Cl **01**　　*SC*　　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　# **41**

disak Mekkittikul　　　　　　　9/5/01 0:00:00

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**

] Should remove SRP definitition, it's

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the item

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**　　*SC*　　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　# **51**

James Chan　　　　　　　Riverstone Networks

Comment Type **TR**　　*Comment Status* **D**

TBD items

SuggestedRemedy

Remove TBD items

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Each term whose definition is TBD shall be either (1)removed or (2)supplied with an appropriate definition.

Cl **01**　　*SC* **01.**　　　*P* **12**　　*L* **318**　　# **214**

Carey Kloss　　　　　　　Cisco Systems

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **D**

"Specific station" is misleading, as some fairness algorithms send messages without knowing the specific sources of congestion.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the text from the definition, resulting in: "The sending of a control frame to stop or slow the flow of data traffic"

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "To regulate the transmission rate of a station".

Cl **01**　　*SC* **01.0**　　　*P* **0**　　　*L* **0**　　# **196**

Robert Castellano　　　　　　　Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **D**

Add term/definition for "MAC Relay" as defined in IEEE 802.1D and very applicable to 802.17 reference model.

SuggestedRemedy

Add definition "The MAC Relay Entity handles the MAC method independent functions of relaying frames between Bridge Ports, filtering frames, and learning filtering information. It uses the Internal Sublayer Service provided by the separate MAC Entities for each Port. (The Internal Sublayer Service and its support are described in 6.4 and 6.5.) Frames are relayed between Ports attached to different LANs."

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Keep first and last sentences of the proposed definition.

Cl **01**　　*SC* **01.0**　　　*P* **0**　　　*L* **0**　　# **197**

Robert Castellano　　　　　　　Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **D**

Add term/definition for header

SuggestedRemedy

Add definition "Control information which precedes the data payload portion of the frame, which is used to deliver the frame across the network. The information in the header is typically processed by the MAC sublayer such as addressing information, but may also carry other information which is processed by control functions in the MAC client."

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. The term "header" is common usage. No definition required.

Cl **01**　　*SC* **01.0**　　　*P* **0**　　　*L* **0**　　# **198**

Robert Castellano　　　　　　　Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **D**

Add term/definition for payload

SuggestedRemedy

Add definition "The informational content of a frame passed between the client and MAC sublayers for delivery across a network. The payload is typically not processed by the MAC sublayer with perhaps the exception of performing an integrity check of the payload. The informational content may either be user data from the end station or control information which is processed by the MAC sublayer."

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. The term "payload" is common usage. No definition required.

Cl **01**	*SC* **01.0**	*P* **0**	*L* **0**	**#**	**199**

Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

Add term/definition for trailer

SuggestedRemedy

Add definition "Control information which follows the payload portion of the frame, which is used to deliver the frame across the network. The trailer typically consists of a frame checksum and any padding that is required. Elements of the trailer may either be processed in the MAC sublayer, the client or both."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. The term "trailer" is common usage. No definition required.

Cl **01**	*SC* **01.0**	*P* **6**	*L* **157**	**#**	**216**

Mete YILMAZ   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**

Latency is also defined to be synonymous with delay but delay is not defined before.

SuggestedRemedy

Add a delay definition to the document.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. Remove second sentence of definition. Add the following definition of the term 'delay': "Synonym for latency."

Cl **01**	*SC* **01.00**	*P* **0**	*L* **0**	**#**	**72**

Harmen R. van As   Vienna University of T

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**

Document contains terms and definitions which are still to be determined. How to handle this in the voting?

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPAL. See #51.

Cl **01**	*SC* **01.00**	*P* **0**	*L* **0**	**#**	**96**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **D**

The Terms and Definitions is a subset of the complete standard, and cannot be fully reviewed out of the context of the complete document. I have reviewed and commented against this clause, but cannot vote to approve without seeing the remainder of the document.

SuggestedRemedy

Include this clause as part of a complete draft and re-distribute for ballot and comments.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**	*SC* **01.00**	*P* **0**	*L* **0**	**#**	**97**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Definitions are inconsistent with respect to use of "byte" and "octet".

SuggestedRemedy

Pick one term and perform global search and replace as appropriate.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. Replace 'octet' with 'byte' in all instances.

Cl **01**	*SC* **01.00**	*P* **0**	*L* **0**	**#**	**98**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**

Header indicates "TA Document". Footer indicates this is a "TA specification", and some pages even reference "1394 Trade Association". This is a draft IEEE document, not a TA document. Copyright on some pages is 2000, others is 2001.

SuggestedRemedy

Correct errors.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.00**   *P* **0**   *L* **0**   **#** **174**

Nader Vasseghi   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **D**

There are a lot of sub-clauses with TBD. I can not approve with so many open issues

SuggestedRemedy

Please populate the sub-clauses

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPAL. See #51.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.00**   *P*   *L*   **#** **1010**

David V. James   Cypress

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

I thought a run-in header was IEEE style.

SuggestedRemedy

Use a run-in header on definition numbering.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.1**   *P* **1**   *L* **11**   **#** **99**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

This definition is misleading, since there is no IEEE Std 802.17 (yet). Also, this definition is unnecessary. The document _IS_ IEEE802.17. Any references to itself should identify "this standard" or "this document".

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the definition.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. (also remove '802.17' from acronym list)

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.104**   *P* **8**   *L* **214**   **#** **219**

Mete YILMAZ   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

unnecessary wording.

SuggestedRemedy

"A frame to which medium dependent fields are added." is comparably better.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Comment apparently refers to 1.108 'packet', which will be changed to "A frame to which medium dependent fields have been added."

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.105**   *P* **8**   *L* **217**   **#** **65**

Donghui Xie   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **D**

Network is not only L2 bridged.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "a bridged" to "an interconnected" .

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #167.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.105**   *P* **8**   *L* **217**   **#** **87**

Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

RAN is not a widely understood concept.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "RAN," in this sublclause and elsewhere.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.105**   *P* **8**   *L* **217**   **#** **167**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **D**

the word bridged is not a sufficiently wide definition and limits the term to L2 networks.

SuggestedRemedy

change bridged to interconnected

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. The word 'bridged' will be removed since 'network' refers to a 'LAN, MAN, etc.' which may or may not be interconnected.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.107**   *P* **8**   *L* **220**   **#** **233**

Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

Is outbound the same direction as ingress?

SuggestedRemedy

If the same, say so, otherwise clarify.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. Add the sentence: "Outbound frames travel in the 'egress' direction.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.108**   *P* **8**   *L* **221**   **# 50**
Bruce B. Johnson   Excite@Home

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**
This precludes "IP packets." Remove term.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED REJECT. The IEEE 802 committee defines 'packet' to have a meaning different from its common usage as an L3 PDU. See the IEEE dictionary

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.11**   *P* **1**   *L* **29**   **# 201**
Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**
The current usage of the term "network" and its associated definition is inaccurate in applying to broadcast address for 802.17 if the 802.17 standard defines these as locally scoped to an 802.17 ring. A more accurate description for 802.17 is to use "802.17 ring" or "802.17 network" in place of "network". Note, 802.17 was used in definitions for source/destination stations.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace "network" with "802.l7 network"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Insert 'ring or' before 'network'.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.111**   *P* **8**   *L* **224**   **# 131**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
The definition states that a partitioned ring is associated with failures. However, the definition for "virtual medium" refers to "logical partitions", that presumably do not imply ring failures. "Partitions" should not be limited to ring failures.

SuggestedRemedy
Change definition to "A ring having two or more non-communicating sets of stations."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "A ring that is disconnected at two or more points due to administrative action or to failure."

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.112**   *P* **8**   *L*   **# 16**
Jim Kao   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Included existed widely used term.

SuggestedRemedy
Create another equivalent term "transit buffer delay"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED REJECT. The T&D committee voted for 'passthru' instead of 'transit'. (i.e. The correct term is 'passthru buffer delay'.)

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.113**   *P* **8**   *L*   **# 17**
Jim Kao   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Included widely used terms.

SuggestedRemedy
Create another equivalent term "transit delay"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED REJECT. See #16

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.114**   *P* **9**   *L*   **# 18**
Jim Kao   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Included widely used terms.

SuggestedRemedy
Create another equivalent term "transit queuing"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED REJECT. See #16

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.114**   *P* **9**   *L* **228**   **# 66**
Donghui Xie   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**
DISAPPROVE When passthru traffic is queued, any station traffic regardless of its priority should be allowed to insert. Network is not only L2 bridged.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "traffic of higher priority" to "station traffic" .

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Omit 'of higher priority'. (assume the phrase "Network is only L2 bridged" is a typo).

Cl **01**	*SC* **01.114**	*P* **9**	*L* **229**	# **95**

Kumar Kovvali   Coriolis Networks

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

passthru queuing: The text "insertion traffic of higher priority", defines a service policy and may have effect on fairness within a priority class. The policy definition may be specified as part of the .17 specification, and is not needed in Terms And Definitions.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "insertion of traffic of higher priority", to, "insertion of traffic".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT

Cl **01**	*SC* **01.114**	*P* **9**	*L* **229**	# **168**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

The definition is incorrect since it does not include an SRP style of packet scheduling mechanism. The term higher priority is not correct.

SuggestedRemedy

Change insertion of traffic to insertion of station traffic Remove "higher priority"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #66

Cl **01**	*SC* **01.115**	*P* **9**	*L*	# **19**

Jim Kao   Cisco

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Included widely used terms.

SuggestedRemedy

Create another equivalent term "transit"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. See #16

Cl **01**	*SC* **01.115**	*P* **9**	*L* **230**	# **132**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

The definition states that passthru is a frame passing through a station "via the ring". However, the ring is a "collection of stations and links". Hence the definitions states that passthru is a frame passing through a station via a collection of stations and links. Is this what was intended?

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "via the ring".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change definition to "The act of receiving a frame inbound on a ringlet and retransmitting that frame outbound on a ringlet." The definition proposed in the comment is incorrect as it includes traffic to and from the local MAC client.

Cl **01**	*SC* **01.118**	*P* **9**	*L* **235**	# **234**

Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

"Denotes" isn't the right word.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "denotes" to "describes".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Omit 'denotes' but do not replace with 'describes'. Make same change to secion 1.124.

Cl **01**	*SC* **01.119**	*P* **9**	*L* **238**	# **88**

Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Signals are generally physical events. Better to refer to the information that comes down from higher layers as data.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "conditioning signals received" to "formatting data received"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change second sentence to "Supports the exchange of data between the physical medium and the MAC layer".

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 5 of 36

RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written   C/closed   U/unsatisfied   Z/withdrawn   *Cl* **01**   *SC* **01.119**

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.119**   *P* **9**   *L* **237**   # **133**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

The definition refers to "the layer". Layer of what?

SuggestedRemedy

Change "the layer" to "the OSI reference model layer".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change 'layer' to 'protocol layer'. Also clarify layers in question by inserting "the MAC layer" between 'interfacing' and 'with'.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.119**   *P* **9**   *L* **2,3**   # **194**

Timothy R. Plunkett   NSWCDD (Navy)

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

The terms "conditioning signals" and "processing signals" are not defined.

SuggestedRemedy

These definitions should be added to document.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Omit second sentence.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.12**   *P* **2**   *L* **31**   # **202**

Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

In the context of 802.17, more descriptive to say "sending a frame addressed to all stations on an 802.17 network".

SuggestedRemedy

add "on an 802.17 network" after "all stations".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Insert 'ring or' before 'network'. See #201

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.120**   *P* **9**   *L*   # **2**

Andrew Brown   Cisco

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

clarification

SuggestedRemedy

change to read ...may be needed for physical connection to the ring...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.120**   *P* **9**   *L* **240**   # **134**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

I believe "Plug-and-Play" is an ISA bus standard, and could be trademarked (didn't check this). Does RPR really want to use this nomenclature as a formal definition?

SuggestedRemedy

Change to an alternate name (no suggestions).

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Term is not trademarked.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.120**   *P* **9**   *L* **240**   # **135**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

The definition isn't clear on what "may be needed for connection to the ring."

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "may be needed for connection to the ring." with "may be needed for physical connection to the ring."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.120**   *P* **9**   *L* **240**   # **235**

Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

I think the last sentence is inappropriate. With it, the definition of P&P is just that a station can be added without disrupting the ring; it doesn't have to do anything useful. I don't think that is what users want.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "... may additionally copy and insert frames" to " ... is also able to copy and insert frames."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Current definition was the intended meaning of 'plug and play' when discussed during the specification of objectives.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 6 of 36

RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *Cl* **01**   *SC* **01.120**

Cl **01** *SC* **01.121** *P* **9** *L* **243** # **40**
Robert D. Love   LAN Connect Consulta

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**
 Definition 2 is not relevant to 802.17

SuggestedRemedy
 Drop Definition 2

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT

Cl **01** *SC* **01.121** *P* **9** *L* **244** # **136**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**
 What is the distinction between "data station" (used in definition) and "station" (defined in this document)?

SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "data".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT

Cl **01** *SC* **01.121** *P* **9** *L* **243** # **236**
Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **X**
 The use of ingress and inbound conflicts with their definitions. Ingress has been defined as towards the ring. Inbound has been defined as from the ring. It might be better to use different words. Where are the ports? Only the ring interfaces? Or also on the client side?

SuggestedRemedy
 Clarify the location of ports then choose appropriate words.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. The definition of 'port' is simplified to: "The point of attachment of a ringlet to a station." The definition of ingress is changed so that an inbound frame arrives at a station in the ingress direction.

Cl **01** *SC* **01.124** *P* **9** *L* **250** # **89**
Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**
 I believe this should refer to the lower layer. The MAC is protocol-agnostic if it can run with any of a number of lower layers; this is not a common feature of layered protocols. In general any protocol layer is independent of the upper layers: its services can be invoked by any upper layer without its knowledge of what that upper layer is.

SuggestedRemedy
 Replace "upper" with "lower"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED REJECT. Clarify definition with improved wording: "The property of a layer that it is independent of the client type of that layer"

Cl **01** *SC* **01.13** *P* **2** *L* **32** # **57**
David V. James   Cypress

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**
 Buffer insertion ring definition is to specific.

SuggestedRemedy
 Replace with "An access technique for ring media that buffers passthru traffic for delayed retransmission when transmission of another frame is in progress."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #67

Cl **01** *SC* **01.13** *P* **2** *L* **32** # **67**
Harmen R. van As   Vienna University of T

Comment Type **TR** *Comment Status* **X**
 Ring media with an access technique that gives ....

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Remove this term and, instead, describe in the standard the access method to be used by RPR.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.130**   *P* **10**   *L*   # **3**
Andrew Brown   Cisco

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
clarification

SuggestedRemedy
change to ..traffic rate measured in bytes ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change definition to: "Limitation of incoming traffic over a specified time interval."

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.130**   *P* **10**   *L* **262**   # **137**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
Definition refers to "data rate" in "bytes". Rate should be in bits per second or bytes per second.

SuggestedRemedy
Change to "bits per second" or other data rate.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #3

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.132**   *P* **10**   *L* **266**   # **237**
Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
The sentence fragment after the dash doesn't fit.

SuggestedRemedy
Clarify the relation of PLS to RS or delete the fragment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change definition to "A sublayer of the PHY layer responsible for mediation of signals between the physical medium dependent sublayer of the PHY layer and the MAC layer."

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.135**   *P* **10**   *L*   # **4**
Andrew Brown   Cisco

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

SuggestedRemedy
add WAN

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.135**   *P* **10**   *L* **272**   # **94**
Kumar Kovvali   Coriolis Networks

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**
definition of RPR - "A connectionless ring-based MAC protocol", restricts to "Connectionless" only. This is a MAC protocol issue that might restrict to connectionless only. However at the definitions level, no reason to restrict to connectionless only.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "A connectionless ring-based MAC protocol", to, "A ring-based MAC protocol".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED REJECT. RPR can be characterized as a 'connectionless' MAC.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.135**   *P* **10**   *L* **273**   # **169**
Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**
The term WAN is missing and RAN should be changed to WAN/RAN

SuggestedRemedy
LAN, MAN, WAN/RAN instead of LAN, MAN, RAN

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Omit RAN

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.135**   *P* **10**   *L* **272**   # **238**
Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
Aren't two congruent ringlets required for resiliency?

SuggestedRemedy
Add something to explain the resilient part of the name.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT. Add at end of (1) "and providing resilience in the face of a single station or medium failure".

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.14**   *P* **372**   *L*   # **151**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
IEEE Std 802.17 does not exist yet. Prior to approval, it will be referenced as a draft standard, and/or "P802.17". This doesn't seem like a necessary or appropriate abbreviation or acronym.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete the acronym.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.140**   *P* **10**   *L* **280**   **#** 138
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
Definition states that topology is the logical "and/or" physical arrangement of stations on a ring. In RPR context, physical arrangement has no significance for topology.

SuggestedRemedy
Change definition to "The logical and/or physical connection of stations on a ring."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED REJECT. IEEE 802 definition not incorrect.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.145**   *P* **11**   *L* **290**   **#** 90
Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
We need to be more specific here.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "entities" to "layers or sublayers".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT. Change 'entities' to 'layers'.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.145**   *P* **11**   *L* **290**   **#** 139
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
Acronym in definition makes it difficult to follow.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "PDU" to "protocol data unit (PDU)".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.147**   *P* **11**   *L* **293**   **#** 140
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
Couldn't this apply equally well to two or more users at a single station?

SuggestedRemedy
Replace "The capability of two or more stations to share..." with "The capability of two or more stations, or two or more users at a single station, to share...".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED REJECT.   Term specifies 'stations' sharing the ring.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.148**   *P* **11**   *L*   **#** 5
Andrew Brown   Cisco

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
clarifiy/more detail

SuggestedRemedy
at the end add .. between all stations on the same link.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Add: "among stations on the ring".

