Maintenance Task Group Conference Call

March 10, 2020
Paul Congdon

Maintenance Task Group Meeting
January 21, 2020 – 8AM
Agenda

- Patents and Guidelines

- Attendees

- Responses to comments received on the JTC1 ballot of IEEE 802.1AR-2018 – Karen Randall

- Document Vehicle Status
    - Existing Maintenance items
    - 0251 – 802.1Q-2018 Figure 8-13 missing stream_handle – Discussion – Johannes Specht
    - 0248 – Managed objects for ECP in 802.1Q-2018
    - 0247 – 802.1Qcp-2018: Missing copyright release for YANG modules.
    - 0246 – IEEE Std 802.1Q-2018: Color-aware flow meters are color-blind – Discussion – Johannes Specht
    - YANGsters to discuss – 0242 – IEEE Std 802.1Qcp-2018: Collected issues on data consistency and others

- EPD/LPD change proposal – Roger Marks

- New Maintenance items
    - 0254 – 802.1Q-2018 5.4 VLAN Bridge Component Requirements item p)
    - 0255 – 802.1CB-2017 7.4.1.3 SequenceGenerationReset
    - 0256 – 802.1CB-2017, 7.4.3 Base recovery function
    - 0257 – 802.1CB-2017, 7.4.3.4 VectorRecoveryAlgorithm

Instructions for Chairs of standards development activities

□ **At the beginning of each standards development meeting the chair or a designee is to:**

☐ Show the following slides (or provide them beforehand)

☐ Advise the standards development group participants that:

☐ IEEE SA's copyright policy is described in Clause 7 of the IEEE SA Standards Board Bylaws and Clause 6.1 of the IEEE SA Standards Board Operations Manual;

☐ Any material submitted during standards development, whether verbal, recorded, or in written form, is a Contribution and shall comply with the IEEE SA Copyright Policy;

☐ Instruct the Secretary to record in the minutes of the relevant meeting:

☐ That the foregoing information was provided and that the copyright slides were shown (or provided beforehand).

IEEE SA Copyright Policy

- **By participating in this activity, you agree to comply with the IEEE Code of Ethics, all applicable laws, and all IEEE policies and procedures including, but not limited to, the IEEE SA Copyright Policy.**

    - ☐ Previously Published material (copyright assertion indicated) shall not be presented/submitted to the Working Group nor incorporated into a Working Group draft unless permission is granted.

    - ☐ Prior to presentation or submission, you shall notify the Working Group Chair of previously Published material and should assist the Chair in obtaining copyright permission acceptable to IEEE SA.

    - ☐ For material that is not previously Published, IEEE is automatically granted a license to use any material that is presented or submitted.

IEEE SA Copyright Policy

☐ The IEEE SA Copyright Policy is described in the IEEE SA Standards Board Bylaws and IEEE SA Standards Board Operations Manual

- IEEE SA Copyright Policy, see
    Clause 7 of the IEEE SA Standards Board Bylaws
    https://standards.ieee.org/about/policies/bylaws/sect6-7.html#7
    Clause 6.1 of the IEEE SA Standards Board Operations Manual
    https://standards.ieee.org/about/policies/opman/sect6.html

☐ IEEE SA Copyright Permission
- https://standards.ieee.org/content/dam/ieee-standards/standards/web/documents/other/permissionltrs.zip

☐ IEEE SA Copyright FAQs
- http://standards.ieee.org/faqs/copyrights.html/
☐ IEEE SA Best Practices for IEEE Standards Development
- http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/best_practices_for_ieee_standards_development_051215.pdf

☐ Distribution of Draft Standards (see 6.1.3 of the SASB Operations Manual)
- https://standards.ieee.org/about/policies/opman/sect6.html

Instructions for the WG Chair

The IEEE-SA strongly recommends that at each WG meeting the chair or a designee:

- **Show slides #1 through #4 of this presentation**
- **Advise the WG attendees that:**
  - IEEE's patent policy is described in Clause 6 of the *IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws*;
  - Early identification of patent claims which may be essential for the use of standards under development is strongly encouraged;
  - There may be Essential Patent Claims of which IEEE is not aware. Additionally, neither IEEE, the WG, nor the WG Chair can ensure the accuracy or completeness of any assurance or whether any such assurance is, in fact, of a Patent Claim that is essential for the use of the standard under development.

