1
2
3   IEEE 802.20 Meeting Minutes
4   Plenary Session,
5   March 17-21, 2008,
6   Orlando, FL, USA
7
8 Chair: Arnie Greenspan
9 Vice-chair: Mark Klerer
10 Recording Secretary: Chirag Patel
11
12 **Day 1 – March 17, 2008**
13
14 PM1 session begins at 1:45 pm
15
16 The Chair noted that Mr. Gillies could no longer serve as recording secretary but that Mr.
17 Chirag Patel had volunteered to serve as recording Secretary. There were no objections to
18 Mr. Patel assuming the duties of recording secretary.
19
20 Chairman (Arnie Greenspan) reviews IEEE patents policy.
21
22 Member introduction and disclosure of their affiliations.
23
24 Chair's opening remarks
25
26 Chair gives week's agenda
27   • Two PARs,
28   • Comment Resolution,
29   • Election of Officers,
30   • Affirmation of Taiwan Accomplishments,
31   • Update of 802.20 P&P)
32
33 **Motion for Approval of Atlanta meeting minutes**
34 Mover: Jerry Upton
35 Second: Radhakrishna Canchi
36
37 *Atlanta minutes are approved unanimously by the voting members.*
38
39 **Motion for Approval of Taipei meeting minutes – revision R2.**
40 Mover: Jerry Upton
41 Second: Victor Hou
42
43 *Taiwan meeting minutes version R2 are approved unanimously by the voting members.*
44
45 Discusson on new 802.20 Technical development work plan
46 Two new PARs are discussed.

1   **Motion to approve the new technical development plan (Refer to doc: 802.20-PD-**
2   **07r5)**
3
4   Mover: Jim Tomcik
5   Second: Francis O'Brien
6
7   *The new technical development work plan approved unanimously by the voting members.*
8
9   **Motion to approve the meeting agenda**
10 Mover: Nancy Bravin
11 Second: Jim Ragsdale
12
13 Agenda corrected to show correct dates and also a note is added to indicate that if agenda
14 moves faster, then items for the later day will be moved ahead.
15
16 *Agenda approved unanimously by the voting members.*
17
18 **Discussion of P&P (C802.20-08/20)**
19
20 Draft P&P prepared by Jerry Upton
21 Update on the P&P proposal prepared in Taipei.
22 Jerry Upton goes over major points of the P&P document.
23
24 Chair comments on what voting procedure is needed for 802.20.
25 Change entity voting to block voting or something more appropriate in the document.
26
27 Victor Hou's comments:
28 Discussion on P&P C802.20-08-01.pdf
29 Discusses good points in the current P&P (e.g., four hour rule, standing committees)
30 Strongly stated that directly referencing IEEE 802 P&P is not the most suitable approach
31 because good information, procedure and practice will be lost.
32 Victor Hou opposes removal of some of the 802.20 P&P material (e.g. meeting etiquette).
33
34 Arnie Greenspan suggests putting together a task group in this meeting to take a look at
35 current P&P.
36
37 Jerry Upton suggests to operate as per 802 procedures and include some items that are
38 good and may be kept.
39 Jim Ragsdale suggests having a procedure unified and consistent to 802
40 Jim Tomcik agrees with Jim Ragsdale' s suggestions
41
42 Arnie Greenspan suggests adding Appendices to include relevant items.
43 Jim Ragsdale suggests deciding on an approach to make changes to P&P
44 Arnie Greenspan suggests discussing above two approaches
45
46 **Coffee Break (3:10 pm)**

1   Meeting re-convenes after the break (3:45 pm)
2
3   Discussion on PAR for Minimum Performance Requirements (C802.20-08/04).
4   **Motion to approve the MPR PAR.**
5   Mover: Jim Tomcik
6   Second: Radhakrishna Canchi
7
8   *The MPR PAR approved by the voting members by acclamation.*
9
10 Discussion on PICS PAR (802.20/08-03)
11 **Motion to approve the PICS PAR.**
12 Mover: Jerry Upton
13 Second: Nancy Bravin
14
15 *The PICS PAR approved by the voting members by acclamation.*
16 All 9 voters (including the chair) were present.
17
18 Discussion on Officer election process
19 (The document was mailed on the reflector)
20
21 Summary: There will be a survey of the WG members by roll-call or ballot followed by
22 voting by the voting members.
23
24 Continued discussion on P&P
25
26 Jim Ragsdale pointed to discussion in Taipei that 802 P&P will be adopted. (Page 5 of
27 Taipei approved minutes)
28
29 **Motion to affirm the decision taken in Taipei to follow the P&P adoption approach**
30 **suggested by Jerry Upton.**
31
32 Mover: Jim Ragsdale
33 Second: Jerry Upton
34
35 Voting:
36 5 Affirm, 1 Abstain, 1 NO, 2 did not vote (including the Chair)
37
38 *The motion is approved. We have a decision to move forward regarding the approach to*
39 *be followed for P&P changes.*
40 This will be formally voted on Friday.
41
42 Further discussion on the voting procedure to be specified in P&P
43 Discussion ensued on incorporating the voting procedure edited by Mr. Greenspan for the
44 March 2008 elections as Appendix A of the 802.20 P&P.
45 Victor Hou opposes the changing of the voting procedure in the 802.20 P&P to be the
46 one used for officer elections at the March 2008 meeting, edited by Arnie Greenspan, and

