Cl **147**　　*SC* **147.9.2**　　　　*P* **203**　　*L* **32**　　# i-1

Huszak, Gergely　　　　　　　Kone

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　*EZ*

Format of the "NOTE-" paragraph is incorrect

SuggestedRemedy

Use the appropriate paragraph style for "NOTE-" paragraphs.
Consider scrubbing through the whole draft, to make sure all clauses are aligned with this:
e.g. 147.3.2.7 and c146, including the annexes are good candidates for such checks

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**　　*SC* **1.1.3**　　　　*P* **27**　　*L* **8**　　# i-11

Anslow, Peter　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　*EZ*

In the editing instruction, "Figure 1--1" should be "Figure 1-1" (en dash rather than em dash)

SuggestedRemedy

In the editing instruction, change "Figure 1--1" to "Figure 1-1" (en dash rather than em dash)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **01**　　*SC* **1.5**　　　　*P* **29**　　*L* **22**　　# i-14

Anslow, Peter　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　*EZ*

The expansion for the abbreviation "DCR" should not be capitalised as this is not a proper noun.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Direct Current Resistance" to "direct current resistance"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **30**　　*SC* **30.2.5**　　　　*P* **36**　　*L* **52**　　# i-15

Anslow, Peter　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　*EZ*

When a table splits across two pages, the bottom ruling on the first page should be "very thin"

SuggestedRemedy

In Table 30-1c, uncheck "Draw Bottom Ruling on Last Sheet Only"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.9.2.7**　　　　*P* **62**　　*L* **25**　　# i-17

Anslow, Peter　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　*EZ*

As pointed out in Comment #7 against D2.3, in the editing instruction "42.2.9.2.7 " should be "45.2.9.2.7" (45 instead of 42)

SuggestedRemedy

In the editing instruction, change: "42.2.9.2.7 " to "45.2.9.2.7"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **104**　　*SC* **104.7**　　　　*P* **92**　　*L* **27**　　# i-18

Anslow, Peter　　　　　　　Ciena

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　*EZ*

"Table 104-6" is an external cross-reference, so should be forest green.

SuggestedRemedy

Apply character tag "External" to "Table 104-6"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-18**　　　Page 1 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.7.1.4**   *P* **97**   *L* **26**   # i-19

Anslow, Peter   Ciena

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

As pointed out in Comment #11 against D2.3:
In Equation (104-5) "min" is a function not a variable, so should not be italic font.
Same issue for Equation (104-6)

SuggestedRemedy

Change "min" to be in upright font in both Equation (104-5) and Equation (104-6)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.7.1**   *P* **147**   *L* **28**   # i-20

Anslow, Peter   Ciena

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

This editor's note just describes work going on in another standards body. This is not appropriate in a draft that is suitable for submission to RevCom

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the editor's note.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **98**   *SC* **98.2.1.1.2**   *P* **73**   *L* **6**   # i-36

Yseboodt, Lennart   Signify

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Last column "Units" is broken at the last letter.

SuggestedRemedy

Increase column width slightly.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **30**   *SC* **30.3.9.2.7**   *P* **39**   *L* **54**   # i-52

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

comma at the end of the line is too much.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove comma at the end of the line.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.186a.3**   *P* **45**   *L* **4**   # i-53

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

If bit 1.2294.12 is set to one the PHY shall operate in 2.4 Vpp operating mode according to 146.5.4.1. (add comma after "one")

SuggestedRemedy

If bit 1.2294.12 is set to one, the PHY shall operate in 2.4 Vpp operating mode according to 146.5.4.1.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.186a.3**   *P* **45**   *L* **5**   # i-54

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

If bit 1.2294.12 is set to zero the PHY shall operate in 1.0 Vpp operating mode according to 146.5.4.1. (add comma after "zero")

SuggestedRemedy

If bit 1.2294.12 is set to zero, the PHY shall operate in 1.0 Vpp operating mode according to 146.5.4.1.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-54**   Page 2 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.1.186d.5**   *P* **49**   *L* **52**   # i-55

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

When in loopback the 10BASE-T1S PHY ... (add comma after "loopback")

SuggestedRemedy

When in loopback, the 10BASE-T1S PHY ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.25.4**   *P* **59**   *L* **6**   # i-56

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

If bit 7.526.12 is set to one the PHY shall advertise a request to operate the 10BASE-T1L PHY in increased transmit level mode. (add comma after "one")

SuggestedRemedy

If bit 7.526.12 is set to one, the PHY shall advertise a request to operate the 10BASE-T1L PHY in increased transmit level mode.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.25.5**   *P* **59**   *L* **13**   # i-57

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

If bit 7.526.7 is set to one the PHY shall advertise 10BASE-T1S full duplex capability. (add comma after "one")

SuggestedRemedy

If bit 7.526.7 is set to one, the PHY shall advertise 10BASE-T1S full duplex capability.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.2.7.25.6**   *P* **59**   *L* **20**   # i-58

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

If bit 7.526.6 is set to one the PHY shall advertise 10BASE-T1S half duplex capability. (add comma after "one")

SuggestedRemedy

If bit 7.526.6 is set to one, the PHY shall advertise 10BASE-T1S half duplex capability.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **45**   *SC* **45.5.3.7**   *P* **68**   *L* **44**   # i-60

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Support tick boxes for RM172 are missing.

