

NESC SUBCOMMITTEE 3
 ELECTRIC SUPPLY STATIONS
 25 Sep, 2008-25 Sep, 2008
 IEEE, Piscataway, NJ

Name	Organization	09/25
Christopher A Carson (Alternate)	SEEX	X
D. J Christofersen (Principal)	IEEE/PES/SUB	X
Alton L Comans (Principal)	AEIC	X
W. Bruce Dietzman (Principal)	IEEE	X
Gary R Engmann (Principal)	IEEE	X
Keith Harrison (Principal)	NRECA	A
James Houston (Alternate)	AEIC	X
Timothy Jyrkas (Alternate)	EEI	A
Mark A Konz (Principal)	SEEX	X
Kenneth Posey (Alternate)	EEI	X
Kevin Robinson (Alternate)	EEI	X
Robert D Saint (Alternate)	NRECA	X
Robert E Sipler, Jr (Principal)	NARUC	A
James R Tomaseski (Principal)	IBEW	X
Kenneth D White (Alternate)	IEEE PES/SUB	X
Brian Winoski (Principal)	EEI	X
George Zaczek (Principal)	APPA	X
Guest		
Hunt Edward	WAPA	A

Chair: D. J Christofersen

Secretary: Gary R Engmann

X - Present

A - Absent

Meeting Note:

Jim Tomaseski was acting secretary from 1:00 - 3:45 pm.

IR546 - No Action Required

IR542 - Created CP3463

IR539 - No Action Required

Revised Text

Part: 1 Section: 10 Rule: 110 B2 Exception 3 **CP3220**

Subcommittee Recommendation: Accept

Subcommittee Comment:

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (7) Comans, Dietzman, Konz, Saint, Tomaseski, Winoski, Zaczek

Negative: (2) Engmann, Christofersen

Abstention: (0)

Explanation of Vote:

Christofersen - Negative - Vehicles should be a subset of material and equipment. Clarification of the equipment or material essential for maintenance or construction is beyond the scope of the NESC.

Engmann - Negative - The inclusion of the word “operations” may produce an effect that is counter to the intent of the proposed change. The Exception will require that any operations vehicle that is parked in a substation, e.g. a vehicle that enters the substation as part of a routine patrol, shall meet the all of the requirements of (a) – (f), regardless of the length of time that the vehicle is in the substation. More seriously, it violates the intent of the Rule to limit combustible material in the substation. Convenience will become sufficient reason to add any quantity of vehicle fuel to the contents of the substation.

Revised Text

Part: 1 Section: 11 Rule: 110 A2 **CP3347**

Subcommittee Recommendation: Accept as Modified

Subcommittee Comment:

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (8) Comans, Dietzman, Engmann, Konz, Saint, Tomaseski, Winoski, Zaczek

Negative: (1) Christofersen

Abstention: (0)

Explanation of Vote:

Christofersen - Negative - Would accept if the 2 foot lower section may be constructed of chain link fence fabric.

Revised Text

Part: 1 Section: 11 Rule: 110 A2 **CP3223**

Subcommittee Recommendation: Withdrawn

Subcommittee Comment:

Duplicate of CP3347 - By Submitter

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (0)

Negative: (0)

Abstention: (0)

Explanation of Vote:

New Text

Part: 1 Section: 11 Rule: 110 B2 **CP3033**

Subcommittee Recommendation: Withdrawn

Subcommittee Comment:

Withdrawn by submitter (Brian Winoski).

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (0)

Negative: (0)

Abstention: (0)

Explanation of Vote:

Winoski - withdrew the CP - in favor of CP3222

Revised Text

Part: 1 Section: 11 Rule: 110 B2 Exception 1 **CP3222**

Subcommittee Recommendation: Accept

Subcommittee Comment:

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (8) Comans, Dietzman, Engmann, Konz, Saint, Tomaseski, Winoski, Zaczek

Negative: (1) Christofersen

Abstention: (0)

Explanation of Vote:

Christofersen - Negative - Vehicles should be a subset of material and equipment. Clarification of the equipment or material essential for maintenance or construction is beyond the scope of the NESC.

Revised Text

Part: 1 Section: 11 Rule: 110 B2 Exception 2 **CP3221**

Subcommittee Recommendation: Accept

Subcommittee Comment:

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (7) Comans, Dietzman, Konz, Saint, Tomaseski, Winoski, Zaczek

Negative: (2) Engmann, Christofersen

Abstention: (0)

Explanation of Vote:

Christofersen - Negative - Vehicles should be a subset of material and equipment. Clarification of the equipment or material essential for maintenance or construction is beyond the scope of the NESC.

Engmann - Negative - See response to CP3220. Note that it appears that the inclusion of “operations” requires that all of the vehicles listed in the CP, e.g. “site showup”, shall be separated from the substation by a fence, screen, partition, etc.

Revised Text

Part: 1 Section: 11 Rule: 111 A **CP3463**

Subcommittee Recommendation: Accept

Subcommittee Comment:

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (7) Christofersen, Dietzman, Konz, Saint, Tomaseski, Winoski, Zaczek

Negative: (0)

Abstention: (0)

Explanation of Vote:

Revised Text

Part: 1 Section: 11 Rule: 111 Table 111-1 **CP3474**

Subcommittee Recommendation: Accept

Subcommittee Comment:

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (6) Christofersen, Comans, Dietzman, Engmann, Harrison, Zaczek

Negative: (2) Winoski, Konz

Abstention: (0)

Explanation of Vote:

Konz (Negative) While we like the idea of cleaning up this table, we are not in favor of adding requirements to substations. If they would have been left alone, we would have supported this.