1 has said that any revisions of the voting procedure for the P&P should be based on edits
2 of the old Appendix A. He wants to retain only procedure for individual voting and not
3 include any special cases.
4 It was suggested to include all possible scenarios - block voting as well as individual
5 voting because it's not clear what the procedure will be in the future.
6
7 Jim Ragsdale summarizes it as - operating as agreed upon in Taipei.
8
9 Jerry Upton to update the P&P version 802.20/08-02 to reflect changes required based on
10 the discussion in the meeting.
11
12 Discussion on re-circulation ballot voting
13 153 eligible voters.
14 83% return, 77% approval.
15
16 Chair to discuss the voting results/patterns with the standards board.
17
18 **Session adjourned. To re-convene at 7.00 pm**
19
20 **Session re-convenes**
21
22 Discussion on officer election process
23
24 Chair provides paper ballot to WG members. This is an individual ballot. The votes serve
25 as a survey of the opinion of WG members.
26
27 **Mark Klerer (Affiliation: Qualcomm) is the only nominated person for Chair on the**
28 **individual ballot.**
29
30
31 Results of secret-ballot survey of individual voting members, excluding an entity's
32 primary voter:
33 14 Affirmative, 1 Negative.
34
35 Formal voting: (entity voting)
36 Alcatel Lucent - approve
37 Broadcom - abstain
38 Qualcomm - approve
39 Kyocera - approve
40 Nokia Siemens - abstain
41 Steepest Ascent - approve
42 Ericsson - approve
43 AT&T - approve
44 NEC - approve
45 Niigata University - approve
46

1 8 - approve, 2 - abstain, chairman did not vote
2
3 *Mark Klerer elected the Chairman of 802.20 WG*
4
5 **Voting for procedural vice-chair:**
6 **Candidate: Radhakrishna Canchi (Affiliation: Kyocera)**
7
8
9   Results of secret-ballot survey of individual voting members, excluding an entity's
10 primary voter: 14 approve, 1 abstain
11
12 Formal voting (entity based):
13 Alcatel Lucent - approve
14 Broadcom - disapprove
15 Qualcomm - approve
16 Kyocera - approve
17 Nokia Siemens - approve
18 Steepest Ascent - approve
19 Ericsson - approve
20 AT&T - approve
21 NEC - approve
22 Niigata University - approve
23
24 9 - approve, 1 - disapprove, chairman did not vote
25
26 *Radhakrishna Canchi elected vice-chair of 802.20 WG*
27
28
29 **Session adjourned. Re-convene tomorrow (18th march).**
30 **End of Day one.**
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45 **Day 2 – March 18, 2008**
46

1   **AM1 session - Meeting re-convenes. (8:45am)**
2
3   Mark Klerer discusses recirculation ballot comments and the way to proceed in resolving
4   them. Mark provided a grouping of related comments to the meeting attendees to
5   facilitate discussion and resolution of comments. Around 80 comments had been
6   received.
7
8   **Comment resolution.**
9   Refer to Sponsor Ballot spreadsheet for detailed disposition of various comments.
10
11   **Coffee break (10:00 am)**
12
13   AM2 session re-convenes (10:30 am)
14
15   Comment resolution continued.
16   Refer to Sponsor Ballot spreadsheet for detailed disposition of various comments.
17
18   **Lunch break (12:30 pm).**
19   **PM1 - Meeting re-convenes (2:15 pm).**
20
21   Comment resolution continued.
22   Refer to Sponsor Ballot spreadsheet for detailed disposition of various comments.
23
24   **Coffee break (2:40 pm).**
25   **PM1 session - (3:05 pm).**
26
27   Comment resolution continued.
28   Refer to Sponsor Ballot spreadsheet for detailed disposition of various comments.
29
30   **Meeting adjourned (5:55 pm).**
31   **End of Day Two**
32
33
34   **<u>Day 3 – March 19, 2008</u>**
35   **AM1 session – 8:45 am**
36
37   Summary of ITU meeting (802.18) by Tom Wasilewski.
38   It was reported that 802.18 is going to evaluate different proposals from different WGs,
39   but that 802.18 will not get into technical content of the submitted proposals.
40   Jim Ragsdale – presented the schedule for IMT Advanced.
41
42   M. Klerer goes over the day's agenda
43
44   **Comment resolution continued from the previous day.**
45   Refer to Sponsor Ballot spreadsheet for detailed disposition of various comments.
46