SuggestedRemedy

Please add "Yes [ ]" and "N/A [ ]" into the support field for RM172.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **98**   *SC* **98.5.1**   *P* **73**   *L* **53**   # i-64

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Condition that is true until such time as the power supply ... (redundant wording)

SuggestedRemedy

Condition that is true until the power supply ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.

The phrase "Condition that is true until such time" is consistent with all similar statements in 802.3-2018.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-64**   Page 3 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **98**   *SC* **98.5.2**   *P* **76**   *L* **40**   # i-65

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

3030 to 3090 ms (add unit "ms" after 3030)

SuggestedRemedy

3030 ms to 3090 ms

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace, "3030 to 3090 ms"

with, "3030 ms to 3090 ms"

Cl **98**   *SC* **98.5.6.3**   *P* **81**   *L* **54**   # i-66

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

under laying (correct spelling)

SuggestedRemedy

underlying

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Accomodated by comment i-158.

The resolution to comment i-158 is:

Change "under laying" to "underlying"

Cl **98**   *SC* **98.6.8**   *P* **85**   *L* **13**   # i-67

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

0.005 % (remove space acc. to style guide requirements)

SuggestedRemedy

5e-05

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace, "0.005 %"

with, "0.005%"

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.3**   *P* **87**   *L* **19**   # i-68

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Cable mm (AWG) (from the text it is not clear that the "mm" means the diameter)

SuggestedRemedy

Cable diameter in mm (AWG)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace, "Cable mm (AWG)"

with,

"Cable diameter in mm (AWG)"

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.4.1**   *P* **87**   *L* **30**   # i-69

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

For PoDL systems there are multiple types of PSEs ... (add comma after "systems")

SuggestedRemedy

For PoDL systems, there are multiple types of PSEs ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **104**   *SC* **104.4.6.3**   *P* **89**   *L* **41**   # i-70

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

100 +/-0.1 % (add space before "0.1", remove space before "%" to meet the style guide requirements)

SuggestedRemedy

100 +/- 0.1%

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-70**

Page 4 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **104**	*SC* **104.4.6.3**	*P* **90**	*L* **2**	# i-71

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

3.18 kHz +/- 1 % ... 0.1 MHz +/- 1 % (remove 2 x space before %)

SuggestedRemedy

3.18 kHz +/- 1% ... 0.1 MHz +/- 1%

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **104**	*SC* **104.5.11**	*P* **90**	*L* **15**	# i-72

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

For PoDL systems there are five types ... (add comma after "systems")

SuggestedRemedy

For PoDL systems, there are five types ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.1.2**	*P* **105**	*L* **50**	# i-73

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

... provides clock recovery, link management and PHY Control functions. (serial comma after "management" is missing)

SuggestedRemedy

... provides clock recovery, link management, and PHY Control functions.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.1.2.2**	*P* **106**	*L* **10**	# i-74

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

... up to 1000 m in length. (avoid redundant wording)

SuggestedRemedy

... up to 1000 m.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.1.2.3**	*P* **106**	*L* **26**	# i-75

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

While the transmit function is in the LPI mode the PHY may disable data path ... (use comma after "mode")

SuggestedRemedy

While the transmit function is in the LPI mode, the PHY may disable data path ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.1.3.1**	*P* **107**	*L* **9**	# i-76

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

If the logical expression associated with the IF evaluates TRUE all the actions listed between THEN and ELSE will be executed. (add comma after "TRUE")

SuggestedRemedy

If the logical expression associated with the IF evaluates TRUE, all the actions listed between THEN and ELSE will be executed. (please change this also on page 168, line 41 and page 214, line 22)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.1.3.1**	*P* **107**	*L* **11**	# i-77

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

If the logical expression associated with the IF evaluates FALSE the actions listed between ELSE and END will be executed. (add a comma after "FALSE")

SuggestedRemedy

If the logical expression associated with the IF evaluates FALSE, the actions listed between ELSE and END will be executed. (please change this also on page 168, line 43 and page 214, line 24)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-77**   Page 5 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.2.5**   *P* **110**   *L* **52**   # i-78

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

... defined in 146.3.3.2 to represent MII data, idle data or zero data. (serial comma after "idle data" is missing)

SuggestedRemedy

... defined in 146.3.3.2 to represent MII data, idle data, or zero data.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.3.1**   *P* **117**   *L* **20**   # i-79

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

The integer, n, is a time index, ... (remove commas around "n")

SuggestedRemedy

The integer n is a time index, ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.3.1**   *P* **117**   *L* **31**   # i-80

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Therefore, this symbol triplet will be used for the COMMA symbols ... (avoid redundant wording)

