Cl **1**	*SC* **1.4**	*P* **20**	*L* **17**	*#* 550

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Clarify editorial instruction

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Change definition 1.4.278" to read "Change definition 1.4.278 as shown below"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **1**	*SC* **1.4.244b**	*P* **21**	*L* **16**	*#* 552

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

There are only two added definitions that do not start with a complete sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "a transmission window allocated to a single LLID (including GLID)" to "In Clause 143, an envelope allocation represents a transmission window allocated to a single LLID (including GLID)"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **1**	*SC* **1.4.313**	*P* **20**	*L* **31**	*#* 551

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Clarification on what "it" means in the context

SuggestedRemedy

Change "it is also a collective term" to "an LLI is also a collective term"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change marked in ">><<"

Change "it is also a collective term" to "an LLI>>D<< is also a collective term"

Cl **1**	*SC* **1.4.333a**	*P* **21**	*L* **26**	*#* 554

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

There are only two added definitions that do not start with a complete sentence.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "one of a number of defined paths" to "In Clause 143, an MCRS channel represents one of a number of defined paths"
Strike "(see Clause 143)" at the end of the definition

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **31A**	*SC* **31A**	*P* **22**	*L* **8**	*#* 418

Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

In multiple places the term "modify" is used in editors instructions. No doubt someone in the WG will point out that the term "change" is preferred per the WG Template.

SuggestedRemedy

Change all instances of "modify" to "change" in editing instructions now.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **141**	*SC* **141**	*P* **34**	*L* **1**	*#* 556

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Do not break EPON name across lines

SuggestedRemedy

Insert forced line break before Nx25G-EPON

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **141**
SC **141**

Page 1 of 8
8/31/2018 2:56:30 PM

Cl **141**　　*SC* **141.2.2**　　　　　*P* **37**　　*L* **28**　　# 559
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket*
　Always avoid the use of "always" unless describing unavoidable situations

SuggestedRemedy
　Strike all instances of "always" in 141.2.2

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **141**　　*SC* **141.2.5**　　　　　*P* **37**　　*L* **52**　　# 522
Wey, Jun Shan　　　　　　　ZTE TX

Comment Type **ER**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket*
　Typo "din"

SuggestedRemedy
　"in"

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **141**　　*SC* **141.2.5**　　　　　*P* **37**　　*L* **52**　　# 426
Remein, Duane　　　　　　　Huawei

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket*
　typo "indicate din" should be "indicated in"

SuggestedRemedy
　per comment

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **141**　　*SC* **141.2.7**　　　　　*P* **38**　　*L* **45**　　# 564
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket*
　There is very little in the way of description in this subclause: "This subclause describes how"

SuggestedRemedy
　Change to "Table 141-6 shows how"

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **141**　　*SC* **141.3**　　　　　*P* **40**　　*L* **30**　　# 432
Remein, Duane　　　　　　　Huawei

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket*
　We have a good mix of "PQ-type PMD", "PQ type PMD", and "PQ compliant". Consistency would be better.

SuggestedRemedy
　For "PQ-type PMD" and "PQ type PMD" use "Nx25G-EPON PMD"
　For "A PQ compliant" use "An Nx25G-EPON compliant"

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **141**　　*SC* **141.3.1.5**　　　　　*P* **41**　　*L* **41**　　# 439
Remein, Duane　　　　　　　Huawei

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket*
　the term PMD_UNITDATA[
　i].indication(rx_bit) should not break the line.

SuggestedRemedy
　make the term non-breaking {Esc n s}.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **141**　　*SC* **141.3.1.5**　　　　　*P* **41**　　*L* **46**　　# 566
Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*bucket*
　Wrong format for NOTE

SuggestedRemedy
　Apply proper style for NOTE

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**
　PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **141**
SC **141.3.1.5**

Page 2 of 8
8/31/2018 2:56:30 PM

Cl **141**   *SC* **141.3.2**   *P* **42**   *L* **4**   # 440
Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
  "defined on per channel basis" missing "a"

SuggestedRemedy
  change to "defined on a per channel basis"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
  PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **141**   *SC* **141.5.1**   *P* **44**   *L* **34**   # 570
Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
  Tables are not displayed within the associated subclauses

SuggestedRemedy
  Force Table 141–12 and Table 141–13 to follow 141.5.1 Transmitter optical specifications
  Force Table 141–14 and Table 141–15 to follow 141.5.2 Receiver optical specifications
  Similar changes needed in 141.6.1 Transmitter optical specifications and 141.6.2 Receiver
  optical specifications

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
  PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **141**   *SC* **141.6**   *P* **44**   *L* **46**   # 445
Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
  As near as I can tell there are no specifications in 141.2.