1   **Coffee break (10:05 am)**
2   **AM2 session begins (11:05 am)**
3
4   **Comment resolution continued**
5
6   **Lunch break (12:40 am)**
7   **PM1 session - 2:15 pm**
8
9   Discussion on 802.20.3 PAR feedback
10
11   Discussion of comments related to the PICS PAR.
12
13   Discussion of comments on the Minimum Performance PAR.
14
15   Jim Tomcik and Jerry Upton agreed to draft the responses to comments and modify the
16   PAR text accordingly.
17
18   **Coffee break (2:50 pm)**
19   **PM2 session begins (3:15 am)**
20
21   Discussion on PAR feedback and modified PAR
22
23   PAR 802.20.2 (MP PAR)
24   Chair goes over the responses prepared by Jim T. (Qualcomm)
25
26   **Motion to approve the modified** 802.20.2 **(MP) PAR**
27   Moved: Jerry Upton
28   Second: Radhakrishna Canchi
29
30   6 members (excluding the chair) present
31
32   *The designated voting members approve the modified PAR with acclamation*
33
34   Discussion on PICs PAR
35
36   Members discuss the responses crafted to the comments on the PICS PAR.
37   Agree to fix minor typos.
38
39   **Motion to approve the modified PICS PAR**
40   Moved: Jerry Upton
41   Second: Radhakrishna Canchi
42
43   *The voting members unanimously approve the modified PAR.*
44   Typos, etc. fixed.
45   No objections from members on the modified PAR
46

1   **Comment resolution continued**
2
3   **Session adjourned** (5:50 pm)
4   **End of Day 3**
5
6
7   <u>**Day 4– March 18, 2008**</u>
8   AM1 session - Meeting re-convenes (8:40 am)
9
10 **Comment resolution continued.**
11 Refer to Sponsor Ballot spreadsheet for detailed disposition of various comments.
12
13 Discussion on revised P&P
14
15 **Motion to approve revised P&P as reviewed in March 2008 (given in C802.20-02R1)**
16 The Working Group approves the revision of the 802.20 Policies and Procedures as
17 reviewed in the March 2008 opening and stated in Contribution C802.20-08/02R1 which
18 was based on C802.20-08/01.
19
20
21 Moved: Jerry Upton
22 Second: Jim Ragsdale
23
24 Request to continue discussion after coffee break
25 The motion discussion will be continued after the break
26
27 Voting:
28 Alcatel-Lucent - approve
29 Broadcom - disapprove
30 Qualcomm - approve
31 Kyocera - approve
32 Nokia-Siemens - disapprove
33 Steepest Ascent - approve
34 Ericsson - approve
35 AT&T - approve
36 NEC - approve
37 Niigata Univ. - approve
38 Miagi Univ. - approve
39
40 9 - approves, 2 - disapproves, chair did not vote
41
42 *The motion to approve revised P&P passed*
43
44 Victor Hou requested that this motion be sent out as a letter ballot to the voting members.
45 This request needs to be formally voted by the WG members before sending it.
46