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.15**   *P* **2**   *L* **35**   **#** 29
Robert D. Love   LAN Connect Consulta

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
There is no requirement that the maximum data rate of a channel is ever used.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "the maximum data-rate of a channel" to "its maximum data rate"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.150**   *P* **11**   *L* **297**   **#** 141
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
No need to specify "802.17" MAC frames. No other type of MAC frame is discussed in this standard unless explicitly defined.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete "802.17".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.151**   *P* **11**   *L*   **#** 6
Andrew Brown   Cisco

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
I believe I have a more simple definition

SuggestedRemedy
"The use of destination stripping to allow multiple stations to transmit packets on the ring concurrently. This differs from protocols such as 802.5.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to "The use of available ring capacity when traffic communicated between source and destination stations does not traverse all links on the ringlet."

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.151**   *P* **11**   *L* **299-300**   # **42**

Bruce B. Johnson   Excite@Home

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

"Spatial reuse" definition is misleading and wrong. Proposed new wording: Removal (stripping) of unicast frames by the destination station allows bandwidth downstream to be used to communicate between other stations.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #6 The suggested remedy implies that 'spatial reuse' is the 'stripping of frames'. 'Spatial reuse' is the reuse of the ..'bandwidth downstream'...]

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.151**   *P* **11**   *L* **299**   # **61**

David V. James   Cypress

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

See comment #5.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment #5

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #6

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.151**   *P* **13**   *L* **347**   # **62**

David V. James   Cypress

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

Unknown unicast definition is unclear.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete 1.175

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. The definition is clarified as follows "The act of flooding a frame intended for a single station, throughout the network when the location of the destination station within the network is unknown.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.151**   *P* **11**   *L* **299**   # **70**

Harmen R. van As   Vienna University of T

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

Sentence should be 'Reuse of ring capacity on different geographical parts of the ring'

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #6

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.151**   *P* **11**   *L* **299,300**   # **170**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

A better definition is given below

SuggestedRemedy

The use of destination stripping of unicast packets to allow multiple stations to transmit packets concurrently. This differs from earlier ring protcols such as IEEE 802.5

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #6 It is not strictly correct that destination stripping allows frames to be transmitted concurrently at stations around the ring. If destination stripping was not deployed, it would still be possible for every station to transmit a frame at the same time and for the frames to be successfully copied.]

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.153**   *P* **11**   *L* **303**   # **210**

Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

The current usage of the term "network" and its associated definition is inaccurate in applying to station if the 802.17 standard defines the scope in which a station can transmit/receive information is to an 802.17 ring. A more accurate description for 802.17 is to use "802.17 ring" or "802.17 network" in place of "network". Note, 802.17 was used in definitions for source/destination stations.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "network" with "802.l7 network"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. 802.17 station would be associated with 802.17 network. Station is associated with network.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 10 of 36

RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *Cl* **01**   *SC* **01.153**

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.156**   *P* **12**   *L* **311**   **#** **171**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

    Changes in ring topology is correct, but not sufficient

SuggestedRemedy

    substitute "knowledge of the ring topology" to "changes to ring topology due to protection or maintenance events."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

    PROPOSED ACCEPT. Change to: 'A mechanism by which a failure or maintenance event results in the source station placing frames on the opposing ringlet.'

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.156**   *P* **12**   *L* **311**   **#** **211**

Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

    Steering at the "ingress station" is not as clear as using "source station"

SuggestedRemedy

    Replace "ingress station" with "source station"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

    PROPOSED ACCEPT. See #171.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.16**   *P* **2**   *L* **37**   **#** **30**

Robert D. Love   LAN Connect Consulta

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

    Capacity can be specified for entities other than a medium or a channel, for example, a network.

SuggestedRemedy

    Delete the words "by a medium or channel" from the definition

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

    PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace 'medium or channel' with 'medium, network, or similar entity'.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.16**   *P* **2**   *L* **37**   **#** **54**

Dan Romascanu   Avaya inc.

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

    The term 'capacity' has different meanings in different contexts. The current definition in the context of medium or channel capacity restricts other usage.

SuggestedRemedy

    Redefine the term under either 'medium capacity' or channel capacity'

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

    PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #30

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.160**   *P* **12**   *L* **317**   **#** **239**

Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

    QTag needs a reference.

SuggestedRemedy

    change "... contains a QTag ..." to "... contains an 802.1q QTag ..."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

    PROPOSED ACCEPT. Change to "Frame that contains a QTag Prefix as specified by IEEE Std. 802.3-2000"

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.161**   *P* **12**   *L* **318**   **#** **212**

Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

    Throttle is a duplicate of both "flow control" and "backpressure" and will lead to inconsistent usage leading to confusion and possible error.

SuggestedRemedy

    Change definition to "flow control" or "backpressure" is the preferred term. See "flow control"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

    PROPOSED REJECT. See #214

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.162**   *P* **12**   *L* **321**   **#** **71**

Harmen R. van As   Vienna University of T

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

    Throughput also contains frames with erroneous FCS. If only successful frames (based on FCS) than one should speak about Goodput. Omit succesfull and last sentence

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

    PROPOSED ACCEPT. Remove 'successful' from definition of throughput. Remove reference to ITU definition. Use definition with 'successful' for term 'goodput'.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 11 of 36

RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *Cl* **01**   *SC* **01.162**

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.163**   *P* **12**   *L* **323**   # **142**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
"Protocol header" is undefined.

SuggestedRemedy
Add definition for "protocol header".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change 'protocol header of a frame' to 'frame header'. 'Header' is a well-known term and does not require definition.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.163**   *P* **12**   *L* **323**   # **143**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Defintion includes too much information. The first sentence defines what TTL is. The remaining sentences related to usage of TTL should be specifically defined in the standard if needed.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete the 2nd and 3rd sentences.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Also replace 'in order to allow' to 'intended to insure' and change 'frame' to 'frames'. Replace 'stripping of a frame that has' with 'stripping of frames that have'.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.164**   *P* **5**   *L* **139**   # **161**
Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**
This definition is wrong - I believe it might define global bandwidth sharing. Spatial re-use is simply the increase in available bandwidth due to the fact that packets can be destination stripped and thus do not consume BW on links where the packet will never be used.

SuggestedRemedy
Delete the subclause

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.165**   *P* **12**   *L* **328**   # **144**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
"Rules" is not defined, definition is vague.

SuggestedRemedy
Define "rules", or add other text to clarify definition.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Remove term 'traffic class' ('traffic class' is depricated in favor of 'service class'.)

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.165**   *P* **12**   *L* **328**   # **1006**
Unknown   unknown

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**
The definition is not clear. Who processes, what 'processing' means, what is a 'rule'?

SuggestedRemedy
Clarify or eliminate definition

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #144

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.166**   *P* **12**   *L* **329**   # **145**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
By definition, "frames" cannot exist on a ring, only "packets" can exist on a ring. The ring is a medium-a packet has been defined a "frame to which has been added those fields that are medium dependent".

SuggestedRemedy
Delete "frames" and replace with "packets". Perform global check on other references to frames and make sure they don't shouldn't be refering to packets.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.166**   *P* **12**   *L* **329**   # **222**
Pinar Yilmaz   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Replace "ring" with "ringlet"

SuggestedRemedy
Replace "ring" with "ringlet"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.167**   *P* **12**   *L* **330**   # **146**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Acronym in definition makes it difficult to follow.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "SDU" to "service data unit (SDU)".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.168**   *P* **12**   *L* **333**   # **91**
Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Transfer rate is not always measured in bytes.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "number of bytes" to "amount of data"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.173**   *P* **13**   *L* **344**   # **213**
Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Definition of transparent bridging doesn't really pertain to end stations, but to the operations required in bridges to bridge the frame across the network.

SuggestedRemedy
Change definition to "frame does not require modification or translation across the network".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED REJECT. The word 'transparent' in 'transparent bridging' indicates that bridging activity is not visible to the end-station.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.176**   *P* **13**   *L* **349**   # **147**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Clarify layer reference.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "protocol layers" to "OSI protocol layers".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. The definition is correct as it stands. An 'upper layer' is any protocol layer above the data-link layer. There is no requirement that the 'upper layer' conform to the OSI reference model. The work 'protocol' is inserted between 'data link' and 'protocol' to clarify. See #133.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.177**   *P* **13**   *L* **350**   # **92**
Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
This definition is nearly content-free.

SuggestedRemedy
Change to "The direction opposite that of a particular data flow"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #195

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.177**   *P* **13**   *L* **350**   # **148**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Indirect definitions are tedious and difficult to follow.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace definition with "The direction opposite that of data flow."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #195

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.177**   *P* **13**   *L* **1**   # **195**
Timothy R. Plunkett   NSWCDD (Navy)

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Definition of upstream should not require looking up of the definition of downstream.

SuggestedRemedy
Change the definition to read more like the definition of downstream. Somethin like the following: "The direction opposite of data flow."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to 'The direction opposite to the data flow on a ringlet'.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.178**   *P* **13**   *L* **352**   # **240**
Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Upstream has meaning wrt a specific ringlet.

