IEEE 1904 Access Networks Working Group

Sponsored by the IEEE Communications Society

25-26 April 2016
San Jose, CA USA

Minutes

Chair: Glen Kramer
Vice-Chair: Ken-Ichi Suzuki
Executive Secretary: Zhou Zhen
Chief Editor: Marek Hajduczenia
Meeting Recorder: Zhou Zhen

Day 1, Monday, 25 April 2016

1. **Call to Order**
- The meeting was called to order at 9:00 am.
- All present introduced themselves and declared their affiliation.
- A sign in sheet captured attendance each day.
- 10 voting member attended meeting. Quorum was reached.

2. **Executive Secretary Report**
- Zhou Zhen, Executive Secretary, presented *anwg_1604_exec_report.pdf*.
- A report on working group member was provided.

3. **Chair's Opening Remarks**
- Chair Kramer presented ANWG opening remarks *anwg_1604_opening.pdf*.
- Chair Kramer presented WG updates since last meeting.
- Chair Kramer presented the plan for this meeting.

4. **Approval of Agenda**
- Chair Kramer presented the agenda, *anwg_1604_agenda.pdf*.
- ***Motion#1:***
  Approve the agenda for the February 2016 meeting as presented in anwg_1604_agenda.pdf.
  Moved: Marek Hajduczenia, Bright House Networks
  Seconded: Jouni Korhonen, Broadcom Corp.
  (Procedural, required>50%)
  Motion passed by voice vote without opposition

5. **Approval of Past Meeting Minutes**
- Chair Kramer presented *anwg_1602_minutes_unapproved.pdf* .
- ***Motion#2:***
  Approve minutes of the February 2016 meeting as recorded in anwg_1602_minutes_unapproved.pdf.
  Post the approved minutes on the WG website as anwg_1602_minutes_approved.pdf.
  Moved: Zhou Zhen, Fiberhome
  Seconded: Marek Hajduczenia, Bright House Networks
  (Procedural, required>50%)

Motion passed by voice vote without opposition

6. IEEE Patent Policy

- Chair Kramer displayed the patent slides. A call for potentially essential patents was made at 9:30 am. No potentially essential patent claims were declared, and no holders of potentially essential patents were identified.

7. Treasurer's Report

- Zhou Zhen, Treasurer, presented *anwg_1604_treasurer_report.pdf*.
- Balance of WG account and details were shown.

8. Logistics for June 2016 meeting

- Chair Kramer suggested that work group, RMTF and TF2 should have teleconference meeting for June.
- TF3 may have face to face meeting. TF3 chair should make the decision after this meeting.

9. Revision & Maintenance Task Force Opening Report

- Curtis Knittle, Revision & Maintenance Task Force Chair, presented the Task Force Opening Report, *rmtf_1604_opening.pdf*.

10. Resolution of open maintenance requests

- Marek Hajduczenia, Revision & Maintenance Task Force Editor, presented Comments with Proposed Responses, *rmtf_1604_comments_1904_1_proposed.xlsm*.
- All comments were resolved.

11. Revision & Maintenance Task Force Closing Report

- Curtis Knittle, Revision & Maintenance Task Force Chair, presented the Task Force Closing Report, *rmtf_1604_closing.pdf*.
- ***Motion#3:***
  Authorize the Editor to incorporate the resolved comments from the April 2016 meeting as recorded in rmtf_1604_comments_1904_1_resolved.pdf and produce draft 1904.1-rev/D2.3. Editor has a license to resolve conflicts and apply editorial changes as needed.
  Moved: Curtis Knittle, CableLabs
  Seconded: Marek Hajduczenia, Bright House Networks

  (Technical, Required>=2/3)
  11 yes, 0 no, 0 abstained
  Motion Passes
- After discussion, Sponsor Ballot of 1904.1-Rev would be started at August 2016.

