

Unconfirmed Meeting Minutes: Meeting of the IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single-Pair Ethernet Task Force

February 19-20,
2019 Milpitas, CA
USA

Prepared by Jon Lewis, Dell EMC

The meeting of the IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mbps Single Pair Ethernet Task Force convened at 8:04 AM, Tuesday, February 19, 2019 by George Zimmerman, P802.3cg Task Force chair.

Attendance for the meeting is listed in Appendix A

All presentations referenced in these minutes are located on the [February 2019 P802.3cg public website](#).

Administrative Matters

George Zimmerman displayed the agenda in [agenda 3cg 01a 0119.pdf](#).

The Task Force Chair asked the participants to introduce themselves, their employer and affiliations.

Motion #1: Move to approve the agenda as shown in [agenda 3cg 01a 0119.pdf](#).

M: Phil Brownlee S: Steffen Graber

Approved by voice without opposition (Procedural > 50%)

Motion Passes

Motion #2: Move to approve minutes of IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet Task Force from January 2019 as posted.

M: David Brandt S: Martin Zielinski

Approved by voice without opposition (Procedural > 50%)

Motion Passes

- Mr. Zimmerman noted that there should be no recording or photography permitted.
- Mr. Zimmerman asked if anyone was attending from the press including those who would run a public blog on this meeting. None responded.

Chair reviewed the goals for the meeting, big ticket items, access to the reflector and website, and ground rules for the meeting.

Attendance, Mr. Zimmerman advised the group that the attendance tool should be used each day to record attendance and that for today the only meeting that counts in IMAT is the plenary meeting held this morning. The physical attendance log was introduced and passed to the group.

IEEE Patent Policy, at **8:25 AM**, Mr. Zimmerman noted that the patent policy had been updated and then read slide 1 of the patent policy aloud. Mr. Zimmerman then made the call for potentially essential patents at **8:27 AM**, none responded. Mr. Zimmerman then read aloud slides #3 and #4.

Mr. Zimmerman noted that the slide entitled "Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings" had been shown in the opening plenary and thus would be reviewed and not read aloud completely. Mr. Zimmerman asked if there was any discussion necessary, none responded.

Chair reviewed the IEEE 802.3 Standards process and where the Task Force was in the process and the process by which we will develop the standard.

LIAISONS

No Liaisons were received.

Title: 802.3cg 10SPE TF Ad Hoc Report ([jones 10spe 01 0219.pdf](#))
Presenter: Peter Jones, Cisco

Peter Jones noted that the next meeting would be on March 6, 2019 and that Mr. Zimmerman would host that meeting.

Title: Editor's Opening Report: P802.3cg Draft D2.3 ([maguire 3cg 01a 0219.pdf](#))
Presenter: Valerie Maguire, Siemon; P802.3cg chief editor

The Editor reviewed the last draft balloting status, outlined the comments by topic, and reminded participants that the comments had been posted by topic on the website.

Motion #3: Move to consider 4 comments (#93, #94, #95, and #96) submitted after the P802.3cg draft 2.3 Working Group 3rd Recirculation ballot deadline, included with Editor's proposed resolutions.

M: Valerie Maguire S: Peter Jones
(Technical >= 75%)

Y: 20 N: 0 A: 0

Motion Passes

The Chief Editor reviewed the distribution of the submitted comments.

The Editor asked if anyone would like more time to review the EZ bucket or needed any comments pulled from the EZ bucket list.

Motion #4: Accept the resolutions to all P802.3cg d2p3 comments marked with the Topic “EZ” and posted as, [“EZ Bucket” comments with proposed resolutions sorted by clause/subclause](#), excluding withdrawn comments.

M: Valerie Maguire S: Bob Voss

(Technical >= 75%)

Y: 18 N: 0 A: 1

Motion Passes

Motion #5: Accept the resolutions to all P802.3cg d2p2 comments marked with the Topic “Editorial” and posted as, [“Editorial” comments with proposed resolutions sorted by clause/subclause](#), excluding any withdrawn comments and comments 76 and 107.

M: Valerie Maguire S: Steffen Graber

(Technical >= 75%)

Y: 18 N: 0 A: 1

Motion Passes

At this time, the editor’s report was concluded.

COMMENT RESOLUTION

Decisions during comment resolution were made by consensus, except where noted that motions were taken. For details on comment resolution see the posted comment database.