SuggestedRemedy
Add to the end of the sentence "with respect to a specific ringlet."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT. See #195

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause
RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

Page 13 of 36

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.178**

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.18**   *P* **2**   *L* **39**   **#** **20**

Leon Bruckman   Corrigent Systems

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

A Class may also be categorized by the behavior (eg: discard policy), not only by the priority

SuggestedRemedy

Add the following to the end of paragraph: "... and service level"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. 'Delivery priority' can be interpreted as (1) allowing frames on one class to be forwarded ahead of those of another class OR (2) deciding that frames of one class should be dropped in preference to those of another class. The definition was intended to cover the case described by the comment.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.18**   *P* **2**   *L* **39**   **#** **31**

Robert D. Love   LAN Connect Consulta

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Categorization of class of service (CoS) may be by criteria other than relative priority.

SuggestedRemedy

Change definition to words stating CoS is the categorization of traffic according to specified delivery parameters.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. See #20

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.18**   *P* **2**   *L* **39**   **#** **1001**

Unknown   unknown

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

The definition implies that precedence CoS is the only type of CoS that RPR deals with. I think that this is a discussion that the WH has yet to do, and a decision that may be taken only in a later phase.

SuggestedRemedy

Eliminate this definition

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.   The convention is that 'Common usage' is adopted unless the standard requires an alternative definition. CoS is traditionally distinguished from QoS in that the former specifies relative service priority while the latter specifies an absolute service guarantee.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.180**   *P* **13**   *L* **356**   **#** **241**

Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

VLAN needs a reference.

SuggestedRemedy

Add "802.1q"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace 'bridged local area network' with 'bridged 802.3 local area network'. Delete second sentence.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.181**   *P* **13**   *L* **357**   **#** **149**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

See separate comments against "partition", and ensure that "logical partition" used in this definition matches that definition.

SuggestedRemedy

See related comment against "partition".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Use of the term 'partition' in the two definitions is unrelated.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.181**   *P* **13**   *L* **357**   **#** **242**

Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

How does it provide customer separation.

SuggestedRemedy

Either explain more fully or give a reference.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. The method is to be specified by the standard. The definition does not suggest particular method for meeting this requirement.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.182**   *P*   *L*   **#** **7**

Andrew Brown   Cisco

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**

clarification

SuggestedRemedy

change to read ..that allows the.. dynamic allocation of proportional ring capacity

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. A property of the fairness algorithm that it allows sharing of ring capacity in proportion to specified weights.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.182**   *P* **13**   *L* **359,360**   # **172**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

change definition to

SuggestedRemedy

A class of fairness algorithm that allows the dynamic allocation of proportional shares of ring capacity between stations on the ring.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #7.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.183**   *P* **6**   *L* **172**   # **166**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

The definition is wrong. It is almost a good definition for the term Congestion Domain.

SuggestedRemedy

We need a definition of congestion domain. Start with this one and remove local spatial reuse as a definition.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.184**   *P* **13**   *L* **364**   # **93**

Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Needs a bit more explanation.

SuggestedRemedy

Add ", in order to reach a destination cut off by a failure on the original ringlet."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #173.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.184**   *P* **13**   *L* **363**   # **150**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Definition refers to "the" ringlet opposing the one it was received on. A general ring may or may not have a single opposing ringlet.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "on the ringlet opposing..." to "on a ringlet opposing...".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #173

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.184**   *P* **13**   *L* **363-364**   # **173**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

SuggestedRemedy

In the case of a ring composed of dual counter rotating ringlets, the transmission of a frame on the ringlet opposing the ringlet on which it was received due to a protection or maintenance event.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.19**   *P* **2**   *L* **40**   # **52**

Constantinos Bassias   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

CUG has nothing to do with RPR

SuggestedRemedy

remove it.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.2**   *P* **14**   *L* **386**   # **13**

Fredrik Davik   University of Oslo

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

is FTR the correct abbreviation for frame delivery ratio?

SuggestedRemedy

Use FDR instead

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.2**   *P* **14**   *L* **375, 376,**   # **63**

David V. James   Cypress

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Inconsistent capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

Upper case characters change to lower case.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 15 of 36

RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *Cl* **01**   *SC* **01.2**

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.2**   *P* **14**   *L* **370**   **#** **64**

David V. James   Cypress

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Helvetica font.

SuggestedRemedy

Consistent use of Times New Roman.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.20**   *P* **9**   *L* **240**   **#** **53**

Constantinos Bassias   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

plug and play station may or may not strip

SuggestedRemedy

remove it.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. Move 'strip' from first sentence to second sentence. (note that comment refers to 1.120, not 1.20)

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.20**   *P* **2**   *L* **43**   **#** **176**

Necdet Uzun   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

committed burst size needs to be measured in a shorter time duration than CIR.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Tc" to "Tb", where Tb is the interval of measuring the burst size. Note that Tb << Tc.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.23**   *P* **2**   *L* **51**   **#** **101**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

What is "mild congestion", exactly? How is it distinguished from "congestion"?

SuggestedRemedy

Change "onset of mild congestion" to "onset of congestion".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.24**   *P* **2**   *L* **52**   **#** **32**

Robert D. Love   LAN Connect Consulta

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

The defintion for Congestion control anticipates the solution.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Congestion control includes ..." to "Congestion control may include ..."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change definition to 'Activities intended to avoid or to reduce congestion.'

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.24**   *P* **2**   *L* **52-54**   **#** **75**

Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

"real-time" suggests that there are predetermined bounds for response; "resource failures" are actually dealt with by mechanisms such as steering.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "Real-time" and "(e.g. resource failures)".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #32.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.25**   *P* **2**   *L* **56**   **#** **33**

Robert D. Love   LAN Connect Consulta

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

The definition of congestion management contradicts the previous definition since "congestion control" has already been defined as including congestion avoidance and congestion recovery.

SuggestedRemedy

delete "congestion avoidance, and congestion recovery" from the end of the definition.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**　　　*SC* **01.25**　　　　　*P* **2**　　　*L* **56**　　　# **102**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor　　　Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**

The definition includes two sentences about what congestion management "includes", but fails to define what it is.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to something along the lines of "The means by which congestion is avoided, minimized, or controlled on a network, including network engineering, OAM procedures to detect the onset of congestion, and real-time mechanisms to prevent or recover from congestion. Congestion management includes, but is not limited to, congestion control, congestion avoidance, and congestion recovery."

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #32.

Cl **01**　　　*SC* **01.25**　　　　　*P* **2**　　　*L* **56**　　　# **103**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor　　　Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**

OAM is not defined or listed in acronyms.

SuggestedRemedy

Define "OAM" (or OAM&P), or include it in acronyms.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Definition will be included if supplied by commentor.

Cl **01**　　　*SC* **01.26**　　　　　*P* **2**　　　*L* **61**　　　# **9**

Fredrik Davik　　　　　　　　　University of Oslo

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**

add missing...

SuggestedRemedy

.. the end user's ..

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**　　　*SC* **01.3**　　　　　*P* **0**　　　*L* **0**　　　# **26**

Mike Davis　　　　　　　　　Cisco Systems

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**

1.48,1.52,1.61,1.63,1.70,1.82,1.87,1.94,1.109,1.112,1.113,1.123, 1.127,1.136,1.137,1.143,1.155 - All of the above definitions are TBD. These terms should either be defined or removed.

SuggestedRemedy

Drop them for now.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #51

Cl **01**　　　*SC* **01.3**　　　　　*P* **1**　　　*L* **14**　　　# **28**

Robert D. Love　　　　　　　　LAN Connect Consulta

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**

All Stations MAC Address definition is missing:

SuggestedRemedy

Either remove the term or Add definition: All Stations MAC Address is the Broadcast Address.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. Delete term 'all stations MAC address'.

Cl **01**　　　*SC* **01.30**　　　　　*P* **3**　　　*L* **67-69**　　　# **76**

Jim Mollenauer　　　　　　　　Technical Strategy As

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**X**

This needs to be distinguished from the concept of session, as in the session layer.

SuggestedRemedy

TBD

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Remedy not specified (e.g. define 'session', clarify definition of conversation, other?)

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial　COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause　Page 17 of 36

RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn　　　　　　　　　　　　　　　　　*Cl* **01**　　*SC* **01.30**

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.31**   *P* **3**   *L* **72**   # **157**
Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

The final word stripped does not describe the correct action. The correct action is received.

SuggestedRemedy

Change stripped to received.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. A unicast is always copied and stripped at the same station (ie. destination station). A multicast is stripped at a station (ie. source station) different from the statopms where it is copied.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.31**   *P* **3**   *L* **71**   # **177**
Necdet Uzun   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

Stripped means that frame is removed from the ring, hence you can not copy and strip.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "stripped" to "received".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. A station 'copies' a frame bearing the individual or group address of that station. In the case of a unicast, the destination station 'copies and strips'. In the case of a multicast, all stations in the multicast group 'copy', while the destination 'strips'.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.31**   *P* **3**   *L* **71**   # **223**
Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

Replication where? I'd guess, because of the paranthetical about stripping, that it is copied from the ring toward the MAC client, but I shouldn't have to guess.

