maint-request-haddock-figure-6-3-1111.txt

```
+----------------------------------------------------------------------+
| IEEE 802.1 REVISION REQUEST 0019                                     |
+----------------------------------------------------------------------+
```

DATE: 9/29/11
NAME: Stephen Haddock
COMPANY/AFFILIATION: Haddock Consulting LLC
E-MAIL: shaddock@stanfordalumni.org

REQUESTED REVISION:
     STANDARD: 802.1Q-2011
     CLAUSE NUMBER: 6.1
     CLAUSE TITLE: Basic architectural concepts and terms

RATIONALE FOR REVISION:

Figure 6-3 shows Link Aggregation as a shim between MSAPs. This is
fine as long as there is no bridging involved. Because of the "MSAP"
and "MAC Service" labels, however, if bridging were inserted then all
of bridging would go below Link Aggregation (see Figure 6-1 of 802.1Q).
This is wrong on two counts: Link Aggregation does not work across all
of bridging (LACPDUs won't go through for one thing), and the figure
implies there cannot be aggregated links between bridges. Also, 802.1AXbq
is modifying the Link Aggregation standard to clarify that the interface
above and below is an ISS.

This comment was submitted in the 802.1AC-d1.3 Working Group recirculation
ballot, as this figure is also in 802.1AC. The proposed revision text
below is the same as the resolution of the comment.

PROPOSED REVISION TEXT:

Change Figure 6-3 as follows: Change MSAP to SAP in all three occurrences.
Delete the MAC Service line. Change "802.3 MAC" to "MAC" here and in the
text below the diagram.

IMPACT ON EXISTING NETWORKS:

None.

```
   +----------------------------------------------------------------------+
   | Please attach supporting material, if any                            |
   | Submit to:- Tony Jeffree, Chair IEEE 802.1                           |
   |  and copy:- Paul Congdon, Vice-Chair IEEE 802.1                      |
   |     E-Mail: stds-802-1-maint-req@ieee.org                            |
   |                                                                      |
   |           +------- For official 802.1 use ------------+             |
   |           | REV REQ NUMBER: 0019                       |             |
   |           | DATE RECEIVED: 9/29/11                     |             |
   |           | TECHNICAL                                  |             |
   |           | ACCEPTED/DENIED                            |             |
   |           | BALLOT REQ'D YES/NO                        |             |
   |           | Status: R                                  |             |
   |           +--------------------------------------------+             |
   +----------------------------------------------------------------------+
```