This provides responses to comments JTC1 ballot of IEEE 802.1Q-2018 (revision to ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1Q:2016).

The voting results on IEEE 802.1Q-2018 (revision to ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1Q:2016):
- Support need for ISO standard? Passed 10/0/8
- Support this submission being sent to FDIS? 8/1/9
- 1 comment with the China NB NO vote and 1 comment with the Canada NB YES vote.

The comments have been processed in a timely manner using the mechanisms defined and agreed in 6N15606. This document provides the responses from IEEE 802 to the comment by China NB on this ballot.

China NB comment 1 on IEEE 802.1Q-2018 (revision to ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1Q:2016):

IEEE 802.1Q-2018 is IEEE 802.1Q-2014 as amended by its 7 amendments and 1 corrigendum.

Regarding IEEE 802.1Q-2014 project, China NB has already submitted the comments during its 60-day ballot and FDIS ballot against the references to IEEE 802.1X, which has security problems such as "cannot achieve the real mutual authentication between the Supplicant and Authenticator", etc.

However, there is no further steps taken in this new 2018 version to resolve those comments. IEEE 802.1X is still the normative reference in IEEE 802.1Q-2018 and IEEE 802.1X is used in Clause 8.13.9, 10.1, 25.2 etc.

Therefore, China NB cannot support submission of IEEE 802.1Q-2018 for FDIS ballot.

Proposed Change:

(none)

IEEE 802 response to CN.1 on IEEE 802.1Q-2018 (revision to ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1Q:2016):

IEEE 802.1Q-2018 is the revision to IEEE 802.1Q-2014 (ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1Q:2016) incorporating the approved amendments to the base standard.

As was stated in the earlier responses to the IEEE Std 802.1Q-2014 ballot comments from China NB, IEEE Std 802.1Q explains how it can be used in conjunction with IEEE Std 802.1X (approved as ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1X:2013). IEEE Std 802.1Q is not based on nor does it depend on the use of IEEE Std 802.1X-2010. It is provided as an illustrative example to provide additional security through port-based network access control. Specifically, IEEE 802.1X may be used to provide a further level of control over the connectivity provided by a Bridge Port to the MAC Relay Entity and the Higher Layer Entities within a Bridge. It is unnecessary to remove the IEEE 802.1X-2010-related descriptions and reference from the text.

We also refer China NB to our previous rebuttals of similar claims of defects in IEEE Std 802.1X-2010 (ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1X:2013).

Canada NB comment 1 on IEEE 802.1Q-2018 (revision to ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1Q:2016):

Canada welcomes this update to ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1Q:2016

IEEE 802 response to CA.1 on IEEE 802.1Q-2018 (revision to ISO/IEC/IEEE 8802-1Q:2016):

IEEE 802 thanks Canada NB.