- **Instruct the WG Secretary to record in the minutes of the relevant WG meeting:**
  - That the foregoing information was provided and that slides 1 through 4 (and this slide 0, if applicable) were shown;
  - That the chair or designee provided an opportunity for participants to identify patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) of which the participant is personally aware and that may be essential for the use of that standard
  - Any responses that were given, specifically the patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) and/or the holder of the patent claim(s)/patent application claim(s) that were identified (if any) and by whom.

- The WG Chair shall ensure that a request is made to any identified holders of potential essential patent claim(s) to complete and submit a Letter of Assurance.
- It is recommended that the WG Chair review the guidance in *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual* 6.3.5 and in FAQs 14 and 15 on inclusion of potential Essential Patent Claims by incorporation or by reference.

  Note: **WG** includes Working Groups, Task Groups, and other standards-developing committees with a PAR approved by the IEEE-SA Standards Board.

(Optional to be shown)

Participants have a duty to inform the IEEE

- **Participants <u>shall</u> inform the IEEE (or cause the IEEE to be informed) of the identity of each holder of any potential Essential Patent Claims of which they are personally aware if the claims are owned or controlled by the participant or the entity the participant is from, employed by, or otherwise represents**

- **Participants <u>should</u> inform the IEEE (or cause the IEEE to be informed) of the identity of any other holders of potential Essential Patent Claims**

Early identification of holders of potential Essential Patent Claims is encouraged

Ways to inform IEEE

- **Cause an LOA to be submitted to the IEEE-SA (patcom@ieee.org); or**

- **Provide the chair of this group with the identity of the holder(s) of any and all such claims as soon as possible; or**

- **Speak up now and respond to this Call for Potentially Essential Patents**

If anyone in this meeting is personally aware of the holder of any patent claims that are potentially essential to implementation of the proposed standard(s) under consideration by this group and that are not already the subject of an Accepted Letter of Assurance, please respond at this time by providing relevant information to the WG Chair

Other guidelines for IEEE WG meetings

- **All IEEE-SA standards meetings shall be conducted in compliance with all applicable laws, including antitrust and competition laws.**

    - **Don't discuss the interpretation, validity, or essentiality of patents/patent claims.**

    - **Don't discuss specific license rates, terms, or conditions.**

        - Relative costs of different technical approaches that include relative costs of patent licensing terms may be discussed in standards development meetings.

            - **Technical considerations remain the primary focus**

    - **Don't discuss or engage in the fixing of product prices, allocation of customers, or division of sales markets.**

    - **Don't discuss the status or substance of ongoing or threatened litigation.**

    - **Don't be silent if inappropriate topics are discussed … do formally object.**

    For more details, see *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual*, clause 5.3.10 and *Antitrust and Competition Policy: What You Need to Know* at http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/antitrust.pdf

Patent-related information

The patent policy and the procedures used to execute that policy are documented in the:

- *IEEE-SA Standards Board Bylaws*
  (http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/bylaws/sect6-7.html#6)

- *IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual*
  (http://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/opman/sect6.html#6.3)

Material about the patent policy is available at
http://standards.ieee.org/about/sasb/patcom/materials.html

If you have questions, contact the IEEE-SA Standards Board Patent Committee Administrator at patcom@ieee.org

Participation in IEEE 802 Meetings

Participation in any IEEE 802 meeting (Sponsor, Sponsor subgroup, Working Group, Working Group subgroup, etc.) is on an individual basis

- **Participants in the IEEE standards development individual process shall act based on their qualifications and experience. (https://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/bylaws/sb_bylaws.pdf section 5.2.1)**

- **IEEE 802 Working Group membership is by individual; "Working Group members shall participate in the consensus process in a manner consistent with their professional expert opinion as individuals, and not as organizational representatives". (subclause 4.2.1 "Establishment", of the IEEE 802 LMSC Working Group Policies and Procedures)**

- **Participants have an obligation to act and vote as an individual and not under the direction of any other individual or group. A Participant's obligation to act and vote as an individual applies in all cases, regardless of any external commitments, agreements, contracts, or orders.**

- **Participants shall not direct the actions or votes of any other member of an IEEE 802 Working Group or retaliate against any other member for their actions or votes within IEEE 802 Working Group meetings, see https://standards.ieee.org/develop/policies/bylaws/sb_bylaws.pdf section 5.2.1.3 and the IEEE 802 LMSC Working Group Policies and Procedures, subclause 3.4.1 "Chair", list item x.**

By participating in IEEE 802 meetings, you accept these requirements. If you do not agree to these policies then you shall not participate.

(Latest revision of IEEE 802 LMSC Working Group Policies and Procedures: http://www.ieee802.org/devdocs.shtml)

Brief Status Update

- Maintenance database site issues resolved – current status believe to be accurate: https://www.802-1.org/

- Current Document Vehicles for open items
    - 802.1AS-2020 was approved Jan 30th. Waiting for publication.
    - 802.1ABcu/D1.0 WG ballot completed Jan 13th. Editor is preparing next draft.
    - 802.1Qcw/D1.0 WG ballot completed Jan 13th. Editor is preparing next draft.
    - 802.1Qcr/D2.0 SA ballot to completed Jan 16th.
    - 802.1Qcx/D2.1 SA recirc ballot complete. Comment resolution completed on March 9th
    - 802.1CBdb/D0.5 TG ballot completed March 6th. Comment resolution to begin on March conference calls
    - 802.1CMde/D2.1 SA recirc ballot complete. Comment resolution completed on March 9th
    - 802.1AE-Cor/D1.0 passed SA ballot, 100% approval, no comments.

- Open Items awaiting document vehicles
    - 0170 – waiting for 802.1BA
    - 0174 – waiting for 802.1AC
    - 0210, 0243 – waiting for 802.1DC to go to Sponsor ballot to update 802.1Q
    - 0237 – waiting for 802

802.1 Maintenance Status

Category	Count
Approved	0
Ready for Ballot	1
Complete then Ballot	11
Complete then Errata	0
Errata	0
Failed	0
Incomplete	0
Rejected	38
Published	132
Received	4
Errata Sheet Published	0
Technical experts review	5
Balloting	31
Withdrawn	2

Responses to comments received on the JTC1 ballot of IEEE 802.1AR-2018

- Karen Randall - Discussion

Existing Maintenence Items

- All existing open maintenance items are included here, **except** items which are in "balloting" state already, as those aren't really interesting to track.

- Task force chairs and editors: have you decided in your groups not to change something which is covered by a Maintenance item? If so, you please ensure you bring this to the attention of the Maintenance Task Group.

Review 802.1 Maintenance Items

Number	Status	Submitted	Standard	Clause	Subject	Draft with fix
0170	Ready for Ballot	2016-05-16	802.1BA-2011	7.3.5	References to other standards in 802.1BA-2011	
0174	Complete then Ballot	2016-11-08	802.1AC-2016	2	802.1AC: IEEE 802.17 has been withdrawn	
0210	Complete then Ballot	2018-09-11	IEEE Std 802.1Q-2018	43.3.3.4	ECP protocol code point for P802.1CS needed in 802.1Q-2018	
0230	Technical experts review	2019-06-06	802.1Qcp-2018	48.6.3.2	802.1Qcp-2018 maintenance: Incorrect traffic-class-table-grouping	
0232	Technical experts review	2019-07-17	IEEE Std 802.1Q-2018	Appendix A	Maintenance requires: PICS inconsistent in 802.1Q-2018	
0237	Complete then Ballot	2019-08-16	IEEE Std 802-2014	8.2.2	802.1 Maintenance request: IEEE Std 802	
0242	Technical experts review	2019-09-16	IEEE Std 802.1Qcp-2018	48	IEEE Std 802.1Qcp-2018: Collected issues on data consistency and others	
0244	Complete then Ballot	2019-10-14	IEEE Std 802.1Q-2018	5.4.1.6	Minor maintenance item for 802.1Q	
0245	Complete then Ballot	2019-10-14	IEEE Std 802.1Q-2018	5.4.1	RESEND Another small maintenance item for 802.1Q-2018	
0246	Technical experts review	2019-10-31	IEEE 802.1Q-2018	8.6.5.1.3	IEEE Std 802.1Q-2018: Color-aware flow meters are color-blind	

Review 802.1 Maintenance Items

Number	Status	Submitted	Standard	Clause	Subject	Draft with fix
0247	Technical experts review	2019-11-13	IEEE Std 802.1Qcp	48.6.3	802.1Qcp-2018: Missing copyright release for YANG modules	
0248	Technical experts review	2019-11-12	IEEE Std 802.1Q-2018	12.26	Managed objects for ECP in 802.1Q-2018	
0249	Complete then Ballot	2019-11-14	IEEE Std 802.1Qcc-2018	46.2.3.5.2 and others	Ambiguity in 802.1Qcc TSpec parameter MaxFramesPerInterval	
0250	Complete then Ballot	2020-01-14	802.1Q-2018	8.6.5	802-1Q-2018 clause 8.6.5 NOTE 3	
0251	Technical experts review	2020-01-14	802.1Q-2018	8.6.5.1	802.1Q-2018 Figure 8-13 missing stream_handle	
0252	Complete then Ballot	2020-01-15	802.1Q-2018	17	802.1Q-2018 Clause 17 MIB	
0253	Complete then Ballot	2020-01-21	IEEE Std 802.1Q-2018	F.1.3.2	Incorrect spelling of Bridge	
0254	Received	2020-01-24	IEEE Std 802.1Q	5.4	802.1Q-2018 5.4 VLAN Bridge Component Requirements item p)	
0255	Received	2020-03-02	802.1CB-2017	7.4.1.3	802.1CB-2017 7.4.1.3 SequenceGenerationReset	
0256	Received	2020-03-02	802.1CB-2017	7.4.3	802.1CB-2017, 7.4.3 Base recovery function	

Review 802.1 Maintenance Items

Number	Status	Submitted	Standard	Clause	Subject	Draft with fix
0257	Received	2020-03-02	802.1CB-2017	7.4.3.4	802.1CB-2017, 7.4.3.4 VectorRecoveryAlgorithm	

Items for Discussion

- [0251](#) – 802.1Q-2018 Figure 8-13 missing stream_handle
  - [Discussion](#) – Johannes Specht
- [0248](#) – Managed objects for ECP in 802.1Q-2018
- [0247](#) – 802.1Qcp-2018: Missing copyright release for YANG modules.
- [0246](#) – IEEE Std 802.1Q-2018: Color-aware flow meters are color-blind
  - [Discussion](#) – Johannes Specht
- YANGsters to discuss – [0242](#) – IEEE Std 802.1Qcp-2018: Collected issues on data consistency and others

EPD/LPD Change Proposal

- Roger Marks - Discussion

NEW MAINTENANCE ITEMS

- 0254 – 802.1Q-2018 5.4 VLAN Bridge Component Requirements item p)
- 0255 – 802.1CB-2017 7.4.1.3 SequenceGenerationReset
- 0256 – 802.1CB-2017, 7.4.3 Base recovery function
- 0257 – 802.1CB-2017, 7.4.3.4 VectorRecoveryAlgorithm