SuggestedRemedy

This symbol tripled is used for the COMMA symbols ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.3.1.1**   *P* **118**   *L* **40**   # i-82

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

After PCS Reset the initial value ... (use comma after "Reset")

SuggestedRemedy

After PCS Reset, the initial value ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.3.2.1**   *P* **121**   *L* **30**   # i-84

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

For the master PHY PCS Transmit shall employ ... (use comma after "PHY")

SuggestedRemedy

For the master PHY, PCS Transmit shall employ ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.3.2.1**   *P* **121**   *L* **35**   # i-86

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

For the slave PHY PCS Transmit shall employ ... (use comma after "PHY")

SuggestedRemedy

For the slave PHY, PCS Transmit shall employ ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.4.1.1**   *P* **126**   *L* **23**   # i-87

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

After PCS Reset the initial value ... (use comma after "Reset")

SuggestedRemedy

After PCS Reset, the initial value ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-87**

Page 6 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.4.1.1**   *P* **126**   *L* **32**   # i-88

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

The values for disparity_error are missing.

SuggestedRemedy

Add a new line with: Values: TRUE or FALSE

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.4.1.2**   *P* **127**   *L* **16**   # i-91

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

For function CHECK_DISP it is not clear, which table to use for the 4B3T encoding.

SuggestedRemedy

Add a sentence at the end of the paragraph: The encoding rules for the 4B3T encoding are stated in Table 146-1.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.5**   *P* **131**   *L* **38**   # i-101

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

encompass (needs to be singular)

SuggestedRemedy

encompasses

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.4.3**   *P* **133**   *L* **35**   # i-102

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

..., it is highly recommended that PMA Receive include the functions of ... (needs to be singular)

SuggestedRemedy

..., it is highly recommended that PMA Receive includes the functions of ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.7.2.1**   *P* **151**   *L* **41**   # i-115

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

To ensure the total alien NEXT ... (use relative pronoun after "ensure")

SuggestedRemedy

To ensure that the total alien NEXT ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.7.2.3**   *P* **152**   *L* **28**   # i-117

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

To ensure the total alien FEXT ... (use relative pronoun after "ensure")

SuggestedRemedy

To ensure that the total alien FEXT ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-117**   Page 7 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.11.4.2.2**	*P* **164**	*L* **31**	# i-119	

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

7.5 MBd +/- 50 ppm has the wrong font size and/or style.

SuggestedRemedy

Use correct font size and style.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "MBd ± 50 ppm" to font Times New Roman on P146 L31 and P146 L40

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.11.4.2.2**	*P* **164**	*L* **40**	# i-120	

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

7.5 MBd +/- 50 ppm has the wrong font size and/or style.

SuggestedRemedy

Use correct font size and style.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Accomodated by comment i-119
Response to comment i-119 is:
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "MBd ± 50 ppm" to font Times New Roman on P146 L31 and P146 L40

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.11.4.3**	*P* **165**	*L* **17**	# i-121	

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

45.2.1.185 has the wrong font size and/or style.

SuggestedRemedy

Use correct font size and style.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Change cross reference to 45.2.1.185 to 9 pt Times New Roman.

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.11.4.3**	*P* **165**	*L* **18**	# i-122	

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

... when MDIO implemented, ... ("is" is missing)

SuggestedRemedy

... when MDIO is implemented, ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.11.4.4**	*P* **165**	*L* **31**	# i-123	

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Insertion loss (1 Vpp operating mode) (the mode is called 1.0 Vpp operating mode)

SuggestedRemedy

Insertion loss (1.0 Vpp operating mode)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.9.2**	*P* **156**	*L* **37**	# i-125	

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

... to any applicable local, state or national standards ... (add missing serial comma after "state")

SuggestedRemedy

... to any applicable local, state, or national standards ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**	*SC* **146.11.4.5**	*P* **166**	*L* **9**	# i-127	

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Support MDI2 status field is empty and tick box for MDI2 is missing.

SuggestedRemedy

Please add "M" in the status field for MDI2 and "Yes [ ]" in the support field for MDI2.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-127**   Page 8 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.3.2.3**   *P* **178**   *L* **3**   # i-129

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

'J' is not only used for SYNC, but also for COMMIT

SuggestedRemedy

Change SYNC to SYNC / COMMIT.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.3.7.1**   *P* **185**   *L* **13**   # i-132

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

..., while the slave PHY replies back to received HB signals. (redundant wording)

SuggestedRemedy

..., while the slave PHY replies to received HB signals.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
While "reply back" indeed is somewhat redundant, it is a valid expression and appropriate
for this sentence.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.7**   *P* **198**   *L* **4**   # i-137

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

..., such as industrial, automotive and building automation ... (add serial comma)

SuggestedRemedy

..., such as industrial, automotive, and building automation ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.7.2**   *P* **198**   *L* **24**   # i-138

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

In order to limit the noise at the receiver due to impedance mismatches each 10BASE-T1S
... (add comma after "mismatches")

SuggestedRemedy

In order to limit the noise at the receiver due to impedance mismatches, each 10BASE-
T1S ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.10.2**   *P* **204**   *L* **32**   # i-141

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

... according to any applicable local, state or national standards ... (add serial comma)

SuggestedRemedy

... according to any applicable local, state, or national standards ...

