

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 00 SC 0 P0 L0 MyBallot # 119  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type GR Comment Status R  
 Comments on Section 3.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

The commenter withdrew this comment and supplied the comments contained in this pdf in responsive format prior to the ballot deadline.

Cl 00 SC 0 P0 L0 MyBallot # 118  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type GR Comment Status R  
 Comments on Section 4, as notes in pdf.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

The commenter withdrew this comment and supplied the comments contained in this pdf in responsive format prior to the ballot deadline.

Cl 00 SC 0 P0 L0 MyBallot # 117  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type GR Comment Status R  
 Section 2 comments, in pdf.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

The commenter withdrew this comment and supplied the comments contained in this pdf in responsive format prior to the ballot deadline.

Cl 00 SC 0 P0 L0 MyBallot # 116  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type GR Comment Status R  
 Changes to Section 1, in attached pdf.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

The commenter withdrew this comment and supplied the comments contained in this pdf in responsive format prior to the ballot deadline.

Cl 00 SC 0 P0 L0 MyBallot # 115  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type GR Comment Status A  
 Comments to be coming, by 13Jan2005 deadline.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT.

The comment arrived by the deadline.

Cl 00 SC 0 P0 L0 MyBallot # 1638  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type GR Comment Status R  
 Section 5 comments in pdf.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

The commenter withdrew this comment and supplied the comments contained in this pdf in responsive format prior to the ballot deadline.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 00 SC i P0 L17 MyBallot # 160  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

DVJ1/1-i-17: The title is inconsistent with page #1, leading one to (I believe falsely) conclude that these mean different things.

SuggestedRemedy

==> Part 3: Carrier xense multiple zccess with collision detection (CSMA/CD) access method and physical layer specifications OR Part 3: Carrier Sense Multiple Access with Collision Detection (CSMA/CD) access method and physical layer specifications And d

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The title both here and on page 1 will be corrected to match exactly that stated on the IEEE P802.3REVam PAR, "Information technology -- Telecommunications and information exchange between systems -- Local and metropolitan area networks -- specific requirements Part 3: Carrier Sense Multiple Access with Collision Detection (CSMA/CD) Access Method and Physical Layer Specifications".

The PAR is available on the web at the URL:  
 [ <http://standards.ieee.org/board/nes/projects/802-3-REVam.pdf> ].

Cl 00 SC iii P0 L45 MyBallot # 161  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/2-iii-45: There is no table of contents. I suspect this is because its too hard to do automatically, due to the excessively long clause names, and too error prone to do manually. However, that is not a good excuse.

SuggestedRemedy

Add table of contents, changing excessively long clause titles so they do not wrap when it is automatically generated.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

The table of contents is part of the frontmatter and therefore is not within the scope of an initial sponsor ballot. Table of contents is added is during preparation for publication - the length of the Clause titles has never been raised as an issue by the IEEE-SA Editorial staff.

Cl 01 SC 1.1 P1 L30 MyBallot # 162  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/3-1-30: The funny capitalization leads one to believe this is a special form of "international standard" when that is not the case.

SuggestedRemedy

International Standard ==> international standard

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 01 SC 1.1.2 P2 L28 MyBallot # 163  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/4-2-28: In 1-ii, the capitalization was "media access control", which is proper and inconsistent.

SuggestedRemedy

Media Access Control ==> media access control

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

We consider that the use of capitalization for important and significant terms is useful, and intend to continue its use. Such terms must be distinguished from ordinary English usage; in the context of this standard, they are proper nouns. This standard has undergone editorial coordination review by the IEEE Editorial staff many time during its development, the first version was published in 1985, and this capitalization has never been raised as an issue by them.

The usage on page ii, line 17 will be corrected, that is media access control ==> Media Access Control.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 01 SC 1.1.2 P3 L7 MyBallot # 164  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/5-3-7: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 01 SC 1.2.1 P6 L14 MyBallot # 165  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/6-6-14: Tw, Td, and Tb are not described.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Describe them and illustrate their usage. Also, I think there are more operators than \* and + that need to be described. If so, define them in a consistent fashion.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 Additional description of Tw, Td, and Tb for their usage in each Clause is provided in each Clause. The general definition here is appropriate for Clause 1 and need not be enhanced.  
 The additional operators are defined in subclause 21.5.4.

Cl 01 SC 1.2.1 P6 L9 MyBallot # 166  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/7-6-9: Figures should not have intermixed ALL CAPS and Lower Case, as per IEEE Style Manual.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 TERMS TO ENTER STATE ==> Terms to enter state (etc.)  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 01 SC 1.2.5 P8 L4 MyBallot # 167  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/8-8-4: The notation does not describe a common usage, which is the format of type: xx-yy-zz, which is often used to describe OUI and MAC addresses.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Define the xx-yy-zz hex notation, as per definitions available in RPR.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 This format has not caused problems in the industry and the committee believes that the risk of introducing errors in attempting the recommended change is not justified by the perceived benefit.

Cl 01 SC 1.2.5 P8 L4 MyBallot # 168  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/9-8-4: The notation is too redundant, in that only the subscript notation is needed, except in code, where the language defines the format and meaning.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Eliminate the 0x prefix, and use the more standard subscript(16) in its place.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 The 0x prefix has not caused problems in the industry and the committee believes that the risk of introducing errors in attempting the recommended change is not justified by the perceived benefit.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.110 P22 L9 MyBallot # 174  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/15-22-9: In 1-ii, the capitalization was "media access control", which is proper and inconsistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Media Access Control ==> media access control  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #163.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 01 SC 1.4.148 P24 L45 MyBallot # 175  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/16-24-45: This is an industry standard term, not a proper noun. The capitalization makes it seem different, which it is not.

SuggestedRemedy

Extinction Ratio ==> extinction ratio

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.153 P25 L6 MyBallot # 176  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/17-25-6: This is an industry standard term, not a proper noun. The capitalization makes it seem different, which it is not.

SuggestedRemedy

Extinction Ratio ==> extinction ratio

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See Myballot comment #1900.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.206 P28 L40 MyBallot # 177  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/18-28-40: The capitalization is inconsistent, leading one to believe there are two types of MACs.

SuggestedRemedy

Media Access Control ==> media access control Here and throughout (except where this is already lower case).

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

We consider that the use of capitalization for important and significant terms is useful, and intend to continue its use. Such terms must be distinguished from ordinary English usage; in the context of this standard, they are proper nouns. This standard has undergone editorial coordination review by the IEEE Editorial staff many time during its development, the first version was published in 1985, and this capitalization has never been raised as an issue by them.

The committee recommends that the IEEE-SA editor correct this globally, that is 'media access control' ==>' Media Access Control'.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.224 P29 L38 MyBallot # 178  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/19-29-38: This is an industry standard term, not a proper noun. The capitalization makes it seem different, which it is not.

SuggestedRemedy

Non-Return-to-Zero, Invert on Ones (NRZI): ==> non-return-to-zero, invert on ones (NRZI):

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 01 SC 1.4.230 P30 L4 MyBallot # 179  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/20-30-4: This is not the standard way of defining acronyms.

SuggestedRemedy

Define acronyms in the acronym subclause

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

NLP - Normal Link Pulse is indeed defined in the acronyms subclause (see subclause 1.5).

Cl 01 SC 1.4.253 P31 L26 MyBallot # 180  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/21-31-26: This is an industry standard term, not a proper noun. The capitalization makes it seem different, which it is not.

SuggestedRemedy

Passive-Star Coupler ==> passive-star coupler

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.275 P33 L1 MyBallot # 183  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/24-33-1: In 1-ii, the capitalization was "media access control", which is proper and inconsistent.

SuggestedRemedy

Media Access Control ==> media access control

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #163.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.288 P33 L43 MyBallot # 182  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/23-33-43: In 1-ii, the capitalization was "media access control", which is proper and inconsistent.

SuggestedRemedy

Media Access Control ==> media access control

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #163.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.288 P33 L46 MyBallot # 181  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/22-33-46: This is an industry standard term, not a proper noun. The capitalization makes it seem different, which it is not.

SuggestedRemedy

Reflectance ==> reflectance

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.301 P34 L34 MyBallot # 184  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/25-34-34: In 1-ii, the capitalization was "media access control", which is proper and inconsistent.

SuggestedRemedy

Media Access Control ==> media access control

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #163.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 01 SC 1.4.325 P36 L28 MyBallot # 185  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/26-36-28: In 1-ii, the capitalization was "media access control", which is proper and inconsistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Media Access Control ==> media access control  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #163.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.4 P15 L3 MyBallot # 169  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ1/10-15-3: Inconsistent notation.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use Figure-1b or Figure.1b, but not both notations.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Change 'Figure 17.3' to read 'Clause 17'.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.72 P19 L24 MyBallot # 170  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/11-19-24: This is an industry standard term, not a proper noun. The capitalization makes it seem different, which it is not.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Binary Phase Shift Keying ==> binary phase shift keying  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.76 P19 L39 MyBallot # 172  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/13-19-39: In 1-ii, the capitalization was "media access control", which is proper and inconsistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Media Access Control ==> media access control  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #163.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.78 P19 L44 MyBallot # 171  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/12-19-44: In 1-ii, the capitalization was "media access control", which is proper and inconsistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Media Access Control ==> media access control  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #163.

Cl 01 SC 1.4.82 P20 L1 MyBallot # 173  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/14-20-1: In 1-ii, the capitalization was "media access control", which is proper and inconsistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Media Access Control ==> media access control  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #163.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 01 SC 1.5 P40 L39 MyBallot # 186  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/27-40-39: This is an industry standard term, not a proper noun. The capitalization makes it seem different, which it is not.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Multiplexer ==> multiplexer  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See comment #1900.

Cl 01 SC 1.5 P41 L49 MyBallot # 187  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/28-41-49: This is an industry standard term, not a proper noun. The capitalization makes it seem different, which it is not.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Signal To Noise Ratio ==> signal to noise ratio  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 01 SC 1.5 P41 L18 MyBallot # 189  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/30-41-18: This is an industry standard term, not a proper noun. The capitalization makes it seem different, which it is not.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Phase Locked Loop ==> phase locked loop  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 01 SC 1.5 P41 L8 MyBallot # 190  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/31-41-8: This is an industry standard term, not a proper noun. The capitalization makes it seem different, which it is not.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Printed Circuit Board ==> printed circuit board  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 01 SC 1.5 P41 L27 MyBallot # 188  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/29-41-27: This is an industry standard term, not a proper noun. The capitalization makes it seem different, which it is not.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Pseudo Random Bit Sequence ==> pseudo random bit sequence  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 01 SC 1.5 P42 L12 MyBallot # 192  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/33-42-12: Wrong definition.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Type/Length/Value ==> Type/Length value  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 This is not related to the Type/Length filed interpretation but an widely used encoding for protocols data within a frame that consists of a Type field, a Length field and a Value field.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

**Cl 01**    **SC 1.5**                      **P42**            **L16**    MyBallot # **191**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type    **ER**            Comment Status    **A**                      IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/32-42-16: This is an industry standard term, not a proper noun. The capitalization makes it seem different, which it is not.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Unit Interval ==> unit interval  
 Proposed Response            Response Status    **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 01**    **SC 1.5**                      **P43**            **L1**    MyBallot # **194**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type    **ER**            Comment Status    **R**  
 DVJ1/35-43-1: In 1-ii, the capitalization was "media access control", which is proper and inconsistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Media Access Control ==> Media access control  
 Proposed Response            Response Status    **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #163.

**Cl 02**    **SC 2.1**                      **P43**            **L5**    MyBallot # **193**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type    **ER**            Comment Status    **R**  
 DVJ1/34-43-5: In 1-ii, the capitalization was "media access control", which is proper and inconsistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Media Access Control ==> media access control  
 Proposed Response            Response Status    **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #163.

**Cl 02**    **SC 2.3.4.4**                      **P49**            **L1**    MyBallot # **196**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type    **ER**            Comment Status    **R**  
 DVJ1/37-49-1: Great! This is the proper use of this inconsistent capitalization. However, should include the acronym on first usage, even if in the title.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Media access control ==> media access control (MAC)  
 Proposed Response            Response Status    **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #200.

**Cl 03**    **SC 3.1.1**                      **P49**            **L21**    MyBallot # **195**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type    **TR**            Comment Status    **R**  
 DVJ1/36-49-21: This figure is extremely confusing. The industry places the MSB on the left and the LSB on the right. Doing otherwise is highly confusing.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Show the MSB on the left, change notation to: TRANSMITTED LSB-to-MSB  
 Proposed Response            Response Status    **W**  
 REJECT.

The ability of hundreds of implementers to independently build interoperable MACs with hundreds of millions of installed product demonstrates that the representation used is not a problem.

Changing this figure at this point in the maturity of Ethernet would be highly confusing to the entire community.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 03 SC 3.2.3 P50 L34 MyBallot # 197  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **R**

DVJ1/38-50-34: As Mick Seaman has noted, the transmission order for multibit interconnects is *\_very\_* hard to define.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Show these bits in their MSB-to-LSB order and illustrate how they are transmitted on a bit-serial media.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

REJECT.

The ability of hundreds of implementers to independently build interoperable MACs with hundreds of millions of installed product demonstrates that the representation used is not a problem.

It should also be noted that many of the IEEE Std 802.3 PHYs are not serial and therefore adding a figure that illustrated a bit mapping to a serial transmission would be highly confusing to the entire community.

Cl 03 SC 3.5 P54 L8 MyBallot # 198  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/39-54-8: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 03 SC 3.5.9 P57 L1 MyBallot # 199  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**

DVJ1/40-57-1: Inconsisten with clause 3 title.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Media Access Control ==> Media access control (MAC)

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #200.

Cl 04 SC 4.1.3 P60 L31 MyBallot # 200  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**

DVJ1/41-60-31: Inconsistent with Clause 3 title.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Media Access Control ==> media access control

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

REJECT.

The capitalization of the Clause 3 title will be corrected to match Clause 4, that is "Media access control frame structure" ==> "Media Access Control frame structure".

We consider that the use of capitalization for important and significant terms is useful, and intend to continue its use. Such terms must be distinguished from ordinary English usage; in the context of this standard, they are proper nouns. This standard has undergone editorial coordination review by the IEEE Editorial staff many time during its development, the first version was published in 1985, and this capitalization has never been raised as an issue by them.

The committee recommends that the IEEE-SA editor correct this globally, that is 'media access control' ==>' Media Access Control'.

Cl 04 SC 4.2.2.3 P63 L21 MyBallot # 100  
 BROWN, BENJAMIN J

Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A** IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

Part 1: The first figure referenced in this clause is Figure 4-2

*SuggestedRemedy*

All figure references should be corrected to be in order

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 04 SC 4.2.3.4 P71 L35 MyBallot # 201  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ1/42-71-35: What is this proper noun? Its not defined in the glossary.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Duration of Carrier Event ==> duration of carrier event  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT.  
 This also needs to be corrected on line 7 of this page.

Cl 04 SC 4.3.3 P90 L22 MyBallot # 203  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ1/44-90-22: These unfilled table cells are confusing and look like possible don't cares.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Eliminate the Function column, since it can be included in the title. 2) Straddle other cells as appropriate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 The lines will be eliminated such that this becomes a two line table. The information under the headings are in fact lists.

Cl 04 SC 4.3.3 P90 L22 MyBallot # 202  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A  
 DVJ1/43-90-22: These unfilled table cells are confusing and look like possible don't cares.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Eliminate the Function column, since it can be included in the title. 2) Straddle other cells as appropriate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #203.

Cl 06 SC 6.1 P113 L13 MyBallot # 204  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/45-113-13: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 06 SC 6.3.1.1.2 P114 L38 MyBallot # 205  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/46-114-38: Inconsistent with Clause 3 title.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Media Access Control ==> media access control  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #200.

Cl 07 SC 7.1 P117 L22 MyBallot # 206  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/47-117-22: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 07 SC 7.2.1 P119 L9 MyBallot # 207  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/48-119-9: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 07 SC 7.2.1.1.5 P121 L33 MyBallot # 208  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/49-121-33: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 07 SC 7.2.1.1.5 P122 L15 MyBallot # 210  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ1/51-122-15: Breaking a names across and arrow is unacceptable: it looks like two names.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't break: SET\_MONITOR\_MODE across the arrow.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 07 SC 7.2.1.1.5 P122 L29 MyBallot # 209  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/50-122-29: Special words should not be hyphenated across lines.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Make the special (italics) work nonbreaking: normal.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 07 SC 7.2.2.2.3 P127 L27 MyBallot # 211  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/52-127-27: Be consistent on message names: use an underscore always.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) ACTIVATE PHYSICAL ==> ACTIVATE\_PHYSICAL 2) DEACTIVATE PHYSICAL ==> DEACTIVATE\_PHYSICAL and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

The standard is in wide use with many interoperable implementations, and the current style has not been a detriment to interoperable implementation. Message names have been used in many different design systems.

Also, the committee has an obligation to both past and current users of the standard. In this case, the message names are likely to have been used in product documentation, and a change would be a disservice to users of the current standard.

Cl 07 SC 7.2.4.2 P129 L27 MyBallot # 212  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/53-129-27: State machine names should be computer compatible and easily parsed, as well as consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 BIT\_BUCKET ==> BIT\_BUCKET (similar changes throughout)  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

**Cl 07** SC 7.2.4.2 P129 L40 MyBallot # 213  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A** IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ1/54-129-40: Based on the early state machine definition, '+' is a logical symbol, which is not (i believe) what is intended.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use consistent state machine notation throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 The definition in subclause 1.2 and 21.5 for '+' will be changed to read '+ logical OR, arithmetic addition'.

**Cl 07** SC 7.2.4.6 P131 L11 MyBallot # 214  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/55-131-11: State machine names should be computer compatible and easily parsed, as well as consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NO ERROR ==> NO\_ERROR (similar changes throughout)  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

**Cl 07** SC 7.3.1.1 P132 L10 MyBallot # 215  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/56-132-10: State machine names should be computer compatible and easily parsed, as well as consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 RECEIVE COLLISION ==> RECEIVE\_COLLISION (similar changes throughout)  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

**Cl 08** SC 8.3.1.3 P158 L11 MyBallot # 217  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/58-158-11: Be consistent, compatible with code, and clear.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 POWER ON ==> POWER\_ON  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

**Cl 08** SC 8.3.1.3 P158 L4 MyBallot # 216  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/57-158-4: Be consistent, compatible with code, and clear.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Choose one of: RESET IDLE POWER\_ON And use consistently as the start state of all machines. IDLE is used too many other ways, so RESET may be preferred.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

**Cl 08** SC 8.3.1.3 P159 L13 MyBallot # 218  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/59-159-13: Be consistent, compatible with code, and clear.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Transmitter Idle ==> TRANSMITTER\_IDLE  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 08 SC 8.3.1.3 P161 L2 MyBallot # 220  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/61-161-2: Be consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Power On ==> PowerOn  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

Cl 08 SC 8.3.1.3 P162 L33 MyBallot # 221  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/62-162-33: Bad alignment  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put a line break before the first note, so that the numbered items are consistently aligned.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.3.1.3 P161 L4 MyBallot # 219  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/60-161-4: Be consistent, compatible with code, and clear.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NO OUTPUT ==> NO\_OUTPUT  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

Cl 08 SC 8.4.1.1 P164 L39 MyBallot # 224  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/65-164-39: Bad hyphen  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use nonbreaking hyphen.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.3.1.3 P162 L22 MyBallot # 222  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/63-162-22: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.4.1.1 P164 L43 MyBallot # 223  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/64-164-43: Confusing syntax  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 8.4.2.1.1 b ==> 8.4.2.1.1 (b) and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 08 SC 8.4.1.5 P165 L27 MyBallot # 225  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/66-165-27: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.4.2.1.3 P166 L39 MyBallot # 226  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/67-166-39: Confusing cross-reference

SuggestedRemedy

8.4.2.1d) ==> 8.4.2.1(d) or 8.4.2.1-d Here and throughtout.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.5.3.1 P169 L1 MyBallot # 227  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/68-169-1: Inconsistent italics. There is no need for italics in these headings, and this confuses the meaning of italics used to connotate special meanings other places.

SuggestedRemedy

Eliminate italics in list-item names.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #255.

Cl 08 SC 8.5.3.2.2 P169 L39 MyBallot # 228  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/69-169-39: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.6.2.1 P171 L10 MyBallot # 230  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/71-171-10: Inconsistent normative statements.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 'recommendations' to 'should', with appropriate surrounding wording.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #255.

Cl 08 SC 8.6.2.3 P171 L52 MyBallot # 229  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/70-171-52: Inconsistent italics. There is no need for italics in these headings, and this confuses the meaning of italics used to connotate special meanings other places.

SuggestedRemedy

Eliminate italics in list-item names.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #255.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

**Cl 08**    **SC 8.7.3.1**                      **P174**            **L 20**    MyBallot # **231**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
**Comment Type**    **ER**            **Comment Status**    **A**                                      **IEEE-SA Editor**  
 DVJ1/72-174-20: Bad line break.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Use nonbreaking space within '1 GHz'  
**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status**    **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 08**    **SC 8.7.5**                      **P175**            **L 1**    MyBallot # **233**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
**Comment Type**    **ER**            **Comment Status**    **R**  
 DVJ1/74-175-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 ... Clause 8, ... ==> ... Clause 68  
**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status**    **W**  
 REJECT.  
 The commenter's assumption is wrong. Long titles can be produced in a TOC (see IEEE Std 802.3-2002). The TOC is produced as part of the publication process, it is part of the front matter and therefore not within the scope of this ballot. A TOC will be produced by the publication editor prior to publication.  
 In the case of a PICS title, the PICS is intended for use as a separate document -- filled out by an implementer. The clause name is useful to the recipients of the completed PICS.

**Cl 08**    **SC 8.7.5**                      **P175**            **L 1**    MyBallot # **232**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
**Comment Type**    **ER**            **Comment Status**    **A**                                      **IEEE-SA Editor**  
 DVJ1/73-175-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence.  
**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status**    **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 08**    **SC 8.8.3.2**                      **P176**            **L 26**    MyBallot # **234**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
**Comment Type**    **ER**            **Comment Status**    **A**                                      **IEEE-SA Editor**  
 DVJ1/75-176-26: Inconsistent capitalization, which looks like a typo. Also, inconsistent sentence structure.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 PIXIT (Protocol Implementation eXtra Information for Testing) ==> protocol implementation extra information for testing (PIXIT)  
**Proposed Response**                      **Response Status**    **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 08 SC 8.8.6.1 P178 L13 MyBallot # 237  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/78-178-13: A subclause number with "/2" is very confusing.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Explain with a footnote. 2) Delete. Here and throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

The number after the '/' references the PICS item which is a major capability option.

As noted at the beginning of the clause, the content is not recommended for new implementations. Consequently, changes to the clause will only make them less familiar to the users of the clause that created and use those legacy implementations. In addition, the committee consensus is that risks of introducing errors when making the proposed change to a stable part of the standard outweigh any benefits.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.6.1 P178 L5 MyBallot # 235  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/76-178-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.6.10 P184 L5 MyBallot # 248  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/89-184-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.6.10 P184 L9 MyBallot # 246  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/87-184-9: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

This entry in the table is empty because there is no value or comment necessary. The committee believes this is obvious to the reader and that the addition of extra characters decreases readability.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.6.11 P184 L35 MyBallot # 247  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/88-184-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.6.2 P178 L23 MyBallot # 236  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/77-178-23: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

CI 08 SC 8.8.6.3 P179 L5 MyBallot # 239  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/80-179-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

CI 08 SC 8.8.6.3 P179 L6 MyBallot # 238  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/79-179-6: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #246.

CI 08 SC 8.8.6.4 P180 L6 MyBallot # 240  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/81-180-6: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

CI 08 SC 8.8.6.5 P180 L38 MyBallot # 241  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/82-180-38: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

CI 08 SC 8.8.6.6 P181 L4 MyBallot # 242  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/83-181-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

CI 08 SC 8.8.6.7 P182 L4 MyBallot # 243  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/84-182-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 08 SC 8.8.6.8 P183 L4 MyBallot # 244  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/85-183-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.7.2 P185 L18 MyBallot # 249  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/90-185-18: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.6.9 P183 L29 MyBallot # 245  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/86-183-29: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.7.3 P186 L3 MyBallot # 251  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/92-186-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.7.1 P185 L7 MyBallot # 250  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/91-185-7: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.7.4 P187 L4 MyBallot # 253  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/94-187-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 08 SC 8.8.7.5 P187 L35 MyBallot # 252  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/93-187-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.7.6 P188 L16 MyBallot # 255  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/96-188-16: This table is very confusing, with the header switch in the center.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Split into two tables, so each has its own header. 2) Sort the pins in numerical order.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 As noted at the beginning of the clause, the content is not recommended for new implementations. Consequently, changes to the clause will only make them less familiar to the users of the clause that created and use those legacy implementations. In addition, the committee consensus is that risks of introducing errors when making the proposed change to a stable part of the standard outweigh any benefits.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.7.6 P188 L4 MyBallot # 254  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/95-188-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.8.1 P189 L24 MyBallot # 257  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/98-189-24: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #246.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.8.1 P189 L24 MyBallot # 260  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/101-189-24: Confusing/unnecessary notation.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Eliminate the "a)", etc in descriptions. If this is a necessary part of the cross reference, then include this after the subclause number. The same changes throughtout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.8.1 P189 L37 MyBallot # 259  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/100-189-37: Confusing/unnecessary notation.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Eliminate the "a)", etc in descriptions. If this is a necessary part of the cross reference, then include this after the subclause number. The same changes throughtout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 08 SC 8.8.8.1 P189 L42 MyBallot # 256  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/97-189-42: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.8.1 P189 L6 MyBallot # 258  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/99-189-6: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 08 SC 8.8.8.1 P190 L15 MyBallot # 261  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/102-190-15: Confusing/unnecessary notation.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Eliminate the "a)", etc in descriptions. If this is a necessary part of the cross reference, then include this after the subclause number. The same changes throughtout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

Cl 09 SC 9.1 P191 L38 MyBallot # 262  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/103-191-38: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 09 SC 9.6.6.2 P203 L4 MyBallot # 263  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/104-203-4: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 COUNT CLEAR ==> COUNT\_CLEAR and similar changes throughtout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 09 SC 9.9.1.1 P206 L37 MyBallot # 264  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/105-206-37: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #267.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 09 SC 9.9.4.1.5 P215 L8 MyBallot # 266  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/107-215-8: I'm surprized this doesn't have a RESET state, when others do. What's up?

SuggestedRemedy  
 Explain the difference between IDLE and RESET states, or use RESET notation throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.

As noted at the beginning of subclause 9.9, the content has been superceded by Clause 18. Consequently, changes to the subclause will only make them less familiar to the users of the subclause that created and use those legacy implementations. In addition, the committee consensus is that risks of introducing errors when making the proposed change to a stable part of the standard outweigh any benefits.

Cl 09 SC 9.9.4.1.5 P215 L9 MyBallot # 265  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/106-215-9: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.

SuggestedRemedy  
 TRANSMIT\_TIMER C ==> TRANSMIT\_TIMER\_C

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 09 SC 9.9.6.2 P219 L27 MyBallot # 267  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/108-219-27: Misleading capitalization errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Bit Loss ==> Bit loss Invalid Bits ==> Invalid bits Steady-State Propagation Delay==>Steady-state propagation delay Start-Up Delay==>Start-up delay

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.

As noted at the beginning of subclause 9.9, the content has been superceded by Clause 18. Consequently, changes to the subclause will only make them less familiar to the users of the subclause that created and use those legacy implementations. In addition, the committee consensus is that risks of introducing errors when making the proposed change to a stable part of the standard outweigh any benefits.

Cl 10 SC 10.1.1 P223 L24 MyBallot # 268  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/109-223-24: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 10 SC 10.3.1.1 P226 L29 MyBallot # 269  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/110-226-29: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 OUTPUT\_IDLE ==> OUTPUT\_IDLE and similar changes throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 10 SC 10.3.2.2 P229 L36 MyBallot # 270  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/111-229-36: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 UNJAB\_WAIT ==> UNJAB\_WAIT and similar changes throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 10 SC 10.4.1.3 P 232 L 49 MyBallot # 271  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/112-232-49: Font is wrong and inconsistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ==> 8-point Arial  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 11 SC 11.1.1 P 243 L 28 MyBallot # 274  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/115-243-28: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 10 SC 10.4.1.3 P 232 L 49 MyBallot # 272  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/113-232-49: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 11 SC 11.1.1 P 244 L 11 MyBallot # 275  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/116-244-11: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 10 SC 10.6 P 237 L 29 MyBallot # 273  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/114-237-29: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 11 SC 11.2.3.1 P 251 L 4 MyBallot # 276  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/117-251-4: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 BEGIN RX ==> BEGIN\_RX and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 11 SC 11.3.1.2.3 P 256 L 39 MyBallot # 277  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/118-256-39: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 11 SC 11.3.1.2.4 P 257 L 25 MyBallot # 278  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/119-257-25: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 12 SC 12.1.2 P 271 L 24 MyBallot # 279  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/120-271-24: Inconsistent with Clause 3 title.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Media Access Control ==> media access control  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #200.