SuggestedRemedy

Clarify intended meaning.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Remedy not specified. Use of 'copy' would be circular. The term 'receive' describes a frame inbound to the station (whether copied or not). See 177

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.32**   *P* **3**   *L* **73**   # **77**
Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

This sounds more like the definition of a closed user group. Customer separation deals more with preventing one customer from impacting another's QoS.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "The property that network usage by one or more groups of network users does not adversely impact the quality of service seen by other users."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. The term 'customer separation' was associated with security rather than performance during the discussion of objectives.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.33**   *P* **3**   *L* **75**   # **104**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

For a short frame, the first bit may not be retransmitted before the last bit is received due to station latency, even though the implementation is cut-through and performs no buffering.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the definition to "The passthru of a frame through a station such that the received frame is not buffered prior to retransmission."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace 'not buffered' with 'not fully buffered'.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.34**   *P* **3**   *L* **77**   # **68**
Harmen R. van As   Vienna University of T

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

accuracy -> correctness

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #78.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.34**   *P* **3**   *L* **77**   **# 78**

Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

This definition doesn't explain what a CRC is. This definition could be met by many kinds of check which are not CRCs at all, for example a simple additive checksum.

SuggestedRemedy

TBD

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace definition with: A mathematical algorithm based on an n-th degree generator polynomial that computes a numerical value based on the bits in a block of data. This number is transmitted with the data and the receiver uses this information and the same algorithm to insure the accurate delivery of data by comparing the results of algorithm and the number received. If a mismatch occurs, an error in transmission is presumed.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.34**   *P* **3**   *L* **77**   **# 105**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

CRC definition indicates it is "used to ensure the accuracy of transmitting a message". This is misleading and/or false using the definition of "transmit" in this document, since CRC is typically used to check the transfer or reception of a message. Also, the text following the "Note" is interesting, but unnecessary for the definition. Finally, "message" is used in the definition but is undefined.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) move CRC to the list of acronyms, and delete the definition entirely, or 2) change definition to something along the lines of "A form of error checking used to ensure the accuracy of transferred data or frames." and delete remaining sentences.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #224.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.34**   *P* **3**   *L* **77**   **# 224**

Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

This needs a reference to a more complete definition.

SuggestedRemedy

Add a reference to a more complete definition.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #78.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.35**   *P* **3**   *L* **78**   **# 43**

Bruce B. Johnson   Excite@Home

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

"transmitting" should be "receiving"

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace 'transmission' with "transmission and reception".

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.35**   *P* **3**   *L* **83**   **# 69**

Harmen R. van As   Vienna University of T

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

omit 'attempted' (meaning not clear)

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Remove 'attempted' but replace 'transmitted' with 'offered for transmission' in order to address the case where transmission of a frame fails (also replace 'octet' with 'byte')]

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.35**   *P* **3**   *L* **82**   **# 106**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Incomplete sentence: "Reports the network's effectiveness in transporting offered data."

SuggestedRemedy

Replace with "The DDR is a number used to report the network's effectiveness in transporting offered data."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. Omit 'successful'. (also change 'Reports the' to 'a measure of" and do not repeat the term DDR in the second sentence of the definition)

Cl **01** *SC* **01.35** *P* **3** *L* **83** *#* **107**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**
"Payload" is not defined.

SuggestedRemedy
Define "payload".

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED REJECT. Payload is a well-known term whose meaning does not differ from common usage.

Cl **01** *SC* **01.35** *P* **3** *L* **83** *#* **108**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**
Definition refers to "successful payload octets". What is a "successful octet"?

SuggestedRemedy
Replace "successful payload octets" with "payload octets successfully received".

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01** *SC* **01.35** *P* **3** *L* **84** *#* **109**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**
Using the definition of "transmit", there's no significance to "attempted" transmission in this definition.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "attempted payload octets transmitted" to "payload octets transmitted".

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #69

Cl **01** *SC* **01.37** *P* **3** *L* **86** *#* **79**
Jim Mollenauer Technical Strategy As

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**
Data rate is not always expressed in bits per second. For disk drives it is usually megabytes per second, and for fiber optics it is usually megabits or gigabits per second.

SuggestedRemedy
Change to "See bit rate."

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Delete term as it is 'well-known'.

Cl **01** *SC* **01.37** *P* **3** *L* **86** *#* **110**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**
"Data-rate" should not be hyphenated.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove hyphenation from "data-rate", and perform global search and replace "data-rate" with "data rate".

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01** *SC* **01.39** *P* **3** *L* *#* **1**
Andrew Brown Cisco

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**
I think it is confusing

SuggestedRemedy
It should read ..at the destination such that the frame is exactly the same as... and middle stuff should be removed

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #203

Cl **01** *SC* **01.39** *P* **3** *L* **89** *#* **21**
Leon Bruckman Corrigent Systems

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **X**
Inconsistent with definition 1.40.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "A frame received" to "The number of frames received". Or change the term to: "delivered duplicated frame"

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01** *SC* **01.39** *P* **3** *L* **89** *#* **111**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E** *Comment Status* **X**
Definition is for "delivered duplicated frames" (plural), but the definition refers to a singular frame.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "delivered duplicated frames" to "delivered duplicated frame".

Proposed Response *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.39**   *P* **3**   *L* **90**   **# 158**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

The phrase "the frame was not generated bu the source station identified by the source address and" is not correct or is at least confusing. It can be removed as it adds no value or information

SuggestedRemedy

Remove it. the new defintion A frame received at a destination such that the frame is exactly the same as a frame that was previously delivered to that destination. is correct and simple.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. The wording in the ITU definition is intended to exclude the case where a station generates two identical frames and those frames are correctly delivered to the same destination. See #203.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.39**   *P* **3**   *L* **89**   **# 178**

Necdet Uzun   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

Definition is confusing.

SuggestedRemedy

Rewrite. As simple as " Reception of a frame more than once by the destination." would be good enough.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #203.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.39**   *P* **3**   *L* **89**   **# 203**

Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

definition is confusing.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace definition with "a frame transmitted by a source station is received multiple times at a destination station".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.4**   *P* **1**   *L* **15**   **# 56**

David V. James   Cypress

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

Definition is unclear.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "flow of data traffic"==>"flow of its downstream traffic"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #175.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.4**   *P* **1**   *L* **15**   **# 73**

Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Backpressure may not require sending a full frame; it may be part of another frame.

SuggestedRemedy

change "a control frame" to "information"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #175.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.4**   *P* **1**   *L* **15**   **# 156**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

Backpressure is a term that will also be used from the MAC layer to the MAC client layer in order to stop the flow of certain traffic classes.

SuggestedRemedy

Broaden the defintion as follows The sending of a control signal or control frame to stop or slow the flow of data traffic. When used in the context of the ring, this is a MAC to MAC communication. It also applies to signalling from the MAC layer to MAC Client to control the flow of ingress traffic.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #175.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 21 of 36

RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *Cl* **01**   *SC* **01.4**

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.4**   *P* **1**   *L* **14**   **#** 175
Necdet Uzun   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**
backpressure can be sent by any means, it does not have to be sent by using a frame.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "control frame" to "control signal"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to: "The sending of a control signal in the direction opposite that of the data traffic for the purpose of slowing or stopping the data traffic."

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.4**   *P* **1**   *L* **15**   **#** 200
Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
A "control frame" may not be the actual mechanism in 802.17 to provide backpressure. A control signal is more accurate.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "control frame" to "control signal"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #175.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.40**   *P* **3**   *L* **94**   **#** 10
Fredrik Davik   University of Oslo

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
last part of sentence could be reworded to improve readability

SuggestedRemedy
reword as follows (added/changed words are marked with a + on both sides) are lost bits or +the frame contains+ extra bits (i.e. bits that were not present in the original +frame+).

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #112.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.40**   *P* **3**   *L* **92**   **#** 112
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
Definition isn't consistent with similar definitions (ie, "delivered duplicated frames", etc). The definition here refers to the "number of frames", other definitions refer to the frame itself.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "The number of frames for which the..." to "A frame for which the...". With this change, also change the term from plural to singular-ie, "delivered duplicated frames" to "delivered duplicated frame".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. "A frame in which one or more bits are in error, have been lost, or are present in the delivered frame but were not present in the original frame"

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.40**   *P* **3**   *L* **94**   **#** 225
Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
The grammar in the last phrase isn't too good :-)

SuggestedRemedy
change ... are lost bits or extra bits (...). to: ... are lost, or some added.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #112.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.41**   *P* **4**   *L* **95**   **#** 22
Leon Bruckman   Corrigent Systems

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
Inconsistent with definition 1.40.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "A frame " to "The number of frames ". Or change the term to: "delivered out-of-sequence frame"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT. Change to singular

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.41**   *P* **4**   *L* **95**   # **113**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Definition is for "delivered out-of-sequence frames" (plural), but the definition refers to a singular frame.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "delivered out-of-sequence frames" to "delivered out-of-sequence frame".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. Change to singular. See #22.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.41**   *P* **4**   *L* **97**   # **159**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

This definition does not include the concept of priority. The rules concerning delivery include the notion that no re-ordering is allowed within a flow between the same source and destination pair and same priority class. It is not clear to me that this provided definition is sufficient.