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **148**   *SC* **148.4.4.2**   *P* **218**   *L* **51**   # i-142

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

PLCA specific (add "-")

SuggestedRemedy

PLCA-specific

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-142**   Page 9 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **148**　　*SC* **148.4.5.1**　　　　*P* **220**　　*L* **13**　　# i-145

Graber, Steffen　　　　　　　　Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*EZ*

CRS is asserted by the PHY through MII, indicating there's activity on the line. (avoid short forms)

SuggestedRemedy

CRS is asserted by the PHY through MII, indicating there is activity on the line.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **148**　　*SC* **148.4.5.1**　　　　*P* **220**　　*L* **22**　　# i-146

Graber, Steffen　　　　　　　　Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*EZ*

If condition (1) occurs, the node is about to receive either a valid packet, a COMMIT request, a BEACON request or it might just be receiving a false carrier event. (remove "just")

SuggestedRemedy

If condition (1) occurs, the node is about to receive either a valid packet, a COMMIT request, a BEACON request or it might be receiving a false carrier event.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **148**　　*SC* **148.4.5.1**　　　　*P* **220**　　*L* **45**　　# i-147

Graber, Steffen　　　　　　　　Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*EZ*

In this case the YIELD state is entered to just skip the TO, allowing other nodes a chance to transmit. (add comma after "case" and remove (redundant) "just")

SuggestedRemedy

In this case, the YIELD state is entered to skip the TO, allowing other nodes a chance to transmit.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **148**　　*SC* **148.4.6.1**　　　　*P* **225**　　*L* **22**　　# i-149

Graber, Steffen　　　　　　　　Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*EZ*

In this case the Data state diagram switches to the COLLIDE state asserting ... (add comma after "case")

SuggestedRemedy

In this case, the Data state diagram switches to the COLLIDE state asserting ...

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **148**　　*SC* **148.4.7.2**　　　　*P* **229**　　*L* **51**　　# i-150

Graber, Steffen　　　　　　　　Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*EZ*

If plca_status is true, ... (TRUE is if capital letters in the rest of the page)

SuggestedRemedy

If plca_status is TRUE, ...

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **148**　　*SC* **148.4.7.2**　　　　*P* **229**　　*L* **53**　　# i-151

Graber, Steffen　　　　　　　　Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*EZ*

If plca_status is false, ... (FALSE is in capital letters in the rest of the page)

SuggestedRemedy

If plca_status is FALSE, ...

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**　　*SC* **146.20.1.1.1**　　　*P* **240**　　*L* **9**　　# i-152

Graber, Steffen　　　　　　　　Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　*EZ*

mm (AWG) (it is not exactly clear, what "mm" means)

SuggestedRemedy

Diameter in mm (AWG)

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-152**　　　Page 10 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **146**　　*SC* **146.20.1.1.1**　　　　*P* **240**　　*L* **18**　　# i-153

Graber, Steffen　　　　　　　　Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　*EZ*

1.02(18) (Space is missing)

SuggestedRemedy

1.02 (18)

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **98**　　*SC* **98.5.6.2**　　　　*P* **81**　　*L* **54**　　# i-158

Zimmerman, George　　　　　ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, Commscop

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　*EZ*

"under laying" should be "underlying"

SuggestedRemedy

Change "under laying" to "underlying"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**　　*SC* **146.3.3.1**　　　　*P* **117**　　*L* **20**　　# i-161

Zimmerman, George　　　　　ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, Commscop

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　*EZ*

"The integer, n, is a time index" should have no commas

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "The integer n is a time index."

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Accomodated by comment i-179
Response to comment i-179 is:
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Change to "The integer n is a time index, ..."

Cl **146**　　*SC* **146.3.3.1**　　　　*P* **117**　　*L* **33**　　# i-162

Zimmerman, George　　　　　ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, Commscop

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　*EZ*

"Therefore, this symbol triplet will be used" is not standard language in the style manual

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "This symbol triplet is used"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Accomodated by comment i-80.
Response to comment i-80 is:
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
(Change to)
"This symbol tripled is used for the COMMA symbols ..."

Cl **147**　　*SC* **147.3.2.2**　　　　*P* **177**　　*L* **49**　　# i-172

Zimmerman, George　　　　　ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, Commscop

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　*EZ*

"When Auto-Negotiation is not present or enabled" seems logically incorrrect.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "When Auto-Negotiation is not present or Auto-Negotiation is disabled,"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **147**　　*SC* **147.3.2.8**　　　　*P* **180**　　*L* **16**　　# i-173

Zimmerman, George　　　　　ADI, APL Group, Aquantia, BMW, Cisco, Commscop

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　　　*EZ*

"or it can keep silent until reset." - this is unusual language for allowed behavior - "may" is more appropriate

SuggestedRemedy

Change "can" to "may"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-173**　　　Page 11 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.7.2.3**   *P* **152**   *L* **46**   # i-175

Graber, Steffen   Pepperl+Fuchs GmbH

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

f / 20 in Equation 146-16 is not written in fraction style.

