This provides responses to comments on 802.1Xbx-2014 during FDIS ballot.

The FDIS voting results on IEEE 802 in 6N16364

- Passed 15/1/18, with 1 negative vote from China NB
- 1 comment was received with the China NB vote

The comments have been processed in a timely manner using the mechanisms defined and agreed in 6N15606.

This document provides the responses from IEEE 802 to all comments by China NB on the ballot.

China NB comment on IEEE 802.1Xbx-2014

ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1X: 2013 FDAmd1 is the same as IEEE 802.1XbxTM-2014, it is based on IEEE 802.1X. China has already submitted the comments on IEEE 802.1XbxTM-2014 during its pre-FDIS ballot. Although IEEE 802 provided the response in 6N16255, it still hasn't resolved Chinese comments. Moreover, many documents distributed in SC6 have already pointed out the existing problems in IEEE 802.1X, such as 6N15613, 6N15662, 6N15523. It is regretful that all these documents didn't get IEEE's much attention and reasonable solution. China NB cannot support a standard that hasn't reasonably solved the above Chinese comments.

Proposed change: Reasonably resolve Chinese comments.

IEEE 802 response to CN.1 on IEEE 802.1Xbx-2014

IEEE 802 has given the China NB comments much attention and has previously responded to the comments provided during the pre-FDIS ballot (6N16255). IEEE 802.1 WG has not received corroborating technical information to be able to determine if any additional action is appropriate.

In the past, the China NB has asserted that man-in-the-middle (and other) attacks are possible, however the technical details of such an attack (or the attack being demonstrated) have still not been supplied by the China NB to IEEE 802 experts for review and discussion. In the absence of technical substantiation of the claims IEEE 802.1X cannot be updated to address this issue.

China NB Comment 2 on the pre-FDIS ballot requested that the references be updated. This was addressed in IEEE 802.1Xbx-2014. Reference updates will continue to be part of the regular maintenance process for IEEE 802.1X in the IEEE 802.1 WG as per the PSDO agreement. Additional updates will be incorporated in the IEEE 802.1Xck amendment (current work in progress).