P802.1ASdm-Rev/D0.2
Editor's Report

Proposed Comment Resolution for TG Ballot

Version 4

Geoffrey M. Garner
Huawei (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG

2021.05.10

Ballot Statistics

☐Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Yes (voters)	8	40.00
No (voters)	12	60.00
Voting Yes or No	20	100
Abstain Time	3	
Abstain Expertise	9	
Abstain Total	12	37.5
Respondents	33	
Voting Members	32	100
Non-voting member commenters	1 (voted no)	
Number of Commenters	18	
Number of Comments	148	
TR	55	
T	6	
ER	67	
E	20	

Comments by Category - 1

❑In what follows, grouped comments are shown together in parentheses

❑Editorial Comments (Category E or ER) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial (35 comments)

- All the following comments will be accepted or accepted in principle, and will not be discussed unless someone indicates a desire to discuss them (they will be left in proposed mode for an adequate time period for participants to review them)

  - (6, 110), (7, 40, 111), 23, 24, 25, 29, 30, (31, 62, 119), 35, (36, 55, 76), (39, 78),41, 43, (51, 52, 53, 61, 63), 58, 59, 60, 74, 90, 105, 130, 145, 146,

❑The comments on the following pages will be discussed.

- Note that many of the ones marked E or ER are nontrivial and must be discussed in detail (even though they are marked E or ER)

- Note that the listed topics are not necessarily full descriptions of the comments; they are mainly to aid the editor in the comment resolution

Comments by Category - 2

❑ Comments to be discussed (113 comments):

- Why is the scope changing: (1, 73, 85)

- Why are maintenance items not in Cor1: 2

- Elimination of references to 60802: (3, 100)

- Event message terminology, event messages in HotStandbySystem state machine, and criteria for isCapable transition from TRUE to FALSE : (4, 12, 79, 80)

- syncReceiptTimeoutTime: (5, 71)

- Subclause organization: (8, 9, 21, 72, 136)

- Why must all available ports be asCapable for isCapable to be TRUE: 10

- Criteria for SYNCED and NOT_QUALITY: (11, 14, 17, 57, 64, 103)

- slaveP changing to/from -1 in HotStandbySystem state machine: 13

- Nomenclature – "HotStandby" instead of "60802": (15, 19, 42, 65, 68, 69, 70, 86, 87, 94, 99, 112, 121, 122, 124, 125, 126, 132)

- References to global variables in state machines, instead of managed objects: (16, 22, 67, 102)

- Use of italics for hot standby related names: 18, 66, 96, 104, 116, 123

Comments by Category - 3

❑Comments to be discussed (Cont.):

- Reverting via "human being" vs "external entity" vs "higher-layer entity", etc.: (20, 26, 56, 133, 134, 141)

- Use of term "timescale": 33

- Clarification of description of HotStandbySystem entity: (37, 38, 118), 144

- Split functionality (should it be included): 44

- Description of actions caused by HotStandbySystem entity in 17.12: (45, 46, 47, 48, 84)

- MIB modifications: 49

- Editing instructions to change "domain number" to "domainNumber": 50

- Errata page link: 54

- Reference to figure 10-1: 75

- Use of PTP versus gPTP: (77, 97)

- Nomenclature: FAULT versus NOT_REDUNDANT: 81

- Description of holdover: (82, 107, 113)

- Action by HotStandbySystem entity when the system is a slave and in FAULT state: 83

- Addition of hotStandbySystemReset variable: 88

- Recovery of HotStandbySystem: 89

Comments by Category - 3

❑Comments to be discussed (Cont.):

▪Addition of editor's notes to indicate changes and, where relevant, maintenance items: (91, 92, 93, 120, 129,131)

▪"Seamless" terminology: (114, 115)

▪Clarification of HotStandbyInstance: 117, 135, 137, 138, (139, 140), 142, 143

▪Addition of "N/A [ ]" to PICS: 127

▪Backward compatibility of 802.1ASdm with 802.1AS-2011: (128, 148)

▪Miscellaneous: 27, 28, 32, 34, (98, 101), 106, (108, 109), 147

▪Redrawing of figures for clarity: 95