SuggestedRemedy

Use for f / 20 writing in fraction style, as it is done in Equation 146-14 on the same page.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.4.4.3**   *P* **137**   *L* **3**   # i-176

Lewis, Jon   Dell EMC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

Arrows and Lines in Figure 146-14 (part a and b) are not connsistent.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the figure to align the thickness of the lines and the size of the arrows.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **148**   *SC* **148.4.6.1**   *P* **226**   *L* **3**   # i-177

Lewis, Jon   Dell EMC

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

Arrows and Lines in Figure 148-4 are not connsistent.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the figure to align the thickness of the lines and the size of the arrows.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.5.5.3**   *P* **144**   *L* **48**   # i-180

Hoglund, David   Johnson Controls Inc

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

Replace "may be adopted" with "may be adapted" if the intent is to permit change to the resistor values. (There is no such note for figure 147-19.)

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "may be adopted" with "may be adapted".

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.3.2.3**   *P* **178**   *L* **3**   # i-185

Xu, Dayin   Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

The constant COMMIT is not defined in 147.3.2.3.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "SYNC" to "SYNC/COMMIT" to match the definition in Table 147-1

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
RESOLVED BY COMMENT i-129, THE PROPOSED RESPONSE OF WHICH IS AS FOLLOWS:
>>>>
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Change SYNC to SYNC / COMMIT.
<<<<

Cl **148**   *SC* **148.4.5.1**   *P* **220**   *L* **28**   # i-186

Xu, Dayin   Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

Change "RECEIVE state is then enterer until ..." to "RECEIVE state is then kept until ..."

SuggestedRemedy

Change "RECEIVE state is then enterer until ..." to "RECEIVE state is then kept until ..."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.1**   *P* **167**   *L* **22**   # i-200

Griffiths, Scott   Rockwell Automation

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   EZ

Clause 148 describes PLCA, not how it is optionally supported.

SuggestedRemedy

Change first sentence on line 22 to "10BASE-T1S PHYs optionally support PHY Level Collision Avoidance (PLCA), described in Clause 148."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-200**   Page 12 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.1.2**   *P* **104**   *L* **37**   # i-233

Thompson, Geoffrey   Independent Consultant

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

It isn't clear here that you are talking about the coding on the link rather than the XMII.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the text: "...transmitted at 7.5 MBd." to: "transmitted at 7.5 Mbd on the link segment."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change the text: "...transmitted at 7.5 MBd." to: "transmitted at 7.5 MBd on the link segment."

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.1**   *P* **167**   *L* **23**   # i-242

Thompson, Geoffrey   Independent Consultant

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Grammer, this is a comparative sentence that doesn't actually have two things to compare.

SuggestedRemedy

Either actually do a comparison or get rid of the sentence.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Remove the following sentence
====
PLCA provides improved performance in terms of effective throughput and maximum
transmission latency when operating in half-duplex mode over a mixing segment network.
====

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.1.1**   *P* **167**   *L* **29**   # i-243

Thompson, Geoffrey   Independent Consultant

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Title is incorrect wrt clause contents. What is claimed in the title and what is stated in the first sentence are two different things.

SuggestedRemedy

Change title to: Relationship of 10BASE-T1S to other portions of this standard

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "Relationship of 10BASE-T1S to other standards" to "Relationship of 10BASE-T1S to other clauses"

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.3.7.1.3**   *P* **186**   *L* **5**   # i-249

Thompson, Geoffrey   Independent Consultant

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

The state diagram can be significantly compacted vertically with no loss in clarity.

SuggestedRemedy

Move the WAIT_TX state from the left column to the right column above REPLY_HB and move both boxes up.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Editorial license to compact this figure.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.3.7.2**   *P* **188**   *L* **3**   # i-250

Thompson, Geoffrey   Independent Consultant

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

The leftmost transition into INACTIVE is confusing. It looks like it is an entrance from the text.

SuggestedRemedy

Put in a CR or, preferably, don't use a purely vertical transition line.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Editorial license to eliminate the visual artifact (top of hanging vertical line that goes into INACTIVE almost touches the 2nd underline in "link_hold_timer") as appropriate (without inserting CR to text).

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.4**   *P* **190**   *L* **31**   # i-251

Thompson, Geoffrey   Independent Consultant

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

In the sentence "The PMA provides either half duplex communications, or, optionally full duplex..." the word "either" is superficial given the presence of the word "optionally".

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the word "either" so that it reads: "The PMA provides half duplex communications, or, optionally full duplex..."

