

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D1.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl FM **SC FM** **P13** **L1** # **87**
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 Page number misaligned. PDF page numbers will be used in this comment set.
SuggestedRemedy
 Ensure the draft page numbers and the PDF page numbers match.
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 6 **SC 6.5.2** **P64** **L** # **148**
 Jethanandani, Mahesh Cisco
Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **X**
 Namespace is incorrect
SuggestedRemedy
 Follow namespace allocation as defined by IEEE
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 6 **SC 6.5.2** **P64** **L1** # **137**
 Jones, Peter Cisco
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 Fix indentation issues in the model.
SuggestedRemedy
 Here are some examples. There is no standard indetation used in the model. Sometimes the indentation is 0, sometimes 2 spaces and sometimes more than 2 spaces. Suggest that you pick on 2 spaces. An example is under organization. The next line is at 0 indentation, where it should be 2. Same for description of the model. Revision statement has an indentation of 5 spaces and within it the reference statement has an indentation of - 2.
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 6 **SC 6.5.2** **P64** **L27** # **145**
 Jones, Peter Cisco
Comment Type **TR** **Comment Status** **X**
 Organization and contact text in D1.1 doesn't match what's in GIT at <https://github.com/YangModels/yang/blob/master/standard/ieee/802.3/draft/ieee802-ethernet-pse.yang>
 We need these to be the same, otherwise external reviewers will not see curent drafts. In this case, D1.1. Organization and contact don't match what's in github
SuggestedRemedy
 Make draft and github are consistent
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 6 **SC 6.5.2** **P64** **L28** # **135**
 Jones, Peter Cisco
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 Typo - "IEEE 802.3 Ethernet Workign Group"
SuggestedRemedy
 "IEEE 802.3 Ethernet Working Group"
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Cl 6 **SC 6.5.2** **P64** **L36** # **146**
 Jones, Peter Cisco
Comment Type **E** **Comment Status** **X**
 Typo - configuring
SuggestedRemedy
 configuring
Proposed Response **Response Status** **O**