Cl 12 SC 12.2.1 P 273 L 18 MyBallot # 280  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/121-273-18: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 12 SC 12.2.3.2 P 275 L 25 MyBallot # 281  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/122-275-25: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 12 SC 12.3.2.3 P 279 L 16 MyBallot # 282  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/123-279-16: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 FETCH BIT ==> FETACH\_BIT and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 12 SC 12.3.2.3.3 P280 L40 MyBallot # 283  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/124-280-40: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ERROR HOLD ==> ERROR\_HOLD and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

Cl 12 SC 12.4.3.2.3 P287 L8 MyBallot # 286  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/127-287-8: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 UPWARD ACTIVE ==> UPWARD\_ACTIVE and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

Cl 12 SC 12.3.2.3.3 P280 L8 MyBallot # 284  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/125-280-8: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 BIT BUCKET ==> BIT\_BUCKET and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

Cl 12 SC 12.4.3.2.3 P288 L46 MyBallot # 287  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/128-288-46: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 DOWNWARD ACTIVE ==> DOWNWARD\_ACTIVE and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

Cl 12 SC 12.3.2.3.5 P281 L9 MyBallot # 285  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/126-281-9: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 CARRIER OFF HOLD ==> CARRIER\_OFF\_HOLD and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

Cl 12 SC 12.4.3.2.3 P288 L9 MyBallot # 288  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/129-288-9: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 JABBER WATCH ==> JABBER\_WATCH and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #255.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 12 SC 12.5.3.1.2 P 294 L 44 MyBallot # 289  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/130-294-44: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 12 SC 12.5.3.1.4 P 295 L 17 MyBallot # 291  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/132-295-17: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 12 SC 12.5.3.1.5 P 295 L 35 MyBallot # 290  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/131-295-35: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 12 SC 12.5.3.1.6 P 296 L 20 MyBallot # 292  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/133-296-20: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 12 SC 12.5.3.2.5 P 298 L 11 MyBallot # 293  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/134-298-11: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 13 SC 13.3 P 309 L 3 MyBallot # 294  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/135-309-3: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Repeater Set ==> Repeater set Link Segments ==> Link segments  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 13 SC 13.3 P310 L12 MyBallot # 298  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/139-310-12: Confusing/unnecessary abbreviations

SuggestedRemedy  
 Coax Seg ==> Coax segment  
 Link Seg ==> Link segment

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

This figure has been in existence for many years. The uncounted number of users, and hundreds of millions of installed devices, indicate configuration of proper Ethernet topologies has not been impeded by these abbreviations.

Cl 13 SC 13.3 P310 L23 MyBallot # 297  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/138-310-23: Misleading capitalization errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Repeater Set ==> Repeater set Link Segment ==> Link segment Coax ... Segment ==> Coax ... segment Fiber Optic Link ==> Fiber optic link

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 13 SC 13.3 P310 L38 MyBallot # 296  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ1/137-310-38: Right side of figure is missing

SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix it.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 13 SC 13.3 P310 L44 MyBallot # 295  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ1/136-310-44: Bottom side of figure is missing.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix it

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 13 SC 13.3 P310 L7 MyBallot # 299  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/140-310-7: Misleading capitalization errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Repeater Set ==> Repeater set Link Segments ==> Link segments

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 13 SC 13.3 P311 L7 MyBallot # 300  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/141-311-7: Misleading capitalization errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Repeater Set ==> Repeater set Link Segment ==> Link segment Fiber Optic Link ==> Fiber optic link

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 13 SC 13.3 P312 L18 MyBallot # 301  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/142-312-18: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Repeater Set ==> Repeater set Fiber Optic Mixing Segment==> Fiber optic mixing segment  
 Fiber Optic Link Segment==> Fiber optic link segment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 13 SC 13.3 P313 L13 MyBallot # 302  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/143-313-13: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Repeater Set ==> Repeater set Fiber Optic Mixing Segment==> Fiber optic mixing segment  
 Fiber Optic Link Segment==> Fiber optic link segment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 13 SC 13.4.1.2 P314 L51 MyBallot # 303  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/144-314-51: The mathematical meaningof "Round" - "Trip" is not what was intended.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 A convention for these field names is needed. Suggestion is either: Round-Trip ==>  
 roundTrip OR 'Round Trip', using single quotes  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 This text has been in existence for many years. The uncounted number of users, and  
 hundreds of millions of installed devices, indicate configuration of proper Ethernet topologies  
 has not been impeded by this name.

Cl 14 SC 14.1.1 P317 L29 MyBallot # 305  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/146-317-29: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.1.1 P317 L39 MyBallot # 304  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/145-317-39: Confusing term: is this a proper noun? Is this a special pair?  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Twisted-Pair Link Segment ==> Twisted-pair link segment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.1.2 P318 L29 MyBallot # 307  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ1/148-318-29: The meaning of "See 1.4" is unclear. What is there? Other definitions?  
 Clearer definitions?  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Clarify, with something like: See 1.4 for additional definitions  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Will add the text 'See 1.4 for additional definitions'.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.1.2 P318 L31 MyBallot # 306  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ1/147-318-31: Funny text-processor errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete these "<=0>" symbols. I suspect its nonstandard FrameMaker template usage problems.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 14 SC 14.1.3.1 P319 L11 MyBallot # 309  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/150-319-11: Twisted-Pair Link Segment

SuggestedRemedy  
 Twisted-Pair Link Segment==>Twisted-pair link segment Twisted-Pair Link Segment==>Twisted-pair link

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.1.3.1 P319 L32 MyBallot # 308  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/149-319-32: Twisted Pairs

SuggestedRemedy  
 Twisted Pairs==>Twisted pairs  
 Twisted-Pair Link Segment==>Twisted-pair link segment  
 Twisted-Pair Link==>Twisted-pair link

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.1.3.1 P319 L8 MyBallot # 310  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/151-319-8: Twisted Pairs

SuggestedRemedy  
 Twisted pairs

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.1 P349 L8 MyBallot # 345  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/186-349-8: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.1.3 P349 L41 MyBallot # 344  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/185-349-41: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.3 P351 L37 MyBallot # 348  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/189-351-37: Inconsistent capitalization, which looks like a typo. Also, inconsistent sentence structure.

SuggestedRemedy

PIXIT (Protocol Implementation eXtra Information for Testing) ==> protocol implementation extra information for testing (PIXIT)

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.1 P352 L10 MyBallot # 353  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/194-352-10: Inconsistent notation.

SuggestedRemedy

Put letters before numbers, as done elsewhere.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

The format for PICS tables has changed during the decades in which IEEE Std 802.3 has been used. As pointed out in various comments, PICS formats vary within this document, including column headings, column order and PICS item numbering. Consideration must be given to both the legacy users of the document and future users of the document. Completed PICS may also be used in contracts.

The IEEE P802.3REVam task force believes conversion of older PICs tables to current format would create too high a probability of introducing errors in very stable portions of the standard and make the material less familiar to legacy users.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.1 P352 L12 MyBallot # 349  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/190-352-12: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.1 P352 L6 MyBallot # 354  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/195-352-6: No column label

SuggestedRemedy

Provide column label

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.1 P352 L6 MyBallot # 351  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/192-352-6: Inconsistent table header names/order.

SuggestedRemedy

All of the PICS should have tables with the same header names and orders. Do this!

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.1 P352 L6 MyBallot # 350  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/191-352-6: Inconsistent table header fonts.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Make these bold.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.10 P357 L21 MyBallot # 388  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/229-357-21: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.1 P352 L7 MyBallot # 352  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/193-352-7: Inconsistent title  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Imp ==> Status  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.10 P357 L24 MyBallot # 383  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/224-357-24: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.1 P352 L9 MyBallot # 355  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/196-352-9: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #246.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.11 P357 L30 MyBallot # 387  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/228-357-30: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.11 P357 L32 MyBallot # 386  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/227-357-32: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefix letters.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.11 P357 L33 MyBallot # 382  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/223-357-33: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.11 P357 L38 MyBallot # 381  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/222-357-38: No column label

SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.12 P358 L27 MyBallot # 390  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/231-358-27: Confusing table rows.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.12 P358 L4 MyBallot # 393  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/234-358-4: No column label

SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.12 P358 L6 MyBallot # 392  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/233-358-6: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefix letters.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.12 P358 L9 MyBallot # 391  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/232-358-9: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.13 P359 L4 MyBallot # 398  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/239-359-4: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.13 P359 L19 MyBallot # 394  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/235-359-19: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.13 P359 L7 MyBallot # 397  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/238-359-7: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefix letters.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.13 P359 L29 MyBallot # 395  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/236-359-29: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.13 P359 L8 MyBallot # 396  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/237-359-8: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.14 P360 L11 MyBallot # 400  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/241-360-11: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.14 P360 L23 MyBallot # 399  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/240-360-23: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.14 P360 L34 MyBallot # 405  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/246-360-34: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.14 P360 L36 MyBallot # 404  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/245-360-36: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row  
 can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefix letters.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.14 P360 L38 MyBallot # 401  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/242-360-38: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.14 P360 L5 MyBallot # 406  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/247-360-5: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.14 P360 L7 MyBallot # 403  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/244-360-7: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.

SuggestedRemedy

Add a couple of prefix letters.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.14 P360 L8 MyBallot # 402  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/243-360-8: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.2 P353 L4 MyBallot # 361  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/202-353-4: No column label

SuggestedRemedy

Provide column label

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.2 P353 L6 MyBallot # 358  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/199-353-6: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.

SuggestedRemedy

Add a couple of prefix letters.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.2 P353 L8 MyBallot # 357  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/198-353-8: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.3 P353 L29 MyBallot # 360  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/201-353-29: No column label

SuggestedRemedy

Provide column label

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.3 P353 L30 MyBallot # 359  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/200-353-30: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefix letters.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.3 P353 L32 MyBallot # 356  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/197-353-32: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.4 P354 L11 MyBallot # 363  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/204-354-11: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.4 P354 L7 MyBallot # 367  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/208-354-7: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.4 P354 L9 MyBallot # 364  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/205-354-9: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefix letters.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.5 P354 L29 MyBallot # 366  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/207-354-29: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.5 P354 L30 MyBallot # 365  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/206-354-30: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefix letters.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.5 P354 L33 MyBallot # 362  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/203-354-33: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.6 P355 L10 MyBallot # 369  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/210-355-10: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.6 P355 L11 MyBallot # 373  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/214-355-11: No column label

SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.6 P355 L7 MyBallot # 374  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/215-355-7: No column label

SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.6 P355 L9 MyBallot # 370  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/211-355-9: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefix letters.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.7 P355 L23 MyBallot # 372  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/213-355-23: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.8 P356 L23 MyBallot # 376  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/217-356-23: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.7 P355 L25 MyBallot # 371  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/212-355-25: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefix letters.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.8 P356 L28 MyBallot # 377  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/218-356-28: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.7 P355 L27 MyBallot # 368  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/209-355-27: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.8 P356 L4 MyBallot # 380  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/221-356-4: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.8 P356 L6 MyBallot # 379  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/220-356-6: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefex letters.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.8 P356 L8 MyBallot # 378  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/219-356-8: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.8 P356 L9 MyBallot # 375  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/216-356-9: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.9 P357 L3 MyBallot # 389  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/230-357-3: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.9 P357 L6 MyBallot # 385  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/226-357-6: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefex letters.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.5.9 P357 L7 MyBallot # 384  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/225-357-7: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6 P361 L4 MyBallot # 413  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/254-361-4: Unclear notation  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: a) Define the meaning of the "/1" notation. b) Eliminatge the "/1" notation.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #237.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.1 P361 L10 MyBallot # 412  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/253-361-10: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.1 P361 L11 MyBallot # 409  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/250-361-11: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefex letters.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.1 P361 L13 MyBallot # 408  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/249-361-13: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.2 P361 L23 MyBallot # 411  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/252-361-23: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.2 P361 L26 MyBallot # 410  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/251-361-26: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefex letters.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.2 P361 L26 MyBallot # 407  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/248-361-26: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.3 P362 L5 MyBallot # 420  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/261-362-5: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.3 P362 L6 MyBallot # 417  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/258-362-6: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefix letters.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.3 P362 L8 MyBallot # 416  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/257-362-8: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.4 P362 L35 MyBallot # 419  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/260-362-35: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.4 P362 L37 MyBallot # 418  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/259-362-37: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefix letters.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.4 P362 L39 MyBallot # 415  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/256-362-39: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.4 P362 L43 MyBallot # 414  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/255-362-43: Confusing table rows.

SuggestedRemedy

Put lines between rows.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.5 P363 L4 MyBallot # 427  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/268-363-4: No column label

SuggestedRemedy

Provide column label

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.5 P363 L6 MyBallot # 424  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/265-363-6: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.

SuggestedRemedy

Add a couple of prefix letters.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.5 P363 L8 MyBallot # 423  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/264-363-8: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.6 P363 L17 MyBallot # 426  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/267-363-17: No column label

SuggestedRemedy

Provide column label

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.6 P363 L20 MyBallot # 425  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/266-363-20: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.

SuggestedRemedy

Add a couple of prefix letters.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.6 P363 L21 MyBallot # 422  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/263-363-21: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.6.6 P363 L34 MyBallot # 421  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/262-363-34: Confusing table rows.

SuggestedRemedy

Put lines between rows.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.7.1 P364 L10 MyBallot # 431  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/272-364-10: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.

SuggestedRemedy

Add a couple of prefix letters.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.7.1 P364 L12 MyBallot # 430  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/271-364-12: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.7.1 P364 L24 MyBallot # 429  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/270-364-24: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.7.1 P364 L27 MyBallot # 428  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/269-364-27: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.7.1 P364 L60 MyBallot # 432  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/273-364-60: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefix letters.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.7.1 P364 L7 MyBallot # 433  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/274-364-7: No column label  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide column label  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.7.1 P365 L1 MyBallot # 440  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/281-365-1: Confusing typo  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 able ==> capable  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.8 P365 L11 MyBallot # 434  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/275-365-11: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.8 P365 L6 MyBallot # 435  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/276-365-6: Elsewhere this column is called Support.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Imp ==> Support  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.8 P365 L6 MyBallot # 438  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/279-365-6: There is no column header.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a column header.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.8 P365 L6 MyBallot # 439  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/280-365-6: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.8 P365 L8 MyBallot # 436  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/277-365-8: These blank cells, in the Imp column, look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.10.4.8 P365 L9 MyBallot # 437  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/278-365-9: Other PICS tables use a few letters in front of the digit, so that the row can be quoted in an easy way, independent of table number changes.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Add a couple of prefix letters.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 14 SC 14.2.1.8 P326 L4 MyBallot # 311  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/152-326-4: Twisted Pairs

SuggestedRemedy  
 Twisted pairs

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

We could find no instance of the text 'Twisted Pairs' at the location this comment indicated, in fact a search of the entire IEEE P802.3REVam section 1 pdf found no instances of 'Twisted Pairs', only 'twisted pairs'.

Cl 14 SC 14.2.3.2 P328 L1 MyBallot # 315  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/156-328-1: Inconsistent notation

SuggestedRemedy  
 Power On ==> PowerOn (as is done elsewhere)

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

The recommended changes do not significantly improve the readability of the document and would only change where inconsistencies appear. There are more usages of Power On in the standard than uses of PowerOn. Many different forms of power on are used interchangeably within the standard (e.g., Power On, PowerOn, power-on, etc.). This has not been a significant problem to implementers as evidenced by the large number of interoperable implementations.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.2.3.2 P328 L32 MyBallot # 313  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/154-328-32: Inconsistent notation

SuggestedRemedy  
 Power On ==> PowerOn (as is done elsewhere)

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

The recommended changes do not significantly improve the readability of the document and would only change where inconsistencies appear. There are more usages of Power On in the standard than uses of PowerOn. Many different forms of power on are used interchangeably within the standard (e.g., Power On, PowerOn, power-on, etc.). This has not been a significant problem to implementers as evidenced by the large number of interoperable implementations.

Cl 14 SC 14.2.3.2 P328 L32 MyBallot # 314  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/155-328-32: Inconsistent notation

SuggestedRemedy  
 Power On ==> PowerOn (as is done elsewhere)

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #313.

Cl 14 SC 14.2.3.2 P328 L37 MyBallot # 319  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/160-328-37: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.

SuggestedRemedy  
 NO OUTPUT ==> NO\_OUTPUT and similar changes throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 14 SC 14.2.3.2 P328 L42 MyBallot # 312  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/153-328-42: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 NO OUTPUT ==> NO\_OUTPUT

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 14 SC 14.2.3.2 P328 L48 MyBallot # 317  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/158-328-48: Confusing capitalization

SuggestedRemedy  
 Transmit State Machine ==> Transmit state machine

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.2.3.2 P328 L48 MyBallot # 316  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/157-328-48: Confusing capitalization

SuggestedRemedy  
 ReceiveState Machine ==> Receive state machine

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.2.3.2 P 328 L 49 MyBallot # 318  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/159-328-49: ACTIVATE PHYSICAL ==> ACTIVATE\_PHYSICAL  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 14 SC 14.2.3.2 P 329 L 3 MyBallot # 320  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/161-329-3: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 SQE TEST WAIT ==> SQE\_TEST\_WAIT  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 14 SC 14.3 P 330 L 1 MyBallot # 321  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/162-330-1: Inconsistent notation  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Power On ==> PowerOn  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #313.

Cl 14 SC 14.3 P 330 L 12 MyBallot # 322  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/163-330-12: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NON-JABBER OUTPUT ==> NON\_JABBER\_OUTPUT And, similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 14 SC 14.3.1 P 331 L 13 MyBallot # 324  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/165-331-13: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 LINK TEST FAIL RESET==> LINK\_TEST\_FAIL\_RESET And, similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 14 SC 14.3.1 P 331 L 2 MyBallot # 323  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/164-331-2: Inconsistent notation  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Power On ==> PowerOn  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #313.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.3.1.2.1 P333 L23 MyBallot # 326  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/167-333-23: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.3.1.2.1 P333 L53 MyBallot # 325  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/166-333-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.3.1.2.2 P335 L27 MyBallot # 327  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/168-335-27: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.3.1.2.2 P335 L30 MyBallot # 328  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/169-335-30: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.3.1.2.6 P337 L28 MyBallot # 329  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/170-337-28: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.3.1.2.6 P337 L7 MyBallot # 330  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/171-337-7: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.3.1.2.7 P 338 L 22 MyBallot # 331  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/172-338-22: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.3.1.3.5 P 340 L 38 MyBallot # 334  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/175-340-38: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.3.1.2.7 P 338 L 8 MyBallot # 332  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/173-338-8: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.3.1.3.5 P 340 L 9 MyBallot # 335  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/176-340-9: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.3.1.3.1 P 339 L 6 MyBallot # 333  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/174-339-6: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.4.4.1 P 343 L 38 MyBallot # 336  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/177-343-38: Illegal equation.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 $7 \log \implies 7x \log$  where x is the multiply symbol  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 This is an acceptable mathematical formal.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.5.1 P344 L10 MyBallot # 337  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/178-344-10: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.5.1 P344 L8 MyBallot # 338  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/179-344-8: columns too wide  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Make them slightly wider than content.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.9 P348 L11 MyBallot # 339  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/180-348-11: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Symbol" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.9 P348 L11 MyBallot # 342  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/183-348-11: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Steady-State Propagation Delay ==> Steady-state propagation delay  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.9 P348 L11 MyBallot # 341  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/182-348-11: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Invalid Bits ==> Invalid bits  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.9 P348 L11 MyBallot # 340  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/181-348-11: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Bit Loss ==> Bit loss  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 14 SC 14.9 P348 L8 MyBallot # 343  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/184-348-8: Start-up Delay  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Start-up delay  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.9 P349 L1 MyBallot # 346  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/187-349-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 14 SC 14.9 P349 L1 MyBallot # 347  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/188-349-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 14, ... ==> ... Clause 14  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 15 SC 15.1.1.2 P368 L14 MyBallot # 441  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/282-368-14: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.1.1.2 P368 L45 MyBallot # 442  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/283-368-45: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.1.1.2 P369 L6 MyBallot # 444  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/285-369-6: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Repeater ==> repeater  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 15 SC 15.1.1.2 P369 L7 MyBallot # 445  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/286-369-7: Inconsistent with Clause 3 title.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Media Access Control ==> media access control  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #200.

Cl 15 SC 15.1.1.2 P369 L9 MyBallot # 443  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/284-369-9: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.1.3.2 P370 L22 MyBallot # 446  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/287-370-22: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Wall Outlet ==> Wall outlet Patch Panel ==> Patch panel Fiber Optic Mixing Segment ==> Fiber optic mixing segment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.1.3.2 P370 L24 MyBallot # 448  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/289-370-24: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.1.3.2 P370 L3 MyBallot # 447  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/288-370-3: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Wall Outlet ==> Wall outlet Duplex Fiber ==> Duplex fiber Patch Panel ==> Patch panel Fiber Optic Link Segment --> Fiber optic link segment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11 P375 L18 MyBallot # 461  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/302-375-18: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11 P375 L31 MyBallot # 459  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/300-375-31: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Reference" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11 P376 L17 MyBallot # 462  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/303-376-17: This blank row is distracting.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Eliminate the blank row.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11 P375 L43 MyBallot # 458  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/299-375-43: Excessively wide columns  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Narrow the columns  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11.2 P376 L36 MyBallot # 463  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/304-376-36: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11 P375 L50 MyBallot # 460  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/301-375-50: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11.2 P377 L16 MyBallot # 466  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/307-377-16: Excessively wide columns  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Narrow the columns  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11.2 P377 L28 MyBallot # 464  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/305-377-28: This blank row is distracting.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Eliminate the blank row.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.  
 Consider a different line to differentiate the two sections.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11.2 P377 L6 MyBallot # 465  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/306-377-6: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Reference" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11.3 P378 L14 MyBallot # 470  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/311-378-14: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11.3 P378 L34 MyBallot # 468  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/309-378-34: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Reference" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11.3 P378 L36 MyBallot # 469  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/310-378-36: Excessively wide columns  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Narrow the columns  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11.3 P378 L46 MyBallot # 467  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/308-378-46: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11.3 P379 L1 MyBallot # 471  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/312-379-1: Looks like two distinct tables.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Include the "continued" marker in the table header, so the continued portions of the table are well identified.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.11.3 P379 L18 MyBallot # 472  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/313-379-18: This blank row is distracting.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Eliminate the blank row.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.8 P373 L16 MyBallot # 456  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/297-373-16: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows, with a straddled left column as needed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 This is common practice in the industry for datasheets and reduces the need to include redundant information that reduces readability.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.8 P373 L23 MyBallot # 455  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/296-373-23: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows, with a straddled left column as needed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #456.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.8 P373 L27 MyBallot # 454  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/295-373-27: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows, with a straddled left column as needed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #456.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.8 P373 L31 MyBallot # 453  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/294-373-31: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows, with a straddled left column as needed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #456.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.8 P373 L36 MyBallot # 452  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/293-373-36: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows, with a straddled left column as needed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #456.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.8 P373 L49 MyBallot # 449  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/290-373-49: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows, with a straddled left column as needed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #456.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.8 P373 L41 MyBallot # 451  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/292-373-41: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows, with a straddled left column as needed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #456.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.8 P373 L8 MyBallot # 457  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/298-373-8: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows, with a straddled left column as needed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #456.

Cl 15 SC 15.2.1.8 P373 L45 MyBallot # 450  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/291-373-45: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows, with a straddled left column as needed.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #456.

Cl 15 SC 15.3.2.2 P381 L48 MyBallot # 474  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/315-381-48: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 15 SC 15.3.2.2 P 381 L 50 MyBallot # 473  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/314-381-50: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.7.1 P 386 L 1 MyBallot # 475  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/316-386-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic  
 formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason  
 one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 15, ... ==> ... Clause 15  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 15 SC 15.8.4.2 P 389 L 5 MyBallot # 478  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/319-389-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.8.6 P 389 L 26 MyBallot # 476  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/317-389-26: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind  
 of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are  
 not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.8.6 P 389 L 27 MyBallot # 477  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/318-389-27: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.8.6.2 P 390 L 5 MyBallot # 481  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/322-390-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 15 SC 15.8.6.3 P 390 L 17 MyBallot # 480  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/321-390-17: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 15 SC 15.8.6.3 P 390 L 40 MyBallot # 479  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/320-390-40: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.1.1.1 P 391 L 35 MyBallot # 482  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/323-391-35: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Star ==> star  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 With one exception, all occurrences of "10BASE-FP Star" have a capitalized "S" in star. The exception is where "10BASE-FP star" is used in a heading (subclause 16.6.7.4). Base on this, and since the IEEE P802.3REVam Task Force believes that this comment is editorial, it will be forwarded to the publication editor.  
 The commenter should note that IEEE editorial staff has indicated that all such comments will only be considered after RevCom / Standards Board approval during the preparation for publication.

Cl 16 SC 16.2.2.2 P 393 L 14 MyBallot # 484  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/325-393-14: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.2.2.2 P 393 L 7 MyBallot # 483  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/324-393-7: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.3.1.1.2 P 395 L 41 MyBallot # 486  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/327-395-41: The definition of a 12-bit Manufacturer IE is very confusing, since the footnote and general assumption is that the IEEE/RAC assigns 24-bit OUIs.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Make this very clear that this is not an OUI. 2) Make it clear how to get one. 3) Provide a detailed example of the layout, from the IEEE/RAC supplied value to the specified value.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 As noted at the beginning of the clause, the content is not recommended for new implementations. Consequently, changes to the clause will only make them less familiar to the users of the clause that created and use those legacy implementations. In addition, the committee consensus is that risks of introducing errors when making the proposed change to a stable part of the standard outweigh any benefits.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 16 SC 16.3.1.1.2 P395 L41 MyBallot # 485  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **A** IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ1/326-395-41: Is this a authority, or the IEEE/RA?  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 a registration authority ==> the IEEE Registration Authority  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 16 SC 16.3.4.2 P397 L49 MyBallot # 487  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/328-397-49: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.3.9.3 P404 L9 MyBallot # 488  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/329-404-9: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 IDENTIFY 2 ==> IDENTIFY\_2 and similar changes throughout  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 16 SC 16.3.9.3 P405 L35 MyBallot # 489  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/330-405-35: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 START LINK TEST ==> START\_LINK\_TEST and similar changes throughout  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 16 SC 16.3.9.3 P405 L9 MyBallot # 490  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/331-405-9: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 OUTPUT DETECTED ==> OUTPUT\_DETECTED and similar changes throughout  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 16 SC 16.3.9.3 P406 L13 MyBallot # 492  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/333-406-13: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NO-JABBER OUTPUT ==> NO\_JABBER\_OUTPUT and similar changes throughout  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 16 SC 16.3.9.3 P 406 L 5 MyBallot # 491  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/332-406-5: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.3.9.3 P 407 L 10 MyBallot # 493  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/334-407-10: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 WAIT FOR PHCRCV ==> WAIT\_FOR\_PHCRCV and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 16 SC 16.3.9.3 P 407 L 5 MyBallot # 494  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/335-407-5: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.4 P 408 L 10 MyBallot # 497  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/338-408-10: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Bit Loss ==> Bit loss Invalid Bits ==> Invalid bits Steady-State Prop.Delay==>Steady-state prop.delay  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.4 P 408 L 11 MyBallot # 496  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/337-408-11: Confusing table  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Split the headers, so each column has its own header.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.4 P 408 L 20 MyBallot # 495  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/336-408-20: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #246.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 16 SC 16.5.2.3 P 410 L1 MyBallot # 500  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/341-410-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 16, ... ==> ... Clause 16

