P802.3 D0p6

10 Layer Specifications and Management Parameters for Greater Than 1 Gb/s Automotive Ethernet 2nd T:

Comment Type E  Comment Status D
Comment: Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Suggested Remedy

Change editor instruction to: Replace Figure 44-1 with Figure 44-1a and Figure 44-1b as shown below.
Renumber Figure 44-1 to 44-1a.
Renumber Figure 44-1a to 44-1b.

Proposed Response  Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Change editor instruction to: Replace Figure 44-1 with Figure 44-1 shown below.
Combine current figures into a single figure with two separate drawings in it.
Grant editorial license to modify figures and/or keep as two figures to fit on a single page.

Comment Type E  Comment Status D
Comment: Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Suggested Remedy

10GBASE-T1 does not have a LDPC PCS.

Proposed Response  Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

In 10GBASE-T1 stack, change "LDPC PCS" to "64B/65B PCS".

Proposed Response  Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

"LDPC PCS" to "64B/65B RS-FEC PCS".

Comment Type T  Comment Status D
Comment: Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Suggested Remedy

Add Section 78.1.4, Table 78-1 with 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1, all referenced to Clause 149.

Proposed Response  Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Insert a row for 2.5GBASE-T1 after 2.5GBASE-T, insert a row for 5GBASE-T1 after 5GBASE-T, and insert a row for 10GBASE-T1 after 10GBASE-T.

Proposed Response  Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Comment Type E  Comment Status D
Comment: Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

Suggested Remedy

"64B/65B encoding" to "64B/65B encoding".

Proposed Response  Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

"The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs” to "The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1, and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs”

Proposed Response  Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Comment Type: E Comment Status: D
missing comma

SuggestedRemedy
Change "The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs" to "The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1, and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs"

Proposed Response

Response Status: W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Comment Type: E Comment Status: D
missing comma

SuggestedRemedy
Change "The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs" to "The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1, and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs"

Proposed Response

Response Status: W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Comment Type: TR Comment Status: D

Tu, Mike Broadcom

SuggestedRemedy
Change "each group of 50 blocks" to "each group of 50 64B/65B blocks"

Proposed Response

Response Status: W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Comment Type: TR Comment Status: D

Tu, Mike Broadcom

SuggestedRemedy
Change "TBD encoding" to "64B/65B encoding"

Proposed Response

Response Status: W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Comment Type: TR Comment Status: D

When Auto-Negotiation is not used, MASTER and SLAVE must be synchronized by the PHY Link Synchronization function as defined in 149.4.2.6.

SuggestedRemedy
Change "The MASTER and SLAVE are synchronized by a PHY Link Synchronization function ..." to "The MASTER and SLAVE shall be synchronized by the PHY Link Synchronization function ...

Proposed Response

Response Status: W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Comment Type: TR Comment Status: D

Tu, Mike Broadcom

SuggestedRemedy
Change "TBD encoding" to "64B/65B encoding"

Proposed Response

Response Status: W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Comment Type: E Comment Status: D
missing space

SuggestedRemedy
Change "10GBASE-T1over" to "10GBASE-T1 over"

Proposed Response

Response Status: W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Comment Type E Comment Status D EZ
Change awkward wording: A 10-bit OAM field is next appended

SuggestedRemedy
Change "A 10-bit OAM field is next appended" to "Next, a 10-bit OAM field is appended".

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Comment Type T Comment Status D EZ
These PHYs use XGMII

SuggestedRemedy
Change "GMII" to "XGMII". Also on line 34.

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Comment Type T Comment Status D Synchronization
Change 1 us to 1.25 us per send_s_timer

SuggestedRemedy
Change "the MASTER PHY sends a synchronization sequence for 1 µs." to "the MASTER
PHY sends a synchronization sequence for 1.25 µs."

Proposed Response Response Status W
PROPOSED ACCEPT.
There should be 1800 rx_PAM4 symbols per RS FEC frame. The figure is showing 1801 rx_PAM4 symbols.

**Suggested Remedy**

Option 1: Change "rx_PAM4n (PMA)" to "rx_PAM4n+1 (PMA)"
Option 2: Change "rx_PAM4n+1800 (PMA)" to "rx_PAM4n+1799 (PMA)"

**Proposed Response**

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See Comment #41

---

**Comment**

Tu, Mike

**Comment Type** TR

**Comment Status** D

**Comment**

This is a single pair PHY

**Suggested Remedy**

Delete "on any pair combination."

**Proposed Response**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

**Comment**

Tu, Mike

**Comment Type** TR

**Comment Status** D

PAM4 has four transmit voltage levels

**Suggested Remedy**

Change "one of ??? Power levels" to "one of four voltage levels"

**Proposed Response**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

**Comment**

Wienckowski, Natalie

**Comment Type** E

**Comment Status** D

Make DISABLE and ENABLE statements parallel.

**Suggested Remedy**

Change "Used by the Auto-Negotiation function to enable the PHY." to "Used by the Auto-Negotiation function to enable the PHY."