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D1.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P64 L38 # 147
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Another 2 typos - provdes functionality
 SuggestedRemedy
 provides functionality
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P68 L57 # 139
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 Remove operational part of the model and collapse it into one container to be NDMA compliant.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Update model structure as discussed in TF AdHoc
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P65 L33 # 136
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Do not use camel cases. Use - instead. Examples include
 enum deliveringPower
 enum otherFault
 SuggestedRemedy
 Use "-" instead of camel case.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P69 L15 # 140
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 Remove when statements in operational state. Even if the condition does not apply, are you not going to report operational value reported by the system??
 SuggestedRemedy
 Remove when statements in operational state.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P67 L54 # 144
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 What is the idea of making multi-pair a presence container?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change if appropriate
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P71 L33 # 138
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Descriptions are minimal in some statements (e.g. leaf pse-type) . Need to do a better job of updating descriptions. An enum of typeA with a description that says "typeA" does not mean much.
 SuggestedRemedy
 provide a little more information in the descriptions.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D1.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P73 L40 # 143
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 Please indicate cumulative-energy units as millijoules
 SuggestedRemedy
 units 'millijoule';
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P86 L39 # 88
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Paragraph alignment seems to be incorrect.
 SuggestedRemedy
 If possible indent "a)", "b)", ... items to align with previous text. Ideally the following text in the item should be indented to align with first line of item.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P73 L52 # 142
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 Why is actual-power units in watt, but the description says milliwatts.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Resolve inconsistency
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P87 L33 # 89
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Indent first line of description.
 SuggestedRemedy
 per comment
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 6 SC 6.5.2 P74 L16 # 141
 Jones, Peter Cisco
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 Fill description statements current marked as "" (e.g. cumulative-energy)
 SuggestedRemedy
 provide useful descriptions
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P87 L46 # 92
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 This description describes what an LLID is not what the mpcp-llid-count is.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace with "Indicates the number of registered LLIDs. The initialization value is 0. This is applicable for an OLT with the same value for all virtual interfaces and for an ONU."
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P85 L56 # 86
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 Shouldn't we reference the 2018 standard (assuming it is released before this amendment).
 This issues exists in 4 locations in the draft.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Add Editors notes to update reference prior to publication.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D1.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P87 L47 # 90
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X
 While much improved from Draft 1.0 (Thank you very much) the indenting throughout section 7.3.2 is still somewhat inconsistent. Some successive lines are indented 2 tab spaces while similar lines are indented 4 Tabs, etc. Note this is especially true for descriptions. For example see pg 89 where no less than 5 descriptoin indenting styles are used.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Check indentation throughout the section and make it consistent.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P87 L50 # 91
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 The following statements are incorrect. "Typically, the number of logical links expected in a PON is equal the number of ONUs, which is 32-64, plus an additional entry for broadcast LLID. At the ONU the number of LLIDs for an interface is one." I understand that this misinformative text exists in 802.3.1 and will happily submit a maintenance request if required. Note that the last sentence "At the ONU the number of LLIDs for an interface is one." is ambiguous as it is not clear which interface(s) are being referred to.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Strike the text.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P90 L63 # 93
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Missing period "An attempt to set the value of 'unknown' is illegal;"
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to: An attempt to set the value of 'unknown' is illegal.;
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P91 L42 # 94
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 The use of undefined abbreviations does nothing to assist the technician in understanding the item.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace all instances of ' Tx ' with 'transmit' and all instances of ' Rx ' with 'receive' where it appears in the description. Note this does not include '-Tx-' or '-Rx-'.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P94 L13 # 95
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Does 'the given moment of time' mean when read or when reported?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to 'the time reported'.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P94 L37 # 96
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 Is 'under the control of the logical layer' really correct? 802.3.1 uses 'Setting this object to true(1) will cause the optical interface to start transmission (according to the control protocol specified for the logical interface). Setting this object to false(2) will cause the interface to stop the optical transmission. When getting true(1), the optical interface is in transmitting mode (obeying to the logical control protocol).'
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 'layer' to 'protocol' in 2x.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D1.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P95 L21 # 98
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Augments definition'
 SuggestedRemedy
 Augments the definition'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P95 L57 # 99
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 of 'fec-mode"
 SuggestedRemedy
 of the 'fec-mode"
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P95 L64 # 97
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 This description could be improved: 'An object that indicates the support of operation of the optional FEC sublayer of the 1000BASE-PX PHY specified in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.2. The value of 'unknown' is assigned in the initialization, for non FEC support state or type not yet known. The value of 'not supported' is assigned when the sublayer is not supported. The value of 'supported' value is assigned when the sublayer is supported. This object is applicable for an OLT, with the same value for all logical links, and for an ONU. All objects in the fec/statistics container will have a zero value when the interface is not supporting FEC.'
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to:
 'An object that indicates the support of operation of the optional FEC sublayer of the 1000BASE-PX PHY specified in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.2. The value of 'unknown' is reported in the initialization, for non FEC support state or type not yet known. The value of 'not supported' is reported when the sublayer is not supported. The value of 'supported' is reported when the sublayer is supported. This object is applicable for an OLT, with the same value for all logical links, and for an ONU. All objects in the fec/statistics container will have a zero value when the interface is not supporting FEC.'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P95 L65 # 107
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 This phrase occurs ~61 times in the draft typically prefaced by "At the OLT". We could avoid future editing if we removed the preface now as in 100G-EPON I expect that ONUs will naturally support multiple LLIDs (which most physical ONUs do today). Even with the removal of the preface the statement will still be true for both ONUs and OLTs.
 SuggestedRemedy

Remove the preface 'At the OLT, ' when it appears in front of 'it has a distinct value for each logical link'. There are several instances where this is used in conjunction with queues and/or queue sets (e.g., pg 102 ln 34 & pg 105 line 46); in these instances the editor is granted license to use his best judgment in changing the text. Omit the change at the following locations; pg107/ln 43, 108 / 44, 110 / 14, 111 / 16,&50, and 112 / 52. Note there is a separate comment against instance at pg 138 line 13.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P96 L53 # 100
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 Does this object exist in YANG? 'Any discontinuity should be reported in the ifCounterDiscontinuityTime object'. Note this text appears in the draft about 31 times.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace with a reference to the appropriate YANG thingy. Sorry but I'm not sure what that is.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P97 L27 # 101
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X
 TBD reference?
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace with proper pointer.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P97 L50 # 102
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type TR Comment Status X

These statements seem unreliable:

'The set operation can be done at any time. Changing the value of 'trx-transmit-admin-state' to 'disabled'.

This object is applicable for an OLT and an ONU. At the OLT, it has a distinct value for each logical link.

The value of this object is only reliable when can lead to a halt in the optical transmission of the respective interface leading to an interruption of service of the users connected to the respective logical link.'

SuggestedRemedy

Change to:

'The set operation can be done at any time. Changing the value of 'trx-transmit-admin-state' to 'disabled' can lead to a halt in the optical transmission of the respective interface leading to an interruption of service of the users connected to the respective logical link.

This object is applicable for an OLT and an ONU. At the OLT, it has a distinct value for each logical link.

The value of this object is only relevant when the state of the interface is 'enabled' as set by the mpcp-admin-state.'

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P98 L18 # 103
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Reword; 'This object controls the setting of low alarm threshold for the input power into the optical receiver.'