Presentations related to comment resolution are listed as they were presented. Details on the outcome of these presentations are contained in the comment database.

Motion #6: Move to resolve comments 25, 26, 28, 31, 32, 45, 54, 61, 62, 69, 71, 75, 77, 78, 79, 80, and 93 as: Reject. This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

M: Valerie Maguire S: Theo Brillhart

(Technical >= 75%)

Y: 18 N: 0 A: 1

Motion Passes

Title: Comments 66, 67 & 68: Proposed text changes to variable definitions in 147.3.3 PCS Receive ([baggett 3cg 01 0219.pdf](#))

Presenter: Tim Baggett, Microchip

The group took a short break at 10:32 AM.

The group resumed at 10:45 AM.

Comment resolution continued.

Straw Poll #1: I support rejecting comment 120 with the response:
"Commenter fails to show a compatibility problem."

Commenter is incorrect - use of reserved codes preserves compatibility, as has been successfully done in previous projects.

See http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/Jan2019/Tutorial_cg_0119_final.pdf slide 34."

Y: 13 N: 0 A: 3

The Task Force broke for lunch at 12:07 PM.

The Task Force resumed at 12:47 PM.

Comment resolution continued.

Straw Poll #2: I support the resolution to comment 114 as REJECT, with the explanation:

Commenter provides insufficient remedy.

A name of a mode is needed, but commenter provides "half-duplex shared medium" to substitute for "multidrop mode", which seems to indicate the medium itself.

If the commenter actually meant "half-duplex shared medium mode" instead of "multidrop mode" then the existing name is more appropriate as the proposal is liable to cause understanding issues with its length.

Y: 13 N: 0 A: 4

Straw Poll #3: (Chicago rules, except "none of the above" is exclusive of other choices):
Options:

A: Reject, comment out of scope, draft is correct, and reflects content of clause 147.

B: Replace "10BASE-T1L(S) does not define an AUI." with "10BASE-T1L(S) follows an integrated PCS and PMA architecture, and therefore does not support an AUI (See Figure 1-1)."

C: Delete "10BASE-T1L(S) does not define an AUI."

I support resolving this comment with:

A: 2 B: 15 C: 0 None of the Above: 0

Title: Comment 86: PSANEXT and PSAACRF requirements for 10BASE-T1S (rev b) ([shariff_3cg_01b_0219.pdf](#))

Presenter: Masood Shariff

Title: Comment 91: 10BASE-T1S delay constraints (rev 2: Piergiorgio_8023-147-Table-XXX_r2.pdf) (from reflector – 2/19/19) ([Piergiorgio_8023-147-Table-XXX_r2.pdf](#))

Presenter: Piergiorgio Beruto, Canova Tech

The group took a short break at 3:01 PM.

The group resumed at 3:30 PM.

Comment resolution continued.

The Task Force meeting recessed at 6:17 PM.

The Task Force was brought to order at 8:30 AM.

George Zimmerman displayed the agenda in [agenda_3cg_01a_0119.pdf](#).

Mr. Zimmerman brought the meeting to order and asked if there was anyone was attending that was not here on Tuesday, none responded.

- Mr. Zimmerman noted that there should be no recording or photography permitted.
- Mr. Zimmerman asked if anyone was attending from the press including those who would run a public blog on this meeting. None responded.

IEEE Patent Policy, at 8:32 AM, Mr. Zimmerman reviewed the patent slides. Mr. Zimmerman then made the call for potentially essential patents at **8:33 AM**, none responded.

COMMENT RESOLUTION

Decisions during comment resolution were made by consensus, except where noted that motions were taken. For details on comment resolution see the posted comment database.

Presentations related to comment resolution are listed as they were presented. Details on the outcome of these presentations are contained in the comment database.

Title: ADDITIONAL COMMENTS document. P802.3cg/D2.3 ([Thompson%20addl%20comments%20P802.3cgD2.3v2.pdf](#))

Presenter: Geoff Thompson, GraCaSI S.A.

Title: Reference Models ([Feb2019/2019-02-20%20Thompson%2002.pdf](#))

Presenter: Geoff Thompson, GraCaSI S.A.

Straw Poll #4: I support the following response to comment 128:

REJECT.

