Seq. #	Sect. number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal

Section 1 comments from Ballot on Draft Standard D2 (Vic Hayes, Chair, AT&T WCND)

	1	ZV	E		Clause 1 should be labeled "Overview" and **a distinct subclause, labeled "Scope" MUST BE ADDED in 1.1**. "Purpose" should be numbered 1.2. It would be much better if you were to make clause and subclause numbering changes at this time rather than waiting until the standard is approved. This would give your working group the additional time necessary to ensure that all cross-references within text and graphics are correct.		
	1	FMi	e		page 1 should be a right-facing page	normal document formatting	
	1	FMi	t	N	Specifically the 802.11 standard: Describes the functions and services required by an 802.11 compliant device to operate within ad-hoc and infrastructure networks as well as the aspects of station mobility (transition) within those networks. Defines~~Describes~~ the medium access control (MAC) procedures to support the asynchronous ~~and time-bounded~~ MAC service data unit (MSDU) delivery services and to allow future support for time bounded MSDU delivery services. Defines several physical layer (PHY) signalling techniques and interface functions that may be controlled by the 802.11 MAC. Permits~~Supports~~ the operation of an 802.11 conformant~~compliant~~ device within a wireless LAN which may coexist with multiple overlapping 802.11 wireless LANs. Describes the requirements and procedures ~~services~~ to provide privacy of user information being transferred over the wireless medium~~confidentiality~~ and authentication of 802.11 conformant~~compliant~~ devices.	Make this description match the actual content of the standard, especially to include a mention of the existence of the plurality of PHYs.	

Seq. #	Section number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
	1.1	**BA**	**E**		**Channel.** ... that can be used simultaneouslysimultaniously	Spelling Error.	
	1.1	**BPh**	**e**		**"...(ad-hoc) network)."**	**Missing right paren.**	
	1.1	BTh	E		**in definition of Ad hoc network there should be no hyphen in Ad hoc**	According to my dictionary the proper use of word is "ad hoc network"	
	1.1	BTh	E		**in definition of Channel.** **typo...** volume **add words...**instances of the same type of PHY	Can't be the same PHY since a PHY is only using one channel at a time. Could also say the same WM. This repairs the sentence as is but it would be far better to craft a definition that didn't use the word to define itself.	
	1.1	Bth	E		**in defintion of Channel.** **add words...**1 narrowband RF channel **change...**FDMFrequency Division Multiplexed CDMACode Division Multiple Access	Narrowband is an adjective of RF not channel. There is no place in document that explains these acronyms so spell it out.	
	1.1	BTh	E		**add definition...** **Clear Channel Assessment function (CCA).** That logical function in the PHY which determines the current state of use of the WM	This is an essential definition that was missed. My definition may be inadequate so roll your own.	
	1.1	Bth	e		**in definition of DCF** **change...**in the BSS at any ~~any~~ given time	typo	
	1.1	BTh	e		**last line of ESS_BASIC_RATE_SET definition...** <tab>For IR PHY: {1Mbs,2Mbs}<return>Note that...	typo	
	1.1	BTh	e		**in definition of ESS** **change...**any station associated with one of those BSSs.	typo	
	1.1	BTh	e		**in definition of PCF** **change...**any given time that the network	typo	
	1.1	BTh	E		**in definition of STATION_BASIC_RATE need underscores in ESS_BASIC_RATE_SET**	need to be consistent in usage throught document	
	1.1	DM	e		Change font for Independent Basic Service Set (IBSS) to be the same as the rest of the document.		
	1.1	DM	e		Typo in definition for DSS: instance		
	1.1 also all of 2–2.5	FMi	e		globally re–select Times New Roman font for this section	various words and phrases are coded as other fonts that print as Courier on systems without those fonts loaded	