SuggestedRemedy

To: 'This object controls the low alarm threshold setting of the optical receiver input power.'

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P98 L25 # 104
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Reword: 'A set of a value into the 'trx-power-in-low-threshold' object may be done at any time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-in-low-threshold-crossing' event, if a too high a value is set.'

SuggestedRemedy

To: 'The 'trx-power-in-low-threshold' object may be set at any time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-in-low-threshold-crossing' event if the set value is too high.'

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P98 L50 # 105
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Reword; 'This object controls the setting of high alarm threshold for the input power into the optical receiver.'

SuggestedRemedy

To: 'This object controls the high alarm threshold setting of the optical receiver input power.'

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P98 L57 # 106
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Reword: 'A set of a value into the 'trx-power-in-high-threshold' object may be done at any time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-in-high-threshold-crossing' event, if a too low a value is set.'

SuggestedRemedy

To: 'The 'trx-power-in-high-threshold' object may be set at any time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-in-high-threshold-crossing' event if the set value is too low.'

Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D1.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P99 L17 # 109
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Reword; 'This object controls the setting of low alarm threshold for the output power out of the optical transmitter.'
 SuggestedRemedy
 To: 'This object controls the low alarm threshold setting of the optical transmitter output power.'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P99 L56 # 112
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Reword: 'A set of a value into the 'trx-power-out-high-threshold' object may be done at any time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-out-high-threshold-crossing' event, if a too low a value is set.'
 SuggestedRemedy
 To: 'The 'trx-power-out-high-threshold' object may be set at any time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-out-high-threshold-crossing' event if the set value is too low.'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P99 L24 # 110
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Reword: 'A set of a value into the 'trx-power-out-low-threshold' object may be done at any time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-out-low-threshold-crossing' event, if a too high a value is set.'
 SuggestedRemedy
 To: 'The 'trx-power-out-low-threshold' object may be set at any time, and may cause generation of a 'trx-power-out-low-threshold-crossing' event if the set value is too high.'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P100 L8 # 114
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Reword 'allowing ONUs report'
 SuggestedRemedy
 To 'allowing ONUs to report'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P99 L49 # 111
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Reword; 'This object controls the setting of high alarm threshold for the output power out of the optical transmitter.'
 SuggestedRemedy
 To: 'This object controls the high alarm threshold setting of the optical transmitter output power.'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P100 L65 # 113
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 Invalid reference to dot3ExtPkgQueueSetsTable. Occurs 4 times in the draft.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Replace with reference to the appropriate YANG model object.
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D1.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P101 L28 # 117
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type TR Comment Status X

Description does not give the user any information about the objects meaning, only the values it can assume. "This object can have a value between 0 and 7, limited by the value stored in the 'mpcp-maximum-queue-count-per-report' object.";
 There may be something funky going on in this section (like stray or duplicate description?), it's difficult to tell with the random indenting. Please check carefully.
 Same issues pg 102 ln 2, pg 102 ln 49, pg 104 ln 46, pg 127 ln 31, pg 128 ln 4, pg 128 ln 47, pg 130 ln 45 which will need different solution text.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: "This object indicates the identity (index) of a queue in the ONU. It can have a value between 0 and 7, limited by the value stored in the 'mpcp-maximum-queue-count-per-report' object.";
 Editor given license to correct remaining instances noted in a similar fashion.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P101 L34 # 115
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status X

"See '...' object" seems to be understood in previous references.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the understood phrasing 'See ... object' for all references where it is used.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P101 L40 # 116
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type E Comment Status X

"An object" any object or some specific one? This error or the similar error of "An object that ..." occurs 12x in the draft.

SuggestedRemedy

change to "This object"

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P102 L25 # 118
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type T Comment Status X

invalid range '0 .. '

SuggestedRemedy

Strike, clarified by object following name.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P107 L1 # 119
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type T Comment Status X

While true this statement may not tell the end user, who is unlikely to know what the ReceiveFrame function call is or does, much 'This counter is incremented when a ReceiveFrame function call returns a valid frame with: 1) a lengthOrType field value equal to the reserved Type for 802.3_MAC_Control as specified in IEEE Std 802.3 31.4.1.3, 2) an opcode indicating an MPCP frame.'

