

# IEEE 802.3 YANG PAR and CSD Comments

Marc Holness  
Version 0.1  
25 July 2016

# 802.3 YANG PAR



- PAR document at [http://www.ieee802.org/3/YANG/public/may16/IEEE\\_P802d3d2\\_230516\\_PAR.pdf](http://www.ieee802.org/3/YANG/public/may16/IEEE_P802d3d2_230516_PAR.pdf)

- Project SCOPE is very broad

*“This standard defines YANG data models for IEEE Std 802.3 Ethernet”*

- Suggestion: To avoid project feature creep and have a somewhat deterministic project timeline, perhaps they should consider refining/confining the scope statement
- Scope refinement guidance can be acquired from their Objectives document

([http://www.ieee802.org/3/YANG/public/may16/YANG\\_SG\\_draft\\_objectives\\_v1.5.pdf](http://www.ieee802.org/3/YANG/public/may16/YANG_SG_draft_objectives_v1.5.pdf)).

However, even there, the scope/objectives seem very broad

- MAC/RS
- PHY
- Multi Point Control Protocol (MPCP)
- DTE Power via medium dependent Interface (MDI)
- Ethernet Operations, Administration, and Maintenance (OAM)

- Project PURPOSE statement is interesting

*“The purpose of the standard is to define YANG models for IEEE Std 802.3 and publish these models in a machine-readable format.”*

- Not sure of the significance of the following wording “... *publish these models in a machine-readable format ...*”

- I see no reason to have the 802.3 YANG project have any dependency on the YANG work being done in P802.1Qcp. Consequently, I think that their project dependency statement is appropriate

*“... Is the completion of this standard dependent upon the completion of another standard: No ...”*

## 802.3 YANG PAR



- Perhaps the PROJECT NEED statement should make reference to 6020bis instead of 6020
  - The IETF is close to approve YANG 1.1 (rfc6020bis) and announced that further YANG modules in the IETF will use 1.1
  - Taking into account the timeline of this project and the fact that this is the first YANG project in IEEE 802.3, perhaps the development of the YANG modules starting with this project is done in YANG 1.1
- Is there a need to state that UML models will be generated as part of their project?

## 802.3 YANG 5-Criteria

- 5 Criteria document at [http://www.ieee802.org/3/YANG/public/may16/YANG\\_SG\\_draft\\_csd\\_v1.4.pdf](http://www.ieee802.org/3/YANG/public/may16/YANG_SG_draft_csd_v1.4.pdf)
- Project COMPATIBILITY statement seems to imply that the YANG model should be compatible with 802.1 YANG work

*“In defining YANG models for IEEE Std 802.3, the proposed project shall comply with IEEE Std 802, IEEE Std 802.1AC and IEEE Std 802.1Q.*

*This work is fully aligned to and coordinated with equivalent work taking place in 802.1.”*

- I think the above statement is sufficient to ensure that the 802.3 YANG definitions should gracefully extend the 802.1Q Bridge Port Interface YANG model being defined in 802.1Qcp