12. RMTF Liaison to CableLabs

- Curtis Knittle, Revision & Maintenance Task Force Chair, presented the liaison from RMTF to CableLabs, *anwg_1604_LS_CL_outgoing.pdf*.
- ***Motion#4:***
  Authorize IEEE 1904 Chair to send liaison provided in anwg_1604_LS_CL_outgoing.pdf to CableLabs together with draft 1904.1-rev/D2.3. Chair has editorial license to make necessary changes to the liaison letter. .
  Moved: Curtis Knittle, CableLabs

Seconded: Marek Hajduczenia, Bright House Networks

(Procedural, required>50%)
   Motion passed by voice vote without opposition

13. Status update on 1904.2 and EtherType assignment discussion

- There was no contribution of 1904.2 in this meeting. Chair and editor of 1904.2 did not attend this meeting.
- Chair Kramer, presented the letter from IEEE Registration Authority, *RA_letter_1904_ethertype.pdf* and 1904.2 UMT frame format, *tf2_1408_kramer_2.pdf*.
- Chair Kramer explained that IEEE Registration Authority gave 1904 WG only one EtherType: A8C8.

14. P1904.3 (Task Force 3) Opening Report

- Jouni Korhonen, Task Force 3 Chair, presented the Task Force Opening Report, *tf3_1604_opening.pdf*.

15. EtherType and RoE common header format

- Jouni Korhonen, Broadcom Corporation, presented EtherType and RoE common header format, *tf3_201604_korhonen_ptk_type_1.pdf*.
- ***Motion#5:***
  Allocate multiple subtypes as RoE protocol identifiers.
     Moved: Kevin Bross, Intel Corporation
     Seconded: Jouni Korhonen, Broadcom Corp.

  (Technical, Required>=2/3)
     7 yes, 3 no, 0 abstained
     Motion Passes

16. 1PPS Signal

- Kevin Bross, Intel Corporation, presented 1PPS Signal, *tf3_1604_bross_1pps_1.pdf*.

17. Time Accuracy of Sequence Numbers

- Kevin Bross, Intel Corporation, presented Time Accuracy of Sequence Numbers, *tf3_1604_bross_seqnum_1.pdf*.

18. RF Accuracy - Presentation time & sequence numbers

- Richard Maiden, Intel Corporation, presented RF Accuracy - Presentation time & sequence numbers, *tf3_1604_maiden_rf_timing_1a.pdf*.

18.a. RoE OAM PDU

- Richard Maiden, Intel Corporation, presented RoE OAM PDU proposal, *tf3_1604_maiden_oampdu.pdf*.

The WG recessed at 4:45pm.

Day 2, Tuesday, 26 April 2016

The WG reconvened at 9:05am. Introductions by all attendees were made.

Jouni Korhonen, Task Force 3 Chair, resumed Task Force 3 meeting.

19. Redefining Timestamp Precision

- Kevin Bross, Intel Corporation, presented Redefining Timestamp Precision, *tf3_1604_bross_timestamp_1.pdf*.
- Chair Kramer requested that concrete proposals for timestamp be brought forward for Task Force consideration.

20. RoE Use Cases

- Jouni Korhonen, Broadcom Corporation, on behelf of Rechard Tse, presented RoE Use Cases, *tf3_1604_tse_use_cases_1.pdf*.

21. Data Path vs Control Path for Timing of Radio Data

- Jouni Korhonen, Broadcom Corporation, on behelf of Rechard Tse, presented Data Path vs Control Path for Timing of Radio Data**,** *tf3_1604_tse_datapath_1.pdf.*

22. Control Packets for RoE

- Kevin Bross, Intel Corporation, presented control Packets for RoE, *tf3_1604_bross_control_packets_1.pdf*.

23. RoE Link Setup

- Gareth. Edwards, Xilinx, presented RoE Link Setup, *tf3_1604_edwards_link_setup_1.pdf*.

24. Handling Multiple K-Characters

- Kevin Bross, Intel Corporation, presented Handling Multiple K-Characters, *tf3_1604_bross_k_chars_1.pdf*.

25. Task Force 3 Closing Report

- Jouni Korhonen, Task Force 3 Chair, presented Task Force 3 Closing Report, *tf3_1604_closing.pdf*.
- ***Motion#6:***

  Accept as a baseline the format of the timestamp as presented in tf3_1604_bross_timestamp_4.pdf page 8.

    Moved: Kevin Bross, Intel Corporation

    Seconded: Yasser Bajwa, Hon Hai Precision

  (Technical, Required>=2/3)

    8 yes, 0 no, 0 abstained

    Motion Passes

- ***Motion#7:***

  Accept adding a recommendation of the 1PPS output as outlined in tf3_1604_bross_1pps_2.pdf page 2 second bullet.