SuggestedRemedy

change "sent a source station" to "sent from the same source station with the same priority class"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. Replace 'sent from a source station' to 'with respect to a flow sent from a source station.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.41**   *P* **4**   *L* **95**   # **179**

Necdet Uzun   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

"after frame Ft+1, ..." is not sufficient enough for ordered delivery.

SuggestedRemedy

Modify the whole thing as "A same priority frame (Ft) arriving at a destination station after Ft+1 or before Ft-1 in a sequence of frames F0, F1, F2, ..., Fn sent from a source station.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. A frame is misordered when it arrives later than a frame with an earlier departure time. When a frame arrives early, it is not possible to know at the time of arrival if the expected frame is late (misordered) or lost.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.41**   *P* **4**   *L* **95**   # **204**

Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Current definition of out-sequence-frames is not accurate and needs further qualification of "flow" or "conversation" to be accurate. Definitions of flow/conversation stipulate in-order delivery is required. This is not required in general of traffic between source/destination stations unless the traffic is from the same flow. Also, the frame Ft is out of sequence if it arrives after any of the subsequent frames. The definition implies arriving after an entire sequence.

SuggestedRemedy

change definition to "A frame Ft from a conversation or flow F from a sequence of frames Ft, Ft+1, ... Fn arriving at a destination station after Ft+1 or Ft+2 or Fn."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.42**   *P* **4**   *L* **99**   # **114**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Definition refers to "an 802.17 frame". "802.17" is redundant since the standard doesn't address any other types of frames. Any frame referenced in this document is assumed to be an 802.17 frame, unless explicitly identified otherwise.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "802.17".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Remove '802.17'. Change 'network' to 'ring'. In the case where 'destination station' refers to a device in the 'network', the term 'destination end station' should be used'

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.44**   *P* **4**   *L* **103**   # **44**

Bruce B. Johnson   Excite@Home

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

As written, this is meaningless. Propose adding the words: from source station to destination station.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to 'The direction of data flow on a ringlet' (data always flows from source to destination).

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.45**   *P* **4**   *L* **104**   **#** **115**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Is a dual-ring implementing symmetrical data rates a special case of a dual-ring, or is it implied?

SuggestedRemedy
Add a clarification on this point if symmetrical rates are not needed.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED REJECT. Term is independent of whether or not data rates are symmetrical.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.45**   *P* **4**   *L* **104**   **#** **226**
Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
"orientation" isn't very descriptive.

SuggestedRemedy
change "orientations" to "transmission directions"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to 'having opposite directions of data flow',

---

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.46**   *P* **4**   *L* **105**   **#** **152**
Martin Green   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Needs definition.

SuggestedRemedy
dynamic bandwidth allocation : The continuous management of ring ingress rates without the active participation of an operator.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.47**   *P* **4**   *L* **107**   **#** **80**
Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
Other rates are defined in terms of bits, etc.   Why bytes here?

SuggestedRemedy
Change "number of bytes" to "amount of data"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.48**   *P* **4**   *L* **109**   **#** **34**
Robert D. Love   LAN Connect Consulta

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
The term, egress queue delay, is not defined here.

SuggestedRemedy
Define the term or delete the definition

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT. See #51.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.48, 61, 63, 70, 82, 87**   *P*   *L*   **#** **188**
Timothy R. Plunkett   NSWCDD (Navy)

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **D**
There should be no TBD items left, especially the ones to part of the final standard.

SuggestedRemedy
Finish defining all terms that are to be used in the   final standard.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT. See #51. [PROPOSED REJECT. Invalid TR because suggested remedy must supply sufficient text to correct the problem. No suggested definitions were included.]

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.49**   *P* **4**   *L*   **#** **14**
Chuck Lee   Appian Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
egress station is not defined

SuggestedRemedy
change "by the egress station" to "in the egress path"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #227.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.49**   *P* **4**   *L* **110**   **#** **227**
Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**
"Egress Station" is not defined, but "destination station" is. Destination is much clearer for this purpose than egress.

SuggestedRemedy
change "egress" to "destination" in the entire line.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.50**   *P* **4**   *L* **111**   # **116**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

"The direction" is vague.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "The direction" with "The data direction..." or "The direction of data flow...".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Egress is the direction from client towards the ring, independent of whether frames are data or control]

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.50**   *P* **4**   *L* **111**   # **205**

Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Definition of egress is opposite of its usage in IEEE specification 802.1Q. It is also opposite from definitions outbound/port. It should share a similar definition to outbound or it is going to lead to confusion and error. Egress direction is always from a device to an external port or interface. I have never seen this reversed usage of egress/ingress in any reference model.

SuggestedRemedy

Change definition to "The direction from the MAC client towards the ring or MAC sublayer".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.51**   *P* **4**   *L* **112**   # **35**

Robert D. Love   LAN Connect Consulta

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Spell out SDU

SuggestedRemedy

Spell out service data unit = SDU

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.51**   *P* **4**   *L* **112**   # **117**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

What "entity" is being referenced in the definition?

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "The process by which a header and, optionally, a trailer, are place on an SDU."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. ('place' should be 'placed')

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.51**   *P* **4**   *L* **51**   # **229**

Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

It's helpful to indicate the purpose.

SuggestedRemedy

Add to end of sentence: "to support transmission without modifying the SDU."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.52**   *P* **4**   *L* **113**   # **58**

David V. James   Cypress

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

A TBD is unacceptable.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment #6.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE . See #51.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.52**   *P* **4**   *L* **113**   **#** 206
Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
Add definition for Encapsulation Bridging

SuggestedRemedy
Add definition "A method of bridging a frame across two or more networks whereby the frame from the first network (header , payload , and trailer) form the payload portion of the PDU for the second network. Header and trailer specific to the second network are added to the payload portion of the PDU, for transmission across the second network. "

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to: A method of bridging a frame between two or more segments of a network across a dissimilar intermediate network, whereby bridged frames are carried as payload information by the intermediate network,

---

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.53**   *P* **4**   *L* **117**   **#** 118
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
Missing period at end of line.

SuggestedRemedy
Add period at end of line.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.56**   *P* **5**   *L* **123**   **#** 11
Fredrik Davik   University of Oslo

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
Broaden scope of clause

SuggestedRemedy
Reword as follows .. to communicate to (another) station(s)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Replace 'station' with 'station or stations'.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.56**   *P* **5**   *L* **123**   **#** 36
Robert D. Love   LAN Connect Consulta

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
Badly run-on sentence

SuggestedRemedy
Change to: 1.56 flow control: A congestion control mechanism allowing one station to communicate to another station the information that frame transmission should be (a) reduced or halted in order to avoid buffer overrun or other conditions associated with congestion at the receiving station, or (b) allowing the resumption of normal levels of frame transmission when the condition is resolved.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #180

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.56**   *P* **5**   *L* **125**   **#** 119
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
Reference to "buffer overrun" is too specific, and refers to a special condition associated with the general case of congestion.

SuggestedRemedy
Change definition to "A congestion control mechanism allowing one station to communicate to another station the information that frame transmission should be reduced or halted in order to avoid congestion at the receiving station, and allowing the resumption of normal levels frame transmission when the congestion is resolved."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #180

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.56**   *P* **5**   *L* **123**   **#** 153
Martin Green   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**
"...and allowing the resumption of normal levels frame transmission when the condition is resolved." This implies XON/XOFF behavior, the flow control action should be for a specified time period.

SuggestedRemedy
"..when notified that the condition is resolved or a specified time period has elapsed."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #180

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.56**   *P* **5**   *L* **124,125**   # **160**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

This defintion is not factually correct in two places line 124 2st word - station should read station or stations, line 125 receiving station should changed to congested station

SuggestedRemedy

changes shown above

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #180

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.56**   *P* **5**   *L* **123**   # **180**

Necdet Uzun   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

"receiving station" may not be congested but an intermediate station may be.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "receiving station" in line 125 with "congested station"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to: "A congestion control mechanism having the characteristic that stations can signal to other stations for the purpose of regulating data rate."

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.56**   *P* **5**   *L* **4**   # **190**

Timothy R. Plunkett   NSWCDD (Navy)

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Missing the word "of".

SuggestedRemedy

Add the word of so that the last line reads, "... resumption of normal levels of frame transmission ...."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #180

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.56**   *P* **5**   *L* **123**   # **208**

Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Flow control is not limited to congestion at the receiving station. It could be due to congestion at an intermediate station.

SuggestedRemedy

either change "the receiving station" to "a receiving station" or to "an intermediate station"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #180

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.57**   *P* **5**   *L* **128**   # **120**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

"Protocol header" is used in the definition, but is undefined.

SuggestedRemedy

Add definition for "protocol header".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. 'Protocol header' is a synonym for 'header'. It is a well-known term.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.57**   *P* **5**   *L*   # **215**

Jingsong Fu   CIENA Corporation

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**   9/5/01 0:00:00

Since a flow can be identified by one or a combination of values in the header of either MAC layer or above, it may or may not be associated with one conversation that is defined by 1.30.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest to change to the following, "The collection of Frames that can be identified by one or a combination of specific values carried in the protocol headers at the MAC layer or above."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Specification should not address flows above the MAC layer as these are protocol specific.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.58**   *P* **5**   *L* **131**   # **121**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Missing period at end of line.