Seq. #	Secti number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Co. ected Text/Comment	ationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
	1.1	FMi	e		**Integration.** The service which enables delivery of MAC service data units between the Distribution System and an existing, non–802.11 local area network (via a Portal).	Clarify that integration applies to wired LANs, not to other wireless LANs.	
	1.1	FMi	E		**Portal.** The logical point at which MSDUs~~data~~ from an integrated, non-802.11 LAN enter ~~connects with an 802.11 LAN via~~ the Distribution System of an ESS.	clarity, correctness	
	1.1	FMi	e		**Wireless Medium (WM).** The medium used to implement the transfer of PDUs between peer PHY entities of a wireless LAN.	clarity	
	1.1	FMi	E		**ESS_BASIC_RATE_SET:** The~~A~~ set of data transfer rates which~~that~~ all the stations ~~o~~in an~~the given~~ ESS ~~are required to~~ must be capable of using to receive frames from the WM. ~~According to the PHYs definitions t~~The default ESS BASIC RATE SETs for the different PHYs are~~will be~~: For ~~2,4 Ghz ISM~~ DS PHY: {1Mbps, 2Mbps~~Bs~~} For ~~2,4 Ghz ISM~~ FH PHY: {1Mbps} For IR PHY: - {1Mbps, 2Mbps} The ESS_BASIC_RATE_SET ~~Note that this~~ data rates are~~value is~~ preset for all stations in the ESS.	grammar, consistency	
	1.1	FMi	E		**EXTENDED_RATE_SET:** The set of data transfer rates supported by a station (if any) outside of~~beyond~~ the ESS_BASIC_RATE_SET ~~that a station supports~~. This set may include data transfer rates ~~can be a speed~~ that ~~is~~ are defined in future PHY standards.	grammar, consistency	
	1.1	**MB**	**e**		**Channel.An instance.... in the same ~~voliume~~ volume**		
	1.1	**MB**	**e**		**Distribution System Services (DSS) The set of....with each other over a single ~~instancfe~~ instance of the WM**		
	1.1	**MB**	**e**		**Point Coordination Function(PCF) A class ..... at any given time ~~tat~~ that the network**		
	1.1	**RJa**	**e**		**Channel.** ... volume~~voliume~~ of space, ...	Spelling Error	

Seq. #	Section number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
	1.1	RJa	E		**Channel.** ... with an acceptably low frame error rate due to mutual interference. ~~Some PHYs only provide one channel, whereas others provide multiple channels.~~ ~~single channel ..... n-channel~~ ~~1 narrowband channel — FDM channels~~ ~~DSS with 1 code — DSS with CDMA~~	As defined, DSS is multichannel PHY just like FH. Text is confusing and adds nothing to standard.	
	1.1	RJa	e		**Distribution System Services (DSS).** ... instance~~instancfe~~ ...	Spelling Error	
	1.1	RJa	e		**Net Allocation Vector (NAV):** ... transmission~~trasnmission~~ ...	Spelling Error	
	1.1	RJa	e		**Point Coordination Function (PCF).** ... that~~tat~~ ...	Spelling Error	
	1.1	SKy	e		A set of stations controlled by a single Coordination Function at any given time. A BSS can have one PCF and one DCF.	**Clarification. One PCF and one DCF do not add up to a single coordination function.**	
	1.1	STh	e		**Capitalizations not consistent; various misspellings**		
	1.1	STh	e		**FDM channels not defined**		
	1.1	STh	e		**Under definition of Channel: should be DSSS**		
	1.1	STh	e		**BASIC_RATE_SET not defined**		
	1.1	STh	e		**CCA not defined**		
	1.1	STh	e		**Capitalizations not consistent; various misspellings**		
	1.1	STh	e		**FDM channels not defined**		
	1.1	STh	e		**Under definition of Channel: should be DSSS**		
	1.1	STh	e		**BASIC_RATE_SET not defined**		
	1.1	STh	e		**CCA not defined**		
	1.1	TM	e		Access Point (AP). ..., via the wireless medium (WM) for associated stations.	this is the first occurrence of the WM abbreviation	
	1.1	TM	e		Channel. ..., in the same volume *(spelling)*		
	1.1	TM	e		single channel — n-channel one hop pattern — multiple hop patterns DSSS with 1 code — multiple frequencies	DSSS (not DS) is the abbreviation to use. these definitions apply to the standard as CDMA applies only to the	

