Layer Specifications and Management Parameters for Greater Than 1 Gb/s Automotive Ethernet 2nd Edition

Comment Type E  Comment Status A  EZ

Suggested Remedy

- Change editor instruction to: Replace Figure 44-1 with Figure 44-1a and Figure 44-1b as shown below. Renumber Figure 44-1 to 44-1a. Renumber Figure 44-1a to 44-1b.

Response  

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

- Change editor instruction to: Replace Figure 44-1 with Figure 44-1 shown below. Combine current figures into a single figure with two separate drawings in it.

Grant editorial license to modify figures and/or keep as two figures to fit on a single page.

---

Comment Type E  Comment Status A  PCS

Suggested Remedy

- In 10GBASE-T1 stack, change "LDPC PCS" to "64B/65B PCS".

Response  

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

- Change "LDPC PCS" to "64B/65B RS-FEC PCS".

---

Comment Type T  Comment Status A  EEE

Suggested Remedy

- Add Section 78.1.4, Table 78-1 with 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1, all referenced to Clause 149.

Response  

ACCEPT.

---

Comment Type E  Comment Status A  EZ

Suggested Remedy

- Change editor instruction to: Replace Figure 125-1 (as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cb-2018) with Figure 125-1 shown below. Combine current figures into a single figure with two separate drawings in it.

Grant editorial license to modify figures and/or keep as two figures to fit on a single page.

---

Comment Type E  Comment Status A  EZ

Suggested Remedy

- Change "LDPC PCS" to "64B/65B encoding".

Response  

ACCEPT.

---

Comment Type E  Comment Status A  EZ

Suggested Remedy

- Change "64B/65B encoding" to "64B/65B encoding".

Response  

ACCEPT.

---

Comment Type E  Comment Status A  EZ

Suggested Remedy

- Change "The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs" to "The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs".

Response  

ACCEPT.
Comment Type: E
Comment Status: A
missing comma

Suggested Remedy:
Change "The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1 and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs" to "The 2.5GBASE-T1, 5GBASE-T1, and 10GBASE-T1 PHYs"

Response: Response Status: C

ACCEPT.

Tu, Mike
Broadcom

Comment Type: TR
Comment Status: A
missing space

Suggested Remedy:
Change "TBD encoding" to "64B/65B encoding"

Response: Response Status: C

ACCEPT.

Tu, Mike
Broadcom

Comment Type: TR
Comment Status: A
Need to specify the meaning of "50 blocks"

Suggested Remedy:
Change "each group of 50 blocks" to "each group of 50 64B/65B blocks"

Response: Response Status: C

ACCEPT.
These PHYs use XGMII.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "GMII" to "XGMII". Also on line 34.

Response

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Change 1 us to 1.25 us per send_s_timer

SuggestedRemedy

Change "it responds with a synchronization sequence for 1 µs" to "it responds with a synchronization sequence for 1.25 µs".

Response

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Change to 6.25 us, sum of send_s_timer and sigdet_wait_timer.

SuggestedRemedy

"MASTER repeats by sending a synchronization sequence every 5 µs." to "MASTER repeats by sending a synchronization sequence every 6.25 µs."

Response

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

This is a single pair PHY

SuggestedRemedy

delete "on any pair combination."

Response

Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Change "one of ??? Power levels" to "one of four voltage levels"

SuggestedRemedy

"PAM4 has four transmit voltage levels"

Response

Response Status C

ACCEPT.
Comment Type  E  Comment Status  A
Make DISABLE and ENABLE statements parallel.
SuggestedRemedy
  Change "Used by the Auto-Negotiation to enable the PHY." to "Used by the Auto-Negotiation function to enable the PHY."

Response  Response Status  C
ACCEPT.

Comment Type  E  Comment Status  A
missing comma
SuggestedRemedy
  Change "for 5GBASE-T1 and 5625 MHz for" to "for 5GBASE-T1, and 5625 MHz for"

Response  Response Status  C
ACCEPT.

Comment Type  E  Comment Status  A
Missing periods
SuggestedRemedy
  Add periods at the end of the OK and NOT_OK statements.

Response  Response Status  C
ACCEPT.

Comment Type  T  Comment Status  A
symbol period scales with 1/S not with S
SuggestedRemedy
  Change "x S" to "1/S"

Response  Response Status  C
ACCEPT.

Comment Type  T  Comment Status  A
accept highlighted text for PAM 2 levels
SuggestedRemedy
  Remove yellow highlighting on "2/3, 2/3" to keep the transmit power in the training mode close to the transmit power in normal mode."

Response  Response Status  C
ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
  Change 2/3 to 1 and -2/3 to -1.
The PAM2 transmit levels have not yet been determined.

Suggested Remedy: An agreement by the task force is required.

Response: REJECT.

That is why there are currently highlighted in yellow. See Comment #29.

The interleaving depths have not yet been determined.

Suggested Remedy: An agreement by the task force is required.

Response: REJECT.

That is why there are currently highlighted in yellow.

There should be 1800 \( rx_{PAM4} \) symbols per RS FEC frame. The figure is showing 1801 \( rx_{PAM4} \) symbols.

Suggested Remedy: Option 1: Change "\( rx_{PAM4n} \) (PMA)" to "\( rx_{PAM4n+1} \) (PMA)"

Option 2: Change "\( rx_{PAM4n+1800} \) (PMA)" to "\( rx_{PAM4n+1799} \) (PMA)"

Response: ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

See Comment #41 where we changed to option 2.

a block has 1800 symbols.

Suggested Remedy: change "\( n+1800 \)" to "\( n+1799 \)"

Response: ACCEPT.
Comment Type E Comment Status A
missing comma

SuggestedRemedy
Change "2.5, 5 and 10" to "2.5, 5, and 10".

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

Comment Type E Comment Status D
figure references should be clause 149 instead of 136

SuggestedRemedy
change "136" to "149" in multiple locations

Proposed Response Response Status Z
REJECT.

This comment was WITHDRAWN by the commenter.

Update the references, which are currently highlighted in yellow, to the appropriate references when the Figures are provided and added to the document.

Comment Type TR Comment Status A
Input should be m325, m324, .

SuggestedRemedy
Change "m355" to "m325". Use subscript for "325".

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.
"All equipment subject to this clause may be additionally required to conform to any applicable local, state, or national standards or as agreed to between the customer and supplier." the customer and supplier have no business in an interoperability spec. Delete this text.

SuggestedRemedy
c change to: "All equipment subject to this clause may be additionally required to conform to any applicable local, state, or national standards."

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.

To: All equipment subject to this clause shall conform to all applicable local, state, national, and application-specific standards.

"In addition, the system may need to comply with more stringent requirements as agreed upon between customer and supplier, for the limitation of electromagnetic interference." the customer and supplier have no business in an interoperability spec. Delete this text.

SuggestedRemedy
c change to: "In addition, the system may need to comply with more stringent requirements for the limitation of electromagnetic interference."

Response Response Status C
ACCEPT.