doc: P802.11-95/52

## **IEEE P802.11**

## Wireless Access Method and Physical Layer Specification

## Section 10 Response to Draft D1 Letter Ballot Processed at March 1995 Meeting

Ed Geiger Apple Computer, Inc. One Infinite Loop M/S 301-4J Cupertino CA 95014 Dean Kawaguchi Symbol Technologies 2145 Hamilton Ave San Jose CA 95125

**Abstract:** This paper presents the section 10 Response to the Draft D1 Letter Ballot Processed at the March 1995 Meeting. Not all Letter Ballot comments were processed at the March 1995 Meeting.

March 1995 doc: P802.11-95/52

## **Section 10.0 Comment Review**

Nbr	Section	Name	Resolution		
1	10	Wim	Unresolved		
2	10.5.4	Jerry	Deferred to later		
3	10.1, 10.5,	Mike F.	Will use whatever reference model the MAC and other PHY agree to. We believe this is editorial 7,0,0		
4	10.2	Siep	We propose a change to section 8 to agree with section 10. 7,0,0		
5	10.2.2	Mahany	Deferred to later		
6	10.2.2	McDonald	We will deleted ANTSEL parameter in section 10.2.2 6,0,1		
7	10.2.2	Tom T.	Deferred to later		
8	10.2.2	Sonnenberg	See McDonald 6		
9	10.2.3	Geiger	Commentor agreed to editorial change rather then technical		
10	10.2.2.3	McDonald	Deferred to later		
11	10.2.2.3	Renfo	See McDonald 10		
12	10.2.3	Sonnenberg	RSSI comment considered as Technical.  Note: FH PHY recognizes the need but not sure if this is a mandatory requirement.  Deferred to later		
13	10.2.3	Mahany	See Mahany 5		
14	10.2.3.1	Fischer	Accept change 7,0,0		
15	10.2.3.1	Geiger	LENGTH comment defined editorial by commentor, editor to change.		
16	10.2.3.1	Fischer	Ed to review with Mike See Geiger 15		
17	10.2.3.3	Dellacourt	RSSI Deferred to later See 12		
18	10.2.3.3	Loraine	See Dellacourt 17		
19	10.2.3.3	McDonald	Nbr of Levels See Dellacourt 17		
20	10.2.3.3	Renfro	See Dellacourt 17		
21	10.6.28	Dellacort	See 10.6.2.8		
22	10.3.1.1	Kubler	Remove the repeater reference. 8,0,0		
23	10.3.1.1	Mahany	See Kubler 22		

doc: P802.11-95/52

24	10.3.1.1	Renfro	Need consistency throughout Standard. Deferred to later	
25	10.3.2	Ohara	Bit ordering Need to talk Bob about what he wants in addition to what is there already Fig 10.3?	
26	10.3.2	Mahany	See Mahany 5	
27	10.3.2	Renfro	See Mahany 5	
28	10.3.2	Black	PLCP vs all PHY Deferred to later	
29	10.3.2.2	Tom T.	See Mahany 5	
30	10.3.2.2	Bolea	See Black 28	
31	10.3.2.2	McDonald	See Mahany 5	
32	10.3.2.2	Bolea	Set Reserved bits to zero 8,0,2	
33	10.3.2.2	Kubler	See Bolea 32	
34	10.3.2.2	Kubler	Changed Undefine to Reserved 7,0,0	
35	10.3.2.2	McDonald	Length and reserved See Mahany 5	
			Deferred to later 6,0,0	
36	10.3.2.2	Zuckerman	Unjustified complexity at this time but thanks	
			anyway, 7,0,3	
37	10.3.2.2	Mahany	See Bolea 32	
38	10.3.2.2	Kawaguchi	Correct polynominal error 9,0,0	
39	10.3.2.2	Stuart	See Kawaguchi 38	
40	10.3.2.2	O'Hara	Replace BCH with CCITT CRC16	
	1		10,0,0	
41	10.3.2.2	O'Hara	Change insert to transmit 9,0,0	
42	10.3.2.2	O'Hara	Remove "and correction" 11,0,0	
43	10.3.2.2	Fischer	See 40, 38	
44	10.3.2.2	Geiger	See 38	
45	10.3.2.2	Kubler	See 42	
46	10.3.2.2	Mahany	See 42	
47	10.3.2.3	O'Hara	Different Technical Requirements	
			Therefore different scramblers 9,0,2	
40	10.2.0.0		Editors to talk to Bob	
48	10.3.2.3	Demange	Committee has disagreement on polynominal.	
40	10.2.2.2	15	Defer to later	
49	10.3.2.3	Demange	Felt by committee that there is some worth to the	
			whitener but we thank you for you input anyway.	
	L		10,0,0	

