Yao
118	Mete	Yilmaz
119	Pinar	Yilmaz
120	Jin	Yu
121	Hui	Zhang
122	Yongdong	Zhao
123	Daniel	Zhu

---------------------- End of Attendance List ----------------------