Cl **00**   *SC* **0**   *P*   *L*   # 91
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
    Note: All my comments use the page number at the bottom of the page, not the page number shown, for page 10 and higher as page 10 is in the document twice.

SuggestedRemedy

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.0**   *P* **10**   *L* **1**   # 5
Dwelley, David   LTC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
    There are 2 page 10s

SuggestedRemedy
    Renumber pages

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.1**   *P* **12**   *L* **8**   # 88
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
    missing space: "Clauses96 and 97."

SuggestedRemedy
    add missing space:"Clauses 96 and 97."

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.1**   *P* **12**   *L* **8**   # 6
Dwelley, David   LTC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
    Space missing between "Clauses" and "96"

SuggestedRemedy
    Add a space

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.1**   *P* **12**   *L* **8**   # 80
Abramson, David   Texas Instruments

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
    "Clauses96" needs a space between Clauses and 96

SuggestedRemedy
    See above

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.1.1**   *P* **12**   *L* **35**   # 89
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
    c) A "T" is missing in "1000BASE-1"

SuggestedRemedy
    Insert missing "T": "1000BASE-T1"

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.1.3**   *P* **13**   *L* **7**   # 81
Abramson, David   Texas Instruments

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
    Figures 104-1 and Figures 104-2 Should be swapped so that the PSE is first. The rest of the clause is written with the PSE first followed by the PD, this is the only place the reverse is true.

SuggestedRemedy
    See above.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT. EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **104**
SC **104.1.3**

Page 1 of 6
5/18/2015 8:59:34 AM

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.2**   *P* **14**   *L* **46**   # 90
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
    Table 104-1

    Inconsistent use of "." and "," to indicate fractional part of a number.

SuggestedRemedy
    In VPD(min) row, column III(48V)replace "28,8" with "28.8"

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.3.3**   *P* **15**   *L* **41**   # 11
Dwelley, David   LTC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
    A PSE does not "provide" state machine behavior

SuggestedRemedy
    Change "provide" to "implement" - also in the PD section on page 22, line 32

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.3.3**   *P* **15**   *L* **6**   # 92
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
    Figure 104-4

    The label of "B" that goes into the IDLE box is turned on its side.

SuggestedRemedy
    Change the B to be oriented correctly, e.g. turn it 90 degrees.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.3.4.1**   *P* **18**   *L* **34**   # 13
Dwelley, David   LTC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
    The phrase "The forced detection current or currents at the PI shall..." is unnecessarily verbose.

SuggestedRemedy
    Replace with "All detection currents at the PI shall..."

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.3.4.3**   *P* **19**   *L* **19**   # 93
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
    Incorrect table reference.

SuggestedRemedy
    Change: Table 200-4

    To: Table 104-4

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.3.5**   *P* **19**   *L* **30**   # 16
Dwelley, David   LTC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
    Add a reference to the SCCP section

SuggestedRemedy
    Change t0: "Classification is performed using SCCP. See section 104.6."

Response   *Response Status* **C**
    ACCEPT. EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **104**   Page 2 of 6
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **104.3.5**   5/18/2015 8:59:34 AM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.3.5**   *P* **19**   *L* **30**   # 15
Dwelley, David   LTC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
The acronym "SCCP" is a proper noun - no "the" is required

SuggestedRemedy
Remove "The" - also in several other places in the document

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.3.6.2**   *P* **20**   *L* **6**   # 18
Dwelley, David   LTC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
Table 104-3 is missing references to explanatory sections of text

SuggestedRemedy
Add references to text in "Additional Information" column (eg, 104.3.6.3 for item 6)

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT. EZ
add TBDs

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.3.7.1**   *P* **21**   *L* **46**   # 94
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
MPS in TMPS should be a subscript.

SuggestedRemedy
Make MPS in "...window TMPS wide..." a subscript.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.3.7.1**   *P* **22**   *L* **1**   # 86
Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
There is a missing space.

SuggestedRemedy
Replace: "APSE shall consider..."

With: "A PSE shall consider..."

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.4.4**   *P* **25**   *L* **6**   # 23
Dwelley, David   LTC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
Text is longer and less clear than it needs to be: "When a PD presents a valid or non-valid detection signature, it shall present the detection signature at the PI.
When a PD becomes powered via the PI, it shall present a non-valid detection signature."

SuggestedRemedy
Change to: "A PD shall present a detection signature, either valid or non-valid, at the PI. A PD shall present a non-valid detection signature when it is powered via the PI."

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.4.6**   *P* **25**   *L* **48**   # 24
Dwelley, David   LTC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
Passive voice: "The power supply of the PD shall operate within the characteristics in Table 104–6."

SuggestedRemedy
Change to: "The PD shall draw power according to Table 104–6."

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT. EZ

search and purge 'power supply' from rest of draft

Add tbds to Table 104-6 empty cells

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **104**
SC **104.4.6**

Page 3 of 6
5/18/2015 8:59:34 AM

Cl **104**　　　*SC* **104.4.6.3**　　　　　*P* **26**　　　*L* **45**　　　# 26
Dwelley, David　　　　　　　　　LTC

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**
Title is too long

SuggestedRemedy
Change to "PD Stability"

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**
ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**　　　*SC* **104.4.6.3**　　　　　*P* **26**　　　*L* **47**　　　# 39
Dwelley, David　　　　　　　　　LTC

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**
Voltage range definition is unclear: "When the PD is fed by VPort_PSE min to VPort_PSE max with RLoop in series..."

