

P802.3af Draft 3.3 Comments

Cl 30 SC 30.2.5 P13 L49 # 1
Romascanu, Dan Avaya Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status A

It is not clear what is the basic package referred here. i assume it is the PSE Basic Package

SuggestedRemedy

change to PSE basic package (if my assumption is true)

Proposed Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In the text 'For managed Midspans, the Basic Package for PSEs is mandatory;' it is not clear which 'Basic Package' this refers to. This comment is in scope as this is new text; however, this text is identical to the existing text for MAUs which reads 'For managed MAUs, the Basic Package is mandatory;'.
Fix the text in both places.

Cl 30 SC 30.9.2.1.2 P20 L21 # 3
Romascanu, Dan Avaya Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status R

acPSEAdminControlAction is referred - should be acPDAdminControl

SuggestedRemedy

replace

Proposed Response Response Status C

REJECT.

Out of scope.

'acPSEAdminControl' should read 'acPDAdminControl' however this has been incorrect since before D3.2 and is certainly not a D3.2 to D3.3 change despite of the fact that Frame has marked it as such. Reject as out of scope and suggest that it be resubmitted at sponsor ballo

Add editors note to D4.0 that this is an obvious error and this will be fixed per comments on this draft.

Cl 30 SC table 3.4 P14 L37 # 2
Romascanu, Dan Avaya Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status R

The definition of the mandatory package does not make sense to me. You enable a capability that contains no useful management information. Why go through this pain at all?

SuggestedRemedy

add to the mandatory part ('basic package') the Powerpairs, DetectionControl, DetectionStatus capabilities (at least)

Proposed Response Response Status C

REJECT.

Out of scope.

This is not a change from D3.2 to D3.3. Tthis hasn't changed since the beginning of the Working Group balloting with D3.0, hence this is certainly out of scope of this particular recirculation.

As far as the actual comment is concerned, the basic package at the moment tells you that you have a PSE and if it is 'enabled' or 'disabled' so it may be the Basic package is too basic The basic package has always tried to be limited to be this simple, and include additional monitoring in recommended packages.

Cl 30A SC 30A.10.1 P24 L31 # 4
Romascanu, Dan Avaya Inc.

Comment Type E Comment Status R

OIDs are missing through the whole Clause 30A - still ?? This was an old TR back to version 2.something, which was closed without the fix being made! there should be thirty-something TRs to be entered for each of the objects...

SuggestedRemedy

fill in the OIDs

Proposed Response Response Status C

REJECT.

OIDs are not issued by the 802.3 Chair until Sponsor Ballot.

P802.3af Draft 3.3 Comments

Cl 33 SC 33.4.4 P80 L1 # 5
Cobb, Terry Avaya

Comment Type E Comment Status A
Figure 33-17, PI should be between the DUT and center tapped inductor.

SuggestedRemedy
Move PI to where the MDI was in the old Figure 33-17.

Proposed Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

(two places)

Cl 33 SC 33.4.5 P81 L6 # 6
Cobb, Terry Avaya

Comment Type E Comment Status A
Missing capacitor in series with resistor 49.9 (2 places). See Figure 33-17.

SuggestedRemedy
Add capacitor.

Proposed Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

(two places)

Cl 33 SC 33.7.1 P92 L49 # 9
Diab, Wael William Cisco Systems

Comment Type E Comment Status A
The introduction line to the section has 200x should be a real year:
"conform to IEEE Std 802.3af-200x"

SuggestedRemedy
conform to IEEE Std 802.3af-2002

Proposed Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.4 P105 L15 # 7
Cobb, Terry Avaya

Comment Type E Comment Status A
EL19 was not updated after last change.

SuggestedRemedy
Add correct value for return loss, see page 81 33.4.7

Proposed Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

"... for a 10Mb/s PHY, in ANSI X3.263:1995 for a 100Mb/s PHY, and subclause 40.8.3.1 for a 1000Mb/s PHY."

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.4 P105 L39 # 8
Cobb, Terry Avaya

Comment Type E Comment Status A
Missing end point equals: <=

SuggestedRemedy
See Table 33-16 page 85.

Proposed Response Response Status C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

"1MHz<=f<20MHz" "20MHz<=f<=100MHz"