

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
--------	----------------	---------------	-----------------------	-----------------	------------------------	-----------	----------------------

### Section 13 comments from Ballot on Draft Standard D2 (Vic Hayes, Chair, AT&T WCND)

1	13 9.3.4.3 9.3.4.4 11.2.2 12.2.6	BJa	E		The description of the service primitives and vector descriptions is not aligned for the different sections. Definition of the primitives and parameters that are common for the different Phy's must appear in section 9, while value definition that are Phy dependant must be defined in the respective sections.		Agreed. Many of us processing comments are not experts in this kind of thing and we would have appreciated more text from commentors to help us resolve this problem. We have tried to make the required changes.
2	13.1	MRo	t	X	Figure 11-1 differs from Figures 12-1. There is no equivalent in section 13. Coordinate between PHYs to select a common reference model.		Correct. IR PHY believes that the other PHY's should also remove their model drawings and reference earlier clause drawing as IR has done.
3	13.1	ws	e		In paragraph 7, too much space in "ensure conformance"	spacing	accepted
4	13.2.1	ws	e		Too much space in "prepending with"	spacing	accepted
5	13.2.2	FMi	t	N	The length of the PLCP header should be an integral number of symbol times (microseconds or multiples of 4 slot times). This can be done by lengthening the DR field to 4 slots, shortening the DR field to 2 slots, or inserting a 1-slot pad immediately before or after the DR field.	The IR PLCP header is the only PLCP header which is not an integral number of symbol times in length. The 3-slot DR field is 750ns or 3/4 of a symbol time. While not a show stopper, this seems to be an unnecessary complication for control and timing logic for unspecified reasons. The current encoding of the DR field could be accomplished using 2 slots or 4 slots, while allowing more data rate codes if the later choice were made.	Rejected. The header has been carefully designed for best performance. There is no need to change because 4 seems cleaner than 3.
6	13.2.2	ZJ	T	N	Change "Length (LENGTH)" to "Length (LENGTH), Duration (DUR)"	Duration information should be part of the PLCP header, not the MAC contents of the frame. Since units communicating at lower speeds cannot receive the MAC contents of a frame transmitted at higher speed, but all stations can receive the PLCP header	Deferred to whole 802.11 group decision

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comment type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
						for all frames (in all PHYs), it is logical to move Duration to where everyone in the BSS can receive it (I don't care if it violates layer purity).	
7	13.2.2	MB	e		First sentence...Figure 12 13-1 shows ..... Last sentence... Each of these fields will be described in detail in 12 13.2.4 Change figure 12-1 to Figure 13-1		accepted
8	13.2.2, 13.2.3, 13.3.2.1 , 13.3.3.3	PP	E		References to sections 12.x and tables 12-x should be changed to 13.x		accepted
9	13.2.3	MB	e		First sentence.. The PLCP Preamble shall be transmitted using the basic pulse defined in 12 13.3.3.2		accepted
10	13.2.4.6	ZJ	T	N	Insert a new 13.2.4.6 PLCP Duration Field (DUR). "The PLCP duration field is an unsigned 16 bit integer that takes on values between 0 and 32767, as specified by the MAC in the TXVECTOR. This field is used by the MAC for collision avoidance calculations. This field is protected by the CRC frame check sequence described in 13.2.4.7" and renumber 13.2.4.6 and 13.2.4.7.	Duration information should be part of the PLCP header, not the MAC contents of the frame.	Deferred to whole 802.11 group decision
11	13.2.5.1	FMi	t	N	The completion of the PLCP header should be indicated by a PHY_TXSTART.confirm, not a PHY_DATA.confirm. Similarly, the completion of transmission should be a PHY_TXEND.confirm not a PHY_DATA.confirm.	Consistency with clause 11 and the recommended changes to clause 9. Clarity of description, because the relevant event is completion of a TX control primitive, not a TX data transfer. Provision of mechanism, because the TX confirms provide a means of indicating errors, which the data confirm does not.	Accepted based on understanding that Clause 9 will be changed also.
12	13.2.5.1	ZJ	T	N	Modify text to include DURATION passed by the MAC as part of the PHY_TXSTART.request.	Duration information should be part of the PLCP header, not the MAC contents of the frame.	Deferred to whole 802.11 group decision

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Comment type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
13	13.3.2.1	MB	e		Relabel Table 12-1 to Table 13-1 3rd sentence..... The 16-PPM encoding is specified in Table <del>12-1</del> 13-1 6th sentence..... The 4-PPM encoding is specified in Table <del>12-2</del> 13-2.		accepted
14	13.3.3.2	MB	e		Relabel Table 12-2 to 13-2		accepted
15	13.3.3.3	MB	e		1st sentence... The emitter radiation pattern mask is defined in table <del>12-3</del> 13-3. Relabel Table 12-3 to 13-3 Relabel Figure 12-3 to 13-3		accepted
16	13.3.3.5	MB	e		Relabel Figure 12-4 to 13-4 3rd sentence... The transmit spectrum mask is shown in figure <del>12-4</del> 13-4.		accepted
17	13.3.4.3	MB	e		Relabel Table 12-4 to 13-4		accepted
18	13.3.5.2	MB	e		3rd sentence.....receiver sensitivity specified in 13.3.3.7 4.1 "Receiver Sensitivity", with a background IR level as specified in 13.3.3.7 4.1. 7th sentence.....signal level specified in 13.3.3.7 4.1.		accepted
19	13.3.5.3	MB	e		3rd sentence.....at the minimum signal level specified in 13.3.3.7 4.1 "Receiver Sensitivity"		accepted
20	13.5.2	FMi	t	N	The PHY service primitives and the parameter values appropriate for the IR PHY need to be specified along with the operating procedures. This is especially important because several of the critical intervals (SIFS, slot time) are calculated using PLCP and PMD delays, whereas the IR PHY does not appear to have this internal layering and does not specify a PMD_SAP.	Consistency with other PHYs. Clarity in how the MAC timing assumptions and calculations apply to the IR PHY.	accepted. We have tried to include all primitives and parameter values.
21	13.x 11.x, 12.x,	TM	T		There should be a method in the standard whereby the basic rate of the network is fixed (ie., all data, PLCP headers, and control packets are transferred at a 2 Mb/s rate)	This will allow for maximum system throughput (at the expense of cell size)	Rejected. The IR PHY has defined that all STA must be able to receive both 1 and 2 Mbps rates. This means that everything sent can be received. However, some vendor may elect to only transmit at 1 Mbps for cost and power saving reasons. This feature must

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
							remain in our opinion. Note that the MAC can decide to request that all transmissions are done at 2 Mbps if the hardware is capable of it.
22	13.xx	ws	e		The internal section references have the wrong chapter number		accepted