

P802.1AS-Rev/D7.0

Editor's Report

Proposed Comment Resolution for WG

Ballot

Revision 2

Geoffrey M. Garner
Huawei (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG
2018.05.31

Ballot Statistics

☐ Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Yes (voters)	28	84.85
No (voters)	5	15.15
Voting Yes or No	33	100
Abstain Time	2	
Abstain Expertise	6	
Abstain Total	8	19.51
Respondents	41	74.55
Voting Members	55	
Non-voting commenters	3	
Number of Commenters	11	
Number of Comments	166	
TR	53	
T	13	
ER	14	
E	87	

Comments by Category - 1

- ❑ In what follows, grouped comments are shown together in parentheses
 - ❑ On this and following pages, finalized comments are highlighted in yellow
 - ❑ Editorial Comments (Category E or ER) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial (90 comments)
 - Several exceptions included – comments that were marked T or TR that, in the opinion of the editor, should have been E or ER
 - All the following comments will be accepted or accepted in principle, and will not be discussed unless someone indicates a desire to discuss them
 - (1, 2, 3), 4, 5, (6, 84, 121 (TR)), (7, 66 (TR)), 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 21, (22, 81 (TR)), 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, (37, 132), 38, 39, 40, 41, 42, 43, 44, 45, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52 (TR), 58, 59 (TR), 60 (TR), 65 (TR), (68 (TR), 123), 69, 72 (TR), 73 (TR), 74 (TR), 75 (TR), 76 (TR), (77 (TR), 128 (TR)), 79 (TR), (80 (TR), 129), 82 (TR), 110, 111, 113, 114, 115, 116, 118, 119, 120, 122, 124, 127, 131, 133, 140, 143, (151, 152), 158
 - ❑ The comments on the following pages will be discussed.
 - Note that many of the ones marked E or ER are nontrivial and must be discussed in detail (even though they are marked E or ER)
 - Note that the listed topics are not necessarily full descriptions of the comments; they are mainly to aid the editor in the comment resolution
-

Comments by Category - 2

□ Other Editorial Comments, to be discussed (29 comments total, 3 remaining as of 5/31/2018):

- References: 19, 20
- End station versus endstation versus endpoint: 46, 89, 105, 106, 107
- Unused annexes: 64
- Use of “Std”: 67, 108, 137
- Forwardable 1588 TLVs: 78
- Indication of definitions that are from other standards: 102
- RNSS: 109
- Type versus member: 117
- 1/0 versus TRUE/FALSE: 130
- Location of frontmatter items still to be added to draft: 138
- Subclause where timeout definitions should go: 154, 155
- Format for definitions of global variables: 164, 165
- Misc items: 85, 101, 103, 104, 139, 146, 153, 157

Comments by Category - 3

□ Technical (T) and Technical Required (TR) Comments; will be discussed (47 comments total, 12 remaining as of 5/31/2018)

- Use of UScaledNs for certain variables: 70, 71
- Need to use “externalPortConfigurationEnabled”: 97, 125
- PortStateSettingExt state machine: 98, 99
- How to change message rate when an unsupported value is requested: 54, 55, 56, 57
- Control of computation of neighborRateRatio and meanLinkDelay: 86, 87
- Adding domainNumber and sdold to EPON TIMESYNC message: 83, 141, 142
- currentUtcOffset, leap seconds, and POSIX algorithm: 147, 148, 149, 150
- Addition of pointers as arguments in setPdelayResp() and setPdelayRespFollowUp() functions: 159, 160, 161, 163
- Illustration of generic delay measurement in Figure 7-7: 47
- Location of certain subclauses: 53, 61
- Maintaining draft information on p.1: 62
- Completion of remaining frontmatter items: 63
- initPdelayRespReceived in MDPdelayReq state machine: 88
- recordOtherAnnouceInfo() in PortAnnounceInformation state machine: 90

Comments by Category - 3

□ Technical (T) and Technical Required (TR) Comments; will be discussed (cont.)

- Conformance item relating to B.1, B.2.4, and 10.8: 91
- Conformance item related to interval setting state machines: 92
- Conformance column of management tables: 93
- Items pertaining to desiredState in External Port Configuration: 94, 100
- Status of MIB: 95
- Conformance item related to best master selection and external port state configuration being mandatory versus optional: 96
- Scope of the global variable delayAsymmetry: 134
- Whether to allow ARB in domain 0: 136
- Definition of PTP Link: 144
- Use of “one-step” and “two-step” to refer to ports versus clocks: 145
- Typedef for spanning tree priority vector: 156
- Use of clock multiplier hardware to syntonizer at the physical layer: 166
- Misc items: 112, 126, 135, 162