**Proposed Response**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

**Comment**

Wienckowski, Natalie

**Comment Type** E

**Comment Status** D

Missing comma

**Suggested Remedy**

Change "for 5GBASE-T1 and 5625 MHz for" to "for 5GBASE-T1, and 5625 MHz for"

**Proposed Response**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

---

**Comment**

Wienckowski, Natalie

**Comment Type** E

**Comment Status** D

Missing periods

**Suggested Remedy**

Add periods at the end of the OK and NOT_OK statements.

**Proposed Response**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CI</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>Comment Type</th>
<th>Comment Status</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Proposed Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 149 | 149.3.2.2 | T | D | symbol period scales with 1/S not with S | Change "x S" to "\(1 / S\)"

**Suggested Remedy**

- Change "136" to "149" in multiple locations
- An agreement by the task force is required.
- An agreement by the task force is required.
- Change "/O/, /S/, and /T/" to "/O/, /S/, /I/, and /T/".

**Proposed Response**

- Update the references, which are currently highlighted in yellow, to the appropriate references when the Figures are provided and added to the document.
- PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
- PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
- PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
- PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

- That is why there are currently highlighted in yellow.
- That is why there are currently highlighted in yellow.
- That is why there are currently highlighted in yellow.

**Comment Status**

- D/dispatched
- A/accepted
- R/rejected
- PROPOSED ACCEPT
- PROPOSED ACCEPT
- PROPOSED ACCEPT
- PROPOSED ACCEPT

**Response Status**

- W/written
- C/closed
- Z/withdrawn

**PCS**

- ICC
- SC
- L3
- P53

**Proposed Response**

- McClellan, Brett Marvell
- McClellan, Brett Marvell
- Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors
- Wienckowski, Natalie General Motors

**Comment Type**

- E/Editorial
- T/Technical
- E/Editorial
- E/Editorial

**Comment Status**

- D/dispatched
- D/dispatched
- D/dispatched
- D/dispatched

**PAM2 levels**

- The PAM2 transmit levels have not yet been determined.
- The interleaving depths have not yet been determined.
- accept highlighted text for PAM 2 levels
- missing comma

**Suggested Remedy**

- An agreement by the task force is required.
- An agreement by the task force is required.
- Remove yellow highlighting on "2/3, 2/3) to keep the transmit power in the training mode close to the transmit power in normal mode."
- Change "/O/, /S/, and /T/" to "/O/, /S/, /I/, and /T/".

**Proposed Response**

- PROPOSED ACCEPT.
- PROPOSED ACCEPT.
- PROPOSED ACCEPT.
- PROPOSED ACCEPT.
Comment Type: E  Comment Status: D  PCS

indexes usually start at zero

Suggested Remedy
change indexes from 1 through 1800 to 0 through 1799

Proposed Response: Response Status: W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Should Page 56, Line 33 also be changed?

Comment Type: E  Comment Status: D  PCS

a block has 1800 symbols

Suggested Remedy
change "n+1800" to "n+1799"

Proposed Response: Response Status: W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

Comment Type: E  Comment Status: D  EZ

missing comma

Suggested Remedy
Change "2.5, 5 and 10" to "2.5, 5, and 10".

Proposed Response: Response Status: W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CI</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Line</th>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Comment Type</th>
<th>Comment Status</th>
<th>Proposed Response</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Conformance</th>
<th>Response Status</th>
<th>Proposed Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>149</td>
<td>149.5.1</td>
<td>P91</td>
<td>L1</td>
<td>#20</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>EZ</td>
<td>Carryover of comment #24 from D0p5.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>149</td>
<td>149.7</td>
<td>P93</td>
<td>L52</td>
<td>#14</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>EZ</td>
<td>Redraw Figure 149-20 in FM.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>149</td>
<td>149.9.1</td>
<td>P97</td>
<td>L21</td>
<td>#5</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>EZ</td>
<td>missing comma</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>149</td>
<td>149.9.2.2</td>
<td>P98</td>
<td>L6</td>
<td>#2</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Conformance</td>
<td>In addition, the system may need to comply with more stringent requirements as agreed upon between customer and supplier, for the limitation of electromagnetic interference. The customer and supplier have no business in an interoperability spec. Delete this text.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>149</td>
<td>149A.1</td>
<td>P102</td>
<td>L12</td>
<td>#15</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Conformance</td>
<td>Exact test setup and test limit values may be adapted to each specific application, subject to agreement between the customer and the supplier. The customer and supplier have no business in an interoperability spec. Delete this text.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comment Type: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general

COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn

SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cl</th>
<th>149A</th>
<th>SC</th>
<th>149A.1</th>
<th>P102</th>
<th>L32</th>
<th># 16</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comment Type</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>Comment Status</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>EZ</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggested Remedy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Change &quot;cable, PCB connectors and inline connectors&quot; to &quot;cable, PCB connectors, and inline connectors&quot;.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposed Response</td>
<td>Response Status</td>
<td>W</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROPOSED ACCEPT.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>