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 16 SC 16.5.2.3 P 410 L1 MyBallot # 499  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/340-410-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.1 P 410 L12 MyBallot # 498  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/339-410-12: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.4.2 P 413 L16 MyBallot # 501  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/342-413-16: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.4.2 P 413 L4 MyBallot # 502  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/343-413-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.12 P 418 L 21 MyBallot # 516  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/357-418-21: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.15 P 419 L 3 MyBallot # 519  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/360-419-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.12 P 418 L 3 MyBallot # 517  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/358-418-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.16 P 419 L 21 MyBallot # 518  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/359-419-21: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.12 P 418 L 32 MyBallot # 515  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/356-418-32: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.17 P 420 L 15 MyBallot # 521  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/362-420-15: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.17 P 420 L 3 MyBallot # 522  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/363-420-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.20 P 421 L 20 MyBallot # 524  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/365-421-20: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.17 P 420 L 36 MyBallot # 520  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/361-420-36: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.20 P 421 L 3 MyBallot # 525  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/366-421-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.2 P 414 L 4 MyBallot # 503  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/344-414-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.20 P 421 L 33 MyBallot # 523  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/364-421-33: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.23 P 422 L 3 MyBallot # 527  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/368-422-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.25 P 423 L 4 MyBallot # 530  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/371-423-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.24 P 422 L 31 MyBallot # 526  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/367-422-31: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.26 P 423 L 35 MyBallot # 529  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/370-423-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.25 P 423 L 17 MyBallot # 528  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/369-423-17: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #456.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.27 P 424 L 4 MyBallot # 534  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/375-424-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.28 P 424 L 28 MyBallot # 533  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/374-424-28: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.3 P 415 L 3 MyBallot # 509  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/350-415-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.29 P 424 L 37 MyBallot # 532  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/373-424-37: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.30 P 425 L 16 MyBallot # 536  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/377-425-16: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.29 P 424 L 44 MyBallot # 531  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/372-424-44: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.30 P 425 L 35 MyBallot # 535  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/376-425-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.30 P 425 L 4 MyBallot # 537  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/378-425-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.30 P 426 L 32 MyBallot # 538  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/379-426-32: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.30 P 426 L 20 MyBallot # 539  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/380-426-20: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.4 P 415 L 24 MyBallot # 508  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/349-415-24: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.30 P 426 L 3 MyBallot # 540  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/381-426-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.5 P 415 L 32 MyBallot # 504  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/345-415-32: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.5 P415 L34 MyBallot # 506  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/347-415-34: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1031.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.5 P415 L38 MyBallot # 505  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/346-415-38: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.6 P415 L51 MyBallot # 507  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/348-415-51: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.6 P416 L19 MyBallot # 511  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/352-416-19: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.6 P416 L3 MyBallot # 512  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/353-416-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.6 P416 L36 MyBallot # 510  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/351-416-36: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.9 P 417 L 26 MyBallot # 514  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/355-417-26: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 16 SC 16.6.6.9 P 417 L 40 MyBallot # 513  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/354-417-40: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.3.10.2 P 436 L 10 MyBallot # 542  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/383-436-10: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial. (I think IEEE limits are no smaller than 6 point, even in extreme cases).  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.3.10.2 P 436 L 11 MyBallot # 544  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/385-436-11: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 LOW LIGHT ==> LOW\_LIGHT and similar changes  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 17 SC 17.3.10.2 P 436 L 31 MyBallot # 541  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ1/382-436-31: There are too many arrow heads.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix your graphics.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 17 SC 17.3.10.2 P 436 L 36 MyBallot # 545  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/386-436-36: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NON-JABBER INPUT ==> NON\_JABBER\_INPUT and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 17 SC 17.3.10.2 P436 L5 MyBallot # 543  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ1/384-436-5: There are too many arrow heads.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix your graphics.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 17 SC 17.3.10.2 P437 L5 MyBallot # 546  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ1/387-437-5: There are too many arrow heads.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix your graphics.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 17 SC 17.4 P438 L15 MyBallot # 547  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/388-438-15: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.4 P438 L33 MyBallot # 550  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/391-438-33: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic  
 formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason  
 one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 17, ... ==> ... Clause 17  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 17 SC 17.4 P438 L34 MyBallot # 548  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/389-438-34: Inconsistent pagination.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Insert page break before 17.5  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.1 P438 L39 MyBallot # 549  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/390-438-39: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are  
 two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance  
 statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and  
 "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with  
 Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.1 P 441 L 42 MyBallot # 552  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/393-441-42: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.1 P 441 L 44 MyBallot # 551  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/392-441-44: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.10 P 446 L 42 MyBallot # 569  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/410-446-42: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.10 P 446 L 5 MyBallot # 570  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/411-446-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.10 P 447 L 29 MyBallot # 572  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/413-447-29: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.10 P 447 L 4 MyBallot # 573  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/414-447-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.10 P 447 L 42 MyBallot # 571  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/412-447-42: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.17 P 448 L 31 MyBallot # 574  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/415-448-31: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.15 P 448 L 4 MyBallot # 576  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/417-448-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.18 P 449 L 26 MyBallot # 577  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/418-449-26: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.16 P 448 L 17 MyBallot # 575  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/416-448-17: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.18 P 449 L 4 MyBallot # 578  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/419-449-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.2 P 442 L 18 MyBallot # 556  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/397-442-18: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.2 P 442 L 36 MyBallot # 553  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/394-442-36: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.2 P 442 L 30 MyBallot # 555  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/396-442-30: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.2 P 442 L 5 MyBallot # 557  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/398-442-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.2 P 442 L 34 MyBallot # 554  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/395-442-34: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.20 P 450 L 5 MyBallot # 581  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/422-450-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.21 P 450 L 33 MyBallot # 580  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/421-450-33: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.24 P 451 L 14 MyBallot # 584  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/425-451-14: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.21 P 450 L 47 MyBallot # 579  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/420-450-47: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.24 P 451 L 27 MyBallot # 583  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/424-451-27: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.23 P 451 L 4 MyBallot # 585  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/426-451-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.24 P 451 L 41 MyBallot # 582  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/423-451-41: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.3 P 443 L 11 MyBallot # 560  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/401-443-11: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.3 P 443 L 4 MyBallot # 562  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/403-443-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.3 P 443 L 14 MyBallot # 559  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/400-443-14: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.4 P 443 L 34 MyBallot # 561  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/402-443-34: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.3 P 443 L 24 MyBallot # 558  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/399-443-24: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.5 P 444 L 26 MyBallot # 563  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/404-444-26: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.5 P 444 L 4 MyBallot # 565  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/406-444-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.5 P 445 L 4 MyBallot # 568  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/409-445-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.5 P 444 L 7 MyBallot # 564  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/405-444-7: Nonstandard confusing table.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows, as is done everywhere else.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.5 P 445 L 43 MyBallot # 566  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/407-445-43: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 17 SC 17.5.6.5 P 445 L 25 MyBallot # 567  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/408-445-25: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P 462 L 12 MyBallot # 587  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/428-462-12: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P 462 L 42 MyBallot # 590  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/431-462-42: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NO OUTPUT ==> NO\_OUTPUT and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P 462 L 7 MyBallot # 586  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/427-462-7: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P 462 L 48 MyBallot # 588  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/429-462-48: Confusing capitalization  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ReceiveState Machine ==> Receive state machine  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P 463 L 12 MyBallot # 592  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/433-463-12: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P 462 L 49 MyBallot # 589  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/430-462-49: Confusing capitalization  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Transmit State Machine ==> Transmit state machine  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P 463 L 15 MyBallot # 593  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/434-463-15: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 OUTPUT DETECTED ==> OUTPUT\_DETECTED and similar changes  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P 463 L 28 MyBallot # 594  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/435-463-28: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P 464 L 3 MyBallot # 596  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/437-464-3: Inconsistent terminology  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Power On ==> PowerOn  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #313.

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P 463 L 4 MyBallot # 591  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/432-463-4: Inconsistent terminology  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Power On ==> PowerOn  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #313.

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P 465 L 1 MyBallot # 599  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/440-465-1: Inconsistent terminology  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Power On ==> PowerOn  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #313.

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P 464 L 13 MyBallot # 595  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/436-464-13: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NON-JABBER OUTPUT ==> NON\_JABBER\_OUTPUT and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P 465 L 15 MyBallot # 597  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/438-465-15: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P465 L3 MyBallot # 598  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/439-465-3: Inconsistent terminology  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Power On ==> PowerOn  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #313.

Cl 18 SC 18.3.2.1 P465 L7 MyBallot # 600  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/441-465-7: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 LINK TEST PASS ==> LINK\_TEST\_PASS and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 18 SC 18.4 P466 L10 MyBallot # 603  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/444-466-10: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Bit Loss ==> Bit loss Invalid Bits ==> Invalid bits Steady-State Prop. Delay==>Steady-state prop. delay  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.4 P466 L12 MyBallot # 604  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/445-466-12: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.4 P466 L12 MyBallot # 602  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/443-466-12: Confusing headers  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Separate Max and Var headers (unstraddle these two cells)  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.4 P466 L18 MyBallot # 601  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/442-466-18: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comments #871.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 18 SC 18.4 P 467 L 1 MyBallot # 606  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/447-467-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

Protocol implementation conformance statement (PICS) proforma for Clause 18, Fiber optic medium attachment unit, type 10BASE-FL ==> Protocol implementation conformance statement (PICS) proforma for Clause 18

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.1 P 467 L 12 MyBallot # 605  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/446-467-12: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.4.2 P 471 L 33 MyBallot # 608  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/449-471-33: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.4.2 P 471 L 34 MyBallot # 607  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/448-471-34: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.15 P 477 L 21 MyBallot # 630  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/471-477-21: Confusing table rows.

SuggestedRemedy

Put lines between rows.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.15 P 477 L 32 MyBallot # 629  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ1/470-477-32: Confusing table rows.

SuggestedRemedy

Put lines between rows.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.15 P 477 L 5 MyBallot # 631  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/472-477-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.16 P 479 L 32 MyBallot # 634  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/475-479-32: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.16 P 478 L 27 MyBallot # 633  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/474-478-27: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.16 P 479 L 8 MyBallot # 635  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/476-479-8: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.16 P 478 L 6 MyBallot # 632  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/473-478-6: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.2 P 472 L 20 MyBallot # 612  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/453-472-20: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.2 P 472 L 29 MyBallot # 611  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/452-472-29: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.2 P 472 L 33 MyBallot # 610  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/451-472-33: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.2 P 472 L 38 MyBallot # 609  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/450-472-38: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.2 P 472 L 5 MyBallot # 613  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/454-472-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.20 P 480 L 6 MyBallot # 641  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/482-480-6: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.21 P 480 L 16 MyBallot # 636  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/477-480-16: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.21 P 480 L 17 MyBallot # 637  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/478-480-17: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.22 P 480 L 49 MyBallot # 638  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/479-480-49: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.21 P 480 L 20 MyBallot # 640  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/481-480-20: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.23 P 481 L 6 MyBallot # 644  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/485-481-6: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.21 P 480 L 29 MyBallot # 639  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/480-480-29: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.24 P 481 L 33 MyBallot # 643  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/484-481-33: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.25 P 481 L 40 MyBallot # 642  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/483-481-40: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.26 P 482 L 19 MyBallot # 645  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/486-482-19: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.26 P 482 L 5 MyBallot # 646  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/487-482-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.3 P 473 L 11 MyBallot # 618  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/459-473-11: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.3 P 473 L 13 MyBallot # 617  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/458-473-13: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.3 P 473 L 22 MyBallot # 616  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/457-473-22: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.3 P 473 L 6 MyBallot # 614  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/455-473-6: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.6 P 474 L 23 MyBallot # 621  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/462-474-23: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.4 P 473 L 34 MyBallot # 615  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/456-473-34: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.7 P 474 L 32 MyBallot # 620  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/461-474-32: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.5 P 474 L 6 MyBallot # 622  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/463-474-6: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.8 P 474 L 44 MyBallot # 619  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/460-474-44: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.8 P 475 L 30 MyBallot # 624  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/465-475-30: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.8 P 476 L 26 MyBallot # 627  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/468-476-26: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.8 P 475 L 45 MyBallot # 623  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/464-475-45: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.8 P 476 L 4 MyBallot # 628  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/469-476-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.8 P 475 L 5 MyBallot # 625  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/466-475-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 18 SC 18.5.6.8 P 476 L 41 MyBallot # 626  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/467-476-41: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 19 SC 19.1.5 P 484 L 16 MyBallot # 650  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/491-484-16: Not proper noun  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Performing Management Operations ==> Performing management operations  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 19 SC 19.1.5 P 484 L 19 MyBallot # 649  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/490-484-19: Not a proper noun, I think.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Notifications Emitted ==> Notifications emitted  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 19 SC 19.1.5 P 484 L 17 MyBallot # 651  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/492-484-17: Not proper noun  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Management Object ==> Management object  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 19 SC 19.1.5 P 484 L 21 MyBallot # 648  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/489-484-21: Not a proper noun, I think.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Managed Objects ==> Managed objects  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 19 SC 19.1.5 P 484 L 17 MyBallot # 647  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/488-484-17: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all ""Item"" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 19 SC 19.2.2.2 P 486 L 34 MyBallot # 652  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/493-486-34: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 19 SC 19.2.2.2 P 489 L 5 MyBallot # 653  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/494-489-5: Inconsistent fonts  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use same font and size for all cells in this table.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 20 SC 20.2.1.3 P 503 L 3 MyBallot # 654  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/495-503-3: Inconsistent fonts  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use same font and size for all cells in this table.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 20 SC 20.2.1.3 P 503 L 9 MyBallot # 655  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/496-503-9: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows and columns.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 As noted at the beginning of the clause, this clause is deprecated by Clause 30. Consequently, changes to the clause will only make them less familiar to the users of the clause that created and use those legacy implementations.  
 In addition, the committee consensus is that risks of introducing errors when making the proposed change to a stable part of the standard outweigh any benefits.

Cl 20 SC 20.2.2.3.1 P 507 L 36 MyBallot # 657  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ1/498-507-36: The Pascal programming language is irrelevant unless its a normative reference, since normative code is written in Pascal.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Remove this reference. 2) Make this a reference, listed up front, and modify Pascal code in this specification to conform to this reference.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

The ability of hundreds of implementers to independently build interoperable MACs with hundreds of millions of installed product demonstrates that the reference used is not a problem. Modifying the Pascal at this point in the maturity of Ethernet would be highly confusing to the entire community and unacceptable probability of introducing errors.

Cl 20 SC 20.2.2.3.1 P 507 L 8 MyBallot # 656  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/497-507-8: Annex A title is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Additional reference material ==> Bibliography  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 21 SC 21.1.1 P 2 L 7 MyBallot # 683  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/1-2-7: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 21 SC 21.5.1 P3 L43 MyBallot # 684  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/2-3-43: This looks like typos.

SuggestedRemedy

.indication ==> ".indication" .request ==> ".request" (here and elsewhere)

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

The consensus of the committee is that this is not a typo.

Cl 21 SC 21.5.3 P4 L46 MyBallot # 686  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/4-4-46: Inconsistent pagination. The PICS convention is to start on a new page, so the PICS can be copied w/o copyright problems.

SuggestedRemedy

Page break before 21.6

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 21 SC 21.5.3 P4 L46 MyBallot # 687  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/5-4-46: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 21 SC 21.6.1 P4 L51 MyBallot # 685  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/3-4-51: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.1 P9 L22 MyBallot # 688  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/6-9-22: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.

SuggestedRemedy

Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.1 P9 L40 MyBallot # 689  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/7-9-40: Inconsistent with Clause 3 title.

SuggestedRemedy

Media Access Control ==> media access control

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #200.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 22 SC 22.2.3 P21 L 26 MyBallot # 696  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/14-21-26: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.3 P21 L 36 MyBallot # 693  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/11-21-36: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 First Bit ==> First bit  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.3 P21 L 36 MyBallot # 694  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/12-21-36: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 MAC's Serial Bit Stream ==> MAC's serial bit stream  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.3 P21 L 37 MyBallot # 695  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/13-21-37: Very \_very\_ confusing.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Flip the octet so that the LSB is on the right.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 This diagram has not present a problem in the past and bits are clearly labeled. It is consensus of the committee that not only would it be more confusing to user of the specification to change this it would also run a high risk of introducing errors.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.3 P21 L 40 MyBallot # 692  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/10-21-40: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Second Nibble ==> Second nibble  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.3 P21 L 40 MyBallot # 691  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/9-21-40: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 First nibble ==> First nibble  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 22 SC 22.2.3 P21 L45 MyBallot # 690  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/8-21-45: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 MII Nibble Stream ==> MII nibble stream  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4 P24 L28 MyBallot # 698  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/16-24-28: Funky table  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use two rows in the header, so MII and GMII can have separate headers.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4 P24 L29 MyBallot # 697  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/15-24-29: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.1 P25 L10 MyBallot # 699  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/17-25-10: Very confusing pseudo column.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Make a separate column for 0,1 values. 2) Always place 0 first, for consistency with natural counting order.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #740.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.1 P25 L10 MyBallot # 711  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/29-25-10: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as SC).  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.1 P25 L12 MyBallot # 710  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/28-25-12: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.1 P25 L15 MyBallot # 709  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/27-25-15: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.1 P25 L24 MyBallot # 706  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/24-25-24: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.1 P25 L19 MyBallot # 708  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/26-25-19: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.1 P25 L27 MyBallot # 705  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/23-25-27: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.1 P25 L22 MyBallot # 707  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/25-25-22: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.1 P25 L29 MyBallot # 704  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/22-25-29: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.1 P25 L 31 MyBallot # 703  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/21-25-31: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.1 P25 L 42 MyBallot # 700  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/18-25-42: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.1 P25 L 33 MyBallot # 702  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/20-25-33: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P29 L 18 MyBallot # 725  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/43-29-18: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as SC).  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.1 P25 L 38 MyBallot # 701  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/19-25-38: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P29 L 18 MyBallot # 712  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/30-29-18: Very confusing pseudo column.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Make a separate column for 0,1 values. 2) Always place 0 first, for consistency with natural counting order.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #740.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P29 L20 MyBallot # 724  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/42-29-20: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P29 L27 MyBallot # 721  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/39-29-27: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P29 L23 MyBallot # 723  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/41-29-23: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P29 L30 MyBallot # 720  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/38-29-30: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P29 L25 MyBallot # 722  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/40-29-25: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P29 L31 MyBallot # 719  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/37-29-31: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P29 L34 MyBallot # 718  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/36-29-34: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P29 L44 MyBallot # 715  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/33-29-44: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P29 L36 MyBallot # 717  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/35-29-36: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P29 L49 MyBallot # 714  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/32-29-49: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P29 L39 MyBallot # 716  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/34-29-39: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P29 L51 MyBallot # 713  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/31-29-51: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P30 L12 MyBallot # 726  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/44-30-12: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P30 L9 MyBallot # 727  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/45-30-9: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P30 L5 MyBallot # 729  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/47-30-5: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.3.1 P33 L2 MyBallot # 730  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/48-33-2: This subclause is very confusing. The IEEE/RAC assigns hex digits, not bits. Bit order is confusing due to mixed endian approach.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Provide an example of how the IEEE/RAC assigned hex values map to this register. Examples are available in the maintenance requests submitted by this reviewer to this standard.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 We reference IEEE Std 802 which defines how the IEEE/RAC assigned hex values map to bits. With that information this figure is sufficient.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.2 P30 L7 MyBallot # 728  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/46-30-7: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.3.11 P34 L28 MyBallot # 733  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/51-34-28: This column (and others throughout) are very confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as SC).  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.3.11 P34 L28 MyBallot # 732  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/50-34-28: Very confusing pseudo column.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Make a separate column for 0,1 values. 2) Always place 0 first, for consistency with natural counting order.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #740.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.3.11 P34 L32 MyBallot # 731  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/49-34-32: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.3.12 P35 L13 MyBallot # 734  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/52-35-13: The table number is missing.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Table 22- ==> Table 22-N, where N is the right number.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.3.12 P35 L22 MyBallot # 735  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/53-35-22: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as SC).  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.4.1 P36 L10 MyBallot # 737  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/55-36-10: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

Cl 22 SC 22.2.4.4.1 P36 L12 MyBallot # 736  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/54-36-12: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #739.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

CI 22 SC 22.2.4.4.1 P36 L3 MyBallot # 741  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/59-36-3: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as SC).

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

CI 22 SC 22.2.4.4.1 P36 L4 MyBallot # 740  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/58-36-4: Very confusing pseudo column.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Make a separate column for 0,1 values. 2) Always place 0 first, for consistency with natural counting order.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

The current format is believed to best convey the desired information. The description of the bit(s) may be a simple 0 or 1, or as the case with Table 22-10, a multibit field, or as the case with Table 22-7, a disjoint multibit field. 0 and 1 columns don't work well for these multibit fields.

CI 22 SC 22.2.4.4.1 P36 L5 MyBallot # 739  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/57-36-5: Confusing table rows.

SuggestedRemedy

Put lines between rows.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

The current format is believed to best convey the desired information.

CI 22 SC 22.2.4.4.1 P36 L8 MyBallot # 738  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/56-36-8: Confusing table rows.

SuggestedRemedy

Put lines between rows.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #739.

CI 22 SC 22.2.4.5.1 P37 L2 MyBallot # 742  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/60-37-2: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all columns.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

CI 22 SC 22.4.4.2 P43 L6 MyBallot # 743  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/61-43-6: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle the rows.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #246.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 22 SC 22.6.5 P48 L8 MyBallot # 745  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/63-48-8: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Contact" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.6.5 P48 L9 MyBallot # 744  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/62-48-9: Very confusing table, with duplicate/contradictory columns.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Make this look like two adjacent tables, but putting a narrow column in the center and making its lines clear.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 22 SC 22.6.5 P49 L1 MyBallot # 748  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/66-49-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.6.5 P49 L1 MyBallot # 747  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/65-49-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 22, ... ==> ... Clause 22  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.1 P49 L7 MyBallot # 746  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/64-49-7: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.2.3 P50 L4 MyBallot # 749  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/67-50-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.1 P51 L7 MyBallot # 754  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/72-51-7: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.1 P51 L7 MyBallot # 755  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/73-51-7: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.1 P51 L8 MyBallot # 753  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/71-51-8: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #766.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.2 P51 L14 MyBallot # 756  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/74-51-14: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.2 P51 L15 MyBallot # 750  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/68-51-15: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.2 P51 L17 MyBallot # 752  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/70-51-17: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #766.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.2 P51 L54 MyBallot # 751  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/69-51-54: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.3 P53 L25 MyBallot # 762  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/80-53-25: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.3 P53 L26 MyBallot # 760  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/78-53-26: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.3 P53 L28 MyBallot # 757  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/75-53-28: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #766.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.3 P53 L53 MyBallot # 759  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/77-53-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.3 P53 L6 MyBallot # 761  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/79-53-6: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

**Cl 22**    **SC 22.7.3.3**                      **P53**            **L 8**    MyBallot # **758**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**            Comment Status **A**                      IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/76-53-8: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response            Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #766.

**Cl 22**    **SC 22.7.3.3**                      **P55**            **L 8**    MyBallot # **763**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**            Comment Status **A**                      IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/81-55-8: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response            Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #766.

**Cl 22**    **SC 22.7.3.3**                      **P55**            **L 38**    MyBallot # **764**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**            Comment Status **A**                      IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/82-55-38: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response            Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #766.

**Cl 22**    **SC 22.7.3.3**                      **P56**            **L 11**    MyBallot # **768**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**            Comment Status **A**                      IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/86-56-11: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response            Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #766.

**Cl 22**    **SC 22.7.3.3**                      **P55**            **L 51**    MyBallot # **765**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**            Comment Status **A**                      IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/83-55-51: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response            Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 22**    **SC 22.7.3.3**                      **P56**            **L 20**    MyBallot # **767**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**            Comment Status **A**                      IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/85-56-20: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response            Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #766.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.3 P56 L43 MyBallot # 766  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/84-56-43: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The format for PICS tables has changed during the decades in which IEEE Std 802.3 has been used. As pointed out in various comments, PICS formats vary within this document, including column headings, column order and PICS item numbering. Consideration must be given to both the legacy users of the document and future users of the document. Completed PICS may also be used in contracts.

The IEEE P802.3REVam task force believes conversion of older PICs tables to current format would create too high a probability of introducing errors in very stable portions of the standard and make the material less familiar to legacy users. The support column however will be made internally consistent.

For the Value/Comment column the cell entry is empty because there is no value or comment necessary. The committee believes this is obvious to the reader and that the addition of extra characters decreases readability.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.3 P56 L44 MyBallot # 769  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/87-56-44: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.3 P57 L16 MyBallot # 771  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/89-57-16: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #766.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.3 P57 L28 MyBallot # 770  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/88-57-28: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #766.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.3 P57 L4 MyBallot # 773  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/91-57-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.3 P57 L5 MyBallot # 772  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/90-57-5: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #766.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.5 P58 L10 MyBallot # 778  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/96-58-10: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #766.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.5 P58 L5 MyBallot # 777  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/95-58-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.5 P58 L7 MyBallot # 779  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/97-58-7: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #766.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.6 P58 L25 MyBallot # 780  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/98-58-25: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.6 P58 L27 MyBallot # 776  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/94-58-27: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.6 P58 L27 MyBallot # 774  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/92-58-27: These blank "Support" cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #766.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.6 P58 L29 MyBallot # 775  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/93-58-29: These blank row cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #766.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.6 P59 L3 MyBallot # 781  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/99-59-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.7 P60 L4 MyBallot # 783  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/101-60-4: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.7 P60 L5 MyBallot # 782  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/100-60-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.7 P60 L6 MyBallot # 784  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/102-60-6: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #766.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

**Cl 22 SC 22.7.3.8 P 60 L 28 MyBallot # 785**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
**Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor**  
 DVJ2/103-60-28: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 23 SC 23.1.4 P 62 L 10 MyBallot # 786**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
**Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor**  
 DVJ2/104-62-10: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 23 SC 23.1.4.1 P 63 L 10 MyBallot # 787**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
**Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor**  
 DVJ2/105-63-10: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 23 SC 23.11.3 P 120 L 11 MyBallot # 804**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
**Comment Type ER Comment Status R**  
 DVJ2/122-120-11: These blank cells look like errors.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1031.

**Cl 23 SC 23.11.3 P 126 L 33 MyBallot # 806**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
**Comment Type ER Comment Status R**  
 DVJ2/124-126-33: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 ... Clause 23, ... ==> ... Clause 23  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

**Cl 23 SC 23.11.3 P 126 L 33 MyBallot # 807**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
**Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor**  
 DVJ2/125-126-33: Inconsistent pagination. The PICS convention is to start on a new page, so the PICS can be copied w/o copyright problems.  
**SuggestedRemedy**  
 Page break before 21.6  
**Proposed Response Response Status W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 23 SC 23.11.3 P126 L33 MyBallot # 808  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/126-126-33: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.1 P126 L41 MyBallot # 805  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/123-126-41: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.3 P128 L4 MyBallot # 813  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/131-128-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.3 P128 L8 MyBallot # 812  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/130-128-8: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4 P128 L31 MyBallot # 814  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/132-128-31: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4 P128 L32 MyBallot # 811  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/129-128-32: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4 P128 L41 MyBallot # 810  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/128-128-41: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4 P128 L39 MyBallot # 815  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/133-128-39: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.10 P133 L7 MyBallot # 834  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/152-133-7: These Support column blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4 P128 L39 MyBallot # 809  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/127-128-39: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.10 P133 L7 MyBallot # 837  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/155-133-7: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.11 P133 L44 MyBallot # 836  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/154-133-44: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.11 P133 L44 MyBallot # 835  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/153-133-44: These Support column blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.11 P133 L44 MyBallot # 838  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/156-133-44: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.12 P134 L5 MyBallot # 840  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/158-134-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.13 P134 L24 MyBallot # 841  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/159-134-24: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.13 P134 L26 MyBallot # 839  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/157-134-26: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.13 P137 L28 MyBallot # 844  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/162-137-28: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.13 P137 L30 MyBallot # 843  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/161-137-30: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.13 P137 L8 MyBallot # 842  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/160-137-8: These Support column blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.13 P138 L7 MyBallot # 845  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/163-138-7: These Support column blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.14 P138 L33 MyBallot # 848  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/166-138-33: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.14 P138 L35 MyBallot # 847  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/165-138-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.14 P138 L38 MyBallot # 846  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/164-138-38: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1031.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.16 P139 L11 MyBallot # 849  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/167-139-11: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1031.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.16 P139 L4 MyBallot # 851  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/169-139-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.16 P139 L6 MyBallot # 850  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/168-139-6: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.17 P140 L31 MyBallot # 852  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/170-140-31: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1031.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.17 P140 L4 MyBallot # 854  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/172-140-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.17 P140 L6 MyBallot # 853  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/171-140-6: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.3 P129 L4 MyBallot # 819  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/137-129-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.3 P129 L6 MyBallot # 820  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/138-129-6: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1031.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.4 P129 L32 MyBallot # 821  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/139-129-32: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.4 P129 L35 MyBallot # 817  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/135-129-35: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1031.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.4 P129 L35 MyBallot # 818  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/136-129-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.4 P129 L 53 MyBallot # 816  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/134-129-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.4 P130 L 18 MyBallot # 824  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/142-130-18: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.4 P130 L 18 MyBallot # 823  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/141-130-18: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.4 P130 L 18 MyBallot # 822  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/140-130-18: These Support column blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.6 P131 L 4 MyBallot # 825  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/143-131-4: These Support column blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.6 P131 L 7 MyBallot # 826  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/144-131-7: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.7 P131 L38 MyBallot # 827  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/145-131-38: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.7 P132 L4 MyBallot # 832  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/150-132-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.7 P132 L46 MyBallot # 833  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/151-132-46: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.7 P132 L47 MyBallot # 829  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/147-132-47: These Support column blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.7 P132 L47 MyBallot # 830  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/148-132-47: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.7 P132 L5 MyBallot # 828  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/146-132-5: These Support column blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 23 SC 23.12.4.8 P132 L20 MyBallot # 831  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/149-132-20: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.2.1.1 P66 L12 MyBallot # 788  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/106-66-12: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.2.1.6 P70 L12 MyBallot # 789  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/107-70-12: Confusing capitalization; implying these are special proper nouns, not simply a "meaning".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Capitalize only first word in Meaning column.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1911.

Cl 23 SC 23.2.4.5 P79 L12 MyBallot # 790  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/108-79-12: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 COLLECT NIBBLE 6N+5 ==> COLLECT\_NIBBLE\_6N\_PLUS\_5 and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

The standard is in wide use with many interoperable implementations, and the current style has not been a detriment to interoperable implementation. Signal and state names have been used in many different design systems and there is no reason to favor the syntax requirements of a single programming language (i.e., C). The variable/signal naming is consistent with the state machine formats described within the standard (see Clause 1.2.1). Also, the committee has an obligation to both past and current users of the standard. In this case, the signal and state names are likely to have been used in product documentation, and a change would be a disservice to users of the current standard.

