Review of comment #i-18 on P802.1Q-Rev/D2.0

Just looking at the formulas and not worrying about what they represent, there is an error.

On page 1848.
Line 3:

$$\text{sendSlope}_A = (R_A - R_0) \qquad \text{(L-11)}$$

Line 33:

$$= M_0 / R_0 + \text{hiCredit}_A / \text{sendSlope}_A + M_A / R_0 \qquad \text{(L-18)}$$

Line 35:

$$= M_0 / R_0 + (R_A \times M_0 / R_0) / (R_0 - R_A) + M_A / R_0 \qquad \text{(L-19)}$$

Note that Line 35 has swapped the order of subtraction as defined for sendSlope_A on line 3. Therefore the commenter is correct that we need to show negative sendSlope_A in line 33.

My only suggestion to the resolution is to add parenthesis to the suggested change (I fear the negative sign by itself might get lost or confuse the formula):

$$= M_0 / R_0 + \text{hiCredit}_A / (-\text{sendSlope}_A) + M_A / R_0 \qquad \text{(L-18)}$$

- Craig

P.S. Having said all that you can see that line 18 solved it a different way by putting the negative sign in front of the numerator instead of the denominator:

$$\text{max Class A burst size} = R_0 \times (- (\text{hiCredit}_A - \text{loCredit}_A) / \text{sendSlope}_A) \quad \text{(L-13)}$$

With that in mind we may want to do the same thing for line 33:

$$= M_0 / R_0 + (-\text{hiCredit}_A) / \text{sendSlope}_A + M_A / R_0 \qquad \text{(L-18)}$$