Seq. #	Sect. number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
						FHSS PHY, the DSSS PHY only specs one code	
	1.1	TM	e		Distribution System Services (DSS). ... instance *(spelling)*		
	1.1	TM	e		remove extra lines between (DSS) description and ESS_BASIC_RATE_SET description		
	1.1	TM	e		ESS_BASIC_RATE_SET: .... For 2.4 GHz ISM DSSS PHY: For 2.4 GHz ISM FHSS PHY: For IR PHY:	DSSS, FHSS, Mb/s are the abbreviations proper tabbing	
	1.1	TM	e		Extended Service Area (ESA). ... and may involve BSAs in overlapping, disjoint or both configurations.	more accurate wording	
	1.1	TM	e		Extended Service Sete (ESS). .... with one of those ...	change 'on' to one	
	1.1	TM	e		(GFSK). ... baseband	change 'base band' to baseband	
	1.1	TM	e		(IBSS) ...	use correct font	
	1.1	TM	e		(NAV). ...transmission *(spelling)*		
	1.1	TM	e		(PCF). ... given time that	change 'tat' to that	
	1.1	TM	e		Portal. ...via the Distr....	remove extra space between via and the	
	1.1	TM	e		(WEP). ..to the confidentiality	remove extra space between the and confidentiality	
	1.1	TM	e		choose a common separater. there is an abritrary usuage of the period and the colon	section uniformity	
	1.1	**ws**	**e**		**Under "channel"- misspell volume - "voliume"**		
	1.1	**ws**	**e**		**Under "net allocation vector" - misspell transmission**		
	1.1	**ws**	**e**		**under PCF- misspell that - tat**		
	1.1	**ws**	**E**		**Consistency - either place all definitions in 1.1 or put a definition section at the first of each chapter. Acronyms are used before they are defined**	**Clarity**	
	1.1	FMi	t		**Authentication.** The service used to adequately ~~positively~~ establish the identity of one station to another station.	The authentication function in 802.11 is not intended to provide "positive" proof of identity, just to provide a mechanism for authentication and a default algorithm which is "adequate" (e.g. "wired equivalent").	
	1.1	FMi	t		**Distributed Coordination Function (DCF).** A class of	clarity	

Seq. #	Section number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
					~~possible~~ coordination functions where the same coordination function logic is active in every station in the BSS whenever ~~at any any given time that~~ the network is in operation.		
	1.1	FMi	t		**Point Coordination Function (PCF).** A class of ~~possible~~ coordination functions where the coordination function logic is active in only one station in ~~the~~a BSS for defined portions of the~~at any given~~ time that the network is in operation.	clarity	
	1.1	FMi	t		**STATION_BASIC_RATE:** A data transfer rate~~value~~ belonging to the ESS_-BASIC_-RATE_-SET~~,~~ that is used by ~~the~~ station for specific transmissions. ~~(it~~The STATION_BASIC_RATE may ~~could~~ change dynamically, as frequently as each MPDU transmission attempt, based on local considerations at that station. ~~for example the Station Basic Rate on the IR depends on the Power Consumption Mode of the Station).~~	grammar, correctness	
	1.1	BTh	E	N	**in definition of DSS change...**~~instancefe~~instance **move sentence from Infrastructure definition to DSS definition...**DS services are provided between pairs of 802.11 MACs.	typo There is a sentence in Infrastructure definition that obviously doesn't belong there; it appears to belong in DSS definition	
	1.1	**BD**	**E/T**	**N**	**ESS Basic Rate Set**~~**ESS_BASIC_RATE_SET**~~**:** A set of rates that all the stations on the given ESS are required to be capable to receive. ~~According to the PHYs definitions the default ESS BASIC RATE SETs for the different PHYs will be:~~ ~~For 2,4 Ghz ISM DS PHY : {1Mbs,2MBs}~~ ~~For 2,4 Ghz ISM FH PHY: {1Mbs}~~ ~~For IR PHY: {1Mbs, 2Mbs}Note that this value is preset for all stations in the ESS.~~	**1) Section 1.1 contains term definitions not MIB variable definitions. Hence the removal of _ and Caps in the term names.** **2) The language about the specific rates supported by different PHYs is not appropriate for sec 1.1, this information is already in the relevant PHY sections and should not be duplicated here.**	

