CommentID: 1
CommenterName: Pat Thaler
CommenterEmail: pat_thaler@agilent.com
CommenterPhone: 916 788 5662
CommenterFax:
CommenterCo: Agilent Technologies
Clause: 1
Subclause: 1 part b
Page: 3
Line: 9
CommentType: T

Comment:
It would be helpful to be a bit more specific about what we think the
error is.
CommentEnd:

SuggestedRemedy:
Change the response to something like: "The correct register for Auto-
Negotiation Link Partner Ability would be Register 5. There is a further
conflict when receiving next pages as Clauses 32 and 40 define
Register 8 for next pages while Clause 28 stores them in Register 5.
A change request will be generated to resolve the conflicts and placed
in the next maintenance ballot."
RemedyEnd:

Response:
**Accept**
ResponseEnd

CommentID: 2
CommenterName: Piers Dawe
CommenterEmail: piers_dawe@agilent.com
CommenterPhone: +44 1473 465654
CommenterFax: +44 1473 465159
CommenterCo: Agilent

Clause:
Subclause:
Page: 1
Line: 5

CommentType: ER
Comment: Missing d
CommentEnd:

SuggestedRemedy:
generated
RemedyEnd:

Response:
**Accept**
ResponseEnd

CommentID: 3
CommenterName: Piers Dawe
CommenterEmail: piers_dawe@agilent.com
CommenterPhone: +44 1473 465654
CommenterFax: +44 1473 465159
CommenterCo: Agilent
Clause:
Subclause:
Page: 2
Line: 6

CommentType: ER
Comment:
Where's the verb? in "Section 28.2.1.2.4 of the IEEE Std 802.3, 1998
Edition Request for clarification of penultimate sentence of this
section."
CommentEnd:

SuggestedRemedy:

Up to you
RemedyEnd:

Response:
The text relates to the request originally received.
**Comment withdrawn**
ResponseEnd

---

CommentID: 4
CommenterName: Piers Dawe
CommenterEmail: piers_dawe@agilent.com
CommenterPhone: +44 1473 465654
CommenterFax: +44 1473 465159
CommenterCo: Agilent
Clause:
Subclause:
Page: 2
Line: 14

CommentType: ER

Comment:
If what you say is true, the text would read "it" or "this
word" not "this".
CommentEnd:

SuggestedRemedy:
Generate a change request for the next maintenance ballot.
RemedyEnd:

Response:
**Accept**
This change request has been allocated the ID 1081 and is available at
the URL - http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/requests/maint_1081.pdf.
ResponseEnd

CommentID: 5
CommenterName: Piers Dawe
CommenterEmail: piers_dawe@agilent.com
CommenterPhone: +44 1473 465654
CommenterFax: +44 1473 465159
CommenterCo: Agilent
Clause:
Subclause:
Page: 2
Line: 10
CommentType: ER

Comment:
Register 7 is the "Auto-Negotiation Next Page transmit register" not
"Auto-Negotiation Next Page register". The latter is used twice, on
p705.
CommentEnd:

SuggestedRemedy:
Generate a change request for the next maintenance ballot.
RemedyEnd:

Response:
**Accept**
This change request has been allocated the ID 1082 and is available at
the URL - http://www.ieee802.org/3/maint/requests/maint_1082.pdf.
ResponseEnd

---

CommentID: 6
CommenterName: Kevin Brown
CommenterEmail: kbrown@broadcom.com
CommenterPhone: 949-585-5307
CommenterFax: 949-453-1848
CommenterCo: Broadcom
Clause: IEEE P802.3 Interpretation 1-03/01Draft response/D1.0

Subclause: Item 2
Page: 6
Line: 4-15
CommentType: Technical
Comment:
The proposal to add a bit to specify the register location for next
pages would not be backward compatible with PHYs designed prior to
the proposed revision.   A phy designed prior to the proposed revision
with bit 6.5 set to 0 (as per the spec) may store Next Pages in register 8
which would be inconsistent with the proposed interpretation of bit 6.5.
CommentEnd:

SuggestedRemedy:
Define 2 new bits:
Bit 6.5 to be defined as in the original proposal
Bit 6.6 to be defined as an indication of whether bit 6.5 is supported
Explanation:  Compliant PHYs designed prior to this proposed remedy
will have bit 6.6 set to 0 indicating that bit 6.5 is not supported, PHYs
designed to comply with this proposed remedy will set bit 6.6 to 1 to
indicate that bit 6.5 is supported

For received next pages:
if 6.6=1 then
if 6.5=1 then 8.15:0 is Autonegotiation Link Partner Next Page Ability
Register
else 5.15:0 is Autonegotiation Link Partner Next Page Ability Register
else 8.15:0 or 5.15:0 is Autonegotiation Link Partner Next Page Ability
Register

RemedyEnd:

Response:
**Reject**

While this seems a perfectly reasonable comment to consider this ballot
is only related to the interpretation response, not the change request
which will be balloted separately as part of the next maintenance ballot.

ResponseEnd: