P802.1AS-Rev/D8.0 Editor's Report

Proposed Comment Resolution for Sponsor Ballot

Geoffrey M. Garner
Huawei (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG

2019.03.11

Ballot Statistics

❑Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Yes (voters)	102	87 (87.93)
No (voters)	14	12.07
Voting Yes or No	116	100
Abstain Time	5	
Abstain Expertise	2	
Abstain Total	7	5.69
Respondents	123	75.93
Voting Members	162	
Non-voting commenters	0	
Number of Commenters	25 (11 voted No)	
Number of Comments	421	
TR	108	
T	16	
ER	22	
E	57	
GR	196	
G	22	

Comments Done So Far and Grouped Comments

❑Comments resolved in 2019-03-04 TSN call (22 comments):

- 421, 1, 363, 364, 319, 320, 321, 322, 323, 327, 328, 329, 330, 331, 332, 333, 334, 335, 338, 341, 349, 8

❑Grouped comments:

- Referencing 802.1 presentations: 3, 4

- Definitions of precision and accuracy: 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 266, 370, 371

- Hyperlinking list items: 345, 347, 348, 359

- Superscript for 2^{-16} : 355, 356, 357, 358

- Put definitions from 1588 in a separate subclause: 387, 388, 389, 393

- PTP Link and PTP Port: 264, 391

- PTP Instance definition: 247, 390

- Font sizes in figures: 340 (and possibly others)

- Acronyms MA-L, MA-S, MA-M: 51, 279

- Replace the word "slave" with an equivalent word: 31 – 47, 52 – 226 (192 comments)

- syncLocked and +/- 1 s accuracy for originTimestamp and preciseOriginTimestamp fields, in 1588: 282, 283, 284

Grouped Comments - 2

❑ Grouped comments:

- Figures not in sections where referenced: 402, 403 (note that 2 comments done in 32019-03-04 call also were on this topic)

- "Detection, Correction, Action" in discussion of redundancy: 401, 244, 245

- Wrong use of "may": 15, 16, 336, 337, 231, 17, 18, 19

- Add new figures to Clause 7: 404, 405

- Referencing 1588 (both 2011 and Rev): 5, 375, 376, 377

- ISS Priority for PTP messages: 30, 317, 318, 29

- Typo (missing space): 383, 21; 373, 229 (2 different places)

- Several distinct topics that are referenced by related comments:
  - tlvType should be ORGANIZATION_EXTENSION_DO_NOT_PROPAGATE: 257, 406
  - Making Table 10-6 consistent with IEEE 1588-Rev: 242, 250, 266
  - Domain 0; TLV forwarding: 265, 233, 407

- EPON referencing construction of sourcePortIdentity incorrectly: 48, 277

- RAC comments and related comments: 49, 280

- RAC comments and related comments: 19, 50, 279

- Editorial – delete strikethroughs: 16, 259, 235, 260

Grouped Comments - 2

❑Grouped comments:

- Wrong data types in Table 14-10: 234, 298, 299, 301, 302, 305

- Remove subclause 14.15.3 on sdoId: 241, 309

- Rewording certain subclauses of Clause 14 to make it clear that the respective managed objects are RW and not R: 303, 304, 306, 307, 308, 312, 313, 314, 315

- Logic in state machines that set rates on receiving a Signaling Message with a TLV: 409, 412, 410, 411, 413