SuggestedRemedy
  Strike ", as specified in 141.2"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
  PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **141**   *SC* **141.6.2**   *P* **45**   *L* **52**   # 446
Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
  No PMDs are "(as specified in 141.2)"

SuggestedRemedy
  Strike the parenthetical.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
  PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **141**   *SC* **141.7.13**   *P* **54**   *L* **10**   # 448
Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
  Incomplete sentences.

SuggestedRemedy
  Change (4x in this section)
  ", value is less than 128 ns …" to
  " and has a value of less than 128 ns …"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
  PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **141**   *SC* **141.7.13.1**   *P* **54**   *L* **26**   # 571
Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
  Stray T in "as defined in TT able 141–16"

SuggestedRemedy
  Remove the green "T"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
  PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **141**
SC **141.7.13.1**

Page 3 of 8
8/31/2018 2:56:30 PM

Cl **141**   *SC* **141.7.13.2**   *P* **54**   *L* **36**   # 572
Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
"The test setup for measuring Ton and Toff is described in Figure 141–4." -figure does not describe really anything.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "described in Figure 141–4" to "shown in Figure 141–4"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **142**   *SC* **142.2.2.2**   *P* **67**   *L* **3**   # 454
Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
Typo "input" should be capitalized in "Once the complete SBD is appended to the TX_FIFO the input process begins transferring"

SuggestedRemedy
per comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **142**   *SC* **142.2.2.5.1**   *P* **79**   *L* **45**   # 456
Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
typo "ofburst"

SuggestedRemedy
use "of burst"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **142**   *SC* **142.2.2.5.2**   *P* **81**   *L* **12**   # 460
Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
Constant name should not cross a line

SuggestedRemedy
Make "FEC_DELAY" non-breaking {Esc n s}

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **142**   *SC* **142.2.3.2.2**   *P* **87**   *L* **31**   # 479
Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
typo "hold" should be "holds"

SuggestedRemedy
per comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **142**   *SC* **142.3.2**   *P* **90**   *L* **4**   # 481
Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
Well this could be embarrassing:
"switch the decoder in appropriately"
Standards should never be inappropriate.

SuggestedRemedy
Change to read:
"switch in the decoder as appropriate."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **142**
SC **142.3.2**

Page 4 of 8
8/31/2018 2:56:30 PM

Cl **143**　　*SC* **143.2.3**　　　　　　*P* **94**　　　*L* **47**　　　# 483

Remein, Duane　　　　　　　　　　Huawei

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*bucket*

MCRS_CTRL.
request() crosses line

SuggestedRemedy

Make MCRS_CTRL.request() none breaking {Esc n s}

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **143**　　*SC* **143.2.4.2**　　　　　*P* **95**　　　*L* **21**　　　# 576

Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*bucket*

More "always" statements

SuggestedRemedy

Remove "always" in line 22

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **143**　　*SC* **143.2.4.4**　　　　　*P* **96**　　　*L* **46**　　　# 577

Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*bucket*

External reference: 46.3.1.4

SuggestedRemedy

Apply Forrest Green color to "46.3.1.4"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **143**　　*SC* **143.2.5**　　　　　　*P* **98**　　　*L* **30**　　　# 579

Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*bucket*

Figure 143-6 uses different colors for LLID a and LLID B, making LLID B bars hard to read
(color is too light)

SuggestedRemedy

Use the same color for LLID A and B alike. Also, for improved readability, consider using
dashed horizontal axes and dotted vertical guide lines

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See hajduczenia_3ca_2_0918.pdf for updated figure.

Cl **143**　　*SC* **143.3.1**　　　　　　*P* **103**　　*L* **5**　　　# 580

Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*bucket*

"In addition to the M PLS service interfaces" - irrespective of how many times I read it, it
always reads as "MPLS" = Multi Protocol Label Switching

SuggestedRemedy

To avoid confusion, can we switch from "M" to "K" (for example)?