50	10.3.2.2	Demange	Deferred to Later Japan Requit's		
51	10.3.2.3	McDonald	See 48		
52	10.3.2.3	McDonald	Security Issue Moved to the MAC resolved		
53	10.3.3	O'Hara	Dean will make textual change to resolve. 10,0,0		
54	10.3.3.1	Bolea	Will accept. 10,0,0		
55	10.3.3.1	Yao	Accept comment for now 10,0,1		
56	10.3.3.1	McDonald	Dwell Ties Addressed		
57	10.3.3.1	McDonald	Issue Addressed		
58	10.3.3.1	McDonald	2M whitener not addressed in fig 10-7, Must be fixed		
59	10.3.3.1	McDonald	See 48		
60	10.3.3.1	Renfro	See 58		
61	10.3.3.1	O'Hara	Editors Talk to Bob PHY SAP		
62	10.3.3.1	O'Hara	Editors Talk to Bob PMD SAP		
63	10.3.3.1	O'Hara	Editors Talk to Bob Subfigures		
64	10.3.3.1	O'Hara	Editors Talk to Bob State Machine		
65	10.3.3.1	McDonald	Accept the text from McDonald		
66	10.3.3.1	Renfro	Deferred to 10.6.13 by Renfro		
67	10.3.3.1	O'Hara	Discuss with Bob		
68	10.3.3.2	McDonald	CCA Discussion deferred		
69	10.3.3.2	Boer	Deferred See 68		
70	10.3.3.2.1	Belanger	Deferred See 68		
71	10.3.3.2.1	O'Hara	Remove sentence 9,0,2		
72	10.3.3.2.1	O'Hara	Deferred See 68		
73	10.3.3.2.1	Chadwick	Comment not reproduced.  MAC should ensure that CCA is CLEAR before transmitting except in the case of SIFS 3,2,6		
74	10.3.3.2.1	Renfro	Resolved by Commentor		
75	10.3.3.2.1	Renfro	Jim to submit textual changes to fix issue.		
76	10.3.3.2.1	Renfro	Jim to submit textual changes to fix issue.		
77	10.3.3.2.1	Sonnenberg	Deferred See 68		
78	10.3.3.2.1	O'Hara	Dean to talk to Bob		
79	10.3.3.2.1	O'Hara	Comment Accepted 7,0,0		
80	10.3.3.2.2	Mahany	Editorial change to clarify text and address comment.		

81	10.3.3.3.1	McDonald	Group agreed to remove this feature.
			9,0,4
82	10.3.3.3.1	Renfro	Withdrew comment after straw poll.
83	10.3.3.3.1	O'Hara	Editors to talk to Bob
84	10.3.3.3.1	O'Hara	Editors to talk to Bob
85	10.3.3.3.1	O'Hara	Editors to talk to Bob
86	10.3.3.3.2	McDonald	Jim withdrew comment.
87	10.3.3.3.2	Renfro	Decided to remove 1us tilming 6,0,4
88	10.3.3.3.2	Mahany	Error Correction comment deleted.
			11,0,1

