

#1 Type: TR TF: TF4 Clause: 9.3.6.1 Page: 208 Line: 7 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

The draft has one instance of OUI_B and seven instances of OUI_C.

Replace with OUI_1904_4

-

#5 Type: ER TF: TF4 Clause: 13.3.2.3 Page: 234 Line: 4 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

Wrong figure numbering

Figures 12-2, 12-3, and 12-4 shall be numbered 13-2, 13-3, and 13-4.

-

#6 Type: T TF: TF4 Clause: 13.3.2.3.6 Page: 238 Line: 30 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

Unclear what is meant by the following sentence "The state diagram in Figure 12-3 is instantiated for every group of eOAM versions identified by a different OUI" The subclause 13.3.2 states that "The eOAM discovery process is executed once per ONU.". Shouldn't then the state diagram be instantiated for each ONU?

Consider removing this statement. Otherwise, clarify how the OLT shall support multiple state diagrams with different OUIs. How shall ONU react to eOAMPDUs that contain an unrecognized OUI? What other OUI can be allowed by this state diagram, given the primitive definitions allow only one OUI? In the preceding sentence "The C-OLT shall implement the extended OAM discovery process as shown in Figure 12-3 for each newly discovered L-ONU", replace "implement" with "instantiate"

Remove the offending statement "The state diagram in Figure 12-3 is instantiated for every group of eOAM versions identified by a different OUI" In the preceding sentence "The C-OLT shall implement the extended OAM discovery process as shown in Figure 12-3 for each newly discovered L-ONU", replace "implement" with "instantiate" + update PICS

#2 Type: TR TF: TF4 Clause: 13.3.2.3.6 Page: 238 Line: 32 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

The sentence "In the case of an mL-ONU, the extended OAM discovery process shall be executed for every registering L-ONU" is not true for the 802.3ca ONUs. The OAM discovery is done once per C-ONU.

Delete the sentence

Delete the sentence + update PICS.

#3 Type: T TF: TF4 Clause: 13.4.3.2 Page: 244 Line: 14 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

"The number of elements in the sequence list shall be determined from the size of the given Variable Container (value of the Length field)." This is a mis-stated requirement. Who shall do the determination and when?

Change the sentence to this: "The number of elements in the sequence list is determined from the size of the given Variable Container (value of the Length field)." Remove the corresponding PICS.

-

#4 Type: TR TF: TF4 Clause: 13.4.4.1 Page: 244 Line: 33 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

In 13.3.2.3, the draft says "Step 2: The ONU responds to the received eOAM_Discovery message by sending the list of supported versions of the management software...". Also the Figure 12-2 shows multiple OAM version being exchanged. The state diagrams use variables versionListONU and versionListOLT. In the OLT, the value of versionListONU is extracted from the Extended Information TLV received from the ONU. But the format of the Extended Information TLV in 13.4.4.1 only allows one OAM version to be carried in this TLV.

Replace the entire subclause 13.4.4.1 with subclause 13.2.2.3.1 from IEEE 1904.1-2017. Rename OUI_C into OUI_1904_4.

Replace the entire subclause 13.4.4.1 with subclause 13.2.2.3.1 from IEEE 1904.1-2017. Rename OUI_C into OUI_1904_4. Update PICS

#7 Type: TR TF: TF4 Clause: Annex 4A Page: 419 Line: 1 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

PICS for Clause 13 and Clause 14 need to be leaned up and aligned with the current text of the standard

Replace the following subclauses per 4A.2.10, 4A.2.11, 4A.2.12, and 4A.2.13 for the ONU side, and 4A.3.8, 4A.3.9, 4A.3.10, and 4A.3.11 for the OLT side, as shown in tf4_2112_hajduczenia_01.pdf

-