

---

**IEEE P802.11**  
**Wireless LANs**

---

**Report of June 1995 Letter Ballot**

**Date:**

July 4, 1995

**Author:**

Vic Hayes  
AT&T WCND Utrecht  
Zadelstede 1-10  
3431 JZ Nieuwegein  
Phone: +31 3402 97528  
Fax: +31 3402 97555  
e-Mail: vic.hayes@utrecht.attgis.com

---

**Abstract**

Two recommendations of the May 1995 Letter Ballot passed; i.e. inclusion of section 10 and section 11 into draft D1.2. The two motions from the FH group failed. The ballot closed July 2, 71 persons returned their ballot, 69 were voting members. IEEE P802.11 had 84 voting members at the time the ballot started, so the ballot is valid because more than 50 % of the voting members returned their ballot.

One ballot was accompanied by comments, one ballot contained a conditional approval.

As a general reminder, I sent a reflector message on June 23, 1995, reminding the membership about the pending June letter ballot and on June 30, 1995, I warned all those voting members that had not returned their June ballots by e-mail and by FAX.

**Ballot result, Voting members only**

**Do you approve the following changes to be included in the Draft D1.1 for preparation of Draft D1.2?**

Approve	Do not approve	Abstain	Topic	Changes given in doc.	Responses to ballot given in doc. #	
53 <sup>1</sup>	1	14	Section 10	95/124N	95/129	<b>98 %, passed</b>
54	1	14	Section 11	95/123	95/119	<b>98 %, passed</b>

**2. Do you approve the motions that passed within the FH group with more than 50 % but less than 75 %? Refer to doc 95/127**

Approve	Do not approve	Abstain	Motion #	
38	16	15	1	<b>70 %, failed</b>
38	14	17	2	<b>73 % failed</b>

---

<sup>1</sup> Plus 1 conditional approval

Comments

Comments from Dave Bagby

Phy motion 1: Do NOT approve

-----  
reason:

Insufficient information has been presented for this change at this time. A minimal requirement is that the conversion between PER and BER be specified. The PAR requires us to meet a BER target, until I can know how to interpret a PER in terms of the PAR required BER I have to vote NO. I will not vote to make a change which could be considered in contravention of the 802.11 PAR at this point in time.

Also, no proposed text has been provided to support this change and therefore I believe that this motion can NOT be approved at this time - it is necessary that any change to the draft be supported by proposed text according to our operating rules.

Phy motion 2: Do NOT approve.

-----  
I sense that either the persons proposing this MIB variable do not understand the operation of the current MIB variables or I don't. I think I do understand them however (I suppose I could be wrong).

The proposed variable is of no use. The max MPDU size is specified as a PHY specific value, not as a bit data rate dependent variable. Time to transmit an MPDU is only part of the equation. What the current mib var is supposed to be is the max length of an MPDU that the specific PHY can reliably deliver. Is the length of time the MPDU takes the only factor? Does the modulation form not matter at all for other reasons? Seems hard for me to believe, this would lead one to conclude that any bit rate is equally as fine as long as the total time of the MPDU is a fixed length - I don't buy this.

Addition of this variable could imply that the MAC is to fragment to different sizes dependant on the bit rate in use. What are the details of this? How would it effect sec 5 where fragmentation is specified?

Again, no proposed text has been provided to support this cMIB variable and therefore I believe that this motion can NOT be approved at this time - it is necessary that any change to the draft be supported by proposed text according to our operating rules.

Comments from Nathan Silberman: Conditional YES on Section 10:

I read a message from Ed Geiger about some editorial "oops"

Once they are fixed, my vote is yes.

**Ballot result, all ballot returns**

Count of S10	S10					
w	a	c	n	y	(blank)	Grand Total
am	0	0	0	0	0	0
dm	0	0	0	0	0	0
m	14	1	1	53	0	69
nm	0	0	0	2	0	2
Grand Total	14	1	1	55	0	71

Count of S11	S11				
w	a	n	y	(blank)	Grand Total
am	0	0	0	0	0
dm	0	0	0	0	0
m	14	1	54	0	69
nm	0	0	2	0	2
Grand Total	14	1	56	0	71

Count of M1	M1				
w	a	n	y	(blank)	Grand Total
am	0	0	0	0	0
dm	0	0	0	0	0
m	15	16	38	0	69
nm	1	0	1	0	2
Grand Total	16	16	39	0	71

Count of M2	M2				
w	a	n	y	(blank)	Grand Total
am	0	0	0	0	0
dm	0	0	0	0	0
m	17	14	38	0	69
nm	0	1	1	0	2
Grand Total	17	15	39	0	71