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: 'This counter is incremented when a frame is received at the interface which is an MPCP frame or has a Length/Type Ethernet header field value equal to the reserved Type for 802.3_MAC_Control as specified in IEEE Std 802.3 31.4.1.3,'

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P107 L4 # 129
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies

Comment Type T Comment Status X

Craft persons might be more familiar with normal 802.3 header field names, Source Address, Destination Address, Length/Type.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace; 'lengthOrType' with Length/Type' (2x) and on pg 135 ln 44 'source_address' with 'Source Address' and 'destination field' with 'Destination Address field'

Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D1.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P108 L38 # 120
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 Are these instructions for the craft? If so we should tell him/her where the counter is located so they can increment it as instructed :-)'Increment the counter by one for each ...'
 This error occurs 10x in the draft.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to: 'This counter is incremented by one for each...'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P109 L12 # 121
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 Really for mpcp-register-req-in? 'At the OLT, the value should be zero for each logical link.'
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to: 'At the ONU, the value should be zero for each logical link.'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P113 L58 # 122
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 We should not assume the craft knows every abbreviation we do. 'SLD'
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change 'SLD' to 'start of LLID delimiter' 11x
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P114 L53 # 123
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 Bad description of bad llid. 'A count of frames received that contain a valid SLD field, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate, and pass the CRC-8 check as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3, as appropriate.'
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to: 'A count of frames received that contain a valid start of LLID delimiter field, as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.1 or 76.2.6.1.3.1, as appropriate, and pass the CRC-8 check as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, 65.1.3.3.3 or 76.2.6.1.3.3, as appropriate, but are discarded due to the LLID check.'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P118 L1 # 124
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 LLID not contained! '... in the LLID and do not the ONU's LLID ...'
 SuggestedRemedy
 change to: '... in the LLID and do not contain the ONU's LLID ...'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P121 L45 # 125
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 For Tx power out this is incorrect 'At the ONU, the measurement is performed in a continuous manner. At the OLT, the measurement is performed in a burst-mode manner, for each incoming data burst.'
 Similar error under trx-power-out-low-15-minutes-bin pg 122 ln 11 and for trx-power-out-high-15-minutes-bin pg 122 ln 39
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to: 'At the ONU, the measurement is performed in a burst-mode manner for each outgoing data burst. At the OLT, the measurement is performed in a continuous manner.'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D1.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 2nd Task Force review comments

CI 7 SC 7.3.2 P121 L56 # 126
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 Wrong ref doc.
 SuggestedRemedy
 change to 802.3.1
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 7 SC 7.3.2 P135 L55 # 130
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 There is no mention of 'MPCP subtype' in CI 31A
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to: 'MAC Control opcode' so item 3) reads '3) a MAC control opcode value equal to the subtype reserved for MPCP as specified in IEEE Std 802.3, Annex 31A.'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 7 SC 7.3.2 P133 L7 # 127
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type E Comment Status X
 Wording: 'each frame is dropped'
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to: 'each frame dropped'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 7 SC 7.3.2 P137 L52 # 131
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 Similar to 2^32 '2^16 - 1'
 SuggestedRemedy
 change to: '65,535'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 7 SC 7.3.2 P134 L62 # 128
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type T Comment Status X
 While you might know what 2^32 - 1 is equal to I doubt a craft will off the top of his/her head. 'If this value exceeds 2^32 - 1 TQ, the value 2^32 - 1 TQ shall be returned.' Same issue occurs pg 136 ln 58, pg 137 ln 23
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to 'If this value exceeds 4,294,967,295 TQ, the value 4,294,967,295 TQ shall be returned.'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 7 SC 7.3.2 P138 L13 # 108
 Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X
 It appears that the distinct value for each LLID is 0 at the OLT. 'At the OLT, it has a distinct value for each logical link. At the OLT, the value should be zero.'
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change to: 'At the OLT, the value should be zero. At the ONU it has a distinct value for each logical link.'
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3cf D1.1 YANG Data Model Definitions 2nd Task Force review comments

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P139 L47 # 132
Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
Comment Type E Comment Status X
For readability: '32768'
SuggestedRemedy
Change to '32,768'
Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P139 L47 # 133
Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
Comment Type TR Comment Status X
This is just wrong 'Typically, the number of logical links expected in a PON is equal the number of ONUs, which is 32-64, plus an additional entry for broadcast LLID.'
SuggestedRemedy
Strike phrase. If I need to enter a maintenance request against 802.3.1 please let me know.
Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 7 SC 7.3.2 P140 L8 # 134
Remein, Duane Huawei Technologies
Comment Type TR Comment Status X
This object likely represents 802.3.1 dot3ExtPkgObjectReportMaximumNumQueues which appears to be incorrectly defined in 802.3.1. In several places 802.3.1 state that this object limits the number of queues that can be reported.
SuggestedRemedy
Change description to: 'This object reflects the maximum number of queues (0-7) that can be accepted by the OLT in a single REPORT MPCPDU as defined in IEEE Std 802.3, Clause 64 and Clause 77. This object is applicable for an OLT and an ONU. It has a distinct value for each logical link.'
Proposed Response Response Status O