    Moved: Kevin Bross, Intel Corporation

Seconded: Xhafer Krasniqi, NEC

(Technical, Required>=2/3)
    8 yes, 0 no, 0 abstained
    Motion Passes

- ***Motion#8:***
Editor shall produce the draft D1.0 of the 1904.3 specification and incorporate the baseline proposal motions #5, #6 and #7 as agreed in this meeting. The editor has an editorial license to make the necessary changes to the draft.
    Moved: Jouni Korhonen, Broadcom Corp.
    Seconded: Richard Maiden, Intel Corporation

    (Technical, Required>=2/3)
    10 yes, 0 no, 0 abstained
    Motion Passes

26. WG Closing Report

- Chair Kramer presented the WG Closing Report, *anwg_1604_closing.pdf*.
- Transferring 1904.3 into 1914 was discussed. Chair Kramer shown three Straw Poll made in February meeting. A new Straw Poll was made.
- ***Straw Poll #1***
I support the transfer of the RoE project from 1904.3 to 1914.x
Yes: 29
No: 0
- ***Motion#9:***
The chair shall take the steps necessary to transfer the 1904.3 RoE project to the 1914 NGFI working group.
    Moved: Curtis Knittle, CableLabs
    Seconded: Xhafer Krasniqi, NEC

    (Super-majority, Required>=2/3)
    1904 voters only: Y: 8   N: 0 A: 2 (11 in the room)
    All attendees: Y: 25 N: 0 A: 3 (29 in the room)
    Motion Passes
- WG planned to have next meeting on June. 1904.1 and 1904.2 would meet by teleconference, 1904.3might meet by face-to-face. TF3 chair should make the decision after this meeting.

27. Unfinished Business

- No unfinished business was brought before the WG.

28. New Business

- No new business was brought before the WG.
- ***Motion#10:***
Move to adjourn the meeting.
    Moved: Kevin Bross, Intel Corporation
    Seconded: Yasser Bajwa, Hon Hai Precision
Motion passed by voice vote without opposition.

The WG adjourned at 5:07pm.

Attendance Record

First Name	Last Name	Affiliation	Monday, April 25, 2016	Tuesday, April 26, 2016
			Attendance	
Mohammad	Akhter	Integrated Device Technology Canada, Inc.		**X**
Andres	ARJONA	Nokia	**X**	**X**
Filippos	Asimakopoulos	University of Kent	**X**	**X**
Yasser Kilde	Bajwa	Hon Hai Precision Ind. (Foxconn)	**X**	**X**
Ralph	Bechstein	Viavi Solutions	**X**	**X**
Kevin	Bross	Intel Corp.	**X**	**X**
Tien-Shou	Chang	Hon Hai Precision Ind. Co.	**X**	**X**
Binrong	Chen	Hon Hai Precision Ind. (Foxconn)	**X**	**X**
Divya	Chitimalla	UC Davis	**X**	**X**
Peter Kwangho	Cho	Actus Networks	**X**	
Jinseek	Choi	Hangyang University	**X**	**X**
Moonchan	Choi	Actus Networks	**X**	**X**
Gareth	Edwards	Xilinx	**X**	**X**
Joerg-Peter	Elbers	ADVA Optical Networking	**X**	**X**
Marek	Hajduczenia	Bright House Networks	**X**	
Jinri	Huang	CMRI	**X**	**X**
Curtis	Knittle	CableLabs	**X**	**X**
Jouni	Korhonen	Broadcom Corporation	**X**	**X**
Glen	Kramer	Broadcom Corp.	**X**	**X**
Xhafer	Krasniqi	NEC	**X**	**X**
Mark	Laubach	Broadcom	**X**	**X**
Bomin	Li	Comcores	**X**	**X**
Richard	Maiden	Altera	**X**	**X**
Amit	Oren	Broadcom		**X**
Erik	Pennings	SOLiD		**X**
Michelle	Perras	InterDigital	**X**	**X**
Philippe	Sehier	Alcatel-Lucent	**X**	**X**
Hans	Sjostrand	Infinera		**X**
Ken-Ichi	Suzuki	NTT Corporation	**X**	**X**
Tony (Shau-Chia)	Tam	Fujitsu Network Communications	**X**	

Thomas	Tan	Verizon		**X**
Perminder	Tumber	Xilinx	**X**	**X**
Stuart	Whitehead	Anritsu	**X**	**X**
Zhen	Zhou	Fiberhome	**X**	**X**

The meeting attendance is only credited for those who attended at least 50% of meeting duration.