

#wg-3-1 Type: E TF: WG Clause: 13.4.1.3.1 Page: 431 Line: 1 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: No Category: -

In Table 13-83, a new line character is missing before "0x22"

Insert new line character

-

#wg-3-2 Type: E TF: WG Clause: 7.4.5.3.2 Page: 141 Line: 35 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: No Category: -

Missing dot in "i.e.,"

Change to "i.e.,"

-

#wg-3-3 Type: E TF: WG Clause: 7.4.5.3.2 Page: 141 Line: 37 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: No Category: -

Duplicated "the"

Delete one "the"

-

#wg-3-4 Type: TR TF: WG Clause: 14.4.2 Page: 560 Line: 17 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: No Category: -

Some of the basic attributes listed in table 14-132 are not applicable. For example, ONU never receives REGISTER_ACK, REGISTER_REQ, and REPORT MPCPDUs, so these counters are useless. aMacID attribute is redundant. MAC address of each port can be retrieved through other attributes. aCollisionFrames attribute is an array of 32 counters. It is optional in 802.3 and should not be shown as mandatory in 1904.1

Modify table 14-132 as shown in rmtf_1604_kramer_1.pdf.

-

#wg-3-5 Type: TR TF: WG Clause: 14.4.2 Page: 560 Line: 17 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Revised Commenter Satisfaction: No Category: -

Basic attributes (branch 0x07) are shown as mandatory, but their definitions are not provided. Information in 802.3 provides description of the behavior, but there is no information of object context, or format of the TLVs. Without this information, interoperability of basic attributes is imporsible.

Adapt definitions of basic attributes as shown in rmtf_1604_kramer_2.pdf

Changes per rmtf_1604_kramer_2.pdf with the following changes

* In Table 14-135, change size of FramesTransmittedOK field from 8 to "1..8"

* Change minimum range size for attribute aFramesAbortedDueToXSColls (0x07/0x00-0B) from 0x00-00-00-00-00-00-00-00 to 0x00

* globally change all instances of "attribution" to "attribute"

For discussion - aPhyType attribute lists all types of PHYs defined in 802.3. The list may potentially be extended in the future. Consider referencing 802.3 specification for up-to-date list, rather than reproduce it in 1904.1

#wg-3-6 Type: E TF: WG Clause: 14.4.3 Page: 564 Line: 37 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: No Category: -

Empty row between attributes 0x05-04 and 0x05-06

Delete the empty row.

-