Cl 23 SC 23.2.4.5 P80 L8 MyBallot # 791  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/109-80-8: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 AWAITING INPUT ==> AWAITING\_INPUT and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 23 SC 23.2.4.5 P81 L12 MyBallot # 792  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/110-81-12: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 PCS ERROR ==> PCS\_ERROR and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 23 SC 23.4.1 P87 L7 MyBallot # 793  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/111-87-7: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.5.1.2.2 P99 L54 MyBallot # 794  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/112-99-54: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.5.1.2.3 P101 L13 MyBallot # 795  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA editor  
 DVJ2/113-101-13: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.5.1.2.4 P102 L29 MyBallot # 796  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/114-102-29: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.5.1.2.4 P102 L7 MyBallot # 797  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/115-102-7: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 23 SC 23.5.1.2.4 P103 L6 MyBallot # 798  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/116-103-6: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.5.1.2.9 P105 L13 MyBallot # 801  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/119-105-13: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.5.1.2.7 P104 L19 MyBallot # 800  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/118-104-19: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.5.1.3.4 P107 L35 MyBallot # 802  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/120-107-35: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.5.1.2.7 P104 L29 MyBallot # 799  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/117-104-29: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 23 SC 23.5.1.3.4 P108 L11 MyBallot # 803  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/121-108-11: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 24 SC 24.1.3 P142 L9 MyBallot # 855  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/173-142-9: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 24 SC 24.1.7 P144 L33 MyBallot # 856  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/174-144-33: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 24 SC 24.1.7 P144 L8 MyBallot # 857  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/175-144-8: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 24 SC 24.1.7 P145 L15 MyBallot # 859  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/177-145-15: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 24 SC 24.1.7 P145 L8 MyBallot # 858  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/176-145-8: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 24 SC 24.2.4.1 P155 L17 MyBallot # 860  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/178-155-17: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 OUTPUT 2 ==> OUTPUT\_2 or OUTPUT2 and similar changes  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 24 SC 24.2.4.2 P156 L13 MyBallot # 861  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/179-156-13: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 START STREAM J ==> START\_STREAM\_J and similar changes

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 24 SC 24.2.4.4.4 P158 L22 MyBallot # 862  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/180-158-22: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 ALIGNED 1 ==> ALIGNED\_1 or ALIGNED1 and similar throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 24 SC 24.2.4.4.4 P159 L15 MyBallot # 863  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/181-159-15: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 BAD SSD ==> BAD\_SSD and similar throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 24 SC 24.2.4.4.4 P160 L23 MyBallot # 864  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/182-160-23: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 CARRIER SENSE OFF ==> CARRIER\_SENSE\_OFF and similar throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 24 SC 24.3.4.4 P169 L15 MyBallot # 865  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/183-169-15: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 RECEIVE NEXT BIT ==> RECEIVE\_NEXT\_BIT and similar throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1911.

Cl 24 SC 24.3.4.4 P170 L19 MyBallot # 866  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/184-170-19: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 LINK\_READY ==> LINK\_READY and similar throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1911.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 24 SC 24.3.4.6 P171 L10 MyBallot # 867  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/185-171-10: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 CHECK\_SIGNAL\_DETECT ==> CHECK\_SIGNAL\_DETECT and similar throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1911.

Cl 24 SC 24.4.1 P172 L14 MyBallot # 868  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/186-172-14: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 GET\_BIT ==> GET\_BIT and similar changes throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1911.

Cl 24 SC 24.6.2 P175 L32 MyBallot # 872  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/190-175-32: These blank 1st column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Merge left column data entries so it's a single cell.

Cl 24 SC 24.6.2 P175 L34 MyBallot # 871  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/189-175-34: These blank Min column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

This entry in the table is empty because there is no value necessary. This is common practice in the industry for datasheets. The committee believes this is obvious to the reader and that the addition of extra characters decreases readability.

Cl 24 SC 24.6.2 P175 L41 MyBallot # 870  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/188-175-41: These blank 1st column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Merge left column data entries so it's a single cell.

Cl 24 SC 24.6.2 P175 L41 MyBallot # 869  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/187-175-41: These blank "Min" column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #871.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 24 SC 24.6.2 P175 L8 MyBallot # 874  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/192-175-8: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Merge left column data entries so it's a single cell.

Cl 24 SC 24.6.2 P175 L8 MyBallot # 873  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/191-175-8: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Merge left column data entries so it's a single cell.

Cl 24 SC 24.7 P177 L1 MyBallot # 878  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/196-177-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 24 SC 24.7 P177 L1 MyBallot # 877  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/195-177-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 24, ... ==> ... Clause 24  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 24 SC 24.7 P177 L1 MyBallot # 876  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/194-177-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 24 SC 24.8.1 P177 L9 MyBallot # 875  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/193-177-9: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 24 SC 24.8.2.3 P178 L4 MyBallot # 885  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/203-178-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 24 SC 24.8.2.3 P178 L6 MyBallot # 884  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/202-178-6: These blank Support column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 24 SC 24.8.2.3 P178 L7 MyBallot # 883  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/201-178-7: These blank right column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 24 SC 24.8.3 P178 L31 MyBallot # 882  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/200-178-31: These blank Support column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 24 SC 24.8.3 P178 L31 MyBallot # 886  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/204-178-31: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 24 SC 24.8.3 P178 L33 MyBallot # 880  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/198-178-33: These blank right column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 24 SC 24.8.3 P178 L42 MyBallot # 881  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/199-178-42: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 24 SC 24.8.3 P178 L42 MyBallot # 887  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA editor  
 DVJ2/205-178-42: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 24 SC 24.8.3 P178 L42 MyBallot # 879  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/197-178-42: These blank right column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 24 SC 24.8.3.3 P179 L11 MyBallot # 889  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/207-179-11: These blank right column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 24 SC 24.8.3.3 P179 L25 MyBallot # 890  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/208-179-25: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 24 SC 24.8.3.3 P179 L26 MyBallot # 892  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/210-179-26: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 24 SC 24.8.3.3 P179 L29 MyBallot # 888  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/206-179-29: These blank right column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 24 SC 24.8.3.3 P179 L9 MyBallot # 891  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/209-179-9: These blank Support column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 25 SC 25.3 P181 L53 MyBallot # 893  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/211-181-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 25 SC 25.4.10 P186 L1 MyBallot # 895  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/213-186-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 25, ... ==> ... Clause 25

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 25 SC 25.4.10 P186 L1 MyBallot # 896  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/214-186-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 25 SC 25.4.3 P183 L13 MyBallot # 894  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/212-183-13: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 2) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1079.

Cl 25 SC 25.5.2.2 P187 L18 MyBallot # 898  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/216-187-18: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 25 SC 25.5.2.2 P187 L18 MyBallot # 903  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/221-187-18: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 25 SC 25.5.2.2 P187 L27 MyBallot # 904  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/222-187-27: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 25 SC 25.5.2.2 P187 L28 MyBallot # 897  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/215-187-28: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 25 SC 25.5.2.2 P187 L31 MyBallot # 900  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/218-187-31: These blank last column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 25 SC 25.5.2.2 P187 L5 MyBallot # 899  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/217-187-5: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 25 SC 25.5.2.2 P187 L5 MyBallot # 902  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/220-187-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 25 SC 25.5.2.2 P187 L6 MyBallot # 901  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/219-187-6: These blank last column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 25 SC 25.5.4.3 P188 L4 MyBallot # 906  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/224-188-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 25 SC 25.5.4.3 P188 L5 MyBallot # 905  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/223-188-5: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 26 SC 26.3 P189 L53 MyBallot # 907  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/225-189-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 26 SC 26.4.2 P192 L1 MyBallot # 908  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/226-192-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 26 SC 26.4.2 P192 L1 MyBallot # 909  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/227-192-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 25, ... ==> ... Clause 25

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 26 SC 26.5.3 P193 L24 MyBallot # 911  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/229-193-24: These blank Support column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 26 SC 26.5.3 P193 L24 MyBallot # 913  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/231-193-24: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 26 SC 26.5.3 P193 L33 MyBallot # 914  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/232-193-33: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 26 SC 26.5.3 P193 L34 MyBallot # 910  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/228-193-34: These blank Support column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 26 SC 26.5.3 P193 L6 MyBallot # 912  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/230-193-6: These blank Support column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.1.1 P195 L33 MyBallot # 915  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/233-195-33: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.

SuggestedRemedy

Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 27 SC 27.1.1 P195 L48 MyBallot # 102  
 BROWN, BENJAMIN J

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

Part 2: The removal of the heading on this figure "LAN CSMA/CD LAYERS" during working group ballot was incorrect. All the layers shown on the right hand side of this figure are indeed CSMA/CD layers. They don't have to be layer 2 to be a CSMA/CD layer. CSMA/CD defines plenty within in layer 1. If it is the plural that is bothersome (because there is only 1 layer shown) then remove it.

SuggestedRemedy

Return the heading "LAN CSMA/CD LAYERS" to this figure.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

This heading is not present above the repeater in Clause 21 nor Clause 41 diagrams. The heading does not make sense without the stack of protocol layers.

Cl 27 SC 27.3.2.2 P209 L3 MyBallot # 916  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/234-209-3: Inconsistent.

SuggestedRemedy

Power on ==> PowerOn

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #313.

Cl 27 SC 27.3.2.2 P210 L20 MyBallot # 917  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/235-210-20: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy

FORCE ATTENTION ==> FORCE\_ATTENTION and similar changes throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 27 SC 27.3.2.2 P211 L21 MyBallot # 918  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/236-211-21: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy

FORCE ATTENTION ==> FORCE\_ATTENTION

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 27 SC 27.3.2.2 P212 L23 MyBallot # 919  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/237-212-23: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 REPEAT DATA ==> REPEAT\_DATA and similar changes  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 27 SC 27.3.2.2 P213 L2 MyBallot # 921  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/239-213-2: Inconsistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Choose between: BEGIN begin = true begin == TRUE (and possible others) and do this everywhere.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 State machine variables are locally defined and in Clause 27 the following definition is provided:  
 begin  
 The Interprocess flag controlling state diagram initialization values.  
 Values: true  
 false  
 On examination of the referenced Clause (clause 27) it does appear to be consistently begin = true.

Cl 27 SC 27.3.2.2 P213 L43 MyBallot # 920  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/238-213-43: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NON-JABBER INPUT ==> NON\_JABBER\_INPUT and similar changes  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 27 SC 27.3.2.2 P213 L5 MyBallot # 922  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/240-213-5: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NO SOURCE DATA ==> NO\_SOURCE\_DATA and similar changes  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 27 SC 27.3.2.2 P214 L6 MyBallot # 923  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/241-214-6: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 CLEAR COUNTER ==> CLEAR\_COUNTER and similar changes  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 27 SC 27.3.2.2 P215 L7 MyBallot # 924  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/242-215-7: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 LINK UNSTABLE ==> LINK\_UNSTABLE and similar changes  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 27 SC 27.3.2.2 P216 L27 MyBallot # 925  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/243-216-27: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 REPEAT DATA ==> REPEAT\_DATA and similar changes  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 27 SC 27.6 P220 L1 MyBallot # 928  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/246-220-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 27 SC 27.6 P220 L1 MyBallot # 927  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/245-220-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 27, ... ==> ... Clause 27  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.1 P220 L7 MyBallot # 926  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/244-220-7: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.2.2 P221 L5 MyBallot # 931  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/249-221-5: These blank right column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.1 P221 L30 MyBallot # 932  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/250-221-30: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.10 P227 L3 MyBallot # 955  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/273-227-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.1 P221 L32 MyBallot # 930  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/248-221-32: These blank right column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.10 P227 L4 MyBallot # 957  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/275-227-4: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.1 P221 L32 MyBallot # 929  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/247-221-32: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.11 P227 L34 MyBallot # 956  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/274-227-34: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.11 P227 L34 MyBallot # 958  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/276-227-34: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.2 P222 L3 MyBallot # 937  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/255-222-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.12 P228 L3 MyBallot # 960  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/278-228-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.2 P222 L4 MyBallot # 934  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/252-222-4: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.12 P228 L4 MyBallot # 959  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/277-228-4: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.2 P222 L5 MyBallot # 936  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/254-222-5: These blank right column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.3 P222 L20 MyBallot # 938  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/256-222-20: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.3 P222 L20 MyBallot # 933  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/251-222-20: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.3 P222 L22 MyBallot # 935  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/253-222-22: These blank right column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.4 P223 L3 MyBallot # 941  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/259-223-3: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.4 P223 L5 MyBallot # 943  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/261-223-5: These blank right column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.5 P223 L33 MyBallot # 940  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/258-223-33: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.5 P223 L34 MyBallot # 944  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/262-223-34: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.5 P224 L18 MyBallot # 947  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/265-224-18: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.5 P223 L36 MyBallot # 942  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/260-223-36: These blank right column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.5 P224 L18 MyBallot # 945  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/263-224-18: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.5 P223 L51 MyBallot # 939  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/257-223-51: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.5 P224 L3 MyBallot # 946  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/264-224-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.7 P225 L3 MyBallot # 950  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/268-225-3: These blank Support column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.7 P225 L36 MyBallot # 951  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/269-225-36: These blank right column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.8 P225 L41 MyBallot # 952  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/270-225-41: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.8 P225 L42 MyBallot # 949  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/267-225-42: These blank Support column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.8 P225 L52 MyBallot # 948  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/266-225-52: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.8 P226 L29 MyBallot # 954  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/272-226-29: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 27 SC 27.7.4.8 P226 L30 MyBallot # 953  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/271-226-30: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 28 SC 28.1.2 P231 L11 MyBallot # 961  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/279-231-11: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.2.1.1.2 P234 L12 MyBallot # 963  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/281-234-12: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Bit Position ==> Bit position Pulse Position ==> Pulse position  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.2.1.1.2 P234 L21 MyBallot # 962  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/280-234-21: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Clock Pulse ==> Clock pulse Data Pulse ==> Data pulse  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.2.1.1.2 P234 L3 MyBallot # 965  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/283-234-3: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Clock Pulses ==> Clock pulses  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.2.1.1.2 P234 L7 MyBallot # 964  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/282-234-7: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 First Bit on Wire ==> First bit on wire  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 28 SC 28.2.4.1.3 P244 L3 MyBallot # 968  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/286-244-3: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (suc

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 28 SC 28.2.4.1.3 P244 L5 MyBallot # 967  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

DVJ2/285-244-5: There is no table footnote describing the meaning of the R/W entry, as provided elsewhere.

SuggestedRemedy

Provide such a footnote, for consistency and clarity.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT.

Cl 28 SC 28.2.4.1.4 P244 L42 MyBallot # 966  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/284-244-42: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as RO).

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 28 SC 28.2.4.1.4 P245 L3 MyBallot # 970  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/288-245-3: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as RO).

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 28 SC 28.2.4.1.5 P245 L31 MyBallot # 969  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/287-245-31: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as RO).

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 28 SC 28.2.4.1.6 P247 L7 MyBallot # 971  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/289-247-7: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as RO).

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 28 SC 28.3.1 P258 L23 MyBallot # 972  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/290-258-23: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #871.

Cl 28 SC 28.3.4 P260 L14 MyBallot # 973  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/291-260-14: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 TRANSMIT ABILITY ==> TRANSMIT\_ABILITY and similar changes

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 28 SC 28.3.4 P261 L13 MyBallot # 974  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/292-261-13: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 FLP PASS ==> FLP\_PASS and similar changes

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 28 SC 28.3.4 P262 L1 MyBallot # 975  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/293-262-1: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 TRANSMIT DISABLE ==> TRANSMIT\_DISABLE and similar changes

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 28 SC 28.3.4 P263 L14 MyBallot # 976  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/294-263-14: State machine names should be single words, for clarity and consistency.

SuggestedRemedy  
 NLP TEST FAIL COUNT ==> NLP\_TEST\_FAIL\_COUNT and similar changes throughout

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 28 SC 28.4 P264 L1 MyBallot # 979  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/297-264-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 28 SC 28.5 P264 L3 MyBallot # 977  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/295-264-3: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 28, ... ==> ... Clause 28

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.1 P264 L9 MyBallot # 978  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/296-264-9: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.2.2 P265 L30 MyBallot # 980  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/298-265-30: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.2.2 P265 L30 MyBallot # 982  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/300-265-30: These blank Support column cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The format for PICS tables has changed during the decades in which IEEE Std 802.3 has been used. As pointed out in various comments, PICS formats vary within this document, including column headings, column order and PICS item numbering. Consideration must be given to both the legacy users of the document and future users of the document. Completed PICS may also be used in contracts.

The IEEE P802.3REVam task force believes conversion of older PICS tables to current format would create too high a probability of introducing errors in very stable portions of the standard and make the material less familiar to legacy users. The support column cells within the Clause however will be made consistent.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.2.2 P265 L5 MyBallot # 981  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/299-265-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 28 SC 28.5.2.2 P265 L5 MyBallot # 983  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/301-265-5: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #982.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.10 P277 L13 MyBallot # 999  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/317-277-13: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #982.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.10 P277 L14 MyBallot # 1001  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/319-277-14: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.10 P278 L7 MyBallot # 1003  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A  
 DVJ2/321-278-7: The comment on item #12 is useless, since the current OUI definitions are based on HEX, not counted bits.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Delete this but provide a cross-reference to a detailed def. 3) Explain this, using a hex-digit example, in text following the table.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 A cross reference to the related Figure 28C-1.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.2 P266 L5 MyBallot # 987  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/305-266-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.2 P266 L5 MyBallot # 985  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/303-266-5: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #982.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.3 P 266 L 25 MyBallot # 986  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/304-266-25: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.3 P 266 L 25 MyBallot # 984  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/302-266-25: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #982.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.3 P 268 L 5 MyBallot # 988  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/306-268-5: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #982.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.3 P 268 L 6 MyBallot # 989  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/307-268-6: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.5 P 269 L 5 MyBallot # 991  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/309-269-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.5 P 269 L 5 MyBallot # 990  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/308-269-5: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #982.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.5 P271 L43 MyBallot # 994  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/312-271-43: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.5 P271 L44 MyBallot # 993  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/311-271-44: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #982.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.5 P271 L58 MyBallot # 992  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/310-271-58: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all ""Item"" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.7 P274 L4 MyBallot # 996  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/314-274-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.7 P274 L6 MyBallot # 995  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/313-274-6: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #982.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.7 P275 L23 MyBallot # 997  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/315-275-23: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #982.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.7 P275 L24 MyBallot # 998  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/316-275-24: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.9 P277 L5 MyBallot # 1000  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/318-277-5: These blank Support column cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #982.

Cl 28 SC 28.5.4.9 P277 L5 MyBallot # 1002  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/320-277-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 28D SC 28D.4 P616 L25 MyBallot # 1115  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 DVJ2/433-616-25: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #982.

Cl 29 SC 29.1 P279 L32 MyBallot # 1004  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/322-279-32: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Multiport Bridge==>Multiport bridge  
 Colision Domain ==> Collision domain  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 29 SC 29.1 P280 L9 MyBallot # 1005  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/323-280-9: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Multiport Bridge ==> Multiport bridge  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 29 SC 29.3 P282 L13 MyBallot # 1006  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A  
 DVJ2/324-282-13: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Repeater Set ==> Repeater set  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 29 SC 29.3.1.1 P283 L39 MyBallot # 1007  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/325-283-39: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 29 SC 29.3.1.2 P284 L3 MyBallot # 1009  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/327-284-3: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 29 SC 29.3.1.2 P284 L4 MyBallot # 1008  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A  
 DVJ2/326-284-4: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 End Segment ==> End segment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Se MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 29 SC 29.3.1.2 P285 L4 MyBallot # 1011  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/329-285-4: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #871.

Cl 29 SC 29.3.1.2 P285 L53 MyBallot # 1010  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/328-285-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 29 SC 29.4 P 288 L 6 MyBallot # 1012  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/330-288-6: Extra blank page.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete the excess ones.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 30 SC 30.2.2.2.1 P 296 L 10 MyBallot # 1014  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/332-296-10: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 30 SC 30.1.4 P 291 L 33 MyBallot # 1013  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/331-291-33: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Capitalize only first word of heading.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 30 SC 30.11.2.1 P 420 L 30 MyBallot # 1  
 BECK, MICHAEL A  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 There is no Clause 30 object to count the TC-CRC errors in the PME.  
 It seems that it has been overlooked, as we do have a coding violations counter in the PME capability.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add an object to count the TC-CRC errors in the PME capability. It should reference the variable TC\_crc\_error in subclause 61.3.3.8 and the associated "10P/2B TC CRC error register" (6.24.15:0) in subclause 45.2.6.11.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 There are many other error counters related to 10P/2B PHYs that are provided in Clause 45 but are not included in Clause 30. If there is a desire to enhance the Clause 30 MIB to include additional counters this should be performed as a separate project.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 30A SC 30A.16.1 P 696 L 52 MyBallot # 31  
LAW, DAVID J

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

The consolidation of Subclause 30A.16.1 and 30A.16.2 seems to have gone wrong.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace all the text in subclause 30A.16.1 and from the start of 30A.16.2 to bPSEAdminState with the following:

30A.16.1 PSE, formal definition  
oPSE MANAGED OBJECT CLASS  
DERIVED FROM CCITT Rec. X.721 (1992) | ISO/IEC 10165-2 :  
1992:top;  
CHARACTERIZED BY  
pPSEBasic PACKAGE  
ATTRIBUTES aPSEID GET,  
aPSEAdminState GET,  
aPSEPowerPairsControlAbility GET,  
aPSEPowerPairs GET-REPLACE,  
aPSEPowerDetectionStatus GET;  
ACTIONS acPSEAdminControl;  
;  
;  
CONDITIONAL PACKAGES  
pPSERecommended PACKAGE  
ATTRIBUTES aPSEPowerClassification GET,  
aPSEInvalidSignatureCounter GET,  
aPSEPowerDeniedCounter GET,  
IEEE  
CSMA/CD Std 802.3af-2003  
Copyright 2003 IEEE. All rights reserved. 19  
aPSEOverLoadCounter GET,  
aPSEShortCounter GET,  
aPSEMPSAbsentCounter GET;  
REGISTERED AS {iso(1) member-body(2) us(840) ieee802dot3(10006)  
csmacdmgt(30) package(4)  
pseRecommendedPkg(27)};  
PRESENT IF The recommended package is implemented;  
REGISTERED AS {iso(1) member-body(2) us(840) ieee802dot3(10006) csmacdmgt(30)  
managedObjectClass(3) pseObjectClass(15)};  
nbPSE-repeaterPortName NAME BINDING  
SUBORDINATE OBJECT CLASS oPSE;  
NAMED BY SUPERIOR OBJECT CLASS oRepeaterPorts AND SUBCLASSES;  
WITH ATTRIBUTE aPSEID;  
REGISTERED AS {iso(1) member-body(2) us(840) ieee802dot3(10006) csmacdmgt(30)  
nameBinding(6) pse-repeaterPortName(26)};  
nbPSE-dteName NAME BINDING  
SUBORDINATE OBJECT CLASS oPSE;  
NAMED BY SUPERIOR OBJECT CLASS oPHYEntity AND SUBCLASSES;

WITH ATTRIBUTE aPSEID;  
REGISTERED AS {iso(1) member-body(2) us(840) ieee802dot3(10006) csmacdmgt(30)  
nameBinding(6) pse-dteName(27)};  
nbPSE-pseGroupName NAME BINDING  
SUBORDINATE OBJECT CLASS oPSE;  
NAMED BY SUPERIOR OBJECT CLASS oPSEGroup AND SUBCLASSES;  
WITH ATTRIBUTE aPSEID;  
REGISTERED AS {iso(1) member-body(2) us(840) ieee802dot3(10006) csmacdmgt(30)  
nameBinding(6) pse-pseGroupName(28)};  
30A.16.2 PSE attributes  
aPSEID ATTRIBUTE  
WITH ATTRIBUTE SYNTAX IEEE802Dot3-MgmtAttributeModule.OneOfName;  
MATCHES FOR EQUALITY;  
BEHAVIOUR bPSEID;  
REGISTERED AS {iso(1) member-body(2) us(840) ieee802dot3(10006) csmacdmgt(30)  
attribute(7) pseID(209)};  
bPSEID BEHAVIOUR  
DEFINED AS See BEHAVIOUR DEFINED AS in 30.9.1.1.1;  
aPSEAdminState ATTRIBUTE  
WITH ATTRIBUTE SYNTAX IEEE802Dot3-  
MgmtAttributeModule.PortAdminState;  
MATCHES FOR EQUALITY;  
BEHAVIOUR bPSEAdminState;  
REGISTERED AS {iso(1) member-body(2) us(840) ieee802dot3(10006) csmacdmgt(30)  
attribute(7) pseAdminState(210)};

Note that the above text is directly from IEEE Std 802.3af-2003 and the arcs will need to be updated to use the new root.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT.

Merge error.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 30A SC 30A.16.2 P 699 L 20 MyBallot # 32  
LAW, DAVID J

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

The consolidation of Subclause 30A.16.2 seems to have gone wrong.

SuggestedRemedy

The text:

aSectionESs ATTRIBUTE

shoudl read:

aPSEInvalidSignatureCounter ATTRIBUTE

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT.

Merge error.

Cl 30A SC 30A.20.1 P 30 L 706 MyBallot # 33  
LAW, DAVID J

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

The consolidation of Subclause 30A.20.1 and 30A.20.2 seems to have gone wrong.

SuggestedRemedy

The text:

ATTRIBUTES aMACControlIID GET,

should read:

ATTRIBUTES aOAMID GET,

and the text:

aMACControlIID ATTRIBUTE

should read:

aOAMID ATTRIBUTE

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT.

Merge error.

Cl 31 SC 31.4.1 P 427 L 20 MyBallot # 1015  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/333-427-20: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 31 SC 31.5.3.5 P 430 L 21 MyBallot # 1016  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/334-430-21: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy

EX READY ==> RX\_READY and similar changes

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 31 SC 31.7 P 432 L 1 MyBallot # 1017  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/335-432-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 31 SC 31.8 P432 L2 MyBallot # 1018  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/336-432-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 31, ... ==> ... Clause 31

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 31B SC 31B.4.3 P781 L3 MyBallot # 1116  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/434-781-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 31B SC 31B.4.3 P781 L5 MyBallot # 1117  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/435-781-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 31B SC 31B.4.4 P781 L20 MyBallot # 1118  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/436-781-20: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 31B SC 31B.4.6 P782 L3 MyBallot # 1120  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/438-782-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 31B SC 31B.4.6 P782 L9 MyBallot # 1119  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/437-782-9: Consusing table rows.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 31B SC 31B.4.6 P786 L20 MyBallot # 1121  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/439-786-20: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 31B SC 31B.4.6 P788 L30 MyBallot # 1124  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/442-788-30: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 31B SC 31B.4.6 P787 L38 MyBallot # 1122  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/440-787-38: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 31B SC 31B.4.6 P788 L4 MyBallot # 1125  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/443-788-4: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 31B SC 31B.4.6 P787 L8 MyBallot # 1123  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/441-787-8: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 31B SC 31B.4.6 P789 L8 MyBallot # 1126  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/444-789-8: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 32 SC 32.1.2 P 436 L 8 MyBallot # 1019  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/337-436-8: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.

SuggestedRemedy

Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.12.1 P 507 L 7 MyBallot # 1047  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/365-507-7: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1031.

Cl 32 SC 32.12.2 P 507 L 28 MyBallot # 1048  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/366-507-28: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #255.