**Votes of those that returned their ballot and those that had voting obligations**

title_firstname	lastname	S10	S11	M1	M2	Cmmnt	w
Mr. DAVID	BAGBY	a	a	n	n	y	m
Mr. C. THOMAS	BAUMGARTNER	a	a	n	n		m
Mr. PHIL	BELANGER	y	y	n	n		m
Mr. MANUEL J.	BETANCOR	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. SIMON	BLACK	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. PETER	BLOMEYER	y	y	a	a		m
Mr. JAN	BOER	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. ALESSANDRO M.	BOLEA	y	a	y	y		m
Mr. PABLO	BRENNER	a	a	y	y		m
Mr. PETER E.	CHADWICK	y	y	y	n		m
Mr. NAFTALI	CHAYAT	y	a	y	y		m
Dr. KWANG-CHENG	CHEN	y	y	n	n		m
Mr. ROBERT S.	CROWDER						m
Mr. FRANK	DELLA CORTE	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. MARK	DEMANGE	y	a	y	n		m
Mr. WIM	DIEPSTRATEN	a	y	y	a		m
Mr. BARRY A.	DOBYNS	y	y	a	a		m
Mr. GREG	ENNIS	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. JOHN	FAKATSELIS	a	y	a	a		m
Mr. MATTHEW	FISCHER	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. MICHAEL	FISCHER	y	y	n	n		m
Mr. ROLAND	FOURNIER	y	y	a	n		nm
Mr. KEITH S.	FURUYA	n	n	n	n		m
Mr. ED	GEIGER	y	y	n	y		m
Mr. EUGEN	GERSHON						m
Mr. HOWARD J.	HALL	y	y	y	y		m
Dr. JAMES	HARRER	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. JOHN	HAYES						m
Mr. VICTOR	HAYES	a	y	a	a		m
Ms. CAROLYN L.	HEIDE	a	a	n	n		m
Mr. BRADLEY	HERRIN	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. DONALD C.	JOHNSON	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. FRED	KAMP						m
Mr. DEAN M.	KAWAGUCHI	y	a	y	y		m
Mr. STUART	KERRY	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. THOMAS E.	KRUEGER						m
Mr. JOSEPH J.	KUBLER	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. MIKIO	KIYONO	y	y	a	a		m
Mr. DANIEL E.	LEWIS						m
Dr. C. JIM	LI						m
Ms. ISABEL	LIN	y	y	a	a		m
Mr. FRANCISCO J.	LOPEZ-HERNANDEZ						m
Mr. JERRY	LORAINÉ	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. RONALD	MAHANY	y	y	y	n		m
Mr. BOB	MARSHALL	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. JIM	McDONALD	y	a	y	y		m
Mr. JOHN	McKOWN						m
Dr. AKIRA	MIURA	a	a	a	a		m
Mr. ADRIANO J.	MOREIRA	y	y	y	a		m

title_firstname	lastname	S10	S11	M1	M2	Cmmnt	w
Mr. WAYNE D.	MOYERS	y	y	n	n		m
Mr. BOB	O'HARA	y	y	a	a		m
Mr. FRANK	O'NEILL						m
Mr. MITSUJI	OKADA	a	y	a	y		m
Mr. ROGER	PANDANDA	y	y	a	a		m
Mr. JIM	PANIAN						m
Mr. AL	PETRICK	a	y	a	a		m
Mr. TIM	PHIPPS	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. PAUL	PIRILLO	y	y	n	n		m
Mr. JEFF	RACKOWITZ						m
Mr. JAMES A.	RENFRO	y	a	y	y		m
Mr. JON WALTER	ROSDAHL	y	y	n	y		m
Mr. MICHAEL	ROTHENBERG	y	a	y	y		m
Mr. CHANDOS	RYPINSKI	a	y	a	a		m
Mr. LEON S.	SCALDEFERRI	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. GLEN	SHERWOOD	y	y	n	y		m
Mr. THOMAS	SIEP	y	y	a	a		m
Mr. NATHAN	SILBERMAN	c	y	n	n		m
Mr. MARVIN	SOJKA	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. KYUNG S.	SON	y	y	a	a		m
Mr. JOHN	SONNENBERG	y	y	n	y		m
Dr. WALTER C.	SOTELO	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. PAUL F.	STRUHSAKER						m
Mr. MACK	SULLIVAN	a	a	n	n		m
Mr. MIKE	TROMPOWER	a	y	y	y		m
Mr. TOM	TSOULOGIANNIS	a	y	n	y		m
Mr. RYAN H.	TZE	y	y	a	a		m
Mr. RUI T.	VALADAS	y	y	y	y		m
Ms. JEANINE	VALADEZ						m
Mr. SAROSH	VESUNA	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. HIROHISA	WAKAI						m
Mr. RICHARD E.	WHITE	y	a	y	y		m
Mr. JERRY	WYATT	y	y	y	a		m
Mr. STEPHEN	WOOD	y	y	y	y		nm
Mr. IWEN	YAO	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. CHRIS	ZEGELIN	y	y	y	y		m
Mr. LAWRENCE H.	ZUCKERMAN	y	y	y	y		m