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED REJECT.
The "either - or" grammatical construct is intended to pinpoint the very alternatives.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-251**   Page 13 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **147**	*SC* **147.4**	*P* **190**	*L* **32**	# i-252

Thompson, Geoffrey   Independent Consultant

Comment Type **ER**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

The statement: "The PMA provides ... communications to and from medium employing DME." would lead one to believe that the medium provides the DME. Such is not the case.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to: "The PMA utilizes DME to provide either half duplex communications, or, optionally full duplex communications to and from the medium.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **30**	*SC* **30.3.9.1.1**	*P* **38**	*L* **13**	# i-308

Kabra, Lokesh   Synopsys, Inc.

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

As per format of previous, similar sub-sections in 802.3-2018, the enumerated values for a attribute are listed in new lines

SuggestedRemedy

Move "disabled enabled" in to new lines for each value;
Make similar formattinng for other attributes in below sub-sections (line 24, line 37, line 50)

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

On page, 38:

Replace,
"An ENUMERATED VALUE that has the following entries: disabled enabled"

with,
An ENUMERATED VALUE that has the following entries:
disabled
enabled"

in two locations (line 13 and line 37)

Replace,
"An ENUMERATED VALUE that has the following entries: TRUE FALSE"

with,
An ENUMERATED VALUE that has the following entries:
TRUE
FALSE"

on line 24

Replace,
"An ENUMERATED VALUE that has the following entries: reset normal"

with,
An ENUMERATED VALUE that has the following entries:
reset
normal"

on line 50

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-308**   Page 14 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **30**　　　*SC* **30.3.9.2.2**　　　　*P* **39**　　　*L* **1**　　　# i-310

Kabra, Lokesh　　　　　　　　　　　　Synopsys, Inc.

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　　　*EZ*

Typo error " Clause 147 PLCA"

SuggestedRemedy

Correct "Clause 147 PLCA" to "Clause 148 PLCA"

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **98**　　　*SC* **98.5.1**　　　　*P* **73**　　　*L* **44**　　　# i-325

Law, David　　　　　　　　　　　　Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　　　*EZ*

The editing instruction reads 'Insert variable for autoneg_speed after the variable for an_receive_idle ...' yet the variable is called ANSP.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that the editing instruction be changed to read 'Insert the variable ANSP after the variable an_receive_idle ...'.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace, "Insert variable for autoneg_speed after the variable for an_receive_idle as follows:"

with, "Insert variable for ANSP after the variable for an_receive_idle as follows:

Cl **98**　　　*SC* **98.5.1**　　　　*P* **73**　　　*L* **45**　　　# i-326

Law, David　　　　　　　　　　　　Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type　**E**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　　　*EZ*

Suggest that the ANSP variable is formatted in the same way as other variables in this subclause.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that the ANSP valuable be formatted to read as follows:

ANSP
　This variable contains the type of the selected Auto-Negotiation speed.
　Values:
　HSM: high-speed mode.
　LSM: low-speed mode.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Cl **98**　　　*SC* **98.5.5**　　　　*P* **78**　　　*L* **37**　　　# i-331

Law, David　　　　　　　　　　　　Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　　　*EZ*

Typo, the transition condition from the WAIT 2 state to the TRANSMIT COUNT ACK state should read 'transmit_DME_wait = false', that is the Assignment (<=) should be an Equals (=).

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that 'transmit_DME_wait <= false' should read 'transmit_DME_wait = false'.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **98**　　　*SC* **98.5.5**　　　　*P* **78**　　　*L* **38**　　　# i-332

Law, David　　　　　　　　　　　　Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type　**T**　　　*Comment Status*　**D**　　　　　　　*EZ*

Round brackets are normally used to indicate precedence (see IEEE Std 802.3-2018 subclause 21.5.4 'Operators'), square brackets are usually used to denote bit ranges.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that 'tx_link_code_word(tx_bit_cnt)' should read 'tx_link_code_word[tx_bit_cnt]'.

Proposed Response　　　*Response Status*　**W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general　　　　　*Comment ID* **i-332**　　　Page 15 of 20
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn　　　　5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **98**　　*SC* **98.5.6.1**　　　　*P* **81**　　*L* **14**　　# i-333

Law, David　　　　　　　　　　Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*EZ*

A minor point, but all other variables in subclause 98.5 use lowercase 'true' and false'.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that 'TRUE' be changed to 'true' and 'FALSE' be changed to 'false' here and throughout subclause 98.5.6.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Replace "TRUE" with "true" in these locations:
　　page 81, line 10
　　page 81, line 15
　　page 81, line 33
　　page 81, line 36
　　page 81, line 39
　　page 81, line 44
　　page 82, in the SPEED DETECTION box in Figure 98-11

Replace "FALSE" with "false" in these locations:
　　page 81, line 14
　　page 81, line 16
　　page 81, line 36
　　page 81, line 37
　　page 81, line 43
　　page 81, line 44
　　page 82, in the LOW-SPEED AN box in Figure 98-11
　　page 82, in the HIGH-SPEED AN box in Figure 98-11

