P802.1ASdm-Rev/D0.5
Editor's Report

Proposed Comment Resolution for TG Ballot

Version 3

Geoffrey M. Garner
Huawei (Consultant)

gmgarner@alum.mit.edu

IEEE 802.1 TSN TG
2022.04.07

Ballot Statistics

□Thanks to all who reviewed the document and commented

Category	All respondents	
	Total	Percent
Yes (voters)	8	53.33
No (voters)	7	46.67
Voting Yes or No	15	100
Abstain Time	12	
Abstain Expertise	5	
Abstain Total	17	53.125
Respondents (who are voting members)	32	38.46
Voting Members	78	100
Non-voting member commenters	2 (1 no, 1 abstain due to lack of expertise)	
Number of Commenters	10	
Number of Comments	97	
TR	54	
T	5	
ER	23	
E	15	

Comments by Category - 1

❑ In what follows, grouped comments are shown together in parentheses; they will be discussed together

❑ Editorial Comments (Category E or ER) that are, in the judgement of the editor, trivial (21 comments)

- ▪ All the following comments will be accepted or accepted in principle, and will not be discussed unless someone indicates a desire to discuss them (they will be left in proposed mode for an adequate time period for participants to review them)

  - • 1, 2, 3, 6, 9, 15, 20, 23, 24, 25, 28, (29, 43), 35, 42, 45, 70, 73, 80, 82, 92

❑ The comments on the following pages will be discussed.

- ▪ Note that many of the ones marked E or ER are nontrivial and must be discussed in detail (even though they are marked E or ER)

- ▪ Note that the listed topics are not necessarily full descriptions of the comments; they are mainly to aid the editor in the comment resolution

Comments by Category - 2

❑Comments to be discussed (76 comments):

- Organization and content of 17.6.3 and its subclauses: (79, 14, 33, 51)

- Primary PTP Instance GM: (32, 47)

- Making ClockSource and ClockTarget optional: (30, 64, 31, 50, 96, 52, 16)

- Whether a HotStandbyInstance should be able to go directly to NOT_SYNCED from INITIALIZING: (46, 77, 65)

- Fixes to several equations: 21, 83

- Definition of delayAsymmetry: 36

- Wrong variable in an equation: 37, 38

- Inclusion of maintenance items: (39, 67, 68)

- Inclusion of the MIB: (7, 40)

- Definition of holdover: 53

- Updating the definition of PTP Instance: 54

- Definition of offsetFromMaster: 63

- Hot Standby introductory material and assumptions: 57, 27, 49, 59

Comments by Category - 3

❑Comments to be discussed (Cont.):

▪Time error and budgets: (58, 60)

▪Miscellaneous comments on functions used in state machines: (84, 86),85, 91, (75, 81)

▪Nomenclature for term intervalTimer: 87

▪Non-use of managed objects in state machines: (74, 90)

▪Conformance statement and PICS entry needed for Hot Standby: (41, 4)

▪Deletion or editing of editor's notes: 5, 7, 8, 10, 19, 76

▪New managed objects: (11, 93, 95)

▪Transferring timeProperties information: 18

▪Description in isSynced() function: 44

▪Terminology: grandmaster vs Grandmaster PTP Instance: 12

▪Definition of Grandmaster PTP Instance: 13

▪Correction to conformance statement: 22

▪Use of the term "timescale" in Hot Standby: 26

▪Failure of slave port on a PTP Instance: 97

Comments by Category - 3

❑Comments to be discussed (Cont.):

- Use of split functionality to transfer from secondary to primary: <mark>34</mark>

- HotStandbySystem states: 48

- Different LocalClocks for different PTP Instances of a time-aware system: 88

- Use of term "revertible": 89

- Definition of variable hotStandbySystemReset: 94

- Role of secondary PTP Instance: 55

- Separate descriptions of split functionality and transfer of time from primary to secondary at secondary GM: 56

- Determining whether a PTP Instance is synced: 61

- Case where 2 GMs each establish two Sync trees: 62

- Conformance statement related to signaling of gPTP capability: 66

- Description of meanLinkDelay for case of CMLDS: 69

- Incorrect reference:71

- Use of term "external port":72

- HotStandby system in HOLDOVER state: 78