Nbr	Section	Name	Resolution	
200	10.6.10	Silberman	Reject comment, 5% doesn't meet zero crossing spec. 8,4,2	
201	10.6.11	Mahany	Comment redrawn by commentor	
202	10.6.11	McDonald	Commentor agreed to move issue to MAC section 5, put on issues list. 10,1,2	
203	10.6.12	O'Hara	Remove Timing specified because this is addressed by other system requirements.  8,6,1	
204	10.6.12	Fischer	See 203	
205	10.6.12	Renfro	See 203	
206	10.6.13	Loraine	Commentor withdraws comment	
207	10.6.13	Renfro	Commentor withdraws comment	
208	10.6.13	Sonnenberg	Accept: At the end of this 19us switch time, the rf carrier shall be within 1dB of its final transmit power level, and within the described modulation specifications.  12,0,0	
209	10.6.14	Mahany	Comment accepted 10,0,0	
210	10.6.14	Renfro	See 209	
211	10.6.16	Bolea	Editorial. EIRP to be consistent with regulations. 11,0,1	
212	10.6.16	Mahany	Add line: "Unless governed by more str"  Note: latest revision. 8,0,2	

March 1995 doc: P802.11-95/52

010	10 ( 16	ID C	0 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	
213	10.6.16	Renfro	Commentor changed comment ot editorial.	
214	10.6.16	Sonnenberg	Add text: In addition, all conformant PMD	
			implementations shall support at least one power	
			level with a minimum EIRP of 10 mW.	
			4,3,3	
215	10.6.17	Bolea	See 216	
216	10.6.17	Loraine	Accept the replacement text. remove= as	
		Ŷ	measured applications regulations add	
			level AT OR below	
			11,0,0	
217	10.6.17	McDonald	Reluctantly withdraws comment.	
218	10.6.17	Renfro	See 216	
219	10.6.17	Sonnenberg	See 216	
220	10.6.18	Chadwick	Delete fig10-17 by acclaimation	
221	10.6.18	Loraine	Accept text, with the exceptions three failures	
			now -2 failures -50dBc is now -40dBc.	
			10,2,0	
222	10.6.18	Kubler	See 221	
223	10.6.18	Mahany	See 221	
224	10.6.18	Mahany	See 221	
225	10.6.18	Renfro	See 221	
226	10.6.18	Silberman	Rejected, see 221 6,1,3	

Nbr	Section	Name	Resolution
400	10.6.2	Bolea	Change Table 10-10 upper limit for US to 2.480. 9,0,2 Other considered editorial 9,0,1

Nbr	Section	Name	Resolution
500	10.6.3	Renfro	Commentor changed to editorial.
501	10.6.5	Furuya	See 505
502	10.6.5	O'Hara	See 505
503	10.6.5	Geiger	See 505
504	10.6.5	Mahany	Accept DS Temperature Statement
			11,2,1

505	10.6.5	Renfro	Accept Jim's comment for regarding occupied			
			channel bandwidth. 8,3,1			
506	10.6.6	O'Hara	Editors to work with Bob to propose text for			
			MAC Managenment 12,0,1			
507	10.6.6	O'Hara	Comment rejected - Copyright problems,			
			impractical, when regulatory issuses change,			
			standard becomes invalid. 15,0,0			
508	10.6.6	Lewis	See 506			
509	10.6.6	Renfro	Withdrawn by Commentor			
510	10.6.6	Fischer	Deferred to MAC Management as an Issue. See			
			Section 6 in Standard.			
			9,1,1			
511	10.6.7	Bolea	Committee which includes Dean, and Jim			
			Research the equation and fix the problem.			
			Convert to editorial issue.			
			10,0,4			
512	10.6.7	Renfro	See 511			
513	10.6.9	Chayat	Do not implement comment 5,4,4			
514	10.6.9	Chadwick	Peter and Jerry to work with Naftali to reword			
	150		Modulation Definition to address Both their			
			comments 9,2,2			
515	10.6.9	Silberman	Accept as peak error 11,0,1			

		2.0

ė