

# P802.1ASdm-Rev/D0.5 Editor's Report

## Proposed Comment Resolution for TG Ballot

### Version 2

**Geoffrey M. Garner**  
**Huawei (Consultant)**

[gmgarner@alum.mit.edu](mailto:gmgarner@alum.mit.edu)

*IEEE 802.1 TSN TG*  
2022.04.07

# Ballot Statistics

☐ Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Yes (voters)	8	53.33
No (voters)	7	46.67
Voting Yes or No	15	100
Abstain Time	12	
Abstain Expertise	5	
Abstain Total	17	53.125
Respondents (who are voting members)	32	38.46
Voting Members	78	100
Non-voting member commenters	2 (1 no, 1 abstain due to lack of expertise)	
Number of Commenters	10	
Number of Comments	97	
TR	54	
T	5	
ER	23	
E	15	

# Comments by Category - 1

---

- ❑ In what follows, grouped comments are shown together in parentheses; they will be discussed together
- ❑ Editorial Comments (Category E or ER) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial (21 comments)
  - All the following comments will be accepted or accepted in principle, and will not be discussed unless someone indicates a desire to discuss them (they will be left in proposed mode for an adequate time period for participants to review them)
    - 1, 2, 3, 6, 9, 15, 20, 23, 24, 25, 28, (29, 43), 35, 42, 45, 70, 73, 80, 82, 92
- ❑ The comments on the following pages will be discussed.
  - Note that many of the ones marked E or ER are nontrivial and must be discussed in detail (even though they are marked E or ER)
  - Note that the listed topics are not necessarily full descriptions of the comments; they are mainly to aid the editor in the comment resolution

# Comments by Category - 2

---

## ☐ Comments to be discussed (76 comments):

- Organization and content of 17.6.3 and its subclauses: (79, 14, 33, 51)
- Primary PTP Instance GM: (32, 47)
- Making ClockSource and ClockTarget optional: (30, 64, 31, 50, 96, 52, 16)
- Whether a HotStandbyInstance should be able to go directly to NOT\_SYNCED from INITIALIZING: (46, 77, 65)
- Fixes to several equations: 21, 83
- Definition of delayAsymmetry: 36
- Wrong variable in an equation: 37, 38
- Inclusion of maintenance items: (39, 67, 68)
- Inclusion of the MIB: (7, 40)
- Definition of holdover: 53
- Updating the definition of PTP Instance: 54
- Definition of offsetFromMaster: 63
- Hot Standby introductory material and assumptions: 57, 27, 49, 59

# Comments by Category - 3

---

## ☐ Comments to be discussed (Cont.):

- Time error and budgets: (58, 60)
- Miscellaneous comments on functions used in state machines: (84, 86), 85, 91, (75, 81)
- Nomenclature for term intervalTimer: 87
- Non-use of managed objects in state machines: (74, 90)
- Conformance statement and PICS entry needed for Hot Standby: (41, 4)
- Deletion or editing of editor's notes: 5, 7, 8, 10, 19, 76
- New managed objects: (11, 93, 95)
- Transferring timeProperties information: 18
- Description in isSynced() function: 44
- Terminology: grandmaster vs Grandmaster PTP Instance: 12
- Definition of Grandmaster PTP Instance: 13
- Correction to conformance statement: 22
- Use of the term "timescale" in Hot Standby: 26
- Failure of slave port on a PTP Instance: 97

# Comments by Category - 3

---

## □ Comments to be discussed (Cont.):

- Use of split functionality to transfer from secondary to primary: 34
- HotStandbySystem states: 48
- Different LocalClocks for different PTP Instances of a time-aware system: 88
- Use of term “revertible”: 89
- Definition of variable hotStandbySystemReset: 94
- Role of secondary PTP Instance: 55
- Separate descriptions of split functionality and transfer of time from primary to secondary at secondary GM: 56
- Determining whether a PTP Instance is synced: 61
- Case where 2 GMs each establish two Sync trees: 62
- Conformance statement related to signaling of gPTP capability: 66
- Description of meanLinkDelay for case of CMLDS: 69
- Incorrect reference:71
- Use of term “external port”:72
- HotStandby system in HOLDOVER state: 78