SuggestedRemedy
Change to: "When the PD is fed with any voltage between VPort_PSE min and VPort_PSE max and with RLoop_max in series..."

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**
ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**　　　*SC* **104.4.6.4**　　　　　*P* **27**　　　*L* **17**　　　# 27
Dwelley, David　　　　　　　　　LTC

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**
Text could be more clear:
"The specification for ripple and noise in Table 104–6 shall be for the noise at the PD PI generated..."
"The ripple and noise specification shall be for all operating voltages..."
"The PD shall operate correctly in the presence of ripple and noise generated by the PSE that appears at the PD PI. These levels are specified in Table 104–3. Limits are provided to preserve data integrity."

SuggestedRemedy
Change to:
"The specifications for ripple and noise in Table 104–6 apply to the noise at the PD PI generated..."
"The ripple and noise specification shall be met for all operating voltages..."
"The PD shall operate correctly in the presence of ripple and noise generated by the PSE that appears at the PD PI, as specified in Table 104–3. Ripple and noise limits are provided to preserve data integrity."

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**
ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**　　　*SC* **104.5.1**　　　　　*P* **27**　　　*L* **42**　　　# 40
Dwelley, David　　　　　　　　　LTC

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**
Legacy text inherited from PoE that isn't relevant to PoDL: "including those not used by the PD." All two MDI leads are used by PoDL.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove the text "including those not used by the PD"

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**
ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**　　　*SC* **104.5.3.1**　　　　　*P* **28**　　　*L* **23**　　　# 82
Abramson, David　　　　　　　　Texas Instruments

Comment Type　**ER**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**
Equation reference is wrong.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "Equation 104-1" to "Equation 104-2"

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**
ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**　　　*SC* **104.5.3.1**　　　　　*P* **28**　　　*L* **24**　　　# 95
Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　　General Motors

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**
There are random carriage returns in the Note 1 text.

SuggestedRemedy
Remove random carriage returns

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**
ACCEPT. EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **104**
SC **104.5.3.1**

Page 4 of 6
5/18/2015 8:59:34 AM

Cl **104**　　*SC* **104.6**　　　　*P* **28**　　　*L* **32**　　　# 41

Dwelley, David　　　　　　　　　LTC

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**

This text refers to a master entity inside the PSE: "The SCCP uses a single master at the PSE PI to control...". From the spec's point of view, the PSE is the master.

Similar comment at line 37: "...where the master device sources..."

Similar comment at line 43: "The master device shall source..."

SuggestedRemedy

Change text to: "The PSE acts as the master during SCCP communications to control..."

Line 37: "...where the PSE sources..."

Line 43: "The PSE shall source..."

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**　　*SC* **104.6.3.1**　　　*P* **30**　　　*L* **14**　　　# 1

Dwelley, David　　　　　　　　　LTC

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**

Unmatched tenses: "The master shall then release its PI and goes into receive mode (RX)."

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: "The master shall then release its PI and go into receive mode (RX)."

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**　　*SC* **104.6.3.1**　　　*P* **30**　　　*L* **8**　　　# 42

Dwelley, David　　　　　　　　　LTC

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**

"All communication..." could be misinterpreted as including Ethernet communications

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: "All SCCP communication..."

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**　　*SC* **104.6.3.2**　　　*P* **30**　　　*L* **38**　　　# 31

Dwelley, David　　　　　　　　　LTC

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**

Bad text inherited from 1-wire spec: "The master shall use a Write 1 time slot to write a logic 1..."

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: "The master shall use a Write 1 time slot to transmit a logic 1..."

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**　　*SC* **104.6.3.3**　　　*P* **30**　　　*L* **53**　　　# 2

Dwelley, David　　　　　　　　　LTC

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**

Bad text inherited from 1-wire spec: "...in order to find out the status..."

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: "...in order to determine the status..."

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**　　*SC* **104.6.3.3**　　　*P* **31**　　　*L* **1**　　　# 96

Wienckowski, Natalie　　　　　　General Motors

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**A**

missing space

SuggestedRemedy

Change: ...with tRECbetween slots.

to: ...with tREC between slots.

Response　　　　　　*Response Status*　**C**

ACCEPT. EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **104**
SC **104.6.3.3**

Page 5 of 6
5/18/2015 8:59:34 AM

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.6.3.3**   *P* **31**   *L* **1**   # 3

Dwelley, David   LTC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
Missing space

SuggestedRemedy
"trec between"

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.6.3.3**   *P* **31**   *L* **2**   # 4

Dwelley, David   LTC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
Bad grammar: "by pulling its PI port voltage low for tINIT and then release the port."

SuggestedRemedy
Change to: "by pulling its PI port voltage low for tINIT and then releasing the port."

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.6.3.3**   *P* **31**   *L* **24**   # 97

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
In Figure 104-10, there are missing verticle lines in the Figure at the timing arrows for Slave Aamples and Master samples.

SuggestedRemedy
Add missing verticle lines to figure.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.6.3.4**   *P* **31**   *L* **49**   # 98

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
Incorrect reference.

SuggestedRemedy
Change reference to Figure 104-7

to reference to Table 104-7

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT. EZ

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.6.3.4**   *P* **32**   *L* **10**   # 99

Wienckowski, Natalie   General Motors

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**
uA is centered and all other Units are left justified.

SuggestedRemedy
Left justify uA.

Response   *Response Status* **C**
ACCEPT. EZ

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **104**
SC **104.6.3.4**

Page 6 of 6
5/18/2015 8:59:34 AM