SuggestedRemedy

Add period at end of line.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.59**   *P* **5**   *L* **133**   # **37**

Robert D. Love   LAN Connect Consulta

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

The acronym doesn't match the words

SuggestedRemedy

Pick one of the following 3 choices: (1) Change the acronym to FDR; (2) add the literal base of FTR at the end, e.g. Frame Transmit Ratio; or (3) Change the term defined to match the acronym FTR

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.59**   *P* **5**   *L* **132**   # **45**

Bruce B. Johnson   Excite@Home

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

Why the acronym "FTR"? "FDR" would be more understandable.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.60**   *P* **5**   *L* **134**   # **12**

Fredrik Davik   University of Oslo

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Does the time have to specified in milliseconds?

SuggestedRemedy

Reword as follows The time difference between ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.60**   *P* **5**   *L* **134**   # **23**

Leon Bruckman   Corrigent Systems

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

No need to define time units (as in other time related parameters e.g. latency).

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "in milliseconds"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.60**   *P* **5**   *L* **134**   # **81**

Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

FTD is not necessarily measured in milliseconds. Also, we need to specify corresponding points on the transmitted and received packet.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "in milliseconds" and change "a frame exits" to "the last bit of a frame exits" and "the same frame enters" to "the last bit of the same frame enters".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.60**   *P* **5**   *L* **134**   # **122**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Definition refers to frames "exiting" and "entering" stations. This is not a concise definition. What do "exit" and "enter" mean in this context, and how are they measured?

SuggestedRemedy

Clarify definition. No suggestions-definition is too vague to convey its intent.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #81.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.61**   *P* **5**   *L* **136**   # **38**

Robert D. Love   LAN Connect Consulta

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

No definition supplied here and for various other definitions

SuggestedRemedy

The suggested remedy must be applied universally before this comment is satisfied. Do a global search for "TBD" to help locate all definitions that are missing. Then add the definitions or indicate the definitions are still to be supplied such as by leaving the TBD comment in brackets <...> Repeat this process until ALL specified but undefined terms are properly marked.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #51.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.63**   *P* **5**   *L* **138**   **#** **154**

Martin Green   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Need definition.

SuggestedRemedy

global fairness: Algorithm ensuring that every node will receive the proper amount of bandwidth in relation to the total available bandwidth and the bandwidth that the other nodes on the ring are receiving.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.64**   *P* **5**   *L* **140**   **#** **39**

Robert D. Love   LAN Connect Consulta

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

This definition is counter intuitive and not useful

SuggestedRemedy

Either change the definition or drop it.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.64**   *P* **5**   *L* **139-140**   **#** **46**

Bruce B. Johnson   Excite@Home

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

See comment # 1 above. Remove term.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.64**   *P*   *L*   **#** **59**

David V. James   Cypress

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Spatial reuse occurs even when bandwidth is not assigned.

SuggestedRemedy

"global spatial reuse: The concurrent utilization of multiple nonoverlapping ring segments which allows the cumulative delivered bandwidth to exceed the bandwidth capacity of a single link."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED IN PRINCIPLE. See #181.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.64**   *P* **5**   *L* **139**   **#** **82**

Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Spatial reuse refers to the reuse of the same capacity due to destination removal of packets. This definition does not refer to the same process, but rather to a reallocation of assigned but unused bandwidth, which could take place just as well in the absence of destination removal.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the term to "global reallocation".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #181.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.64**   *P* **5**   *L* **139**   **#** **155**

Martin Green   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

This definition does not clearly state the capacity on unused spans are being re-used. It implies that excess bandwidth not allocated can be used by other stations.

SuggestedRemedy

global spatial reuse: The utilization of ring capacity on spans not utilized by other traffic travelling on different spans of the same ringlet.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #181.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.64**   *P* **5**   *L* **139**   **#** **181**

Necdet Uzun   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

There is no need to define the term "global spatial reuse". The term "spatial reuse" is enough.

SuggestedRemedy

delete this subclause.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 29 of 36

RESPONSE STATUS: O/open   W/written C/closed   U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *Cl* **01**   *SC* **01.64**

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.65**   *P* **5**   *L* **141**   **#** **83**

Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Should indicate that group and multicast address are synonyms.

SuggestedRemedy

Add: ", equivalent to multicast address"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. A group address is a general term that refers to either the broadcast address or a multicast address. The terms are not synonymous,]

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.66**   *P* **5**   *L* **143**   **#** **220**

Pinar Yilmaz   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

Guaranteed Service (GS) and Best Effort Service (BES) are defined. That makes two classes.

SuggestedRemedy

Add a definition for a third traffic class in between: Committed Rate Service (CSR)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Definition of CRS must be provided by commenter.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.67**   *P* **5**   *L* **144**   **#** **123**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

An 802.17 standard does not exist (yet), so the definition is meaningless. Why is it needed?

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the definition.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. This type of designation does appear in the introductory sections of other 802 standards. The IEEE has assigned this identifier to the RPR standard. The designation '802.17' that appears in parentheses should be remove as the standard should not use this 'informal' designation.]

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.68**   *P* **5**   *L* **145**   **#** **124**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

General comment. Definition refers to direction of "frame arrival". Other definitions refer to the direction of "data flow" (see "downstream"). Need to pick one approach and use it for consistency.

SuggestedRemedy

Pick "data" or "frame" and use consistently as much as possible. Global search and replace as applicable.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. The use of 'frame arrival' was intentional. An inbound frame may represent data (traveling downstream) or control (traveling upstream).]

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.72**   *P* **5**   *L*   **#** **15**

Chuck Lee   Appian Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

ingress station is not defined

SuggestedRemedy

change "by the ingress station" to "in the ingress path"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See 228.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.72**   *P* **5**   *L* **150**   **#** **47**

Bruce B. Johnson   Excite@Home

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

Why would we ever want to do this? Remove term.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See 228.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.72**   *P*   *L*   **#** **162**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

I assume that this is what people normally refer to as source stripping which is not defined

SuggestedRemedy

add the phrase when the packet has traversed the entire ring to the end of the sentence. Add a sub-clause for source stripping and reference incress stripping

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. Add 'after traversal of the ring'.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.72**   *P* **5**   *L* **150**   # **228**

Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

"Ingress Station" is not defined, but "source station" is. Source is much clearer for this purpose than ingress.

SuggestedRemedy

change "ingress" to "source" in the entire line.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.73**   *P* **5**   *L* **151**   # **125**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

"The direction" is vague.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace with "The data direction..." or "The direction of data flow...".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Ingress is the direction from the ring towards the MAC client, independent of whether frames are data or control.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.73**   *P* **5**   *L* **151**   # **207**

Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

Definition of ingress is opposite of its usage in IEEE specification 802.1Q. It is also opposite from definitions for inbound/outbound/port. It should share a similar definition with inbound or it is going to lead to confusion and error. Ingress direction is always into a device from an external port or interface. I have never seen this reversed usage of egress/ingress in any reference model.

SuggestedRemedy

change definition to "The direction from the ring or MAC sublayer towards the MAC client".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.74**   *P* **6**   *L* **152**   # **209**

Robert Castellano   Jedai Broadband Netw

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

Definition of "insert" is identical to "transmit". Inclusion of both definitions is going to lead to inconsistent usage if some areas use "insert" and others use "transmit" to refer to the same thing.

SuggestedRemedy

replace definition for "insert" with "Transmit is the preferred term, see transmit"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. The definitions are not identical. To transmit is to put ANY frame on the ring (passthru or egress). To insert is to put an egress frame on the ring.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.76**   *P* **6**   *L* **154**   # **126**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

"Delay" is used in the definition, but is an undefined term.

SuggestedRemedy

Either add definition for "delay", or use "latency" instead.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. Delay and latency are both well-known terms and do not have a special meaning in the standard. They do not need to appear in the T&D.]

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.76**   *P* **6**   *L* **154,155**   # **163**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Rather than talk of the variation in delay, Jitter is really the difference between the maximum and minimum delay.

SuggestedRemedy

Change definition to Difference between the minimum and maximum delay in transfering frames from one point in the network to another.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial   COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   SORT ORDER: Clause, Page, Line, Subclause   Page 31 of 36

RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   *Cl* **01**   *SC* **01.76**

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.77**   *P* **6**   *L* **157**   **#** **127**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

"...for purposes of the 802.17 specification" sounds like a reference to another document. This _IS_ the 802.17 specification.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "...for purposes of the 802.17 specification" to "for purposes of this standard".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. Delete second sentence.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.77**   *P* **6**   *L* **156**   **#** **1002**

Unknown   unknown

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

The use of term 'information' is vague. Moreover, it is inconsistent with the definition of jitter, which is defined as 'variation in delay associated with the transfer of frames...'.