Cl **98**　　*SC* **98.5.6.3**　　　　*P* **82**　　*L* **5**　　# i-337

Law, David　　　　　　　　　　Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*EZ*

The variable pwr_on on the open arrow entry to the state SEED DETECTION should be power_on, see subclause 98.5.6.1.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 'pwr_on + mr_main_reset + ...' to read 'power_on + mr_main_reset + ...'.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**　　*SC* **146.1.2**　　　　*P* **104**　　*L* **33**　　# i-338

Law, David　　　　　　　　　　Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*EZ*

Suggest that '... effective rate of 10 Mb/s ..' should read '... an effective data rate of 10 Mb/s ..'.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change "effective rate" to "effective data rate" at P104 L33

Cl **146**　　*SC* **146.3.3.1**　　　*P* **117**　　*L* **18**　　# i-341

Law, David　　　　　　　　　　Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*EZ*

Suggest that 'In each symbol period, PCS Transmit generates a ...' should be changed to read 'In each symbol period, the PCS Transmit function generates a ...'.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**　　*SC* **146.3.3.1**　　　*P* **117**　　*L* **32**　　# i-344

Law, David　　　　　　　　　　Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **D**　　　　　　*EZ*

Suggest that '... symbol triplet (0, 0, 0) ...' should read '... symbol triplet {0, 0, 0} ...'.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response　　*Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-344**　　　Page 16 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.3.1.1**   *P* **118**   *L* **36**   # i-347

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Suggest that '... generated by the PCS Transmit function after ...' should read '... generated by the PCS transmit state diagram after ...'.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.3.1.3**   *P* **119**   *L* **17**   # i-348

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

In the 'Restart time' description for the symb_timer, suggest that the text '... expiration, timer restart resets the condition symb_timer_done.' be changed to read '... expiration; restarting the timer resets the condition symb_timer_done.'. Similarly, in the 'Restart time' description for the symb_triplet_timer, suggest that the text '... expiration, timer restart resets the condition symb_triplet_timer_done.' be changed to read '... expiration; restarting the timer resets the condition symb_triplet_timer_done.'.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.3.2.6**   *P* **123**   *L* **8**   # i-356

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

IEEE Std 802.3 subclause 1.4.471 'ternary symbol' states that 'A ternary symbol can have one of three values: -1, 0, or +1.' and in most cases, the IEEE P802.3cg follows this in relation to 10BASE-T1L code-groups which is a set of three ternary symbols. There are a few instances where just '-' is used instead of -1, and '+' or '1' is used to represent '+1'. As an example, Table 146-1 uses '-' and '+', yet Table 146-2 immediately below uses '-1' and '+1'.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Accomodated by comment i-360.
Response to comment i-360 is:
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
add footnote to Table 146-1 that '-' is an abbreviation for the ternary symbol value '-1' and that '+' is an abbreviation for the ternary symbol value '+1', and (2) on page 11, line 7, change '{-1, 0, 1}' to read '{-1, 0, +1}'.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.3.2.4**   *P* **123**   *L* **35**   # i-357

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Suggest that '... symbol triplet (0, 0, 0) ...' should read '... symbol triplet {0, 0, 0} ...'.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **i-357**   Page 17 of 20
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   5/10/2019 3:14:41 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.3.2.6**   *P* **123**   *L* **51**   # i-359

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type   **TR**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *EZ*

Subclause 146.3.3.2.6 'Generation of symbol sequence' states that 'A ternary triplet (TAn, TBn, TCn) shall be sent in the following order: TAn, TBn, TCn, TAn+1, TBn+1, TCn+1 ...'. The following Tables, 146-1 to 146-3, then define the various ternary triplet code-groups. Of these three tables only one, Table 146-3, defines which symbols are TAn, TBn, TCn.

SuggestedRemedy

To ensure the unambiguous definition of the transmission order, define which symbols are TAn, TBn, TCn in Table 146-1 and 146-2.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Add a note under Table 146-1:
"The Ternary Triplet is (TAn, TBn, TCn)."
Add "(TAn, TBn, TCn)" under "Disparity = 1", "Disparity = 2", and "Disparity = 3"

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.3.2.6**   *P* **124**   *L* **8**   # i-360

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *EZ*

IEEE Std 802.3 subclause 1.4.471 'ternary symbol' states that 'A ternary symbol can have one of three values: -1, 0, or +1.' and in most cases the IEEE P802.3cg follows this in relation to 10BASE-T1L code-groups which is a set of three ternary symbols. There are a few instances where just '-' is used instead of -1, and '+' or '1' is used to represent '+1'. As an example, Table 146-1 uses '-' and '+', yet Table 146-2 immediately below uses '-1' and '+1'.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that: (1) in Table 146-1 that all instances of '-' are replaced with '-1', and all instances of '+' are replaced with '+1'. Alternatively add footnote that '-' is an abbreviation for the ternary symbol value '-1' and that '+' is an abbreviation for the ternary symbol value '+1', and (2) on page 11, line 7, change '{-1, 0, 1}' to read '{-1, 0, +1}'.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
add footnote to Table 146-1 that '-' is an abbreviation for the ternary symbol value '-1' and that '+' is an abbreviation for the ternary symbol value '+1', and (2) on page 11, line 7, change '{-1, 0, 1}' to read '{-1, 0, +1}'.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.4.1.1**   *P* **126**   *L* **32**   # i-361

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *EZ*

The values for the variable disparity_error are not defined.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that 'Values: TRUE or FALSE' be added to the variable disparity_error definition.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.4.1.2**   *P* **126**   *L* **40**   # i-362

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *EZ*

The values for the function valid_idle are not defined.