Cl 32 SC 32.12.2 P 508 L 1 MyBallot # 1051  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/369-508-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13 P 508 L 3 MyBallot # 1050  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ2/368-508-3: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 66, ... ==> ... Clause 66

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 32 SC 32.13 P508 L7 MyBallot # 1049  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/367-508-7: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.3 P509 L27 MyBallot # 1052  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/370-509-27: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.4 P510 L4 MyBallot # 1053  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/371-510-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.11 P526 L22 MyBallot # 1072  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/390-526-22: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.12 P527 L4 MyBallot # 1073  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/391-527-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.13 P527 L22 MyBallot # 1074  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/392-527-22: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.14 P 527 L 36 MyBallot # 1075  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
DVJ2/393-527-36: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
SuggestedRemedy  
Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.4 P 513 L 4 MyBallot # 1056  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
DVJ2/374-513-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
SuggestedRemedy  
Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.2 P 511 L 35 MyBallot # 1054  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
DVJ2/372-511-35: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
SuggestedRemedy  
Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.5 P 514 L 5 MyBallot # 1057  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
DVJ2/375-514-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
SuggestedRemedy  
Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.3 P 512 L 4 MyBallot # 1055  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
DVJ2/373-512-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
SuggestedRemedy  
Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.6 P 515 L 4 MyBallot # 1058  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
DVJ2/376-515-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
SuggestedRemedy  
Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.6 P516 L17 MyBallot # 1060  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/378-516-17: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.8 P517 L53 MyBallot # 1061  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/379-517-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.6 P516 L4 MyBallot # 1059  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/377-516-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.8 P518 L54 MyBallot # 1063  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/381-518-54: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.8 P517 L4 MyBallot # 1062  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/380-517-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.8 P519 L53 MyBallot # 1064  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/382-519-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.8 P 520 L 50 MyBallot # 1065  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/383-520-50: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.8 P 521 L 47 MyBallot # 1066  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/384-521-47: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.8 P 522 L 48 MyBallot # 1067  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/385-522-48: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.9 P 524 L 48 MyBallot # 1069  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/387-524-48: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.9 P 524 L 5 MyBallot # 1070  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/388-524-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.9 P 524 L 58 MyBallot # 1068  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/386-524-58: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 32 SC 32.13.5.9 P 525 L 4 MyBallot # 1071  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/389-525-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.2.5 P 445 L 19 MyBallot # 1020  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/338-445-19: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 SEND IDLE OR DATA ==> SEND\_IDLE\_OR\_DATA and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 32 SC 32.3.6 P 458 L 5 MyBallot # 1022  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/340-458-5: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1st SSD VECTOR, ERROR ==> FIRST\_SSD\_VECTOR\_ERROR and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 32 SC 32.3.6 P 458 L 8 MyBallot # 1021  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/339-458-8: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 1st SSD VECTOR, ERROR ==> FIRST\_SSD\_VECTOR\_ERROR and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 32 SC 32.3.6 P 459 L 11 MyBallot # 1023  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/341-459-11: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NON-IDLE DETECT ==> NON\_IDLE\_DETECT and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 32 SC 32.3.6 P 459 L 7 MyBallot # 1024  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/342-459-7: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 LINK FAILED ==> LINK\_FAILED and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 32 SC 32.3.6 P460 L4 MyBallot # 1025  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/343-460-4: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 CARRIER SENSE OFF ==> CARRIER\_SENSE\_OFF and similar changes

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 32 SC 32.4.1.3.3 P463 L33 MyBallot # 1026  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/344-463-33: Inconsistent state machine state names: other places these are ALL\_CAPS, which has the benefit of being parsable and compatible with C code.

SuggestedRemedy  
 LINK NOT READY ==> LINK\_NOT\_READY and similar changes

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 32 SC 32.5.3.1 P469 L12 MyBallot # 1027  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/345-469-12: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as RO).

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 32 SC 32.5.3.1.6 P470 L30 MyBallot # 1028  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/346-470-30: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as RO).

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.2.4 P479 L53 MyBallot # 1029  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/347-479-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.2.4 P 480 L 41 MyBallot # 1031  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/349-480-41: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

This entry in the table is empty because there is no value or comment necessary. The committee consensus was that this is obvious to the reader and that the addition of extra characters decreases readability.

In addition, as noted at the beginning of the clause, the MAU/PHY is not recommended for new installations. Consequently, changes to the clause will only make them less familiar to the users of the clause that created and use those legacy implementations

Further, it was also the committee consensus that the risks of introducing errors when making the proposed change to a stable part of the standard outweigh any benefits.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.2.4 P 480 L 53 MyBallot # 1030  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/348-480-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.3.1 P 482 L 18 MyBallot # 1032  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A  
 DVJ2/350-482-18: Misleading capitalization errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Capitalize only first word of heading.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.3.1 P 484 L 53 MyBallot # 1034  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/352-484-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy  
 1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.3.1 P 484 L 55 MyBallot # 1033  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A  
 DVJ2/351-484-55: Misleading capitalization errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Capitalize only first word of heading.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.3.1 P 485 L 53 MyBallot # 1035  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/353-485-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.3.1 P 486 L 54 MyBallot # 1036  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/354-486-54: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.3.1 P 487 L 53 MyBallot # 1037  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/355-487-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.3.1 P 488 L 54 MyBallot # 1038  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/356-488-54: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.3.1 P 489 L 54 MyBallot # 1039  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/357-489-54: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.3.1 P 490 L 53 MyBallot # 1040  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/358-490-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.3.1 P 491 L 53 MyBallot # 1041  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/359-491-53: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.3.1 P 492 L 54 MyBallot # 1042  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/360-492-54: The blank bottom line makes this looks like the cell is split across pages, which is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Fix your templates, so this doesn't happen. 2) Use better templates, available on the MSC Sponsor web site: <http://grouper.ieee.org/groups/msc/WordProcessors.html>

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.3.6 P 495 L 6 MyBallot # 1043  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/361-495-6: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.4.2 P 496 L 7 MyBallot # 1045  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/363-496-7: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.4.3 P 496 L 32 MyBallot # 1044  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/362-496-32: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 32 SC 32.6.1.4.4 P 497 L 7 MyBallot # 1046  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/364-497-7: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 33 SC 33.2.1 P 532 L 28 MyBallot # 1077  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A  
 DVJ2/395-532-28: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Capitalize only first word of heading.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.2.1 P 532 L 42 MyBallot # 1076  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A  
 DVJ2/394-532-42: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Capitalize only first word of heading.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.2.1 P 532 L 5 MyBallot # 1078  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A  
 DVJ2/396-532-5: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Capitalize only first word of heading.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.2.10.1.2 P 550 L 33 MyBallot # 1080  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/398-550-33: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #246.

Cl 33 SC 33.2.10.1.2 P 551 L 23 MyBallot # 1081  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/399-551-23: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.2.10.1.2 P 551 L 3 MyBallot # 1082  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/400-551-3: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 33 SC 33.2.2 P533 L12 MyBallot # 1079  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/397-533-12: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

The consensus of the committee was that the current format of the table is clear.

Cl 33 SC 33.3 P552 L26 MyBallot # 1083  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/401-552-26: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1079.

Cl 33 SC 33.3.3 P555 L15 MyBallot # 1084  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/402-555-15: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #246.

Cl 33 SC 33.3.4 P557 L17 MyBallot # 1085  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/403-557-17: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #246.

Cl 33 SC 33.3.6 P560 L5 MyBallot # 1086  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/404-560-5: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate. 3) Straddle cells, if that is meant.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #246.

Cl 33 SC 33.6.1.1 P571 L15 MyBallot # 1088  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ2/406-571-15: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as RO).

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

**Cl 33**      **SC 33.6.1.1**                      **P 571**              **L 20**      *MyBallot #* **1087**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ2/405-571-20: Confusing table rows.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Put lines between rows.  
*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #740.

**Cl 33**      **SC 33.6.1.2.6**                      **P 573**              **L 7**      *MyBallot #* **1089**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ2/407-573-7: Confusing table rows.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Put lines between rows.  
*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #740.

**Cl 33**      **SC 33.6.1.2.10**                      **P 575**              **L 1**      *MyBallot #* **1092**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **A**                      *IEEE-SA Editor*  
 DVJ2/410-575-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 33**      **SC 33.7**                      **P 575**              **L 2**      *MyBallot #* **1093**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ2/411-575-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 ... Clause 33, ... ==> ... Clause 33  
*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

**Cl 33**      **SC 33.6.1.2.6**                      **P 573**              **L 3**      *MyBallot #* **1090**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ2/408-573-3: This column (and others throughout) are very confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as RO).  
*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1427.

**Cl 33**      **SC 33.7.1**                      **P 575**              **L 7**      *MyBallot #* **1091**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **A**                      *IEEE-SA Editor*  
 DVJ2/409-575-7: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 33 SC 33.7.2.2 P576 L13 MyBallot # 1095  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/413-576-13: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.2.2 P576 L5 MyBallot # 1094  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/412-576-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.2.2 P576 L14 MyBallot # 1096  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/414-576-14: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.2.2 P577 L15 MyBallot # 1099  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/417-577-15: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.2.2 P576 L4 MyBallot # 1097  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/415-576-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.2.2 P577 L16 MyBallot # 1100  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/418-577-16: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 33 SC 33.7.2.2 P577 L6 MyBallot # 1098  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/416-577-6: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.3 P581 L4 MyBallot # 1102  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/420-581-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.2.2 P577 L7 MyBallot # 1101  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/419-577-7: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.4 P583 L4 MyBallot # 1105  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/423-583-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.3 P581 L4 MyBallot # 1103  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/421-581-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.4 P583 L5 MyBallot # 1104  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/422-583-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.5 P585 L3 MyBallot # 1106  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/424-585-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.5 P585 L4 MyBallot # 1107  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/425-585-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.6 P586 L5 MyBallot # 1112  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/430-586-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.6 P586 L5 MyBallot # 1108  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/426-586-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.7 P586 L20 MyBallot # 1111  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/429-586-20: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.7 P586 L41 MyBallot # 1109  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ2/427-586-41: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.7 P586 L41 MyBallot # 1110  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/428-586-41: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.9 P587 L4 MyBallot # 1114  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/432-587-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33 SC 33.7.3.9 P587 L4 MyBallot # 1113  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/431-587-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33C SC 33C.1.1 P792 L24 MyBallot # 1128  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/446-792-24: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33C SC 33C.1.1 P792 L30 MyBallot # 1127  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/445-792-30: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33C SC 33C.1.10 P802 L12 MyBallot # 1139  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/457-802-12: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl **33C** SC **33C.1.10** P **803** L **18** MyBallot # **1140**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/458-803-18: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **33C** SC **33C.1.2** P **793** L **15** MyBallot # **1130**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/448-793-15: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **33C** SC **33C.1.11** P **804** L **10** MyBallot # **1141**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/459-804-10: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **33C** SC **33C.1.2** P **793** L **25** MyBallot # **1129**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/447-793-25: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **33C** SC **33C.1.12** P **805** L **12** MyBallot # **1142**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/460-805-12: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **33C** SC **33C.1.4** P **795** L **7** MyBallot # **1131**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/449-795-7: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 33C SC 33C.1.4 P796 L7 MyBallot # 1132  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/450-796-7: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33C SC 33C.1.6 P798 L28 MyBallot # 1135  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/453-798-28: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33C SC 33C.1.5 P797 L11 MyBallot # 1134  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/452-797-11: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33C SC 33C.1.7 P799 L9 MyBallot # 1136  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/454-799-9: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33C SC 33C.1.5 P797 L17 MyBallot # 1133  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/451-797-17: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33C SC 33C.1.9 P800 L26 MyBallot # 1137  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/455-800-26: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 33C SC 33C.1.9 P 801 L 20 MyBallot # 1138  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/456-801-20: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33C SC 33C.2.2 P 808 L 18 MyBallot # 1146  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/464-808-18: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33C SC 33C.2.1 P 806 L 9 MyBallot # 1143  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/461-806-9: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33C SC 33C.2.2 P 808 L 29 MyBallot # 1145  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/463-808-29: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial, here and throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33C SC 33C.2.1 P 807 L 17 MyBallot # 1144  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/462-807-17: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33C SC 33C.3.1 P 809 L 38 MyBallot # 1147  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/465-809-38: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial, here and throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl **33C** SC **33C.3.1** P**810** L**27** MyBallot # **1148**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/466-810-27: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial, here and throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **33C** SC **33C.4.1** P**813** L**33** MyBallot # **1150**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/468-813-33: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial, here and throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **33C** SC **33C.4.1** P**812** L**6** MyBallot # **1149**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/467-812-6: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial, here and throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **33C** SC **33C.5.1** P**815** L**7** MyBallot # **1152**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/470-815-7: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial, here and throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **33C** SC **33C.4.1** P**813** L**17** MyBallot # **1151**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/469-813-17: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial, here and throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **33C** SC **33C.5.1** P**816** L**36** MyBallot # **1153**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/471-816-36: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial, here and throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 33C SC 33C.5.1 P817 L11 MyBallot # 1154  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/472-817-11: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial, here and throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33D SC 33D.1 P820 L8 MyBallot # 1157  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/475-820-8: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial, here and throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33D SC 33D.1 P819 L37 MyBallot # 1155  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/473-819-37: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial, here and throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33D SC 33D.2 P821 L42 MyBallot # 1158  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/476-821-42: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial, here and throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 33D SC 33D.1 P819 L9 MyBallot # 1156  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ2/474-819-9: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial, here and throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 34 SC 34.1.1 P2 L8 MyBallot # 1159  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/1-2-8: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 35 SC 35.1 P5 L21 MyBallot # 1160  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/2-5-21: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 35 SC 35.1 P5 L39 MyBallot # 1161  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/3-5-39: Inconsistent with Clause 3 title.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Media Access Control ==> media access control  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #200.

Cl 35 SC 35.4.2.3 P27 L7 MyBallot # 1162  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/4-27-7: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 35, ... ==> ... Clause 35  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 35 SC 35.5.2.3 P28 L20 MyBallot # 1165  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/7-28-20: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 35 SC 35.5.2.3 P28 L24 MyBallot # 1163  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/5-28-24: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 35 SC 35.5.3 P28 L38 MyBallot # 1164  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/6-28-38: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 35 SC 35.5.3 P29 L4 MyBallot # 1167  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/9-29-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 35 SC 35.5.3 P29 L5 MyBallot # 1166  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/8-29-5: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 35 SC 35.5.3 P30 L4 MyBallot # 1169  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/11-30-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 35 SC 35.5.3.3 P30 L35 MyBallot # 1168  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/10-30-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 35 SC 35.5.3.4 P31 L3 MyBallot # 1172  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/14-31-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 35 SC 35.5.3.5 P31 L11 MyBallot # 1171  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/13-31-11: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

## IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 35 SC 35.5.3.6 P31 L19 MyBallot # 1170  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/12-31-19: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 36 SC 36.1.5 P35 L9 MyBallot # 1173  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/15-35-9: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 36 SC 36.6 P75 L6 MyBallot # 1175  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/17-75-6: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 36 SC 36.7 P75 L8 MyBallot # 1176  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ3/18-75-8: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

*SuggestedRemedy*

... Clause 36, ... ==> ... Clause 36

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 36 SC 36.7.1 P75 L15 MyBallot # 1174  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/16-75-15: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 36 SC 36.7.3 P76 L21 MyBallot # 1180  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/22-76-21: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

**Cl 36**      **SC 36.7.3**                      **P76**              **L 24**      *MyBallot #* **1178**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ3/20-76-24: These blank lines look like errors.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

**Cl 36**      **SC 36.7.4.2**                      **P77**              **L 12**      *MyBallot #* **1182**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ3/24-77-12: These blank lines look like errors.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

**Cl 36**      **SC 36.7.4.1**                      **P76**              **L 45**      *MyBallot #* **1179**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **A**                      *IEEE-SA Editor*  
 DVJ3/21-76-45: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 36**      **SC 36.7.4.2**                      **P77**              **L 5**      *MyBallot #* **1185**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **A**                      *IEEE-SA Editor*  
 DVJ3/27-77-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 36**      **SC 36.7.4.1**                      **P76**              **L 48**      *MyBallot #* **1177**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ3/19-76-48: These blank lines look like errors.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

**Cl 36**      **SC 36.7.4.3**                      **P77**              **L 25**      *MyBallot #* **1184**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **A**                      *IEEE-SA Editor*  
 DVJ3/26-77-25: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 36 SC 36.7.4.4 P77 L43 MyBallot # 1183  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/25-77-43: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 36 SC 36.7.4.4 P77 L46 MyBallot # 1181  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/23-77-46: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 36 SC 36.7.4.4 P78 L15 MyBallot # 1195  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/37-78-15: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 36 SC 36.7.4.4 P78 L16 MyBallot # 1190  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/32-78-16: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 36 SC 36.7.4.4 P78 L18 MyBallot # 1188  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/30-78-18: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 36 SC 36.7.4.4 P78 L29 MyBallot # 1191  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/33-78-29: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 36 SC 36.7.4.4 P78 L30 MyBallot # 1194  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/36-78-30: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 36 SC 36.7.4.4 P78 L39 MyBallot # 1193  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/35-78-39: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 36 SC 36.7.4.4 P78 L32 MyBallot # 1187  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/29-78-32: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 36 SC 36.7.4.4 P78 L4 MyBallot # 1189  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/31-78-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.'  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 36 SC 36.7.4.4 P78 L39 MyBallot # 1192  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/34-78-39: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 36 SC 36.7.4.4 P78 L41 MyBallot # 1186  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/28-78-41: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 36 SC 36.7.4.4 P78 L5 MyBallot # 1196  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/38-78-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.1.2 P80 L19 MyBallot # 1197  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/39-80-19: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.2.5.1.3 P90 L3 MyBallot # 1199  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/41-90-3: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as RO).  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 37 SC 37.2.5.1.4 P90 L35 MyBallot # 1198  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/40-90-35: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as RO).  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 37 SC 37.2.5.1.5 P91 L4 MyBallot # 1200  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/42-91-4: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as RO).  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 37 SC 37.4 P97 L37 MyBallot # 1202  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/44-97-37: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.4 P97 L38 MyBallot # 1203  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ3/45-97-38: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 37, ... ==> ... Clause 37

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.1 P97 L43 MyBallot # 1201  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/43-97-43: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.3 P99 L35 MyBallot # 1206  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/48-99-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.3 P99 L36 MyBallot # 1205  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/47-99-36: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

**Cl 37**    **SC 37.5.3**    **P99**    **L38**    *MyBallot #* **1204**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**    *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ3/46-99-38: These blank cells look like errors.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
*Proposed Response*    *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

**Cl 37**    **SC 37.5.4.1**    **P100**    **L5**    *MyBallot #* **1210**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**    *Comment Status*    **A**    *IEEE-SA Editor*  
 DVJ3/52-100-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
*Proposed Response*    *Response Status*    **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 37**    **SC 37.5.4.1**    **P100**    **L9**    *MyBallot #* **1209**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**    *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ3/51-100-9: These blank cells look like errors.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
*Proposed Response*    *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

**Cl 37**    **SC 37.5.4.2**    **P100**    **L15**    *MyBallot #* **1211**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**    *Comment Status*    **A**    *IEEE-SA Editor*  
 DVJ3/53-100-15: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
*Proposed Response*    *Response Status*    **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 37**    **SC 37.5.4.2**    **P100**    **L17**    *MyBallot #* **1208**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**    *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ3/50-100-17: These blank cells look like errors.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
*Proposed Response*    *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

**Cl 37**    **SC 37.5.4.2.1**    **P100**    **L26**    *MyBallot #* **1212**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
*Comment Type*    **ER**    *Comment Status*    **A**    *IEEE-SA Editor*  
 DVJ3/54-100-26: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
*Proposed Response*    *Response Status*    **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.1 P100 L26 MyBallot # 1215  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/57-100-26: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.1 P100 L35 MyBallot # 1214  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/56-100-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.1 P100 L36 MyBallot # 1213  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/55-100-36: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.1 P100 L37 MyBallot # 1207  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/49-100-37: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.3 P101 L3 MyBallot # 1219  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/61-101-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.3 P101 L4 MyBallot # 1224  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/66-101-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.3 P101 L5 MyBallot # 1218  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/60-101-5: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.4 P101 L13 MyBallot # 1223  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/65-101-13: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.4 P101 L13 MyBallot # 1220  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/62-101-13: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.4 P101 L13 MyBallot # 1216  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/58-101-13: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.4 P101 L15 MyBallot # 1217  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/59-101-15: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.4 P101 L20 MyBallot # 1221  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/63-101-20: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.4 P101 L20 MyBallot # 1222  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/64-101-20: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.6 P102 L15 MyBallot # 1227  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/69-102-15: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.6 P102 L3 MyBallot # 1230  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/72-102-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.6 P102 L3 MyBallot # 1225  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/67-102-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.6 P102 L34 MyBallot # 1228  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/70-102-34: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.6 P102 L34 MyBallot # 1229  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/71-102-34: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 37 SC 37.5.4.2.6 P102 L37 MyBallot # 1226  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/68-102-37: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 38 SC 38.11.4 P123 L1 MyBallot # 1232  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/74-123-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12 P123 L4 MyBallot # 1233  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/75-123-4: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 38, ... ==> ... Clause 38

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.1 P123 L10 MyBallot # 1231  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/73-123-10: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.3 P124 L3 MyBallot # 1235  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/77-124-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.3 P124 L3 MyBallot # 1234  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/76-124-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 38 SC 38.12.3 P125 L1 MyBallot # 1240  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/82-125-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy  
 Abbreviate this header, using clause/subclause number if necessary, and providing the detailed cross-reference name in following text.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4 P125 L33 MyBallot # 1238  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/80-125-33: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4 P125 L35 MyBallot # 1239  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/81-125-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4 P125 L7 MyBallot # 1241  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/83-125-7: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4 P125 L7 MyBallot # 1236  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/78-125-7: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4 P125 L9 MyBallot # 1237  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/79-125-9: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4.3 P126 L3 MyBallot # 1243  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/85-126-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4.4 P126 L19 MyBallot # 1242  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/84-126-19: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4.3 P126 L4 MyBallot # 1247  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/89-126-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4.5 P126 L34 MyBallot # 1244  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/86-126-34: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4.4 P126 L19 MyBallot # 1246  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/88-126-19: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4.5 P126 L35 MyBallot # 1245  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/87-126-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4.5 P127 L4 MyBallot # 1249  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/91-127-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4.5 P127 L4 MyBallot # 1248  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/90-127-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4.5 P128 L4 MyBallot # 1251  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/93-128-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4.5 P128 L4 MyBallot # 1250  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/92-128-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4.6 P129 L3 MyBallot # 1253  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/95-129-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 38 SC 38.12.4.6 P129 L4 MyBallot # 1252  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/94-129-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 39 SC 39.7 P144 L1 MyBallot # 1255  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/97-144-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 39 SC 39.7 P144 L1 MyBallot # 1256  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ3/98-144-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 39, ... ==> ... Clause 39

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 39 SC 39.8.1 P144 L7 MyBallot # 1254  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/96-144-7: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 39 SC 39.8.2.2 P145 L11 MyBallot # 1259  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ3/101-145-11: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 39 SC 39.8.2.2 P145 L28 MyBallot # 1260  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/102-145-28: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 39 SC 39.8.2.2 P145 L29 MyBallot # 1261  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/103-145-29: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 39 SC 39.8.2.2 P145 L4 MyBallot # 1262  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/104-145-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 39 SC 39.8.2.2 P145 L3 MyBallot # 1257  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/99-145-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 39 SC 39.8.4.2 P146 L4 MyBallot # 1263  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/105-146-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 39 SC 39.8.2.2 P145 L31 MyBallot # 1258  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/100-145-31: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 39 SC 39.8.4.2 P146 L4 MyBallot # 1264  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/106-146-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 39 SC 39.8.4.3 P147 L3 MyBallot # 1265  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/107-147-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 39 SC 39.8.4.3 P148 L3 MyBallot # 1268  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/110-148-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 39 SC 39.8.4.3 P147 L4 MyBallot # 1266  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/108-147-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 39 SC 39.8.4.3 P148 L3 MyBallot # 1269  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/111-148-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 39 SC 39.8.4.3 P148 L13 MyBallot # 1267  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/109-148-13: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 40 SC 40.1.3 P150 L7 MyBallot # 1270  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/112-150-7: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

---

Cl 40 SC 40.12.10 P 252 L 5 MyBallot # 1314  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
DVJ3/156-252-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
SuggestedRemedy  
Center all "Item" column cells.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
See MyBallot comment #1900.

---

Cl 40 SC 40.12.2 P 234 L 41 MyBallot # 1279  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
DVJ3/121-234-41: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
SuggestedRemedy  
Center all "Item" column cells.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
See MyBallot comment #1900.

---

Cl 40 SC 40.12.11 P 252 L 32 MyBallot # 1312  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
DVJ3/154-252-32: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
SuggestedRemedy  
Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
See MyBallot comment #1900.

---

Cl 40 SC 40.12.2 P 234 L 42 MyBallot # 1278  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
DVJ3/120-234-42: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
SuggestedRemedy  
Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
See MyBallot comment #1900.

---

Cl 40 SC 40.12.11 P 252 L 32 MyBallot # 1313  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
DVJ3/155-252-32: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
SuggestedRemedy  
Center all "Item" column cells.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
See MyBallot comment #1900.

---

Cl 40 SC 40.12.2 P 234 L 43 MyBallot # 1277  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
DVJ3/119-234-43: These blank cells look like errors.  
SuggestedRemedy  
Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
REJECT.  
See MyBallot comment #1541.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 40 SC 40.12.2 P 235 L 1 MyBallot # 1280  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/122-235-1: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.2 P 235 L 1 MyBallot # 1285  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/127-235-1: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.2 P 235 L 4 MyBallot # 1281  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/123-235-4: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.3 P 235 L 20 MyBallot # 1284  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/126-235-20: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.3 P 235 L 21 MyBallot # 1282  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/124-235-21: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.4 P 235 L 29 MyBallot # 1283  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/125-235-29: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 40 SC 40.12.4 P 236 L1 MyBallot # 1287  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/129-236-1: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.4 P 236 L7 MyBallot # 1286  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/128-236-7: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.4 P 237 L36 MyBallot # 1289  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/131-237-36: Confusing/unnecessary page break.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Insert page break so that following table does not break across pages.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.4 P 237 L7 MyBallot # 1288  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/130-237-7: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.4.1 P 237 L39 MyBallot # 1290  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/132-237-39: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.4.1 P 237 L40 MyBallot # 1291  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/133-237-40: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 40 SC 40.12.4.1 P 238 L 1 MyBallot # 1292  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/134-238-1: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.4.2 P 239 L 4 MyBallot # 1295  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/137-239-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.5 P 239 L 26 MyBallot # 1294  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/136-239-26: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.5 P 239 L 26 MyBallot # 1293  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/135-239-26: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.5 P 241 L 2 MyBallot # 1296  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/138-241-2: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.6 P 241 L 15 MyBallot # 1299  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/141-241-15: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 40 SC 40.12.6.1 P241 L29 MyBallot # 1298  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/140-241-29: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.6.1 P241 L30 MyBallot # 1297  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/139-241-30: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.7 P243 L4 MyBallot # 1301  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/143-243-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.7 P243 L4 MyBallot # 1300  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/142-243-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.7 P245 L1 MyBallot # 1302  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/144-245-1: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.7 P246 L2 MyBallot # 1303  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/145-246-2: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 40 SC 40.12.7 P247 L2 MyBallot # 1304  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/146-247-2: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.8 P249 L4 MyBallot # 1306  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/148-249-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.7 P248 L1 MyBallot # 1305  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/147-248-1: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.8 P250 L2 MyBallot # 1308  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/150-250-2: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.8 P249 L4 MyBallot # 1307  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/149-249-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.9 P250 L20 MyBallot # 1309  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/151-250-20: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 40 SC 40.12.9 P250 L20 MyBallot # 1310  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/152-250-20: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.12.9 P251 L1 MyBallot # 1311  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/153-251-1: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 40 SC 40.3.4 P183 L10 MyBallot # 1271  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/113-183-10: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 SSD1 VECTOR ==> SSD1\_VECTOR and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 40 SC 40.3.4 P183 L5 MyBallot # 1272  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/114-183-5: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 SSD1 VECTOR ==> SSD1\_VECTOR and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 40 SC 40.3.4 P184 L15 MyBallot # 1274  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/116-184-15: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 CARRIER EXTENSION with ERROR ==> CARRIER\_EXTENSION\_WITH\_ERROR and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 40 SC 40.3.4 P184 L16 MyBallot # 1273  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/115-184-16: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NON-IDLE DETECT ==> NON\_IDLE\_DETECT and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 40 SC 40.4.4.2 P194 L11 MyBallot # 1275  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ3/117-194-11: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.

SuggestedRemedy  
 DISABLE 1000BASE-T TRANSMITTER ==> DISABLE\_1000BASE\_T\_TRANSMITTER and similar changes throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 40 SC 40.5.1.1 P197 L6 MyBallot # 1276  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ3/118-197-6: This is great. The use of "Type", rather than R/W, in the column header is good.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Do this everywhere else there is a R/W column header.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 40C SC 40C.2.2 P373 L12 MyBallot # 1389  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ3/231-373-12: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Base\_Page\_RX ==> BASE\_PAGE\_RX and similar changes throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 41 SC 41.1.1 P253 L21 MyBallot # 1315  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/157-253-21: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.2.2.2 P264 L13 MyBallot # 1316  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ3/158-264-13: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.

SuggestedRemedy  
 NON-JABBER INPUT ==> NON\_JABBER\_INPUT and similar changes throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #790.

