P802.1AS-Rev/D7.3
Editor's Report

Proposed Comment Resolution for WG Ballot

Geoffrey M. Garner
Huawei (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG
2018.09.10

Ballot Statistics

□Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Yes (voters)	32	94.12
No (voters)	2	5.88
Voting Yes or No	34	100
Abstain Time	3	
Abstain Expertise	6	
Abstain Total	9	20.93
Respondents	43	78.18
Voting Members	55	
Non-voting commenters	4	
Number of Commenters	6	
Number of Comments	80	
TR	19	
T	3	
ER	20	
E	38	

Comments by Category - 1

❑In what follows, grouped comments are shown together in parentheses

❑Editorial Comments (Category E or ER) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial (41 comments)

▪All the following comments will be accepted or accepted in principle, and will not be discussed unless someone indicates a desire to discuss them

•28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 38, 39, 40, 41, 42, 43, 44, 45, 46, 47, 48, 49, 50, 51, 53, 54, 55, 57, 58, 59, 61, 62, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68,70, 74, 77, 79

❑The comments on the following pages will be discussed.

▪Note that many of the ones marked E or ER either are nontrivial or require decisions, and must be discussed in detail (even though they are marked E or ER)

▪Note that the listed topics are not necessarily full descriptions of the comments; they are mainly to aid the editor in the comment resolution

Comments by Category - 2

❑Other Editorial Comments, to be discussed (13 comments):

- Counting TM or FTM frames for managed object: 60

- Making cross reference format consistent across the document: 2

- Listing 1588 new optional features: 76

- Removal of track changes in next draft (and providing track changes in a separate document), cleanup of draft status on cover page: 19, 27

- Table of contents does not handle track changes well: 23, 71, 72

- Format for function name with list, and for other instances of a word followed by an open parenthesis: 37

- Making a NOTE a table NOTE: 56

- Referring separately to "messages" and "protocol": 69

- Referring to the BMCA and the synchronization spanning tree: 78, 80

Comments by Category - 3

❑ Technical (T) and Technical Required (TR) Comments, plus a few grouped E and ER comments; will be discussed (26 comments)

- Handling TLVs that are forwardable in 1588-Rev: 3, 4, 21, 26

- Referencing 1588-20xx and handling editor's notes that relate to 1588-20xx; general handling of the removal of non-essential editor's notes: 9, 18, 25, 73

- Cleaning up inconsistent terminology: 6

- Removal of bibliography reference [B3]: 1

- Incorrect use of asCapableAcrossDomains when CMLDS is not used: 5

- Whether TM and FTM should be mandatory or optional: 8

- Making editor's note on pdelayTruncatedTimestampsArray a note: 7

- Adding cross-references in subclause that describes syncSlowdown, to respective subclauses of clauses11, 12, and 13: 10

- Making data types for lastAnnouncePort, numberPorts, and thisPort consistent: 11

- Addressing an editor's note that asks in item should be added to maintenance data base: 12

- Range and default value for gPtpCapableReceiptTimeout: 13

- Data type for nframesSent (for state machines relating to WiFi transport): 14

- Informative annex or reference for computation of FTM parameter values: 15

Comments by Category - 4

❑ Technical (T) and Technical Required (TR) Comments; will be discussed (cont.)

- Use of the term "system time": 16
- MTIE mask in Annex B for femtocell application: 17
- Addition of 802.1AS-Cor2 to draft status paragraph: 20
- Completion of work on MIB and addition of MIB to draft: 22
- Duration of the second in the ARB timescale: 24
- Conversion of an Editor's Note to a Note in subclauses of clause 14 that describe the 'useMgtSettable' variables: 52