Winoski (Negative) We are in agreement that the tables need to be updated. We are not in favor of adding in requirements for the light levels of remote areas of substations.

New Text

Part: 1 Section: 11 Rule: 114 **CP3149**

Subcommittee Recommendation: Reject

Subcommittee Comment:

This Rule is not intended to require permanent fire extinguishers or fire extinguishment systems in all electric supply stations or in all areas of large, complex stations.

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (9) Christofersen, Comans, Dietzman, Engmann, Konz, Saint, Tomaseski, Winoski, Zaczek

Negative: (0)
Abstention: (0)

Explanation of Vote:

New Text

Part: 1 Section: 12 Rule: 121 **CP3044**

Subcommittee Recommendation: Reject

Subcommittee Comment:

The need for "Recorded" documentation for the Electrical Supply Stations as presented in the CP is not appropriate for Safety Code. The SC feels that Part B3 which states, "Equipment permanently abandoned", shall be removed or maintained in a safe condition is not necessary.

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (7) Comans, Dietzman, Konz, Saint, Tomaseski, Winoski, Zaczek

Negative: (2) Engmann, Christofersen

Abstention: (0)

Explanation of Vote:

Christofersen - Negative - Rule 121 is inconsistant with inspection Rules of other parts of the Code and needs revision. Also, I am not in agreement with the Rejection relative to not recording defects, scheduling maintenance or defective equipment not being maintained safely.

Engmann - Negative - Rule 121 is inconsistent with inspection Rules of other parts of the Code and needs revision. Also, I am not in agreement with the Rejection relative to not recording defects, scheduling maintenance or defective equipment not being maintained safely.

New Text

Part: 1 Section: 12 Rule: 124 A1 **CP3398**

Subcommittee Recommendation: Accept as Modified

Subcommittee Comment:

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (6) Christofersen, Comans, Dietzman, Engmann, Saint, Zaczek

Negative: (1) Winoski

Abstention: (0)

Explanation of Vote:

Comans - Affirmative - One concern I still have is that this wording may lead someone to believe that if they violate the safety clearance zone that the live parts can be guarded, which is something we may want. However, I am not sure that the guarding method as described in 124.C.2 is sufficient for the 10 foot stick issue of Rule 110.A.2, as Rule 124.C.2 only requires the guard to be to the height needed to comply with Table 124-1.

Winoski (Negative) We feel that in light of all the discussions that have been unable to succinctly address desired changes to 124A1 that the existing language in 124A1 is acceptable.

Revised Text

Part: 1 Section: 12 Rule: 124 A3 **CP3150**

Subcommittee Recommendation: Accept as Modified

Subcommittee Comment:

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (9) Christofersen, Comans, Dietzman, Engmann, Konz, Saint, Tomaseski, Winoski, Zaczek

Negative: (0)

Abstention: (0)

Explanation of Vote:

New Text

Part: 1 Section: 12 Rule: 124 D **CP3369**

Subcommittee Recommendation: Accept as Modified

Subcommittee Comment:

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (8) Comans, Dietzman, Engmann, Konz, Saint, Tomaseski, Winoski, Zaczek

Negative: (0)

Abstention: (1) Christofersen

Explanation of Vote:

Christofersen - Abstain - Minimum of 8.6 feet required to live parts unless guarded. A verification is required that a 5 foot clearance is an adequate guard.

Revised Text

Part: 1 Section: 12 Rule: 125 **CP3426**

Subcommittee Recommendation: Reject

Subcommittee Comment:

The CP did not improve the existing wording.

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (8) Christofersen, Comans, Dietzman, Konz, Saint, Tomaseski, Winoski, Zaczek

Negative: (1) Engmann

Abstention: (0)

Explanation of Vote:

Engmann - Negative - The merit of the CP was lost in the wording.

Revised Text

Part: 1 Section: 14 Rule: 146 B **CP3442**

Also Section:3 Z535 references SC1

Part:1 Section:11 110 A1 SC3

Part:1 Section:12 124 C1 SC3

Part:2 Section:21 217 A1c SC4

Part:2 Section:21 217 A2a SC4

Part:3 Section:32 323 C4 SC7

Part:3 Section:38 381 G2 SC7

Part:4 Section:41 411 D SC8

Subcommittee Recommendation: Accept in Part

Subcommittee Comment:

Revised references in Section 3

Vote on Subcommittee Recommendation:

Affirmative: (8) Christofersen, Comans, Dietzman, Konz, Saint, Tomaseski, Winoski, Zaczek

Negative: (0)

Abstention: (1) Engmann

Explanation of Vote:

Engmann (Abstention) The intent of the CP is a mandatory requirement to conform to the industry consensus standards for signage. The CP fell short of the intent in that it only included the ANSI standards in the References without an explicit mandatory conformance requirement. However, elevation beyond a “Note” is progress.

Meeting Conclusion:

Subcommittee 3 approved the suggestion of Bob Saint, representing Working Group 3.1, to address Table 111-1 and present a Change Proposal suggesting revisions to clean the table up.