Cl 41 SC 41.5 P269 L36 MyBallot # 1319  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ3/161-269-36: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 41, ... ==> ... Clause 41

Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 41 SC 41.5 P269 L36 MyBallot # 1318  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/160-269-36: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.1 P269 L42 MyBallot # 1317  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/159-269-42: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.2.2 P270 L35 MyBallot # 1321  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/163-270-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.2.2 P270 L36 MyBallot # 1320  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/162-270-36: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.1 P271 L7 MyBallot # 1324  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/166-271-7: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.10 P276 L3 MyBallot # 1336  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/178-276-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.10 P 276 L 4 MyBallot # 1339  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/181-276-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.11 P 276 L 19 MyBallot # 1338  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/180-276-19: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.11 P 276 L 20 MyBallot # 1337  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/179-276-20: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.12 P 277 L 3 MyBallot # 1340  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/182-277-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.12 P 277 L 3 MyBallot # 1341  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/183-277-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.2 P 271 L 26 MyBallot # 1323  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/165-271-26: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.2 P271 L26 MyBallot # 1322  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/164-271-26: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.2 P272 L37 MyBallot # 1326  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/168-272-37: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.2 P272 L37 MyBallot # 1325  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/167-272-37: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.2 P272 L4 MyBallot # 1327  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/169-272-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.5 P273 L4 MyBallot # 1330  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/172-273-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.6 P273 L23 MyBallot # 1328  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/170-273-23: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.6 P273 L23 MyBallot # 1329  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/171-273-23: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.7 P275 L35 MyBallot # 1334  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/176-275-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.7 P274 L3 MyBallot # 1331  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/173-274-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.7 P275 L35 MyBallot # 1333  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/175-275-35: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.7 P274 L3 MyBallot # 1332  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/174-274-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 41 SC 41.6.4.7 P275 L4 MyBallot # 1335  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/177-275-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 43 SC 43.6.4.2 P342 L1 MyBallot # 1343  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/185-342-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7 P342 L2 MyBallot # 1344  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ3/186-342-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 43, ... ==> ... Clause 43

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.1 P342 L12 MyBallot # 1342  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/184-342-12: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.12 P346 L5 MyBallot # 1362  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/204-346-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.12 P346 L5 MyBallot # 1369  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/211-346-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 43 SC 43.7.13 P346 L17 MyBallot # 1363  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/205-346-17: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.13 P346 L28 MyBallot # 1364  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/206-346-28: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.13 P346 L18 MyBallot # 1368  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/210-346-18: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.13 P346 L37 MyBallot # 1365  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/207-346-37: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.13 P346 L28 MyBallot # 1367  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/209-346-28: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.13 P346 L38 MyBallot # 1366  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/208-346-38: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 43 SC 43.7.16 P347 L4 MyBallot # 1370  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/212-347-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.16 P347 L4 MyBallot # 1375  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/217-347-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.17 P347 L17 MyBallot # 1371  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/213-347-17: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.17 P347 L17 MyBallot # 1374  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/216-347-17: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.18 P347 L30 MyBallot # 1372  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/214-347-30: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.18 P347 L30 MyBallot # 1373  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/215-347-30: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 43 SC 43.7.19 P348 L4 MyBallot # 1379  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/221-348-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.19 P348 L7 MyBallot # 1378  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ3/220-348-7: Consusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.2.1 P343 L19 MyBallot # 1346  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/188-343-19: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.2.1 P343 L20 MyBallot # 1347  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/189-343-20: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.2.1 P343 L4 MyBallot # 1345  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/187-343-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.2.1 P343 L4 MyBallot # 1348  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/190-343-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 43 SC 43.7.20 P348 L49 MyBallot # 1377  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/219-348-49: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.20 P348 L49 MyBallot # 1376  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/218-348-49: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.21 P349 L4 MyBallot # 1383  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/225-349-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.21 P349 L5 MyBallot # 1382  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/224-349-5: Consusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.22 P349 L43 MyBallot # 1381  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/223-349-43: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.22 P349 L43 MyBallot # 1380  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/222-349-43: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 43 SC 43.7.23 P 350 L 4 MyBallot # 1386  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/228-350-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.25 P 351 L 4 MyBallot # 1388  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/230-351-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.24 P 350 L 36 MyBallot # 1385  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/227-350-36: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.25 P 351 L 5 MyBallot # 1387  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/229-351-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.24 P 350 L 36 MyBallot # 1384  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/226-350-36: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.5 P 344 L 4 MyBallot # 1349  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/191-344-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 43 SC 43.7.5 P344 L4 MyBallot # 1355  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/197-344-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.5 P344 L9 MyBallot # 1354  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/196-344-9: Consusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.6 P344 L22 MyBallot # 1350  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/192-344-22: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.6 P344 L24 MyBallot # 1353  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/195-344-24: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.7 P344 L33 MyBallot # 1351  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/193-344-33: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.7 P344 L34 MyBallot # 1352  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/194-344-34: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 43 SC 43.7.7 P345 L18 MyBallot # 1356  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/198-345-18: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.7 P345 L18 MyBallot # 1360  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/202-345-18: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.7 P345 L31 MyBallot # 1359  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/201-345-31: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.7 P345 L5 MyBallot # 1361  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/203-345-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.7 P345 L50 MyBallot # 1358  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/200-345-50: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43 SC 43.7.7 P345 L50 MyBallot # 1357  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ3/199-345-50: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 43B SC 43B.5 P382 L1 MyBallot # 1391  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/233-382-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43B SC 43B.5 P382 L2 MyBallot # 1392  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ3/234-382-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 43B, ... ==> ... Clause 43B

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 43B SC 43B.6.1 P382 L8 MyBallot # 1390  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/232-382-8: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43B SC 43B.6.2.3 P383 L4 MyBallot # 1393  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/235-383-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 43B SC 43B.6.2.3 P383 L4 MyBallot # 1395  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/237-383-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 43B SC 43B.6.2.4 P383 L19 MyBallot # 1394  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ3/236-383-19: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 44 SC 44.1.4.1 P2 L52 MyBallot # 1396  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/1-2-52: Inconsistent with Clause 3 title.

SuggestedRemedy

Media Access Control ==> media access control

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #200.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.10 P27 L48 MyBallot # 1402  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/7-27-48: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.12 P28 L21 MyBallot # 1404  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/9-28-21: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.13 P30 L10 MyBallot # 1405  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/10-30-10: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.14 P32 L6 MyBallot # 1407  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/12-32-6: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.15 P32 L46 MyBallot # 1406  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/11-32-46: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.16 P33 L40 MyBallot # 1408  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/13-33-40: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.16 P34 L3 MyBallot # 1410  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/15-34-3: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.19 P34 L31 MyBallot # 1409  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/14-34-31: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.21 P35 L3 MyBallot # 1412  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/17-35-3: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.23 P35 L46 MyBallot # 1411  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/16-35-46: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.24 P36 L11 MyBallot # 1414  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/19-36-11: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.27 P36 L49 MyBallot # 1413  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/18-36-49: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.29 P37 L27 MyBallot # 1415  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/20-37-27: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.3 P19 L6 MyBallot # 1398  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

DVJ4/3-19-6: Using a zero value incorrectly uses part of the number space assigned to Xerox.

SuggestedRemedy

Change zero to all ones.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The change as suggested could potentially make many device non-compatible. Instead text will be added that states an all zero value in this register means that the PMA/PMD device identifier is not supported.

The all zero value in PHY identification registers has been in use since at least 1995 and has not caused problems in operation networks.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.31 P38 L19 MyBallot # 1417  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/22-38-19: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.31 P38 L4 MyBallot # 1418  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/23-38-4: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.32 P38 L41 MyBallot # 1416  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/21-38-41: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.33 P39 L10 MyBallot # 1420  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/25-39-10: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.34 P39 L30 MyBallot # 1419  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/24-39-30: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.35 P40 L7 MyBallot # 1422  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/27-40-7: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.36 P40 L26 MyBallot # 1421  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/26-40-26: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.37 P42 L6 MyBallot # 1423  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/28-42-6: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.38 P43 L25 MyBallot # 1424  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/29-43-25: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.39 P44 L28 MyBallot # 1425  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/30-44-28: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.4 P19 L18 MyBallot # 1397  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/2-19-18: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Change the title, perhaps to mode. 2) Change the entries to the column, to RW. The second is the preferred solution, since it is also more consistent with the other element values (such as RO).

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.40 P46 L10 MyBallot # 1426  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/31-46-10: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.41 P47 L41 MyBallot # 1427  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/32-47-41: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

The use of the header 'R/W' for this column has not created implementation issues and is well understood by the implementation community. We believe changing this is more likely to cause confusion and error that leaving it the way it is.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.42 P48 L6 MyBallot # 1430  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/35-48-6: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.43 P48 L21 MyBallot # 1428  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/33-48-21: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.43 P48 L28 MyBallot # 1429  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/34-48-28: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.44 P50 L6 MyBallot # 1431  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/36-50-6: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.45 P52 L35 MyBallot # 1432  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/37-52-35: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.47 P53 L11 MyBallot # 1434  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/39-53-11: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.49 P53 L40 MyBallot # 1433  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/38-53-40: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.51 P54 L15 MyBallot # 1436  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/41-54-15: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.53 P54 L45 MyBallot # 1435  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/40-54-45: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.55 P55 L26 MyBallot # 1437  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/42-55-26: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.57 P56 L23 MyBallot # 1438  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/43-56-23: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.58 P57 L6 MyBallot # 1439  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/44-57-6: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.6 P20 L43 MyBallot # 1399  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/4-20-43: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.6 P22 L9 MyBallot # 1400  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/5-22-9: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.8 P25 L10 MyBallot # 1401  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/6-25-10: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.1.9.3 P27 L4 MyBallot # 1403  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/8-27-4: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.1.1 P61 L3 MyBallot # 1440  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/45-61-3: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.10 P66 L34 MyBallot # 1447  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/52-66-34: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.10 P66 L54 MyBallot # 1446  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

DVJ4/51-66-54: Line is missing on bottom of table. This could lead a reader to believe the row is continued on the next page, which is not true.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix it.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The table is continued on the next page, the table heading on the next page needs fixed.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.11 P69 L18 MyBallot # 1451  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/56-69-18: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.12 P69 L36 MyBallot # 1450  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/55-69-36: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.13 P70 L33 MyBallot # 1452  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/57-70-33: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.14 P71 L28 MyBallot # 1453  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/58-71-28: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.15 P72 L29 MyBallot # 1455  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/60-72-29: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.15 P72 L3 MyBallot # 1456  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/61-72-3: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.17 P72 L49 MyBallot # 1454  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/59-72-49: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.18 P74 L4 MyBallot # 1457  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/62-74-4: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.19 P75 L3 MyBallot # 1458  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/63-75-3: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.2 P62 L22 MyBallot # 1441  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/46-62-22: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.4 P63 L24 MyBallot # 1442  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/47-63-24: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.6.1 P64 L4 MyBallot # 1443  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/48-64-4: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.7 P65 L13 MyBallot # 1445  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/50-65-13: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.7.3 P65 L46 MyBallot # 1444  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/49-65-46: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to ""Type"", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.8 P66 L17 MyBallot # 1449  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ4/54-66-17: The definition of OUI mapping is vague and hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Show the mapping in a figure. 2) Use hex digits in the illustration, and the typical OUI mapping used throughout IEEE/RAC tutorials.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1519.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.2.8 P66 L4 MyBallot # 1448  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/53-66-4: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3 P76 L58 MyBallot # 1459  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/64-76-58: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to ""Type"", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.1 P77 L10 MyBallot # 1460  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/65-77-10: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.12 P86 L7 MyBallot # 1465  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/70-86-7: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.13 P87 L9 MyBallot # 1467  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/72-87-9: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.14 P87 L39 MyBallot # 1466  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/71-87-39: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.15 P88 L12 MyBallot # 1468  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/73-88-12: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.16 P89 L38 MyBallot # 1469  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/74-89-38: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.17 P90 L4 MyBallot # 1471  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/76-90-4: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.17.2 P90 L36 MyBallot # 1470  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/75-90-36: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.20 P92 L34 MyBallot # 1472  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/77-92-34: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.20 P92 L6 MyBallot # 1473  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/78-92-6: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.21 P93 L7 MyBallot # 1476  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/81-93-7: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.22 P93 L27 MyBallot # 1475  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/80-93-27: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.23 P93 L44 MyBallot # 1474  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/79-93-44: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.24 P94 L7 MyBallot # 1479  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/84-94-7: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.25 P94 L25 MyBallot # 1478  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/83-94-25: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.26 P94 L43 MyBallot # 1477  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/82-94-43: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.27 P95 L8 MyBallot # 1481  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/86-95-8: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.28 P95 L28 MyBallot # 1480  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/85-95-28: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.3 P79 L40 MyBallot # 1461  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ4/66-79-40: The definition of OUI mapping is vague and hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Show the mapping in a figure. 2) Use hex digits in the illustration, and the typical OUI mapping used throughout IEEE/RAC tutorials.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1519.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.4.1 P80 L4 MyBallot # 1463  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/68-80-4: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.6 P80 L32 MyBallot # 1462  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/67-80-32: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.3.8 P82 L25 MyBallot # 1464  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ4/69-82-25: The definition of OUI mapping is vague and hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Show the mapping in a figure. 2) Use hex digits in the illustration, and the typical OUI mapping used throughout IEEE/RAC tutorials.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1519.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.4.1.2 P97 L4 MyBallot # 1482  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/87-97-4: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.4.1.4 P98 L9 MyBallot # 1483  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/88-98-9: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.4.3 P98 L51 MyBallot # 1484  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ4/89-98-51: The definition of OUI mapping is vague and hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Show the mapping in a figure. 2) Use hex digits in the illustration, and the typical OUI mapping used throughout IEEE/RAC tutorials.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1519.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.4.3 P99 L10 MyBallot # 1486  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/91-99-10: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.4.5 P99 L37 MyBallot # 1485  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/90-99-37: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.4.7 P100 L27 MyBallot # 1487  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ4/92-100-27: The definition of OUI mapping is vague and hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Show the mapping in a figure. 2) Use hex digits in the illustration, and the typical OUI mapping used throughout IEEE/RAC tutorials.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1519.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.4.8.2 P102 L15 MyBallot # 1488  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/93-102-15: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.5.1.2 P104 L3 MyBallot # 1489  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/94-104-3: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.5.2 P105 L14 MyBallot # 1490  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/95-105-14: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.5.3 P106 L17 MyBallot # 1491  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/96-106-17: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.5.3 P106 L4 MyBallot # 1492  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ4/97-106-4: The definition of OUI mapping is vague and hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Show the mapping in a figure. 2) Use hex digits in the illustration, and the typical OUI mapping used throughout IEEE/RAC tutorials.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1519.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.5.6.2 P107 L3 MyBallot # 1493  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/98-107-3: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.5.6.3 P107 L34 MyBallot # 1494  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ4/99-107-34: The definition of OUI mapping is vague and hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Show the mapping in a figure. 2) Use hex digits in the illustration, and the typical OUI mapping used throughout IEEE/RAC tutorials.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1519.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.5.8.1 P108 L3 MyBallot # 1495  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/100-108-3: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.5.9 P109 L20 MyBallot # 1496  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/101-109-20: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.6.1 P111 L10 MyBallot # 1497  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/102-111-10: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.6.10 P116 L39 MyBallot # 1505  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/110-116-39: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.6.11 P117 L3 MyBallot # 1508  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/113-117-3: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.6.12 P117 L20 MyBallot # 1507  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/112-117-20: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.6.13 P117 L36 MyBallot # 1506  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/111-117-36: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.6.2 P112 L19 MyBallot # 1499  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ4/104-112-19: The definition of OUI mapping is vague and hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Show the mapping in a figure. 2) Use hex digits in the illustration, and the typical OUI mapping used throughout IEEE/RAC tutorials.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1519.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.6.2 P112 L32 MyBallot # 1498  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/103-112-32: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.6.5 P113 L31 MyBallot # 1500  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/105-113-31: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.6.5 P113 L5 MyBallot # 1501  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ4/106-113-5: The definition of OUI mapping is vague and hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Show the mapping in a figure. 2) Use hex digits in the illustration, and the typical OUI mapping used throughout IEEE/RAC tutorials.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1519.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.6.7 P114 L25 MyBallot # 1502  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/107-114-25: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.6.8 P115 L19 MyBallot # 1504  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/109-115-19: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.6.9 P115 L43 MyBallot # 1503  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/108-115-43: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.1 P118 L45 MyBallot # 1509  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/114-118-45: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.3 P119 L13 MyBallot # 1512  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/117-119-13: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.4 P119 L36 MyBallot # 1511  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/116-119-36: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.5 P119 L52 MyBallot # 1510  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/115-119-52: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.7.6 P120 L14 MyBallot # 1513  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/118-120-14: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.8.1 P120 L51 MyBallot # 1514  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ4/119-120-51: The definition of OUI mapping is vague and hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Show the mapping in a figure. 2) Use hex digits in the illustration, and the typical OUI mapping used throughout IEEE/RAC tutorials.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1519.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.2.8.2 P121 L12 MyBallot # 1515  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/120-121-12: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.8.3 P121 L34 MyBallot # 1517  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ4/122-121-34: The definition of OUI mapping is vague and hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Show the mapping in a figure. 2) Use hex digits in the illustration, and the typical OUI mapping used throughout IEEE/RAC tutorials.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1519.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.9.1 P121 L53 MyBallot # 1516  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ4/121-121-53: The definition of OUI mapping is vague and hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Show the mapping in a figure. 2) Use hex digits in the illustration, and the typical OUI mapping used throughout IEEE/RAC tutorials.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1519.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.9.2 P122 L36 MyBallot # 1518  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/123-122-36: This column (and others throughout) are \_very\_ confusing. The title for the column (which represents a set of values) is the same as one of the elements of the set.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: Change the header to "Type", as was done some other places already.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1427.

Cl 45 SC 45.2.9.3 P123 L5 MyBallot # 1519  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ4/124-123-5: The definition of OUI mapping is vague and hard to follow.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Show the mapping in a figure. 2) Use hex digits in the illustration, and the typical OUI mapping used throughout IEEE/RAC tutorials.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

Reference is made to subclause 22.2.4.3.1 where both description and illustration of the mapping is provided, IEEE Std 802-2001 provides the mapping from the IEEE/RAC hex digits to bits. The committee believes it is better to have one figure referenced multiple times rather than a figure repeater multiple time.

Cl 45 SC 45.4.1 P127 L1 MyBallot # 1521  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/126-127-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.4.1, 45.4.2 P125 L11 MyBallot # 105  
BRADSHAW, P D

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

The 'NOTE' permits the use of a weak resistive pull up on the MDIO electrical interface. No definition (or even guidance as to the meaning) of "weak" is offered in Clause 45, but Clause 22 does offer some, in the NOTE to Table 22-13 (page 43, section 2, lines 35 to 40). Here a "resistive pull-up" of 1.5 kohm +/- 5% is allowed on MDIO, exactly matched by the allowed IIL on line 23. A "weak resistive pull-up" is allowed on COL, and the current specification implies (on a similar basis) a resistance of over 27 kohm. In passing, I would note that the XENPAK R3.0 spec, which references the Clause 45 spec for the "Transceiver Monitoring" interface (10.5), calls for 10-22k resistive pull-ups on "Low Speed Signals" in section 10.5.2, Figure 13 and Table 9, though not mentioning any value in the specific data for MDIO and MDC in Table 11, where some other pins are so mentioned.

The risetime implied by the >27 kohm Clause 22 "weak" pull-up and the Clause 45 maximum 470 pF bus capacitance is at least 12.7 usecs, almost 80 times the minimum MDC high time specified in 802.3 subclause 22.2.2.11 (and 30 times the full MDC period). (The worst case XENPAK-based numbers give about 7 usecs, 44 times the MDC high time.) Starting from the maximum VOL (unlikely limit at such a low current!), MDC will take ~1.5 usec to reach the VIL limit, and over 10usec more to reach the VIH limit. During a READ operation, the STA must clock in the data on the rising edge of MDC (45.4.2 line 45), while the MMD should change to the next bit after MDC reaches VIH of the same edge (Fig 45-4). With such a slow rise time, this would require an extremely precise (essentially impractical) VIH threshold for the MMD, unless the STA clocks in the data BEFORE the MDC reaches VIL (possible since the STA controls the MDC signal). So even very slow MDC clock rates have serious practical problems with this slow rise time.

The fall time (controlled by IOL per line 29, with the worst case capacitance) is under about 120 nsecs, and only the STA takes any action on this edge, so it causes much less of a problem.

If we assume that the pull-up on MDC (and MDIO) uses the "resistive pull-up" value of the NOTE to Table 22-13 (1.5 kohm), the timing issues above are reduced by factors of 18. The 1.2V VDD and 4mA IOL values of the 45.4.1 subclause allow a resistive pull-up of about 330 ohms, which would improve the timing issues above by a factor of over 80. However, there is still a problem with the MDC-to-MDIO-sourced-from-MMD minimum delay specification.

As the specification currently stands, the MDIO sourced by MMD must not change until MDC reaches within ~0 nV of VIH, but must change within 300 nsec of MDC reaching ~0 nV above VIH. In practice, a fast-rising MDC will mask this problem, provided that the actual delay from MDC crossing the actual MMD threshold to the MDIO changing is greater than the delay before MDC crosses the VIH minimum value, but the basic problem remains, since the latter number depends on the rate of rise of MDC.

SuggestedRemedy

1. In Line 11 in the Note to 45.4.1, change "open drain buffers and a weak resistive pull up" to "open drain buffers and a resistive pull-up" (NB this also fixes the [editorial] inconsistency between "pull-up" in Clause 22 and "pull up" in Clause 45).

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general  
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn  
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

2. In 45.4.2, line 45, insert "beginning of the " before "rising edge of MDC." (or change "with respect to" to "before the" in line 44, or other equivalent wording). Change Figure 45-4 on page 126 so that the "0 nsec MIN" delay is from MDC crossing VIL, while retaining the "300 nsec MAX" from MDC crossing VIH. (See attached drawing as a guide).

Proposed Response ACCEPT.  
Response Status W

Cl 45 SC 45.5 P127 L2 MyBallot # 1522  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/127-127-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 45, ... ==> ... Clause 45

Proposed Response REJECT.  
Response Status W

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.3 P127 L12 MyBallot # 1520  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/125-127-12: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
Response Status W

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.5.4.3 P128 L12 MyBallot # 1525  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/130-128-12: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.4.3 P128 L9 MyBallot # 1528  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/133-128-9: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.4.3 P128 L9 MyBallot # 1526  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/131-128-9: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5 P128 L42 MyBallot # 1527  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/132-128-42: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5 P128 L42 MyBallot # 1523  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/128-128-42: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5 P128 L43 MyBallot # 1524  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/129-128-43: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.10 P145 L41 MyBallot # 1571  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/176-145-41: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.11 P146 L4 MyBallot # 1574  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/179-146-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.10 P145 L42 MyBallot # 1569  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/174-145-42: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.11 P146 L4 MyBallot # 1572  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/177-146-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.10 P145 L42 MyBallot # 1568  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/173-145-42: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.11 P146 L6 MyBallot # 1573  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/178-146-6: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.11 P147 L2 MyBallot # 1575  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/180-147-2: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.11 P147 L4 MyBallot # 1576  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/181-147-4: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.12 P148 L5 MyBallot # 1581  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/186-148-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.12 P148 L6 MyBallot # 1579  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/184-148-6: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.13 P148 L30 MyBallot # 1580  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/185-148-30: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.13 P148 L30 MyBallot # 1577  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/182-148-30: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.13 P148 L32 MyBallot # 1578  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/183-148-32: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.13 P149 L7 MyBallot # 1583  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/188-149-7: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.13 P149 L4 MyBallot # 1582  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/187-149-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.15 P150 L4 MyBallot # 1587  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/192-150-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.13 P149 L4 MyBallot # 1584  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/189-149-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.15 P150 L4 MyBallot # 1585  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/190-150-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.15 P150 L7 MyBallot # 1586  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/191-150-7: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.15 P151 L3 MyBallot # 1590  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/195-151-3: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.15 P151 L31 MyBallot # 1591  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/196-151-31: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.15 P151 L31 MyBallot # 1588  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/193-151-31: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.15 P151 L34 MyBallot # 1589  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/194-151-34: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.17 P152 L4 MyBallot # 1595  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/200-152-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.17 P152 L6 MyBallot # 1593  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/198-152-6: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.18 P152 L39 MyBallot # 1594  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/199-152-39: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.18 P152 L39 MyBallot # 1592  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/197-152-39: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.19 P153 L11 MyBallot # 1597  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/202-153-11: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.19 P153 L9 MyBallot # 1596  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/201-153-9: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.2 P129 L4 MyBallot # 1529  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/134-129-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.2 P129 L5 MyBallot # 1531  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
DVJ4/136-129-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
SuggestedRemedy  
Center all "Item" column cells.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.2 P129 L8 MyBallot # 1530  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
DVJ4/135-129-8: These blank lines look like errors.  
SuggestedRemedy  
Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
REJECT.  
See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.3 P130 L10 MyBallot # 1532  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
DVJ4/137-130-10: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
SuggestedRemedy  
Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.3 P130 L11 MyBallot # 1534  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
DVJ4/139-130-11: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
SuggestedRemedy  
Center all "Item" column cells.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.3 P130 L13 MyBallot # 1533  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
DVJ4/138-130-13: These blank lines look like errors.  
SuggestedRemedy  
Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
REJECT.  
See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.3 P131 L4 MyBallot # 1535  
JAMES, DAVID V  
Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
DVJ4/140-131-4: These blank lines look like errors.  
SuggestedRemedy  
Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
Proposed Response Response Status W  
REJECT.  
See MyBallot comment #1541.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.3 P132 L5 MyBallot # 1536  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/141-132-5: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.3 P133 L4 MyBallot # 1537  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/142-133-4: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.3 P134 L3 MyBallot # 1538  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/143-134-3: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.3 P135 L4 MyBallot # 1541  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/146-135-4: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

We assume you are referring to the empty cell in this table rather than a blank line.

This entry in the table is empty because there is no value or comment necessary. The committee believes this is obvious to the reader and that the addition of extra characters decreases readability.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.4 P135 L46 MyBallot # 1542  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/147-135-46: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.4 P135 L46 MyBallot # 1539  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/144-135-46: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.4 P135 L47 MyBallot # 1540  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/145-135-47: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.5 P136 L6 MyBallot # 1544  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/149-136-6: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.5 P136 L4 MyBallot # 1543  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/148-136-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.5 P137 L2 MyBallot # 1546  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/151-137-2: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.5 P136 L4 MyBallot # 1545  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/150-136-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.5 P137 L4 MyBallot # 1547  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/152-137-4: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.5 P138 L1 MyBallot # 1548  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/153-138-1: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.5 P138 L4 MyBallot # 1549  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/154-138-4: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.6 P139 L4 MyBallot # 1554  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/159-139-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.6 P139 L7 MyBallot # 1552  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/157-139-7: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.7 P139 L30 MyBallot # 1553  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/158-139-30: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.7 P139 L30 MyBallot # 1550  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/155-139-30: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.7 P139 L33 MyBallot # 1551  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/156-139-33: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.7 P140 L2 MyBallot # 1555  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/160-140-2: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.7 P140 L7 MyBallot # 1556  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/161-140-7: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.7 P141 L2 MyBallot # 1557  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/162-141-2: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.7 P141 L3 MyBallot # 1558  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/163-141-3: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.7 P142 L2 MyBallot # 1559  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/164-142-2: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.7 P142 L5 MyBallot # 1560  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/165-142-5: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.7 P143 L4 MyBallot # 1563  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/168-143-4: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.8 P143 L36 MyBallot # 1564  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/169-143-36: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.8 P143 L36 MyBallot # 1561  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/166-143-36: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.8 P143 L38 MyBallot # 1562  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/167-143-38: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.8 P144 L5 MyBallot # 1567  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/172-144-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.8 P144 L5 MyBallot # 1565  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/170-144-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.8 P144 L7 MyBallot # 1566  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/171-144-7: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45 SC 45.5.5.8 P145 L4 MyBallot # 1570  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/175-145-4: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 45A SC 45A.3, 45A.4 P438 L0 MyBallot # 109  
 BRADSHAW, P D

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

Both 45A.3 and 45A.4 describe a "protocol aware voltage translator" as being required to interface between Clause 22 and Clause 45 voltage and protocol devices. Both say that "the device must have knowledge of any Clause 22 PHY addresses present ...". However, it is possible to use a voltage translator that is protocol-independent, and will work perfectly well between Clause 22 and Clause 45 levels, using nothing more than appropriately-biased NMOS FETs between the groups of lines involved, and the pull-up resistors shown in Figures 45A-3 and 45A-4. I have attached two pages from an I2C specification document (from Philips Semiconductor), showing a suitable arrangement, though in that case interfacing between (open drain) 3.3V and 5V levels. By appropriate changes in the connections of the pull-up resistors, and the gate voltage bias on the FETs, the circuit can be readily changed to operate between 1.2V and 3.3V or 5V. Matched sets of such FETs are available from several suppliers, often including an additional FET that can be used to set the gate bias level to be corrected for the VGS threshold voltage level of the FETs. A succession of such protocol-independent circuits has been used successfully to interface MMD-protocol devices operating at 1.2V, 1.5V, 2.4V, and 3.3V, all the devices being able to talk to each other as needed. The only limitation involves the speed limits set by the various resistive pull-ups, which must (in some cases) be strong enough to pull the higher-voltage signals up high enough to function, while (in aggregate) not overloading the pulldown capability of the driver(s).

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the requirement (especially via the use of "must") of protocol-awareness in the descriptions of the level shifting circuits.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

This is an informative Annex and implementers may produce conformant behavior with simplified logic.

Cl 46 SC 46.1 P155 L28 MyBallot # 1598  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/203-155-28: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.

SuggestedRemedy

Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 46 SC 46.1 P155 L42 MyBallot # 1599  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/204-155-42: Inconsistent with Clause 3 title.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Media Access Control ==> media access control  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #200.