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change
"In addition to the M PLS service interfaces"
to
"In addition to the M instances of the PLS service interface"

Cl **143**　　*SC* **143.3.1**　　　　　　*P* **103**　　*L* **7**　　　# 581

Hajduczenia, Marek　　　　　　　Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*bucket*

Forward looking reference to EPON-specific figure

SuggestedRemedy

Drop "and Figure 143-18" - it is not needed + update Figure 143-10 accordingly

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Drop "and Figure 143-18" - it is not needed

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **143**
SC **143.3.1**

Page 5 of 8
8/31/2018 2:56:30 PM

Cl **143**   *SC* **143.3.1.1**   *P* **103**   *L* **41**   # 582

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

"In all single channel RSs"

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "In all single channel RS,"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change to "In all single-channel RS definitions,"

Cl **143**   *SC* **143.3.1.1**   *P* **103**   *L* **45**   # 583

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Primitive name broken across line

SuggestedRemedy

Make sure PLS_DATA…is not broken across lines

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **143**   *SC* **143.3.1.1.1**   *P* **103**   *L* **53**   # 584

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

External reference: 46.1.7.1

SuggestedRemedy

Add Forrest Green tag to the reference text. Also in 143.3.1.1.3

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **143**   *SC* **143.3.1.2**   *P* **105**   *L* **8**   # 487

Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

1st instance of MPCP

SuggestedRemedy

Change "MPCP" to Multi-Point Control Protocol (MPCP)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **143**   *SC* **143.3.3.1**   *P* **108**   *L* **33**   # 489

Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Empty section

SuggestedRemedy

delete

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **143**   *SC* **143.4.1**   *P* **121**   *L* **3**   # 509

Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Duplicate alpha list) Alpha list) not needed.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the dup "alpha)"s

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **143**   *SC* **143.4.1**   *P* **121**   *L* **4**   # 585

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

Double lettered list

SuggestedRemedy

Remove one of the list levels

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **143**   Page 6 of 8
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **143.4.1**   8/31/2018 2:56:30 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **143**   *SC* **143.4.1.2**   *P* **121**   *L* **48**   # 531

Wey, Jun Shan   ZTE TX

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
   Typo "were" should be "where"

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **143**   *SC* **143.4.1.2**   *P* **122**   *L* **1**   # 512

Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
   This para should be part of the preceding para which deals with "A distinction is made
   regarding the underlying mechanisms of achieving the asymmetric data rates."

SuggestedRemedy
   Combine the two paras.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **143**   *SC* **143.5**   *P* **124**   *L* **2**   # 586

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
   Wrong capitalization: MULTI-CHANNEL Reconciliation SUBLAYER

SuggestedRemedy
   Change to "Multi-Channel Reconciliation Sublayer"
   The same fix needed on page 125, line 4/5

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **144**   *SC* **144.1.1**   *P* **128**   *L* **17**   # 588

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
   Goals and objectives are not needed

SuggestedRemedy
   Strike 144.1.1

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **144**   *SC* **144.1.2**   *P* **128**   *L* **24**   # 589

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
   "Figure 144–2 depict" and should be "Figure 144–2 depicts"

SuggestedRemedy
   Per comment

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **144**   *SC* **144.1.2**   *P* **128**   *L* **32**   # 590

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
   "This clause also specifies a specific … " - a tad too specific :)

SuggestedRemedy
   Change to "This clause also defines a specific"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **144**   *SC* **144.1.2**   *P* **128**   *L* **36**   # 591

Hajduczenia, Marek   Charter Communicatio

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*
   MPCP has been expanded before

SuggestedRemedy
   Change "MultiPoint Control Protocol (MPCP)," to "MPCP"

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**
   PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Cl* **144**   Page 7 of 8
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn   *SC* **144.1.2**   8/31/2018 2:56:30 PM
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **144**   *SC* **144.3**   *P* **132**   *L* **33**   # 513

Remein, Duane   Huawei

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

    Use of Italics should be reserved for variables and not used for emphasis

SuggestedRemedy

    Globally scour the draft for inappropriate use of italics and remove.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **144**   *SC* **Fig 144-3, 144-4**   *P* **131**   *L*   # 533

Wey, Jun Shan   ZTE TX

Comment Type   **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *bucket*

    Figure 144-4 comes before Fig. 144-3

SuggestedRemedy

    Reverse the figure numbers

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

    PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **144**   Page 8 of 8
SC **Fig 144-3, 144-4**   8/31/2018 2:56:30 PM