SuggestedRemedy

Suggest that 'Values: TRUE or FALSE' be added to the valid_idle function.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.3.4.2**   *P* **130**   *L* **34**   # i-366

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *EZ*

Suggest that '... (the triplet (0, 0, 0) ...' should read '... (the triplet {0, 0, 0} ...'.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **i-366**   Page 18 of 20
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   5/10/2019 3:14:42 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Cl **146**   *SC* **146.7.1.3**   *P* **150**   *L* **30**   # i-367

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

The abbreviation 'NVP is used subclause 146.7.1.3 'Maximum link delay' without definition in Clause 146, nor anywhere else in IEEE P802.3cg. I would imagine it is meant to be 'Nominal Velocity of Propagation', however I note that NVP is used in this subclause in reference to Equation (80-1) which uses the parameter n to represents the ratio of the speed of electromagnetic propagation in the cable to the speed of light in a vacuum, not NVP.

SuggestedRemedy

Change '... using Equation (80-1) with an NVP of 0.6.' to read '... using Equation (80-1) with an n of 0.6.' with 'n' italicised.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.1.2**   *P* **167**   *L* **42**   # i-368

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Suggest that '... effective rate of 10 Mb/s ..' should read '... an effective data rate of 10 Mb/s ..' here and on line 44 and 50.

SuggestedRemedy

See comment.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.3.7.1.1**   *P* **185**   *L* **37**   # i-371

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

There isn't a subclause 98.2.1.5 in IEEE Std 802.3-2018, suggest this should be to subclause 98.2.1.2.5.

SuggestedRemedy

Change the text '... method in 98.2.1.5 and ...' to read '... method in 98.2.1.2.5 and ...'.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.3.7.1.1**   *P* **185**   *L* **35**   # i-422

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

Values are not defined for the multidrop variable.

SuggestedRemedy

Add 'Values: TRUE or FALSE' to the end of the multidrop variables in subclause 147.3.7.1.1 'Variables'.

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.3.7.1.3**   *P* **187**   *L* **3**   # i-424

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **D**   *EZ*

The values for pcs_reset defined in subclause 147.3.2.2 'Variables' are 'ON or OFF'. As a result, pcs_reset needs to be tested against these values when used as part of a transition condition.

SuggestedRemedy

[1] On the open arrow entry to the INIT state change 'pcs_reset +' to read '(pcs_reset = ON) +'
[2] On the open arrow entry to the DISABLE_HB state change 'pcs_reset +' to read '(pcs_reset = OFF) +'

Proposed Response   *Response Status* **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
1. At 172/39 change "while pcs_reset = OFF" to "while pcs_reset = FALSE"
2. At 172/44 change "pcs_reset = ON" to "pcs_reset = TRUE"
3. At 172/45 change "pcs_reset = OFF" to "pcs_reset = FALSE"
4. At 175/2 (in "Figure 147-4-PCS Transmit state diagram (part a)") change "pcs_reset = ON +" to "pcs_reset +"
5. At 177/5 change "Values: ON or OFF" to "Values: TRUE or FALSE"

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Comment ID

Comment ID **i-424**   Page 19 of 20
5/10/2019 3:14:42 PM

Cl **147**   *SC* **147.3.7.2**   *P* **188**   *L* **3**   **#** i-429

Law, David   Hewlett Packard Enterprise

Comment Type   **T**   *Comment Status*   **D**   *EZ*

The values for pcs_reset defined in subclause 147.3.2.2 'Variables' are 'ON or OFF'. As a result, pcs_reset needs to be tested against these values when used as part of a transition condition.

SuggestedRemedy

On the open arrow entry to the INACTIVE state change 'pcs_reset +' to read '(pcs_reset = ON) +'

Proposed Response   *Response Status*   **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
RESOLVED BY COMMENT i-424, THE PROPOSED RESPONSE OF WHICH IS AS FOLLOWS:
>>>>
PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
1. At 172/39 change "while pcs_reset = OFF" to "while pcs_reset = FALSE"
2. At 172/44 change "pcs_reset = ON" to "pcs_reset = TRUE"
3. At 172/45 change "pcs_reset = OFF" to "pcs_reset = FALSE"
4. At 175/2 (in "Figure 147-4-PCS Transmit state diagram (part a)") change "pcs_reset = ON +" to "pcs_reset +"
5. At 177/5 change "Values: ON or OFF" to "Values: TRUE or FALSE"
<<<<

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general   *Comment ID* **i-429**   Page 20 of 20
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn   5/10/2019 3:14:42 PM
SORT ORDER: Comment ID