Cl 46 SC 46.4 P173 L1 MyBallot # 1601  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/206-173-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 46 SC 46.5 P173 L2 MyBallot # 1602  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/207-173-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 46, ... ==> ... Clause 46  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 46 SC 46.5.1 P173 L12 MyBallot # 1600  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/205-173-12: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 46 SC 46.5.2.3 P174 L21 MyBallot # 1606  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/211-174-21: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 46 SC 46.5.2.3 P174 L22 MyBallot # 1604  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/209-174-22: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 46 SC 46.5.3 P174 L38 MyBallot # 1603  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/208-174-38: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 46 SC 46.5.3 P174 L38 MyBallot # 1605  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/210-174-38: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 46 SC 46.5.3.2 P175 L4 MyBallot # 1607  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/212-175-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 46 SC 46.5.3.2 P175 L5 MyBallot # 1608  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/213-175-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 46 SC 46.5.3.3 P176 L23 MyBallot # 1609  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/214-176-23: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 46 SC 46.5.3.3 P176 L23 MyBallot # 1610  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/215-176-23: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 46 SC 46.5.3.3 P176 L5 MyBallot # 1611  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/216-176-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 46 SC 46.5.3.5 P177 L20 MyBallot # 1614  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/219-177-20: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 46 SC 46.5.3.6 P177 L41 MyBallot # 1613  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/218-177-41: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 46 SC 46.5.3.6 P177 L41 MyBallot # 1612  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/217-177-41: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 47 SC 47.1 P179 L15 MyBallot # 1615  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/220-179-15: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 47 SC 47.5 P190 L1 MyBallot # 1617  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/222-190-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 47 SC 47.5 P190 L1 MyBallot # 1618  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/223-190-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 47, ... ==> ... Clause 47

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 47 SC 47.6.1 P190 L12 MyBallot # 1616  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/221-190-12: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 47 SC 47.6.2.2 P191 L17 MyBallot # 1619  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/224-191-17: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 47 SC 47.6.2.2 P191 L18 MyBallot # 1624  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/229-191-18: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 47 SC 47.6.2.2 P191 L20 MyBallot # 1621  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/226-191-20: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 47 SC 47.6.2.2 P191 L26 MyBallot # 1623  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/228-191-26: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 47 SC 47.6.2.2 P191 L4 MyBallot # 1625  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/230-191-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 47 SC 47.6.2.2 P191 L40 MyBallot # 1620  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/225-191-40: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #353.

Cl 47 SC 47.6.2.2 P191 L40 MyBallot # 1622  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/227-191-40: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 48 SC 48.6 P223 L1 MyBallot # 1627  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/232-223-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 48 SC 48.7 P223 L2 MyBallot # 1628  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/233-223-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement (PICS) proforma for Physical Coding Sublayer (PCS) and Physical Medium Attachment (PMA) sublayer, type 10GBASE-X5 ==> Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement (PICS) proforma for Clause 48

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 48 SC 48.7.1 P223 L14 MyBallot # 1626  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/231-223-14: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 48 SC 48.7.2.2 P224 L20 MyBallot # 1633  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/238-224-20: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 48 SC 48.7.2.2 P224 L20 MyBallot # 1629  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/234-224-20: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 48 SC 48.7.2.2 P224 L29 MyBallot # 1631  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/236-224-29: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 48 SC 48.7.2.2 P224 L40 MyBallot # 1630  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/235-224-40: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 48 SC 48.7.2.2 P224 L44 MyBallot # 1632  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/237-224-44: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

CI 48 SC 48.7.4.2 P225 L4 MyBallot # 1634  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/239-225-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

CI 48 SC 48.7.4.3 P226 L20 MyBallot # 1636  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/241-226-20: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

CI 48 SC 48.7.4.3 P226 L5 MyBallot # 1635  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/240-226-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

CI 49 SC 49.1.2 P228 L10 MyBallot # 1637  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/242-228-10: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

CI 49 SC 49.2.15 P251 L1 MyBallot # 1639  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/244-251-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

CI 49 SC 49.3 P251 L2 MyBallot # 1640  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/245-251-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 49, ... ==> ... Clause 49  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 49 SC 49.3.1 P251 L12 MyBallot # 1638  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/243-251-12: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 49 SC 49.3.3 P252 L14 MyBallot # 1643  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/248-252-14: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 49 SC 49.3.3 P252 L14 MyBallot # 1641  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/246-252-14: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 49, ... ==> ... Clause 49

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 49 SC 49.3.3 P252 L5 MyBallot # 1644  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/249-252-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 49 SC 49.3.4.1 P252 L29 MyBallot # 1642  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/247-252-29: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 49 SC 49.3.4.2 P253 L18 MyBallot # 1645  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/250-253-18: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 49 SC 49.3.4.2 P 253 L 4 MyBallot # 1646  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/251-253-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 49 SC 49.3.5.1 P 254 L 4 MyBallot # 1649  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/254-254-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 49 SC 49.3.5.1 P 254 L 19 MyBallot # 1648  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/254-254-19: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 49 SC 49.3.5.1 P 255 L 16 MyBallot # 1651  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/256-255-16: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 49 SC 49.3.5.1 P 254 L 30 MyBallot # 1647  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/252-254-30: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 49 SC 49.3.5.1 P 255 L 27 MyBallot # 1650  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/255-255-27: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

CI 49 SC 49.3.5.1 P255 L4 MyBallot # 1652  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/257-255-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

CI 4A SC 4A.1.4 P575 L17 MyBallot # 101  
 BROWN, BENJAMIN J

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

Part 1: The matching subclause in 4 was removed during working group ballot.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove this subclause and associated figure. Also, the figure references are to annex 9A, not 4A. These should be fixed throughout the annex.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT.

CI 4A SC 4A.1.4 P575 L33 MyBallot # 677  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/518-575-33: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

CI 4A SC 4A.2.1 P576 L26 MyBallot # 678  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ1/519-576-26: If the normative text is defined in Pascal, the Pascal code must be defined in a normative (not informative) reference.

SuggestedRemedy

1) Pick on of the reference to be the normative one, the other informative. 2) Change code to use only the normative Pascal code.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

The two references are required for Pascal and the extensions to Pascal used in specifying the MAC. The pointer to the references is consistent with Clause 4 and the ability of hundreds of implementers to independently build interoperable Clause 4 MACs with hundreds of millions of installed product demonstrates the references used are not a problem.

CI 4A SC 4A.2.2.2 P577 L24 MyBallot # 679  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ1/520-577-24: There is no technical reference for the definitions of "Concurrent Pascal"

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Provide a normative reference. 2) Change the code to use only the ANSI standard Pascal.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

Se MyBallot comment #678.

CI 4A SC 4A.2.2.3 P578 L16 MyBallot # 680  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ1/521-578-16: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 4A SC 4A.2.2.3 P 581 L 49 MyBallot # 681  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A  
 DVJ1/522-581-49: Confusing title  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Merge the two quasi titles: "c) MAC sublayer" "Control flow" into one title. Do this in previous figures also.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 The titles of Figures 4A-3a through 4A-3c will be corrected and that title that is part of the figure will be removed.

Cl 4A SC 4A.4.2 P 596 L 37 MyBallot # 682  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/523-596-37: These font sizes look wrong.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix them.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 50 SC 50.1.2 P 258 L 35 MyBallot # 1653  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/258-258-35: IEEE Style Manual avoids ALL CAPS and Some Caps in the same figure.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Don't use the ALL CAPS notation, in this and other figures.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 50 SC 50.5 P 287 L 1 MyBallot # 1655  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/260-287-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 50 SC 50.6 P 287 L 2 MyBallot # 1656  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/261-287-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 50, ... ==> ... Clause 50  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 50 SC 50.6.1 P287 L12 MyBallot # 1654  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/259-287-12: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 50 SC 50.6.2.2 P289 L20 MyBallot # 1658  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/263-289-20: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 50 SC 50.6.2.2 P289 L35 MyBallot # 1657  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/262-289-35: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 50 SC 50.6.2.2 P289 L4 MyBallot # 1659  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/264-289-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 50 SC 50.6.2.2 P290 L2 MyBallot # 1661  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/266-290-2: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 50 SC 50.6.4.3 P290 L36 MyBallot # 1660  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/265-290-36: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 50 SC 50.6.4.4 P291 L44 MyBallot # 1662  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/267-291-44: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 50 SC 50.6.4.5 P292 L4 MyBallot # 1664  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/269-292-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 50 SC 50.6.4.6 P292 L36 MyBallot # 1663  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/268-292-36: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 50 SC 50.6.4.7 P293 L4 MyBallot # 1665  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/270-293-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 51 SC 51.1 P310 L2 MyBallot # 1668  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/273-310-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 51, ... ==> ... Clause 51  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 51 SC 51.10.1 P310 L12 MyBallot # 1666  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/271-310-12: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 51 SC 51.10.3 P312 L19 MyBallot # 1670  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/275-312-19: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 51 SC 51.10.4.1 P312 L32 MyBallot # 1671  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/276-312-32: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 51 SC 51.10.3 P312 L4 MyBallot # 1674  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/279-312-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 51 SC 51.10.4.2 P312 L38 MyBallot # 1672  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/277-312-38: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 51 SC 51.10.4.1 P312 L30 MyBallot # 1673  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/278-312-30: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 51 SC 51.10.4.2 P312 L41 MyBallot # 1669  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/274-312-41: These blank cells look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 51 SC 51.10.4.3 P313 L5 MyBallot # 1676  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/281-313-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 51 SC 51.10.4.3 P313 L8 MyBallot # 1675  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/280-313-8: These blank cells look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 51 SC 51.9 P310 L1 MyBallot # 1667  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/272-310-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.14.4 P350 L41 MyBallot # 107  
 KOLESAR, PAUL R F

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

The referenced singlemode connector performance specification, IEC 61753-021-2, provides several classes of performance that differ by return loss. Of these classes, performance Class S matches the specifications of clause 52, by specifying a 26 dB return loss requirement.

The reference should be made more specific by including a designation of this performance class.

SuggestedRemedy

Modify the reference as follows:

b) IEC 61753-021-2 -- Fibre optic ... Category C -- Controlled environment, performance Class S.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 52 SC 52.14.4 P350 L43 MyBallot # 5  
LAW, DAVID J

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

The resolution to comment #83 on the previous ballot called for modification of the reference to IEC 61753-022-2 to add a specific performance class that is aligned with the specifications for multimode connectors within standard 802.3. This modification was not made where the reference is called out in clause 52. Make the modification as previously agreed. The agreed resolution is reproduced here for reference:

Accept in principle.

Modify the clause 52 and 53 references as follows:

c) IEC 61753-022-2 -- Fibre optic ... Category C -- Controlled environment, performance Class M.

This is based on the following email from e-mail from Paul Kolesar: I've obtained the standard and checked its contents. I believe it meets the expectations of IEEE P802.3ae where referenced in clauses 52.14.4 and 53.14.3, with one possible exception that deserves clarification in the referencing clauses. The exception has to do with the fact that 61753-022-2 specified two performance levels delineated by class designations M and N. Class M meets the 0.75 dB attenuation and 20 dB return loss requirements of 802.3 for multimode connectors, while class N does not. Class N attenuation is 1.25 dB max and has no return loss requirements. Therefore, I believe comment #83 should spawn additional action to insert a designation of Class M into the places where it is called out in clauses 52 and 53 (and any other places).

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest modifying the clause 52 and 53 references as follows:

c) IEC 61753-022-2 -- Fibre optic ... Category C -- Controlled environment, performance Class M.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT.

Cl 52 SC 52.14.4 P350 L43 MyBallot # 114  
KOLESAR, PAUL R F

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

The resolution to comment #83 on the D1.0 ballot called for modification of the reference to IEC 61753-022-2 to add a specific performance class that is aligned with the specifications for multimode connectors within standard 802.3. This modification was not made where the reference is called out in clause 52. Make the modification as previously agreed. The agreed resolution is reproduced here for reference:

Accept in principle.

Modify the clause 52 references as follows:

c) IEC 61753-022-2 -- Fibre optic ... Category C -- Controlled environment, performance Class M.

SuggestedRemedy

Modify the clause 52 references as follows:

c) IEC 61753-022-2 -- Fibre optic ... Category C -- Controlled environment, performance Class M.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT.

Cl 52 SC 52.14.4 P351 L1 MyBallot # 1678  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/283-351-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 52 SC 52.15 P351 L4 MyBallot # 1679  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/284-351-4: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 52, ... ==> ... Clause 52

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.1 P351 L15 MyBallot # 1677  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/282-351-15: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.2.3 P352 L21 MyBallot # 1680  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/285-352-21: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.2.3 P352 L21 MyBallot # 1681  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/286-352-21: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3 P353 L28 MyBallot # 1684  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/289-353-28: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3 P353 L28 MyBallot # 1682  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/287-353-28: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3 P353 L7 MyBallot # 1683  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/288-353-7: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.10 P356 L36 MyBallot # 1698  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/303-356-36: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3 P353 L8 MyBallot # 1685  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/290-353-8: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.11 P357 L4 MyBallot # 1705  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/310-357-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.10 P356 L36 MyBallot # 1700  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/305-356-36: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.11 P357 L4 MyBallot # 1703  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/308-357-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.12 P357 L18 MyBallot # 1704  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/309-357-18: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.3 P354 L5 MyBallot # 1691  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/296-354-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.12 P357 L18 MyBallot # 1702  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/307-357-18: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.4 P354 L16 MyBallot # 1687  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/292-354-16: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.3 P354 L4 MyBallot # 1688  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/293-354-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.4 P354 L16 MyBallot # 1690  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/295-354-16: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.5 P354 L27 MyBallot # 1686  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/291-354-27: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.5 P354 L28 MyBallot # 1689  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/294-354-28: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.6 P355 L4 MyBallot # 1694  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/299-355-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.6 P355 L5 MyBallot # 1697  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/302-355-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.7 P355 L16 MyBallot # 1693  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/298-355-16: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.7 P355 L16 MyBallot # 1696  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/301-355-16: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.8 P 355 L 29 MyBallot # 1692  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/297-355-29: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.8 P 355 L 29 MyBallot # 1695  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/300-355-29: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.9 P 356 L 4 MyBallot # 1699  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/304-356-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.15.3.9 P 356 L 4 MyBallot # 1701  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/306-356-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 52 SC 52.4.14 P 350 L 40 MyBallot # 6  
 LAW, DAVID J  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor  
 The referenced singlemode connector performance specification, IEC 61753-021-2, provides several classes of performance that differ by return loss. Of these classes, performance Class S matches the specifications of clause 52, by specifying a 26 dB return loss requirement.  
 The reference should be made more specific by including a designation of this performance class.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Modify the reference as follows:  
 b) IEC 61753-021-2 -- Fibre optic ... Category C -- Controlled environment, performance Class S.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 53 SC 53.14.3 P389 L19 MyBallot # 8  
LAW, DAVID J

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

The referenced singlemode connector performance specification, IEC 61753-021-2, provides several classes of performance that differ by return loss. Of these classes, performance Class S matches the specifications of clause 52, by specifying a 26 dB return loss requirement.

The reference should be made more specific by including a designation of this performance class.

SuggestedRemedy

Modify the reference as follows:

b) IEC 61753-021-2 -- Fibre optic ... Category C -- Controlled environment, performance Class S.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT.

Cl 53 SC 53.14.3 P389 L20 MyBallot # 111  
KOLESAR, PAUL R F

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

The referenced singlemode connector performance specification, IEC 61753-021-2, provides several classes of performance that differ by return loss. Of these classes, performance Class S matches the specifications of clause 53, by specifying a 26 dB return loss requirement.

The reference should be made more specific by including a designation of this performance class.

SuggestedRemedy

Modify the reference as follows:

b) IEC 61753-021-2 -- Fibre optic ... Category C -- Controlled environment, performance Class S

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT.

Cl 53 SC 53.14.3 P389 L21 MyBallot # 7  
LAW, DAVID J

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

The resolution to comment #83 during the IEEE P802.3REVam D1.0 Working Group ballot called for modification of the reference to IEC 61753-022-2 to add a specific performance class that is aligned with the specifications for multimode connectors within standard 802.3. This modification was not made where the reference is called out in clause 52. Make the modification as previously agreed. The agreed resolution is reproduced here for reference:

Accept in principle.

Modify the clause 52 and 53 references as follows:

c) IEC 61753-022-2 -- Fibre optic ... Category C -- Controlled environment, performance Class M.

This is based on the following email from e-mail from Paul Kolesar: I've obtained the standard and checked its contents. I believe it meets the expectations of IEEE P802.3ae where referenced in clauses 52.14.4 and 53.14.3, with one possible exception that deserves clarification in the referencing clauses. The exception has to do with the fact that 61753-022-2 specified two performance levels delineated by class designations M and N. Class M meets the 0.75 dB attenuation and 20 dB return loss requirements of 802.3 for multimode connectors, while class N does not. Class N attenuation is 1.25 dB max and has no return loss requirements. Therefore, I believe comment #83 should spawn additional action to insert a designation of Class M into the places where it is called out in clauses 52 and 53 (and any other places).

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest modifying the clause 52 and 53 references as follows:

c) IEC 61753-022-2 -- Fibre optic ... Category C -- Controlled environment, performance Class M.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 53 SC 53.14.3 P389 L22 MyBallot # 112  
 KOLESAR, PAUL R F

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

The resolution to comment #83 during the IEEE P802.3REVam D1.0 Working Group ballot called for modification of the reference to IEC 61753-022-2 to add a specific performance class that is aligned with the specifications for multimode connectors within standard 802.3. This modification was not made where the reference is called out in clause 53. Make the modification as previously agreed. The agreed resolution is reproduced here for reference: Accept in principle. Modify the clause 52 and 53 references as follows:  
 c) IEC 61753-022-2 -- Fibre optic ... Category C -- Controlled environment, performance Class M.

SuggestedRemedy

Modify the clause 52 and 53 references as follows:  
 c) IEC 61753-022-2 -- Fibre optic ... Category C -- Controlled environment, performance Class M.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT.

Cl 53 SC 53.14.3 P390 L1 MyBallot # 1707  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/312-390-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 53 SC 53.15 P390 L3 MyBallot # 1708  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/313-390-3: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 53, ... ==> ... Clause 53

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 53 SC 53.15.1 P390 L14 MyBallot # 1706  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/311-390-14: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 53 SC 53.15.3 P391 L21 MyBallot # 1709  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/314-391-21: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 53 SC 53.15.3 P391 L21 MyBallot # 1710  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/315-391-21: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 53 SC 53.15.4.2 P393 L5 MyBallot # 1716  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/321-393-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 53 SC 53.15.4 P392 L7 MyBallot # 1711  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/316-392-7: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 53 SC 53.15.4.2 P393 L5 MyBallot # 1714  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/319-393-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 53 SC 53.15.4 P392 L7 MyBallot # 1712  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/317-392-7: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 53 SC 53.15.4.3 P393 L18 MyBallot # 1715  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/320-393-18: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 53 SC 53.15.4.3 P393 L20 MyBallot # 1713  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/318-393-20: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 53 SC 53.15.4.4 P394 L4 MyBallot # 1717  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/322-394-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 53 SC 53.15.4.4 P394 L4 MyBallot # 1718  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/323-394-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 53 SC 53.15.4.5 P395 L4 MyBallot # 1719  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/324-395-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 53 SC 53.15.4.5 P395 L4 MyBallot # 1720  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/325-395-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 53 SC 53.15.4.6 P398 L5 MyBallot # 1722  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/327-398-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 53 SC 53.15.4.6 P398 L5 MyBallot # 1721  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/326-398-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.1 P421 L3 MyBallot # 1725  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/330-421-3: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 54, ... ==> ... Clause 54

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.1 P421 L8 MyBallot # 1723  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/328-421-8: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.3 P422 L4 MyBallot # 1729  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/334-422-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.3 P422 L5 MyBallot # 1731  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/336-422-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.3 P422 L6 MyBallot # 1727  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ4/332-422-6: These blank lines look like errors.

SuggestedRemedy

Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1541.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4 P 422 L 13 MyBallot # 1728  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/333-422-13: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4 P 422 L 13 MyBallot # 1730  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/335-422-13: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4 P 422 L 17 MyBallot # 1726  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/331-422-17: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4.1 P 423 L 5 MyBallot # 1732  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/337-423-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4.1 P 423 L 5 MyBallot # 1733  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/338-423-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4.1 P 424 L 2 MyBallot # 1735  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/340-424-2: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4.2 P 424 L 20 MyBallot # 1736  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/341-424-20: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4.2 P 424 L 21 MyBallot # 1734  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/339-424-21: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4.3 P 425 L 4 MyBallot # 1738  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/343-425-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4.3 P 425 L 4 MyBallot # 1739  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/344-425-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4.3 P 425 L 6 MyBallot # 1737  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ4/342-425-6: These blank lines look like errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Either: 1) Fill them with useful content (preferred). 2) Fill them with an em dash, if content is too difficult to generate.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1541.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4.4 P 426 L 4 MyBallot # 1741  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/346-426-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4.4 P 426 L 5 MyBallot # 1743  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/348-426-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4.5 P 426 L 21 MyBallot # 1742  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/347-426-21: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4.5 P 426 L 21 MyBallot # 1740  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/345-426-21: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4.6 P 427 L 4 MyBallot # 1744  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/349-427-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 54 SC 54.10.4.6 P 427 L 4 MyBallot # 1745  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ4/350-427-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.5.4 P404 L0 MyBallot # 94  
BRADSHAW, P D

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

The remedy to the problem posed by 54.5.4 in 802.3ak does not work. At an ad hoc meeting of the concerned people at the November 04 maintenance meeting, I agreed to submit the attached change to the SIGNAL\_DETECT function definition.

This comment should be a TR comment.

The attached file shows more detail related to this discussion.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace paragraphs 2 & 3 of 54.5.4 with the following:-

SIGNAL\_DETECT is a global indicator of the presence of electrical signals on all four lanes. The PMD receiver is not required to verify whether a compliant 10GBASE-CX4 signal is being received; however, it shall assert SIGNAL\_DETECT = OK within 100 s after the absolute differential peak-to-peak input voltage on each of the four lanes at the MDI has exceeded 175 mV for at least 1 UI (unit interval).

After any such assertion of SIGNAL\_DETECT = OK, SIGNAL\_DETECT = FAIL shall not be asserted for at least 250 usecs. The PMD shall have asserted SIGNAL\_DETECT = FAIL when the absolute differential peak-to-peak input voltage on any of the four lanes at the MDI has dropped below 50 mV and has remained below 50 mV for longer than 500 s.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The suggested remedy will be implemented.

It should be noted however that there's a "100 s" in the first paragraph of the suggested remedy that should be a "100us" and a "500 s" in the second paragraph that should be a "500us". This seems to be a printout phenomena but it should be checked to make sure the final publication has these numbers as "100us" and "500us". In addition the text '250 usecs' will be changed to read '250us'.

Cl 54 SC 54.5.4 P404 L5 MyBallot # 95  
BRADSHAW, P D

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

The conditions for asserting SIGNAL\_DETECT = OK depend on the existence of an input signal in excess of a value for 1UI. The intent, as expressed in the 802.3ak Working Group, appeared to me to be as follows:-

If the (as defined) input level exceeds some threshold value, for a time that would occur at least during the time span of an IPG, then SIGNAL\_DETECT = OK is to be asserted.

The minimum IPG will always have at least 2 runs of 3 or more 1s or 0s, including at least one run of 4 or more 1s or 0s. Assuming that the input signal (at least when SIGNAL\_DETECT is "at risk") will have suffered high frequency attenuation, the first bit of such runs may be expected to fall below the threshold, but the later bits will be the "key" area for threshold detection. Thus there is a 'reasonable' expectation that an IPG will have 7 to 9 "full amplitude" bits in a 20 UI interval. I think it would be preferable to have the SIGNAL\_DETECT = OK depend on at least 7 of 20 UI as the time criteria for assertion.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Replace "at least 1 UI (unit interval) " by "at least 7 UI (unit interval) in any consecutive 20 UI block".

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

This change will make it harder for SIGNAL\_DETECT=OK to be asserted. The whole intent is to get SIGNAL\_DETECT=OK as soon as possible. Stretching out the criteria from 1UI to 7UI does not solve any problem. In fact this comment does not state there is a problem with what is currently there. Since there is no problem stated there does not need to be a remedy and therefore this comment s/b rejected.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 54 SC 54.9 P 421 L 1 MyBallot # 1724  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ4/329-421-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.4.1 P 33 L 34 MyBallot # 1748  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ5/3-33-34: Its unclear what "left" and "right" mean.

SuggestedRemedy

Any mapping should be defined in terms of MSB and LSB. For clarity, the MSB and LSB should always be on the left and right respectively.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

The terms "left" and "right" are self explanatory. The use of bit 0 on the left and bit 7 on the right is consistent with the mac frame format shown in Figure 3.1.

Cl 57 SC 57.4.1 P 33 L 37 MyBallot # 1747  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ5/2-33-37: Any mappings of the OUI must be defined in terms of hex digits, not bit numbers. Otherwise, errors can occur in interpretation, particularly since this standard has multiple bit counting schemes.

SuggestedRemedy

Define this accurately in terms of hex digit example. The Clause 9 reference doesn't help, since this is nearly unintelligible text.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

Hex digits are used as textual representations of bits and bytes. Transmission rules are defined in terms of bits/bytes. If the commenter feels Clause 9 of another standard (IEEE Std 802-2001) can be improved, address it there.

Cl 57 SC 57.4.1 P 33 L 43 MyBallot # 1746  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R

DVJ5/1-33-43: Don't reference another document, which uses different notation than (many of the) notations within this specification.

SuggestedRemedy

Show the OUI layout in detail, or cross reference a part of this spec that does so. Should be defined in terms of hex-digit mappings, not bit mappings.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

Rather than recreate inconsistence descriptions of the OUI layout in multiple IEEE 802 MAC standards we think it is better to reference the one document, IEEE Std 802-2001 which all IEEE 802 documents are required to be consistent with per the IEEE 802 five criteria.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 57 SC 57.4.3.6 P39 L31 MyBallot # 1749  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **R**

DVJ5/4-39-31: If the remainder of the content is not specified, there is nothing to guarantee two things from the same company are misinterpreted, or each division will have to buy their own OUI.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Define to be a CDI, as specified by the IEEE/RAC.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

REJECT.

This comment has been discussed multiple times throughout the development of IEEE Std 802.3ah-2004. How organizations manage their OUI space is left to the organization. It is just as easy for an organization to misuse a CDI as it is to misuse a OUI.

Cl 57 SC 57.6.5 P52 L1 MyBallot # 1752  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**

DVJ5/7-52-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

*SuggestedRemedy*

... Clause 57, ... ==> ... Clause 57

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 57 SC 57.6.5 P52 L1 MyBallot # 1751  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/6-52-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.1 P52 L7 MyBallot # 1750  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/5-52-7: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

*SuggestedRemedy*

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 57 SC 57.7.2.2 P53 L1 MyBallot # 1754  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/9-53-1: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.2.2 P53 L2 MyBallot # 1756  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/11-53-2: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.1 P53 L31 MyBallot # 1753  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/8-53-31: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.1 P53 L32 MyBallot # 1755  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/10-53-32: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.1 P54 L1 MyBallot # 1758  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/13-54-1: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.2 P54 L31 MyBallot # 1759  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/14-54-31: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.2 P54 L31 MyBallot # 1757  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/12-54-31: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.4 P56 L3 MyBallot # 1763  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/18-56-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.3 P55 L3 MyBallot # 1761  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/16-55-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.4 P56 L4 MyBallot # 1765  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/20-56-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.3 P55 L3 MyBallot # 1760  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/15-55-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.5 P56 L40 MyBallot # 1764  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/19-56-40: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.5 P56 L40 MyBallot # 1762  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/17-56-40: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.6 P57 L13 MyBallot # 1766  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/21-57-13: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.6 P57 L13 MyBallot # 1768  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/23-57-13: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.6 P57 L3 MyBallot # 1769  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/24-57-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.3.6 P57 L3 MyBallot # 1767  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/22-57-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 57 SC 57.7.5 P58 L4 MyBallot # 1770  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/25-58-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

**Cl 57**      **SC 57.7.5**                      **P58**              **L4**      MyBallot # **1771**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**      Comment Status **A**                      IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/26-58-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response              Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 58**      **SC 58.1**                      **P91**              **L3**      MyBallot # **1776**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**      Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ5/31-91-3: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 58, ... ==> ... Clause 58  
 Proposed Response              Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

**Cl 58**      **SC 58.10.1**                      **P91**              **L10**      MyBallot # **1774**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**      Comment Status **A**                      IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/29-91-10: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response              Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 58**      **SC 58.10.2.3**                      **P92**              **L3**      MyBallot # **1780**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**      Comment Status **A**                      IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/35-92-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response              Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 58**      **SC 58.10.2.3**                      **P92**              **L3**      MyBallot # **1778**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**      Comment Status **A**                      IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/33-92-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response              Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl 58**      **SC 58.10.3**                      **P92**              **L31**      MyBallot # **1779**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**      Comment Status **A**                      IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/34-92-31: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response              Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 58 SC 58.10.3 P92 L31 MyBallot # 1777  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/32-92-31: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 58 SC 58.10.3.2 P93 L19 MyBallot # 1785  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/40-93-19: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 58 SC 58.10.3.2 P93 L19 MyBallot # 1782  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/37-93-19: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 58 SC 58.10.3.2 P93 L33 MyBallot # 1784  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/39-93-33: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 58 SC 58.10.3.2 P93 L33 MyBallot # 1781  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/36-93-33: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 58 SC 58.10.3.2 P93 L4 MyBallot # 1786  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/41-93-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 58 SC 58.10.3.2 P93 L5 MyBallot # 1783  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/38-93-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 58 SC 58.10.3.5 P94 L4 MyBallot # 1789  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/44-94-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 58 SC 58.10.3.5 P94 L4 MyBallot # 1792  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/47-94-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 58 SC 58.10.3.6 P94 L27 MyBallot # 1788  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/43-94-27: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 58 SC 58.10.3.6 P94 L27 MyBallot # 1791  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/46-94-27: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 58 SC 58.10.3.7 P94 L43 MyBallot # 1790  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/45-94-43: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 58 SC 58.10.3.7 P94 L43 MyBallot # 1787  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/42-94-43: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 58 SC 58.7.1.1 P70 L7 MyBallot # 1773  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/28-70-7: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 58 SC 58.7.1.1 P70 L8 MyBallot # 1772  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/27-70-8: The trailing 'r' on Number is confusing.