1 **Motion to send out a letter ballot to affirm the vote on the revision of 802.20 P&P as**
2 **voted in March 08 closing plenary**
3
4 Moved: Victor Hou
5 Second: No second
6 However, the motion is not 2nded. So, *the above motion is not moved forward.*
7
8 **Continue with comment resolution.**
9
10 Chair discusses the usage of 3GPP2 material in the 802.20 standard, the procedure to be
11 followed and its implications. Modify comment response to identify the material from
12 3GPP2 with copyright permission from the publisher.
13
14 Members discuss the comment resolution reply to relevant comments on the topic.
15 Provide a reference to TIA documents. Members agree to refer to 3GPP2 related material
16 in as published by the TIA.
17
18 **Motion to approve comment resolution:**
19 The WG affirms the resolution of comments that occurred during the March 2008 session
20 for the recirculation of the sponsor ballot. (Approval of this motion does not mean
21 agreement on all resolutions).
22
23 Moved: Jerry Upton
24 Second: Radhakrishna Canchi.
25
26 Voting:
27 Alcatel-Lucent - approve
28 Broadcom - approve
29 Qualcomm - approve
30 Kyocera - approve
31 Nokia-Siemens - disapprove
32 Steepest Ascent - approve
33 Ericsson - approve
34 NEC - approve
35 Niigata Univ. - approve
36 Miagi Univ. - approve
37
38 9 approve, 1 disapprove, chairman did not vote
39 *Motion passes*
40
41 **Motion to take the P802.20 Draft 4.1m to RevCom:**
42 WG recommends and approves the 802.20 Chair requesting approval from the 802
43 Executive Committee to conditionally approve IEEE 802.20 Working Group P802.20
44 Draft 4.1m to go to RevCom.
45 The recirculation ballot will be a 15 day ballot.
46 Comment resolution will occur at the May interim.

1
2 Moved: Jerry Upton
3 Second: R. Canchi
4 Voting:
5 Alcatel-Lucent - approve
6 Broadcom - disapprove
7 Qualcomm - approve
8 Kyocera - approve
9 Nokia-Siemens - disapprove
10 Steepest Ascent - approve
11 Ericsson - approve
12 NEC - approve
13 Niigata Univ. - approve
14 Miagi Univ. - approve
15
16 8 approve, 2 disapprove, chairman did not vote
17
18 *Motion passes*
19
20 **Lunch break (12:55 pm)**
21
22 **AM2 session - Session reconvened (2:00 pm)**
23
24 Discussion on new MIB (Management Information Base) Enhancements and Corrigenda
25 items PAR (802.20.a)
26 Presented by Jim Tomcik.
27
28 **Motion to approve the above PAR:**
29 The WG approves the PAR for the development of a MIB enhancement
30
31 Moved: J. Tomcik
32 Second: R. Canchi
33
34 Floor open for discussion on the PAR.
35
36 Voting:
37 Alcatel-Lucent - approve
38 Broadcom - abstain
39 Qualcomm - approve
40 Kyocera - approve
41 Nokia-Siemens - abstain
42 Ericsson - approve
43 NEC - approve
44 Miagi Univ. - approve
45 6 approves, 2 abstains, chairman did not vote.
46

1   *The motion is approved*.
2
3   **Motion to adjourn the session**
4   Moved: Jerry Upton.
5   Second: Nancy Bravin
6
7   Meeting adjourned.
8   **Close of March 2008 plenary (2:25 pm).**

1

Attendees– March 2008				
Last Name	**First Name**	**Affiliation**	**Member Status**	**Attendance Credit**
Bravin	Nancy	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Budianu	Cristian	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Canchi	Radhakrishna	Kyocera	M	Y
Epstein	M	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Garcia-Alis	Daniel	Steepest Ascent Ltd.	M	Y
Gowaikar	Radhika	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Greenspan	Arnold	AROSCO INC.	M	Y
Hou	Victor	Broadcom	M	Y
Ishida	Kazuhito	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Ji	Tingfang	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Kadous	Tamer	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Karkhanechi	Haideh	HIFAR	O	N
Khatibi	Farrokh	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Klerer	S	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Kolze	Tom	Broadcom	M	N
Murakami	Kazuhiro	Kyocera	M	N
O'Brien	Francis	ALCATEL-LUCENT	M	Y
Oguma	Hiroshi	Insitute of Miyagi Prefecture	M	N
Patel	Chirag	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Pearson	Orlett	ALCATEL-LUCENT	M	Y
Pirhonen	Riku	Nokia Siemens Networks	M	Y
Ragsdale	James	Telefon AB LM Ericsson	M	Y
Sasaki	Shigenobu	Niigata University	M	N
Tomcik	James	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Upton	Jerry	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Wang	Michael	Qualcomm, Inc.	A	Y
Wasilewski	Tom	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Yallapragada	Subbarao	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y
Yang	Wen-Bin	NIST	O	N
Yuza	Masaaki	NEC Infrontia	M	Y
Zhang	Xin	Qualcomm, Inc.	M	Y

2   M=Member, A=Aspirant Member, O=Observer