IEEE 802.1 REVISION REQUEST 0088

DATE: 4th December 2012
NAME: Tony Jeffree
COMPANY/AFFILIATION: HP/Broadcom
E-MAIL: tony@jeffree.co.uk

REQUESTED REVISION:
STANDARD: 802.1Q-2011
CLAUSE NUMBER: Annex D
CLAUSE TITLE: IEEE 802.1 Organizationally Specific TLVs

RATIONALE FOR REVISION:
(Submitted on behalf of David Law) In the original specification of the Port and Protocol VLAN ID TLV found in Figure F-2 of IEEE Std 802.1AB-2005, the bits in the 'flag' field are numbered 0 to 7 with bit 0 reserved, the 'supported' bit in bit 1, the 'enabled' bit in bit 2, and bits 3 to 7 are reserved. Looking at Figure D-2 of IEEE Std
802.1Q-2011 the bits in the 'flag' field are now numbered 1 to 8, but the 'supported' bit is still in bit 1, the 'enabled' bit is still in bit 2, and now bits 3 to 8 are reserved. It appears the position of the 'supported' and 'enabled' bits in the octet have changed, which doesn't seem to be correct. The version shown in 802.1Q looks to be the same as the version published in 802.1AB-2009.

This seems to have happened as a result of an attempt to align the bit numbering in AB to be consistent with bit numbering usage in 802.1Q; however, there is at least one other instance in 802.1Q-2011 of but numbering starting at 0 (see Figure D-7).

PROPOSED REVISION TEXT:

Need to discuss what to do about Figure D-2 - the two TLV definitions (AB-2005 vs AB-2009/Q-2011) are clearly different.

Ideally, 802.1Q should be fixed so that bit numbering is consistent everywhere.

IMPACT ON EXISTING NETWORKS:

Not clear - depends entirely on how widely the Port and Protocol TLV is used.

Inconsistent representations can lead to misinterpretation.

Please attach supporting material, if any
Submit to:- Tony Jeffree, Chair IEEE 802.1
and copy:- Glenn Parsons, Vice-Chair IEEE 802.1
E-Mail: stds-802-1-maint-req@ieee.org

For official 802.1 use
REV REQ NUMBER: 0088
DATE RECEIVED: 01/09/2013
EDITORIAL/TECHNICAL
ACCEPTED/DENIED
BALLOT REQ'D YES/NO
Status: R