Editor's Report 60802 Draft 0.5

January, 2019 IEEE802 Interim, Hiroshima



Jordon Woods, Analog Devices

Outline

CONTENTS

FOREWORD										
INTRODUCTION										
1	Scope									
2	Norm	ative references								
3	Term	s, definitions, symbols and abbreviated terms								
	3.1	TSN-IA defined Terms								
	3.2	List of terms and definitions given in IEC 61784-2, IEEE 802, IEEE 802.3, IEEE 802.1Q and IEEE 802.1AS								
	3.3	Abbreviated terms and acronyms								
	3.4	Conventions								
	3.4.1	Conventions for (sub)clause selections of referenced documents								
	3.4.2	Convention for Capitalizations								
Sequence.										
4	Over	view of TSN in Industrial Automation								
	4.1	Control Loop Basic Model								
	4.2	Industrial Traffic Types								
5	Confe	Conformance								
	5.1	Requirements Terminology								
	5.2	Profile Conformance Statement (PCS)								
6	Requ	ired Functions for an Industrial Network								
	6.1	PHY and MAC selection								
	6.1.1	General								
	6.1.2	IEEE 802.3-2015 Selections								
	6.2	IEEE 802.1 selection								
	6.2.1	General								
	6.2.2	3								
	6.2.3	11								
	6.2.4									
	6.2.5									
	6.2.6	ů .								
	6.3	Other profiles								
	6.4	Bridge delay requirements								
	6.5	Network access								
	6.6	Bridge FDB requirements								
	6.7	Bridge resource requirements								
	6.8	Quantities								
	6.9	Management selection								
	6.9.1									
7	6.9.2	Protocolsview of the Profiles								
An	Annex A PCS proforma – Time-sensitive networking profile for industrial automation									
	A.1	Introduction								
	A.2	Abbreviations and special symbols								
	A.2.1									
	A.2.2	General abbreviations								

Changes since last editor's report

- Since the report provided during 11/2018 IEEE Plenary Meeting in Bangkok:
 - http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/60802-woods-D04upadate-1018-v00.pdf
- Section 6 Required Functions for an Industrial network.
 - Completed standards-based view of required functions
 - Moved the "quantities" proposal back to section 6 based upon feedback in Bangkok.
 - Removed Device classes
- Annex A PCS proforma
 - Initial cut of PCS proforma complete

Section 6

- Removed Table 4 Device Classes
 - Found that mandatory features and optional features were identical between the bridge and the constrained bridge.
 - The editor believes that the correct place for this distinction would be in the PCS Proforma and considers this part of the on-going discussion regarding the "quantities" proposal.
- Moved the "quantities" text from Annex A back to section 6 based upon feedback in Bangkok
 - Current Proposal for quantities:
 - Define the relevant normative parameters;
 - Giving quantities is mandatory for conformance;
 - Define the required quantities for a limited set of different classes (optional);
 - Allow "wildcard" numbers for the defined parameters.
 - Align terminology (talker/producer, network diameter)

Annex A – PCS Proforma

• Included an initial contribution for the PCS Proforma:

A.4 C	Common requirements	
A.4.1	Implementation identification	
A.4.2	Profile summary, IEC/IEEE 60802	
A.4.3	Implementation type	
A.4.4	Common requirements— PHY and MAC	
A.4.5	Common requirements— Bridges	
A.4.6	Major capabilities—Bridges	
A.4.7	IEEE Std 802.1Q requirements—Bridges	
A.4.8	Time Synchronization Requirements	
A.4.9	Security Requirements	

Other Gaps (from Annex Z)

- 1. Regular synchronization of .1Qbv "tick" event to the 802.1AS-Rev clock
- 2. Distributed and Centralized model "UNI" may need to be expanded.
- 3. Need mechanism for identifying "In-sync" and "out of Sync" for all time-aware systems in the network.
- 4. Network diagnostic base on Gunter's contribution.
- 5. Synchronization base on Gunter's contribution.
- 6. Defined range of destination MAC address, do we get our own OUI
- 7. Do we need a standardized TLV for LLDP to identify the TSN domain
- 8. Do we need a section to distinguish between constrained devices vs other devices?
- 9. Management Reconciliation
 - http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/60802-Steindl-Configuration-0718-v02.pdf
- 10. Need to identify network management access protocols and select data models for management.
- 11. Bridge FDB and resource requirements
- 12. Define procedures to implement hot-stand-by masters.
- 13. Do we need an IEC/IEEE translation dictionary?
- 14. Reference style IEC guides in the profile.
- 15. Editor's note: Do we need a different class of device for constrained devices (two-port mac relays for instance) or a separate profile? (Table 12-24 in 802.1Q-2018 has an example of how this might be done)?
- 16. Do we need to specify link aggregation in support of event-based control?
 - http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/60802-stanica-event-based-control-1118-v02.pdf
 - http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/60802-stanica-link-aggregation-1118-v02.pdf
- 17. How do we deal with destination MAC address constraints
 - http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/public/docs2018/60802-Steindl-DaMacConstraints-0718-v02.pdf

Next Steps

- The editor wishes to move the current draft (D0.5) to task group ballot
 - Suggestions and comments are getting increasingly difficult to track
 - Need a better means to document consensus
 - Therefore, a more formal comment resolution is required.
- A reminder: task group ballot will follow IEEE process
 - This means all comments must be submitted per the ballot instructions
 - All comments must be submitted on the appropriate comment form:

http://www.ieee802.org/1/files/private/commenting-tool/MyBallot-tools/

Ballot Form (example)

	Α	В	С	D	E	F	G					
1		Task Force Review and Working Group Ballot comment input form										
2	First name				Surname	Affiliation	Phone					
3	Jordon				Woods	Analog Devices Inc.						
4	Click on column headers for help											
5	Category	Page	Sub-clause	Line #	Comment	Proposed Change	Must Be Satisfied					
6	Editorial	13	6.1.1	238	TBD should be an editor's note	Resolve the question or change to an editor's note	Yes					
7	Technical	13	6.1.2	244	In table 8, the contraint "Applies only if 6.1.1fulfilled" is non-specific.	As 6.1.1 is mandatory in the sense that one PHY must be selected, the constrain should be changed to "applies only if this PHY is selected"	Yes					
8	Technical	14	6.1.2	246	In table 9, the contraint "Applies only if 6.1.1fulfilled" is non-specific.	As 6.1.1 is mandatory in the sense that one PHY must be selected, the constrain should be changed to "applies only if this PHY is selected"	Yes					
9	Technical	19	6.2.4.4	328	The maximum number of hops in a network is not a bridge or end station requirement.	Either remove the text or change the language to indicate that the text/table is informative	Yes					
10 11	Technical	22	6.4	371	Table 22 indicates bridge delay is measure MII to MII. Figure 2 seems to indicate bridge delay is measure from time on the wire.	Update figure or table to be consistent.	Yes					

Thank you