

P802.1AS-Rev/D6.0

Editor's Report

Proposed Comment Resolution for WG

Ballot

Revision1

Geoffrey M. Garner
Huawei (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG
2018.01.26

Ballot Statistics

☐ Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Yes (voters)	16	69.57
No (voters)	7	30.43
Voting Yes or No	24	100
Abstain Time	6	
Abstain Expertise	10	
Abstain Total	16	41.03
Respondents	39	69.64
Voting Members	56	
Non-voting commenters	0	
Number of Commenters	10	
Number of Comments	262	
TR	96	
T	10	
ER	129	
E	27	

Comments by Category - 4

- Legend for following slides

- Comments highlighted in yellow have been done

- 78 comments still must be resolved

- 32 technical
- 46 editorial

Comments by Category - 1

- ❑ In what follows, grouped comments are shown together in parentheses
- ❑ Editorial Comments (Category E or ER) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial (104 comments)
 - Several exceptions included – comments that were marked T or TR that, in the opinion of the editor, should have been E or ER
 - All the following comments will be accepted or accepted in principle, and will not be discussed unless someone indicates a desire to discuss them
 - 5, (12 (TR),118), 14 (TR), 15 (TR), 24, 25, 26, 32, 33, 34, 36, 40, 41, 42, 47, 48, 51, 52, 53, 56, 58, 59, 60, 61, 62, 65, 66, 67, 71, 73, 75, (78, 223), 79, 80, 82, 83, 84, 85, 86, 87, 88, 89, 91, 92, 93, 94, 96, 98, 100, 103, 105, 106, 107, 108, 109, 110, 111, 112, 114, 115, 116, 121, 123, 124, 126, 127, 128, 129, 130, 133, 134, 136, 138, 139, 140, 141, 143, 144, 147, 150, 151, 152, 156, (160, 184) 163, 164, 169, 180, 189, 190, 193, 194, 215, 226, 239, 244 (TR), 245, 247, 252, 257, 259
- ❑ Comments related to Framemaker issues (Category E or ER) (9 comments)
 - Some of these may need discussion, e.g., proposals that, if implemented, would greatly increase the amount of white space in the document
 - However, these will have the lowest priority in terms of discussion time
 - The editor will likely need assistance in addressing some of these
 - 16, 27, 30, 39, 46, 90, (97, 146, 159)

Comments by Category - 2

- ❑ Other Editorial Comments, to be discussed but with lower priority in terms of discussion time (46 comments)
 - (7, 102), 8, 9, 10, 11, 13, 17, 19, 20, 21, 31, 44, 45, 49, 50, 54, 57, 68, 70, 72, 74, 95, 99, 101, 117, 131, (132, 158, 224), 137, 145, 148, (154, 229), 170, 185, 187, 188, 205, 206, 207, 209, 213, 238, 249

Comments by Category - 3

- Technical (T) and Technical Required (TR) Comments; will be discussed
 - frontmatter items (2 comments): (1, 2)
 - References (5 comments): 3, 4, (29, 37), 35
 - Other (63 comments): (6, 230), 28, 43, 55, 69, (76 (ER), 200), (77, 201), (135, 228), 142, 149, 153, 155, 157, 166, 171, 172, 174, 176, 177, 178, 182, 183, 186, 191, 195, (196, 210), 197, 198, 202, 203, 211, 212, 214, (38 (ER), 216), 217, 219, 220, 231, 232, 235, 236, 237, 240, 242, 243, 246, 248, 250, 251, 253, 254, 255, 256, 257, 258, 261, 262
 - External port state configuration (5 comments): (22, 63, 64, 199), 23
 - gPTP Capable TLV (3 comments): 81, (222, 260)
 - 802.11 transport (5 comments): 104, 113, 119, 120, 122,
 - Managed objects (3 comments): (125, 227), 225,
 - MIB (3 comments): (18, 161 (ER), 162)
 - ClockMaster, ClockSlave, and related entities (7 comments): 165, 167, 168, 173, 175, 233, 241,
 - Aspects related to scope of variables (per PTP instance, per port per PTP instance, etc.) (8 comments): 179, 181, 192, 204, 208, 218, 221, 234