SuggestedRemedy

Eliminate this break, in oneway oranother.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

In addition it will also be recommended to the IEEE-SA editor that the superscript 'b' on line 13 related to '1st 'codegroup' that is on a line of its own should also be fixed.

Cl 58 SC 58.9.4 P91 L1 MyBallot # 1775  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/30-91-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.1 P118 L3 MyBallot # 1795  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ5/50-118-3: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 59, ... ==> ... Clause 59

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 59 SC 59.10.1 P118 L9 MyBallot # 1793  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/48-118-9: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3 P119 L3 MyBallot # 1796  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/51-119-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3 P119 L3 MyBallot # 1797  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/52-119-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.1 P120 L3 MyBallot # 1803  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/58-120-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.1 P120 L4 MyBallot # 1800  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/55-120-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.2 P120 L19 MyBallot # 1799  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/54-120-19: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.2 P 120 L 19 MyBallot # 1802  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/57-120-19: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.4 P 121 L 17 MyBallot # 1806  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/61-121-17: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.2 P 120 L 35 MyBallot # 1801  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/56-120-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.4 P 121 L 17 MyBallot # 1804  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/59-121-17: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.2 P 120 L 35 MyBallot # 1798  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/53-120-35: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.4 P 121 L 3 MyBallot # 1805  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/60-121-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.4 P121 L3 MyBallot # 1807  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/62-121-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.7 P122 L19 MyBallot # 1812  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/67-122-19: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.6 P122 L3 MyBallot # 1813  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/68-122-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.7 P122 L19 MyBallot # 1809  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/64-122-19: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.6 P122 L3 MyBallot # 1810  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/65-122-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.7 P122 L37 MyBallot # 1811  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/66-122-37: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 59 SC 59.10.3.7 P122 L38 MyBallot # 1808  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/63-122-38: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 59 SC 59.9.5 P118 L1 MyBallot # 1794  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/49-118-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.1 P145 L2 MyBallot # 1816  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ5/71-145-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 60, ... ==> ... Clause 60

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.1 P145 L9 MyBallot # 1814  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/69-145-9: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.3 P146 L26 MyBallot # 1819  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ5/74-146-26: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

Abbreviate the clause number, with subclause or clause number in title (in place of text) if necessary.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.3 P146 L4 MyBallot # 1818  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/73-146-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 60 SC 60.10.3 P146 L4 MyBallot # 1821  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/76-146-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.2 P147 L22 MyBallot # 1826  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/81-147-22: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4 P146 L32 MyBallot # 1817  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/72-146-32: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.2 P147 L23 MyBallot # 1823  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/78-147-23: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4 P146 L32 MyBallot # 1820  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/75-146-32: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.2 P147 L4 MyBallot # 1827  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/82-147-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.2 P147 L4 MyBallot # 1824  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/79-147-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.5 P148 L4 MyBallot # 1829  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/84-148-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.2 P147 L41 MyBallot # 1822  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/77-147-41: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.5 P148 L5 MyBallot # 1831  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/86-148-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.2 P147 L42 MyBallot # 1825  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/80-147-42: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.6 P148 L23 MyBallot # 1828  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/83-148-23: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.6 P148 L23 MyBallot # 1830  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/85-148-23: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.8 P149 L21 MyBallot # 1834  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/89-149-21: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.7 P149 L4 MyBallot # 1833  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/88-149-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.8 P149 L21 MyBallot # 1832  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/87-149-21: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.7 P149 L4 MyBallot # 1835  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/90-149-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 60 SC 60.10.4.8 P151 L1 MyBallot # 1836  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ5/91-151-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Shorten the title, expand it in the text that follows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 60 SC 60.9.4 P145 L1 MyBallot # 1815  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/70-145-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61 SC 61.1 P199 L3 MyBallot # 1841  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ5/96-199-3: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 61, ... ==> ... Clause 61

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 61 SC 61.1.3 P152 L31 MyBallot # 1837  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/92-152-31: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61 SC 61.1.4.1.2 P154 L22 MyBallot # 106  
 BECK, MICHAEL A

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

The text is confusing as to whether deference (MAC-PHY rate matching) is based on the state of the CRS signal on the MII, or on the value of the carrierSense variable at the abstract interface between the physical layer and the MAC. This confusion was introduced by an incomplete resolution of comment #556/D3.1 (EFM Sponsor Ballot).

The abstract interface between the physical layer and the MAC is defined in subclause 4.3.3. It consists of the ReceiveBit function, the TransmitBit and Wait procedures, and the variables collisionDetect, carrierSense, receiveDataValid, and transmitting. Section 1, page 91, line 36 states that "The Physical Layer sets carrierSense to true immediately upon detection of activity on the physical medium."

The deference mechanism is further explained in Annex 4A. Section 1, page 582, line 45 states: "When either transmitting or carrierSense is true, the MAC delays any pending transmission."

The specifications in Clause 61, on the other hand, rely on the MII-signal CRS. They specify how the PHY must set the MII signals to achieve MAC-PHY rate matching. The only statement on what the MAC will do, is in section 5, page 154, line 22: "Prior to transmission, the MAC checks the carrierSense variable (mapped from the MII signal CRS), and will not transmit another frame as long as CRS is asserted."

SuggestedRemedy

Add a sentence after the first sentence of 61.1.4.1.1: "For implementations that do not include an MII interface, all references to MII signals in this clause apply to the equivalent elements of the interface between the physical layer and the MAC as defined in 4.3.3."

Replace the quoted sentence in section 5, page 154, line 22, with: "Prior to transmission, the MAC checks the carrierSense variable (mapped from the MII signal CRS), and will not transmit another frame as long as carrierSense is asserted."

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

The first part of the remedy is unnecessary as Clause 22 already states that logic implementation of the MII is mandatory regardless if the physical implementation is present.

The second part of the remedy will be implemented as it makes the current informative text more accurate.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 61 SC 61.10.1 P199 L9 MyBallot # 1839  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/94-199-9: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61 SC 61.10.3 P200 L27 MyBallot # 1845  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ5/100-200-27: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

Abbreviate, using clause number (instead of text) will follow-on text as necessary.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 61 SC 61.10.3 P200 L3 MyBallot # 1844  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/99-200-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61 SC 61.10.3 P200 L4 MyBallot # 1842  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/97-200-4: The dark separators should be thinner in the header.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply the right Frame line widths (very thin) to between rows.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61 SC 61.10.3 P200 L4 MyBallot # 1847  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/102-200-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61 SC 61.10.4 P200 L33 MyBallot # 1843  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/98-200-33: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 61 SC 61.10.4 P200 L33 MyBallot # 1846  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/101-200-33: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61 SC 61.10.4.2 P201 L4 MyBallot # 1849  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/104-201-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61 SC 61.10.4.2 P201 L4 MyBallot # 1848  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/103-201-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61 SC 61.10.4.3 P202 L4 MyBallot # 1850  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/105-202-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61 SC 61.10.4.3 P202 L4 MyBallot # 1851  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/106-202-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61 SC 61.10.4.4 P207 L22 MyBallot # 1852  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/107-207-22: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 61 SC 61.10.4.4 P207 L22 MyBallot # 1853  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/108-207-22: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61 SC 61.2.2.2 P164 L37 MyBallot # 3  
 BECK, MICHAEL A

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

Figure 61-9 suggests that the first byte following the preamble in a MAC frame that is to be fragmented, would end up being the first byte following the Fragmentation Header in the first fragment resulting from the PAF fragmentation. According to Figure 3-1, the first byte following the preamble is the SFD.

On the other hand, 61.1.4.1.2 clearly states that "[t]he transmitter MAC-PHY Rate Matching function strips the Preamble and SFD fields from the MAC frame, and forwards the resulting data frame to the PME Aggregation Function or to the TC sublayer."

SuggestedRemedy

The text in 61.1.4.1.2 shows the EFM Task Force's intent to strip preamble AND SFD from the MAC frame before handing it over to the PAF. Figure 61-9 should be modified accordingly.

In the first line of Figure 61-9 ("From MAC"), insert an "SFD" field between the "preamble" field and the "Data frame" field. Align the tail of the down arrow with the boundary between the "SFD" field and the "Data frame" field.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

1. Preamble box needs to be split to include Preamble and SFD as suggested.
2. The middle arrow needs to point to the end of Fragment N.
3. Add a note that states 'This is one example of how a frame may be fragmented across multiple PMEs.'

Cl 61 SC 61.3.3.1 P179 L27 MyBallot # 2  
 BECK, MICHAEL A

Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE P802.3REVam Editor

There is a conflict between the text and the state diagram. As the state diagram takes precedence, the text should be modified.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace the last sentence of this paragraph with the following text:  
 After the completed End of Frame or Idle codeword, only All Idle or All Idle Out-of-Sync codewords shall be transmitted until TC\_link\_state becomes TRUE again. After TC\_link\_state becomes true again, transmission of data can restart when a new fragment is available for transmission over the gamma-interface.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT.

Cl 61 SC 61.4.7.2 P196 L54 MyBallot # 1838  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/93-196-54: The Style Manual allows ALL CAPS in callouts, and Mixed Caps, but not both simultaneously.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove ALL CAPS callouts in this figure, and throughout other mixed-convention figures. Preferably, eliminate ALL CAPS callouts altogether.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61 SC 61.9 P199 L1 MyBallot # 1840  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/95-199-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 61B SC 61B.4.2.5 P379 L1 MyBallot # 1931  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ5/186-379-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 61B, ... ==> ... Clause 61B

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 61B SC 61B.4.2.5 P379 L1 MyBallot # 1930  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/185-379-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61B SC 61B.5.1 P379 L7 MyBallot # 1929  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/184-379-7: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61B SC 61B.5.3 P379 L48 MyBallot # 1928  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/183-379-48: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 61B SC 61B.5.3 P379 L48 MyBallot # 1927  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/182-379-48: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl **61B** SC **61B.5.4** P**380** L**3** MyBallot # **1933**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/188-380-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **61B** SC **61B.5.4** P**380** L**3** MyBallot # **1932**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/187-380-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **62** SC **62.3.5.4** P**226** L**1** MyBallot # **1855**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/110-226-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **62** SC **62.4** P**226** L**3** MyBallot # **1856**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ5/111-226-3: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 62, ... ==> ... Clause 62  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl **62** SC **62.4.1** P**226** L**9** MyBallot # **1854**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/109-226-9: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **62** SC **62.4.3** P**227** L**20** MyBallot # **1857**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/112-227-20: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 62 SC 62.4.3 P 227 L 22 MyBallot # 1859  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/114-227-22: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 62 SC 62.4.4.2 P 228 L 4 MyBallot # 1862  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/117-228-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 62 SC 62.4.3 P 227 L 4 MyBallot # 1860  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/115-227-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 62 SC 62.4.4.2 P 228 L 5 MyBallot # 1861  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/116-228-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 62 SC 62.4.3 P 227 L 4 MyBallot # 1858  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/113-227-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 62A SC 62A.4 P 389 L 1 MyBallot # 1936  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/191-389-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 62A SC 62A.5 P389 L2 MyBallot # 1937  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ5/192-389-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 62A, ... ==> ... Clause 62A

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 62A SC 62A.5.1 P389 L7 MyBallot # 1935  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/190-389-7: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 62A SC 62A.5.3 P389 L49 MyBallot # 1934  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/189-389-49: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 62A SC 62A.5.4 P390 L4 MyBallot # 1938  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/193-390-4: Do something to avoid breaking the word Subclause in the heading; making vertical if necessary.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix it.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 62A SC 62A.5.4 P390 L5 MyBallot # 1939  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/194-390-5: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 62B SC 62B.4 P396 L1 MyBallot # 1941  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/196-396-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 62B SC 62B.5 P396 L2 MyBallot # 1942  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ5/197-396-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 62B, ... ==> ... Clause 62B

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 62B SC 62B.5.1 P396 L7 MyBallot # 1940  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/195-396-7: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 62B SC 62B.5.3 P397 L3 MyBallot # 1944  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/199-397-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 62B SC 62B.5.3 P397 L4 MyBallot # 1946  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/201-397-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 62B SC 62B.5.4 P397 L13 MyBallot # 1943  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/198-397-13: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 62B SC 62B.5.4 P397 L17 MyBallot # 1945  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/200-397-17: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 63 SC 63.3.2.6 P241 L1 MyBallot # 1864  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/119-241-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63 SC 63.4 P241 L3 MyBallot # 1865  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ5/120-241-3: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 63, ... ==> ... Clause 63

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 63 SC 63.4.1 P241 L9 MyBallot # 1863  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/118-241-9: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63 SC 63.4.3 P242 L17 MyBallot # 1868  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/123-242-17: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63 SC 63.4.3 P242 L17 MyBallot # 1866  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/121-242-17: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 63 SC 63.4.3 P242 L3 MyBallot # 1867  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/122-242-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63 SC 63.4.3 P242 L4 MyBallot # 1869  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/124-242-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63 SC 63.4.4.2 P243 L4 MyBallot # 1870  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/125-243-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63 SC 63.4.4.2 P243 L5 MyBallot # 1871  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/126-243-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63A SC 63A.4 P407 L1 MyBallot # 1948  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/203-407-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63A SC 63A.4 P407 L2 MyBallot # 1949  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ5/204-407-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 63A, ... ==> ... Clause 63A  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 63A SC 63A.5.1 P 407 L 8 MyBallot # 1947  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/202-407-8: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63A SC 63A.5.3 P 408 L 4 MyBallot # 1951  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/206-408-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63A SC 63A.5.3 P 408 L 4 MyBallot # 1953  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/208-408-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63A SC 63A.5.4 P 408 L 15 MyBallot # 1950  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/205-408-15: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63A SC 63A.5.4 P 408 L 17 MyBallot # 1952  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/207-408-17: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63B SC 63B.4 P 412 L 1 MyBallot # 1955  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/210-412-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 63B SC 63B.5 P412 L2 MyBallot # 1956  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R  
 DVJ5/211-412-2: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 63B, ... ==> ... Clause 63B

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 63B SC 63B.5.1 P412 L7 MyBallot # 1954  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/209-412-7: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63B SC 63B.5.3 P413 L3 MyBallot # 1959  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/214-413-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63B SC 63B.5.3 P413 L3 MyBallot # 1958  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/213-413-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 63B SC 63B.5.4 P413 L15 MyBallot # 1957  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/212-413-15: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 64 SC 64.3.3.6 P273 L14 MyBallot # 1872  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ5/127-273-14: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.

SuggestedRemedy  
 SEND DISCOVERY WINDOW ==> SEND\_DISCOVERY\_WINDOW and similar changes throughout.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #1911.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 64 SC 64.3.3.6 P274 L11 MyBallot # 1873  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ5/128-274-11: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ACCEPT REGISTER REQUEST ==> ACCEPT\_REGISTER\_REQUEST and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #1911.

Cl 64 SC 64.3.6.5 P297 L1 MyBallot # 1875  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/130-297-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 64 SC 64.3.6.5 P297 L1 MyBallot # 1876  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ5/131-297-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 ... Clause 64, ... ==> ... Clause 64  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 64 SC 64.4.1 P297 L6 MyBallot # 1874  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/129-297-6: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 64 SC 64.4.3 P298 L17 MyBallot # 1878  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/133-298-17: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 64 SC 64.4.3 P298 L18 MyBallot # 1881  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/136-298-18: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 64 SC 64.4.3 P298 L34 MyBallot # 1880  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/135-298-34: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 64 SC 64.4.3 P298 L34 MyBallot # 1877  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/132-298-34: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 64 SC 64.4.3 P298 L4 MyBallot # 1882  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/137-298-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 64 SC 64.4.3 P298 L4 MyBallot # 1879  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/134-298-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 64 SC 64.4.3 P299 L1 MyBallot # 1884  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/139-299-1: Confusing capitalization.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 State Machines ==> State machines  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 64 SC 64.4.4.3 P299 L4 MyBallot # 1885  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/140-299-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 64 SC 64.4.4.3 P299 L4 MyBallot # 1883  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/138-299-4: Confusing capitalization  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 64 SC 64.4.4.4 P300 L4 MyBallot # 1887  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/142-300-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 64 SC 64.4.4.4 P300 L4 MyBallot # 1886  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/141-300-4: Confusing capitalization  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.2.2.2.2 P309 L16 MyBallot # 103  
 BROWN, BENJAMIN J  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 Part 5: The change implemented for IsIdle is not complete. This covers the case of /I/ but does not cover the case of /C/ - configuration ordered sets. These consist of /K/D/D/D/, a /K28.5/ followed by 3 data code-groups. If the intent is to turn off the laser during the transmission of configuration ordered\_sets, this definition of IsIdle doesn't do it.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace the definition with the following: "This function is used to determine whether tx\_code-group is a code-group in /I/, the IDLE ordered\_set, or /C/, the Configuration ordered\_set."

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Editor will provide detailed text merging the suggested remedy of this comment and MyBallot comment #19.

Cl 65 SC 65.2.3.3.4 P314 L14 MyBallot # 1888  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/143-314-14: Undefined proper noun.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Alignment Machine ==> Alignment machine  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.2.3.5.3 P321 L39 MyBallot # 104  
 BROWN, BENJAMIN J  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 Part 5: Figure 65-14 is out of order  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Re-order the figures in Clause 65 appropriately  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900 (possible anchor location or FrameMaker float problem).

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 65 SC 65.3.3 P 326 L 1 MyBallot # 1890  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A

DVJ5/145-326-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.4 P 326 L 4 MyBallot # 1891  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ5/146-326-4: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 65, ... ==> ... Clause 65

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.1 P 326 L 10 MyBallot # 1889  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/144-326-10: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.3 P 327 L 14 MyBallot # 1894  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ5/149-327-14: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

Abbreviate, using clause number (instead of text) will follow-on text as necessary.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.3 P 327 L 16 MyBallot # 1895  
JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/150-327-16: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.

SuggestedRemedy

Center all "Item" column cells.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 65 SC 65.4.3 P 327 L 23 MyBallot # 1896  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/151-327-23: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.3 P 327 L 5 MyBallot # 1897  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/152-327-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.3 P 327 L 36 MyBallot # 1893  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/148-327-36: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.4.3 P 328 L 4 MyBallot # 1903  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/158-328-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.3 P 327 L 4 MyBallot # 1892  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/147-327-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.4.3 P 328 L 4 MyBallot # 1898  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/153-328-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 65 SC 65.4.4.4 P 328 L 29 MyBallot # 1899  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/154-328-29: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.4.4 P 328 L 29 MyBallot # 1902  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/157-328-29: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.4.5 P 328 L 41 MyBallot # 1900  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/155-328-41: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 The IEEE P802.3REVam Task Force believes that this comment is one on editorial style, and does not affect the technical integrity of the standard. Editing does not take place during the balloting period. As pointed out in the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual subclause 5.4.3.2: "It should be borne in mind that documents are professionally edited prior to publication." This editorial comment will be supplied to the Standards Project Editor.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.4.5 P 328 L 41 MyBallot # 1901  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/156-328-41: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.4.6 P 329 L 3 MyBallot # 1906  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/161-329-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.4.6 P 329 L 3 MyBallot # 1909  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/164-329-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 65 SC 65.4.4.7 P 329 L 17 MyBallot # 1908  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/163-329-17: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.4.7 P 329 L 17 MyBallot # 1905  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/160-329-17: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.4.8 P 329 L 24 MyBallot # 1904  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/159-329-24: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 65 SC 65.4.4.8 P 329 L 25 MyBallot # 1907  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/162-329-25: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 66 SC 66.1.2.2 P 332 L 1 MyBallot # 1910  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/165-332-1: Inconsistent punctuation.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 figure ==> Figure  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 66 SC 66.1.2.2 P 332 L 9 MyBallot # 1911  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status R  
 DVJ5/166-332-9: Be accurate, compatible, and consistent.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 START ERROR J ==> START\_ERROR\_J and similar changes throughout.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #790.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 66 SC 66.3.2.3 P336 L1 MyBallot # 1913  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/168-336-1: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 66 SC 66.3.2.3 P336 L1 MyBallot # 1914  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ5/169-336-1: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

... Clause 66, ... ==> ... Clause 66

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 66 SC 66.4.1 P336 L9 MyBallot # 1912  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/167-336-9: Inconsistent capitalization. This could lead the reader to believe there are two types of things, perhaps a nonbinding "Protocol implementation conformance statement" and a normative "Protocol Implementation Conformance Statement"

SuggestedRemedy

Throughout, change to: "Protocol implementation conformance statement" in headings, and "Protocol implementation conformance statement" within a sentence. This is consistent with Section 1, page 444, line 33.

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 66 SC 66.4.2.2 P337 L20 MyBallot # 1921  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status R

DVJ5/176-337-20: The title of this clause is too long and would overflow the automatic formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason one was not provided).

SuggestedRemedy

Abbreviate, using clause number (instead of text) will follow-on text as necessary.

Proposed Response Response Status W

REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl 66 SC 66.4.2.2 P337 L3 MyBallot # 1918  
 JAMES, DAVID V

Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor

DVJ5/173-337-3: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".

SuggestedRemedy

Value/Comment ==> Value/comment

Proposed Response Response Status W

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 66 SC 66.4.2.2 P 337 L 4 MyBallot # 1923  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/178-337-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 66 SC 66.4.4 P 337 L 25 MyBallot # 1917  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/172-337-25: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 66 SC 66.4.4 P 337 L 25 MyBallot # 1922  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/177-337-25: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 66 SC 66.4.4 P 337 L 35 MyBallot # 1916  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/171-337-35: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 66 SC 66.4.4 P 337 L 35 MyBallot # 1920  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/175-337-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 66 SC 66.4.4 P 337 L 48 MyBallot # 1915  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/170-337-48: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl 66 SC 66.4.4 P337 L48 MyBallot # 1919  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/174-337-48: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 66 SC 66.4.4 P338 L4 MyBallot # 1925  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/180-338-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Center all "Item" column cells.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 66 SC 66.4.4 P338 L4 MyBallot # 1924  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/179-338-4: Confusing/inconsistent capitalization; I don't believe this is a distinct kind of "Comment".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Value/Comment ==> Value/comment Some heading are already done this way; some are not. Do changes to make them all consistent.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl 67 SC 67.3 P341 L34 MyBallot # 1926  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ5/181-341-34: Inconsistent capitalization. Is this a special meaning? I suspect not, but its unclear.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Hybrid Media Topologies ==> Hybrid media topologies  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl B SC B.1.3 P513 L1 MyBallot # 659  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/500-513-1: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl B SC B.1.4 P513 L35 MyBallot # 658  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/499-513-35: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

**Cl B**      **SC B.1.4.2**                      **P 514**      **L 25**      MyBallot # **660**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**      Comment Status **A**                      IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/501-514-25: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response      Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl B**      **SC B.1.5.3**                      **P 518**      **L 26**      MyBallot # **663**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**      Comment Status **A**  
 DVJ1/504-518-26: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 End ==> end Components ==> components Segment ==> segment  
 Proposed Response      Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl B**      **SC B.1.4.2**                      **P 514**      **L 45**      MyBallot # **661**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**      Comment Status **A**                      IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/502-514-45: ALL CAPS or Some Caps, but not both is OK.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Lower case, not all caps, here and throughout figures.  
 Proposed Response      Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl B**      **SC B.1.5.3**                      **P 518**      **L 31**      MyBallot # **664**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**      Comment Status **A**                      IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/505-518-31: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response      Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl B**      **SC B.1.5.2**                      **P 516**      **L 25**      MyBallot # **662**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**      Comment Status **A**                      IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/503-516-25: Wrong font in figures.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Use 8-point Arial.  
 Proposed Response      Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

**Cl B**      **SC B.2.1**                      **P 522**      **L 17**      MyBallot # **665**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER**      Comment Status **A**                      IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/506-522-17: Confusing table rows.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Put lines between rows.  
 Proposed Response      Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

**Cl B**      **SC B.2.2**                      **P 523**      **L 26**      MyBallot # **666**  
 JAMES, DAVID V

*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ1/507-523-26: Confusing table rows.

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Put lines between rows.

*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.

The consensus of the committee is that these tables are clear to the reader. They have been in existence for many years and their format has not been an issue. The risk of introducing an error is far to high for any perceived benefit on such a stable portion of the standard.

**Cl B**      **SC B.2.3**                      **P 524**      **L 13**      MyBallot # **669**  
 JAMES, DAVID V

*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ1/510-524-13: Confusing table rows.

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Put lines between rows.

*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #666.

**Cl B**      **SC B.2.3**                      **P 524**      **L 29**      MyBallot # **668**  
 JAMES, DAVID V

*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ1/509-524-29: Confusing table rows.

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Put lines between rows.

*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #666.

**Cl B**      **SC B.2.3**                      **P 524**      **L 48**      MyBallot # **667**  
 JAMES, DAVID V

*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ1/508-524-48: Confusing table rows.

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Put lines between rows.

*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #666.

**Cl B**      **SC B.4.1**                      **P 527**      **L 14**      MyBallot # **670**  
 JAMES, DAVID V

*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ1/511-527-14: Confusing table rows.

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Put lines between rows.

*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #666.

**Cl D**      **SC D.3**                              **P 535**      **L 9**      MyBallot # **672**  
 JAMES, DAVID V

*Comment Type*    **ER**              *Comment Status*    **R**  
 DVJ1/513-535-9: Confusing table rows.

*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Put lines between rows and columns, making this a real table.

*Proposed Response*              *Response Status*    **W**  
 REJECT.

See MyBallot comment #666.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl **D** SC **D.4.1** P **535** L **29** MyBallot # **671**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/512-535-29: Misleading capitalization errors.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Core ==> core  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **D** SC **D.4.2.2** P **538** L **7** MyBallot # **674**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/515-538-7: Colen is unnecessary  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Splitting: ==> Splitting and same for other cell entries.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **D** SC **D.4.2.2** P **538** L **9** MyBallot # **673**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1/514-538-9: Inconsistent alignment  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Be consistent, either all left or right aligned.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl **G** SC **G.1.1** P **545** L **9** MyBallot # **675**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/516-545-9: The title of this subclause is too long and would overflow the automatic  
 formatting of the table of contents, if one were to be provided (which is, perhaps, the reason  
 one was not provided).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Abbreviate, using clause number (instead of text) will follow-on text as necessary.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 See MyBallot comment #233.

Cl **H** SC **H.4.2** P **570** L **38** MyBallot # **676**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **R**  
 DVJ1/517-570-38: Illegal punctuation  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 -- ==> em dash, throughout  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 REJECT.  
 This text is GDMO code. Em dash is not supported in GDMO. As such accepting the  
 comment would cause a syntax violation.

Cl **x** SC **x.x.x** P **178** L **23** MyBallot # **142**  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **A** IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-77/1-178-23: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl x SC x.x.x P178 L5 MyBallot # 141  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-76/1-178-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl x SC x.x.x P180 L6 MyBallot # 144  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-81/1-180-6: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl x SC x.x.x P179 L5 MyBallot # 143  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-80/1-179-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl x SC x.x.x P181 L4 MyBallot # 146  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-83/1-181-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl x SC x.x.x P180 L38 MyBallot # 145  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-82/1-180-38: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl x SC x.x.x P182 L4 MyBallot # 147  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-84/1-182-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl x SC x.x.x P183 L29 MyBallot # 149  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-86/1-183-29: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl x SC x.x.x P184 L5 MyBallot # 151  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-89/1-184-5: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl x SC x.x.x P183 L4 MyBallot # 148  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-85/1-183-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl x SC x.x.x P185 L18 MyBallot # 152  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-90/1-185-18: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl x SC x.x.x P184 L35 MyBallot # 150  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-88/1-184-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl x SC x.x.x P185 L7 MyBallot # 153  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-91/1-185-7: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

IEEE P802.3REVam Draft 2.0 Comments

Cl x SC x.x.x P186 L3 MyBallot # 154  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-92/1-186-3: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl x SC x.x.x P188 L4 MyBallot # 157  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-95/1-188-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl x SC x.x.x P187 L35 MyBallot # 155  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-93/1-187-35: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl x SC x.x.x P189 L6 MyBallot # 158  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-99/1-189-6: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.

Cl x SC x.x.x P187 L4 MyBallot # 156  
 JAMES, DAVID V  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status A IEEE-SA Editor  
 DVJ1-94/1-187-4: Small items and numbers should be centered in the cell.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 NoRemedySupplied  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 See MyBallot comment #1900.