

Re: Pre-ballot Mandatory Editorial Coordination (Pre-ballot MEC)

Dear Glenn Parsons:

I have reviewed Draft 0.4 of IEEE P802.1Q-rev™, and I have the following comments. Please note that this review has been organized into two sections and uses the “language of standards” to communicate necessary requirements (shall) of the IEEE SA standards process versus those issues that are voluntary (should) in nature.

Section I: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the ballot begins

The draft cannot be balloted or recirculated until these issues are resolved. Your Staff Liaison will review the updated draft for compliance prior to upload of the PDF for ballot.

Section II: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the final recirculation

These issues have to be resolved and viewed by balloters. The items will be checked for completion by the Project Editor during the Sponsor ballot, then checked by the Review Committee (RevCom) of the IEEE SA Standards Board (IEEE SASB), and will impact approval unless rectified.

Please note that professional editing takes place once the document has been approved and, as such, this MEC does not address all of the editorial items that will be reviewed then (i.e., punctuation, grammar, formatting).

The following comments are derived from the *IEEE Standards Style Manual*. The complete *IEEE Standards Style Manual*, in viewable/downloadable format, can be found at:

<https://development.standards.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf>

SECTION I: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the ballot begins:

Copyright

- If applicable, all copyright permission for excerpted text, tables, and figures shall be submitted to the IEEE prior to the start of ballot. If there are missing permission response letters, please submit them immediately to STDS-PERM-LTRS@IEEE.org.

Sample permission letters can be found in Annex A of the [IEEE Standards Style Manual](https://mentor.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf) or <https://mentor.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf>. More information on the IEEE SA Copyright Policy can be found at: <http://standards.ieee.org/jpr/copyright.html>

- The correct copyright statement shall appear on the first page of the standard. The statement can be found in 9.1.2 or Annex C of the [IEEE Standards Style Manual](https://mentor.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf)

SECTION II: Items/issues that shall be resolved before the final recirculation

Trademarks or service marks

- Please review the use of trademarks in the draft, if applicable. References to commercial equipment or products in a standard shall be generic and shall not include trademarks or other proprietary designations. Where a sole source exists for essential equipment or materials, it is permissible to supply the name of the trademark owner in a footnote. The proper use guidelines for trademarks shall be determined by the trademark owner. Trademark owners must grant written permission before their trademarks may be referenced in a standard.
- Trademarks or other proprietary designations that are not commercial equipment or products should be avoided in standards. If used however, all trademarks shall be credited to the trademark owner in the front matter of the standard. The following text shall introduce any mention of specific trademark information:

The following information is given for the convenience of users of this standard and does not constitute an endorsement by the IEEE of these products. Equivalent products may be used if they can be shown to lead to the same results.

For more information on commercial terms and conditions see the IEEE SA Policy on commercial terms set forth in 6.2 of the IEEE SA [Standards Board Operations Manual](#).

Registration objects

- If the draft contains a registration of objects (for additional information, visit the IEEE Standards Web site (<https://standards.ieee.org/products-services/regauth/index.html>), the working group shall submit the document to the IEEE Registration Authority (IEEE RA) for mandatory coordination (submit to a.n.thomas@ieee.org for review). The text containing the registration information should be highlighted in the draft and the clause should be noted in the email. If the working group believes that the draft may potentially contain a registration of objects or if the working group would like information about setting up a registration, contact the IEEE RA as early as possible to prevent a delay in approval by the IEEE SA Standards Board. Search on the following words: object identifier, unique identifier, and assignment of unique numbers.

Normative references

IEEE Std 802.1d-2017 is cited in the normative reference clause, however when used in text it is cited without the date. Since this is to the 2017 amendment list in text as IEEE Std 802.1d-2017 in text.

MEF Technical Specification 4 (MEF 4) is cited in the normative reference clause, however it is not cited normatively. If this specification is not needed for the implementation of the document, please remove and cite only in the Bibliography. If it is needed, please cite in text normatively.

Graphics

- Point out instances where the quality of line art and photos do not comply with the requirements outlined in Clause 14 of the [IEEE Standards Style Manual](#).
- Avoid the use of color alone to convey meaning.
- Separate electronic files of figures shall be supplied (unless created in Word or Framemaker)

Please note that the following are next steps for this project.

a) After you have implemented this review, create the pdf that will be used for ballot (remember that the draft number shall be rolled to reflect that changes have been made to this document, e.g., P1234™/Dx+1).

b) Upon completion of the invitation to ballot please follow the next steps:

Instructions:

1. Login to myProject and click the **Balloting** tab
2. Click **Initiate Sponsor Ballot**
3. Select your project from the PAR drop down list
4. Enter the **Ballot Open Date**
5. Enter the **Ballot Close Date** (should be minimum of 30 days)
6. Enter the **Draft #:** (must match the draft number in the draft)
7. **Select File for Uploading:** Click the Browse button to find your draft file. The file must be in pdf.

NOTE—Fonts shall be embedded in the draft PDF. Instructions on creating a PDF with embedded fonts can be found at: <https://standards.ieee.org/content/dam/ieee-standards/standards/web/documents/other/embeddedfonts.pdf>.

8. Review the system generated text. If you would like to add additional instruction or information, use the **Sponsor Text Area**.
9. Click **Initiate Ballot**.

c) Note that compliance with items in Section I will be reviewed by the Staff Liaison when you upload the pdf to the URL in item b). The Project Editor will not review your draft until the Ballot MEC, which occurs during the Sponsor ballot.

d) The RevCom MEC will occur after you submit the final balloted draft to RevCom. At that time you will also be required to submit the document source file. If the figures are not native Word or Framemaker graphics, each graphic shall be submitted as a separate file following the requirements outlined in Clause 14 of the [IEEE Standards Style Manual](#).

<https://mentor.ieee.org/myproject/Public/mytools/draft/styleman.pdf>

Thank you for the opportunity to review this draft. If you have any queries about the comments in this mandatory editorial coordination, please contact Michelle Turner via email (m.d.turner@ieee.org).

cc: [Jodi Haasz](#)