The ballot resolution committee believes that the commenter is incorrect in asserting PLCA is a new media access control layer overriding the CSMA/CD MAC. PLCA architecturally fits at the reconciliation sublayer and performs functions allocated to the physical layer. It requires the CSMA/CD MAC for media access control.

See http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/Jan2019/Tutorial_cg_0119_final.pdf and

http://www.ieee802.org/3/cg/public/adhoc/brandt_020619_3cg_01_adhoc.pdf for discussion.

Y: 14 N: 1 A: 2

During discussion the ballot resolution committee discussed reviewing possible revisions to the project documentation which might clarify the inclusion of PLCA in 802.3cg and address at least some of the concerns of the presenter. No specific suggestions were forthcoming at this time.

The Chair then asked if there were additional comments that needed consideration from the floor, none responded.

Comment resolution concluded.

Title: Editor's Closing Report: P802.3cg Draft D2.3 ([maquire 3cg 02 0219.pdf](#))
Presenter: Valerie Maguire, Siemon; P802.3cg chief editor

Motion 7: Move to instruct the editors to generate draft 2.4 from draft 2.3 and the closed comments with editorial license to align PICS with comment responses, and request that IEEE 802.3 progress the draft to a 15-day fourth WG Recirculation Ballot

M: Valerie Maguire S: Bob Voss
(Technical >= 75%)

Y: 16 N: 1 A: 0

Motion Passes

The Chair asked if anyone had additional business, none responded.

Motion #8: Adjourn the meeting.

M: Bob Voss S: Bruce Nordman

Approved by voice without opposition (Procedural > 50%)

Motion Passes

THE MEETING ADJOURNED AT 10:50 AM

Appendix A: Attendees at the IEEE P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single-Pair Ethernet Task Force Meeting, February 19-20, 2018.

IEEE 802.3 P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet Task Force IEEE 802.3 February 2019				Day 1 19 Feb	Day 1 20 Feb
By choosing to attend and sign in to this meeting, you acknowledge and agree that your personal data will be documented for IEEE standards development purposes to comply with policies and procedures, legal and accreditation requirements, and evaluation of patent claims by patent offices. See Front Page for additional information.					
Last Name	First Name	Employer	Other Affiliations	Tues	Wed
An	Hongming	Microchip	Microchip	X	X
Asmussen	Jes	Rockwell Automation	Rockwell Automation	X	X
Baggett	Tim	Microchip	Microchip	X	X
Bains	Amrik	Cisco	Cisco	X	
Bhagwat	Gitesh	Analog Devices	Analog Devices	X	X
Brandt	David	Rockwell Automation	Rockwell Automation	X	X
Brillhart	Theo	Fluke Networks	Fluke Networks	X	X
Brownlee	Phillip	Independent	TDK	X	X
Franchuk	Brian	Emerson Automation Solutions	Emerson Automation Solutions	X	X
Graber	Steffen	Pepperl+Fuchs	Pepperl+Fuchs	X	X
Jones	Peter	Cisco	Cisco	X	X
Law	David	Hewlett Packard Enterprise	Hewlett Packard Enterprise	X	X

IEEE 802.3 P802.3cg 10 Mb/s Single Pair Ethernet Task Force IEEE 802.3 February 2019	Day 1 19 Feb	Day 1 20 Feb
---	-----------------	-----------------

By choosing to attend and sign in to this meeting, you acknowledge and agree that your personal data will be documented for
IEEE standards development purposes to comply with policies and procedures, legal and accreditation requirements, and evaluation of patent claims by patent offices. See Front Page for additional information.

Last Name	First Name	Employer	Other Affiliations	Tues	Wed
Lewis	Jon	Dell EMC	Dell EMC	X	X
Maguire	Valerie	Siemon	Siemon	X	X
Miller	Martin	Microchip	Microchip	X	X
Nordman	Bruce	LBNL	LBNL		X
Shariff	Masood	Commscope	Commscope	X	X
Stewart	Heath	Analog Devices	Analog Devices	X	X
Thompson	Geoff	GraCaSI SA.	Independent	X	X
Tremblay	David	HPE	HPE	X	X
Voss	Bob	Panduit	Panduit	X	X
Zielinski	Martin	Emerson Automation Solutions	Emerson Automation Solutions	X	X
Zimmerman	George	CME Consulting	Commscope, Aquantia, CME Consulting, Cisco, ADI, BMW, APL Group, SensTekse	X	X