SuggestedRemedy

replace 'information' with 'frames'

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. See #163.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.77**   *P* **6**   *L* **157**   **#** **1003**

Unknown   unknown

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

'latency' is defined as synonymous with 'delay' - but 'delay' is not defined

SuggestedRemedy

Define 'delay' as a synonymous of 'latency' in the context of this standard.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. See #216.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.78**   *P* **6**   *L* **158-161**   **#** **164**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

It is not clear to me that 802.17 will engage in link aggregation, while it is clear to me that 802.l7 will engage in ring aggregation.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to word link to ring in the entire sub-clause

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Make proposed change but also retain the definition of 'link aggregation' for discussion purposes.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.78**   *P* **6**   *L* **158 (footn**   **#** **185**

Robert (Bob) Hott   Naval Surface Warfare

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

In the footnote for the phrase "link aggregation group", footnote 5, the reference to 802.1ae is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

Link aggregation was an 802.3 effort and should be referenced as IEEE 802.3.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.78**   *P* **6**   *L* **161**   **#** **230**

Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Isn't it true that one conversation may appear on only one link to avoid misordering?

SuggestedRemedy

Add: "However, one conversation may appear on only one link to avoid misordering."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.79**   *P* **6**   *L* **162**   **#** **221**

Pinar Yilmaz   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Redundant and confusing term, we have neighbor definition.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove this term completely

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.79**   *P* **6**   *L* **162**   **#** **1011**

Michael Takefman   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

This is a redundant definition. Neighbour is a defined term and a better one.

SuggestedRemedy

remove the sub-clause.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.8**   *P* **1**   *L* **22**   **# 8**

Fredrik Davik   University of Oslo

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Not consistent with clause 1.37

SuggestedRemedy

Add the following at the end of the sentence measured in bits-per-second.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #1007.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.8**   *P* **1**   *L* **22**   **# 100**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Definition is not consistent with "data rate" definition.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "The rate at which bits are transferred, measured in bits-per-second".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #1007.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.8**   *P* **1**   *L* **1**   **# 189**

Timothy R. Plunkett   NSWCDD (Navy)

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

I believe the definition should say something about bits/sec. I find the term speed too vague since the bits will most likely be moving at the speed of light, no matter what the data rate.

SuggestedRemedy

Add something to the definition such as "measured in bits per second".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. This is a well-known term and can be omitted.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.8**   *P* **1**   *L* **22**   **# 1007**

Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Existing definition is not very informative.

SuggestedRemedy

change to "The number of bits transferred per unit time."

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. This is a well-known term and can be omitted.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.80**   *P* **6**   *L* **163**   **# 48**

Bruce B. Johnson   Excite@Home

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Remove "and"

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. ('medium' instead of 'media'?)

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.81**   *P* **6**   *L* **167**   **# 231**

Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

The phrase "and characterized by moderate to high data transmission rates, ..." is meaningless. What is high? What is low BER?

SuggestedRemedy

Either delete the phrase or put some typical values in it.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED REJECT. No remedy specified.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.82**   *P*   *L*   **# 60**

David V. James   Cypress

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

No TBDs.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete this subclause and all other subclauses with TBD. Replace them with a summary TBD section at the beginning of the draft (typically before the table of contents).

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. See #51.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.83**   *P* **6**   *L* **170**   **# 186**

Steven Wood   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Why is the word local required? what are we trying to differentiate?

SuggestedRemedy

Change to just spatial reuse.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. Delete term 'local spatial reuse'.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.84**   *P* **6**   *L* **173**   # **84**

Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Proper English usage should use the singular here. IEEE standard for LLC should be referred to.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "media independent" to "medium-independent". Add "This sublayer is standardized in IEEE 802.2 [yearTBD]".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.85**   *P* **6**   *L* **175**   # **24**

Leon Bruckman   Corrigent Systems

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Inconsistent with definition 1.40.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "A frame " to "The number of frames ". Or change the term to: "lost frame"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. Change to singular.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.85**   *P* **6**   *L* **175**   # **128**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Definition is for "lost frames" (plural), but the definition refers to a singular frame.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "lost frames" to "lost frame".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.85**   *P* **6**   *L* **175**   # **217**

Mete YILMAZ   Cisco Systems

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Term (lost frames) is in plural form.

SuggestedRemedy

It should be lost frame.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.89**   *P* **7**   *L* **185**   # **1004**

Unknown   unknown

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **X**

The definition limits the scope of a MIB to 'the operation of a specific device'. This seems to prevent for example a MIB that descrives the characteristics of other managed entities - e.g. of a ring

SuggestedRemedy

replace 'operation of a specific network device' with 'management characteristics of a managed entity'

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to 'entity'.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.9**   *P* **1**   *L* **24**   # **74**

Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **X**

Bridges are capable of operating in the absence of LLC, and in fact many Ethernet systems don't use LLC at all.

SuggestedRemedy

After "the same logical link control protocol" add "(or none at all)"

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change to: 'A device supporting MAC-layer interconnection of LANs or MANs'.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.9 and 1.10**   *P* **1**   *L* **23-28**   # **184**

Robert (Bob) Hott   Naval Surface Warfare

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **X**

The phrase "MAC bridges" is italicized in the definition of "bridged network", definition 1.10. The phrase is not defined in this document.

SuggestedRemedy

Add "MAC bridge (bridge)" and move the definition of "bridge" to "MAC bridge (bridge)". Then for "bridge" insert the text "(see MAC bridge)". This would be consistent with the term "frame" and "MAC frame (frame)".

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.90**   *P* **7**   *L* **1**   # **191**
Timothy R. Plunkett   NSWCDD (Navy)

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
Definition a little vague.

SuggestedRemedy
Change definition to read "The maximum number of bytes allowed in a frame."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.91**   *P* **6**   *L* **188**   # **129**
Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
What is the distinction between "physical network" (used in definition) and "network" (defined in the document)?

SuggestedRemedy
Delete "physical".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.91**   *P* **7**   *L* **187**   # **1005**
Unknown   unknown

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
The term payload is not defined and makes this definition uninteligible

SuggestedRemedy
Incorporate a definition for 'payload' or replace 'payload' by another meaningful term.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED REJECT. The term 'payload' is well-known and need not be defined in the document.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.93**   *P* **5**   *L* **192**   # **49**
Bruce B. Johnson   Excite@Home

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**
Add: (PHY) Remove (3)

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.93**   *P* **7**   *L* **191-193**   # **85**
Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
We ought to have a single concept of what a MAC is if we are writing a standard for it.

SuggestedRemedy
Drop definitions 2 and 3.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.93**   *P* **7**   *L* **2,3**   # **192**
Timothy R. Plunkett   NSWCDD (Navy)

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**
Data Link is a Layer, not a Sublayer.

SuggestedRemedy
Data Link Sublayer should be changed to Data Link Layer.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.93**   *P* **7**   *L* **3**   # **193**
Timothy R. Plunkett   NSWCDD (Navy)

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**
Sentence does not make sense.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove the word that from definition (2).

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT. Definition (2) removed.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.95**   *P* **7**   *L* **195**   # **187**
Steven Wood   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**
Implies a reconciliation layer for each PHY. Some phys may not require one.

SuggestedRemedy
Add the sentence: "The reconciliation layer may be null".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.97**   *P* **7**   *L* **203**   **#** **86**

Jim Mollenauer   Technical Strategy As

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

One of the distinguishing features of a MAN is that it is operated by a third party rather than within an enterprise.

SuggestedRemedy

Add at end: "Typically it is operated by a third-party service provider rather than by the user's organization."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.98**   *P* **8**   *L* **204**   **#** **25**

Leon Bruckman   Corrigent Systems

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

Inconsistent with definition 1.40.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "A frame " to "The number of frames ". Or change the term to: "misdelivered frame"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT. Use singular

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.98**   *P* **8**   *L* **204**   **#** **130**

Rhett Brikovskis, Mannix O'Connor   Lantern Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Definition is for "misdelivered frames" (plural), but the definition refers to a singular frame.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "misdelivered frames" to "misdelivered frame".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.98**   *P* **8**   *L* **204**   **#** **218**

Mete YILMAZ   Cisco Systems

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **X**

Term (misdelivered frames) is in plural form.

SuggestedRemedy

It should be misdelivered frame.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.98**   *P* **8**   *L* **205**   **#** **232**

Gary Turner   Lucent Technologies

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **X**

By whom is it considered inconsequential?

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the last sentence.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE. Change final sentence to "An errored frame delivered to the wrong station is still considered misdelivered."

Cl **01**   *SC* **01.All**   *P* **1-13**   *L* **1-364**   **#** **183**

Robert (Bob) Hott   Naval Surface Warfare

Comment Type **TR**   *Comment Status* **X**

While this document will very helpful for converging on a common vocabulary for 802.17, the current state of the document is incomplete. The document has numerous words or phrases with a definition of "TBD by Performance Ad Hoc".

SuggestedRemedy

It is recommended that all phrases or terms currently without definitions should be placed within "angle brackets" until a definition can be supplied. This convention was identified in the Note, page 1, lines 4-5.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE See #51.