Seq. #	Sect. number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
	1.1	BD	E/T	N	**Extended Rate Set~~EXTENDED_RATE_SET~~:** The set of rates beyond the Basic Rate Set~~BASIC_RATE_SET~~ that a station supports. ~~This can be a speed that is defined in future PHY standards.~~	**1) Section 1.1 contains term definitions not MIB variable definitions. Hence the removal of _ and Caps in the term names. 2) The language about what may be defined in the future is irrelevant.**	
	1.1	BD	E/T	N	**Station Basic Rate~~STATION_BASIC_RATE~~:** A value belonging to the ESS Basic Rate Set~~BASIC_RATE_SET~~, that is used by the station for specific transmissions ~~(it could change dynamically, for example the Station Basic Rate on the IR depends on the Power Consumption Mode of the Station)~~.	**1) Section 1.1 contains term definitions not MIB variable definitions. Hence the removal of _ and Caps in the term names. 2) The language about how rates may change and when are not appropriate to the term definition section and is already in the relevant PHY sections and should not be duplicated here.**	
	1.1	BTh	t	N	**in defintion of Channel. correct two places...**DSSS	Distribution System Services don't have codes. DSSS is correct abbreviation for Direct Sequence Spread Spectrum	
	1.1	FMi	t	N	**Ad-hoc network.** An ad-hoc network is a network comprised solely of stations within mutual communication range of each other via with wireless medium. An ad-hoc network is ~~created for a specific purpose,~~ typically created in a spontaneous manner. The principal characteristic of an ad-hoc network is limited temporal and spatial extent. These limitations allow ~~that~~ the act of creating and dissolving the ad-hoc network to ~~be is~~ sufficiently straightforward and convenient so as to be achievable by non-technical users of the network facilities (i.e. no specialized 'technical skills' are required with little and/or no investment of time or additional resources required beyond the stations which are to participate in the ~~(~~ad-hoc~~)~~ network. The term "Ad-Hoc" is often used as slang to refer to an Independent BSS (IBSS).	The purpose for which the network is created has nothing to do with ad-hoc vs. infrastructure. The key distinction is the limited temporal extent. The related "simplicity" aspect precludes the distribution system, producing limited spatial extent. This is a more correct definition for the concept which we have been calling "ad-hoc" for many years. (Also, see the 2nd paragraph of 2.2.1, where the relationship between IBSS and ad-hoc is described in terms of limited temporal extent.)	

Seq. #	Section number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
	1.1	FMi	t	N	**Basic Service Set (BSS).** A set of stations controlled by a single Coordination Function. A BSS mayeen have one PCF and shall have one DCF.	completeness	
	1.1	FMi	t	N	**Coordination Function (CF).** TheThat logical function which determines when a station operating within a Basic Service Set is permitted to transmits and may be able to receives PDUs on via the wireless medium.	correctness	
	1.1	FMi	t	N	**Distribution System Medium (DSM).** The medium or set of media used by a Distribution System (for communication between Access Points and Portals of an ESS. interconnections).	correctness, completeness	
	1.1	FMi	t	N	**Distribution System Services (DSS).** The set of services provided by the distributions system which enable the MAC to transport MSDUs between stations that are not in direct communication with each other over a single instancfe of the WM. These servicesThis includes transport of MSDUs between the APs of BSSs within an ESS, transport of MSDUs between portals and BSSs within an ESS, and the transport of MSDUs between stations in the same BSS in cases where the MSDU has a multicast or broadcast destination address or where the destination is an individual address, but the station sending the MSDU chooses to involve DSS.	completeness	
	1.1	FMi	T	N	**Extended Service Set (ESS).** A set of one or more interconnected Basic Service Sets and zero or more integrated LANs, connected to a common Distribution System, allowing them to appear which appear as a single Basic Service Set to the logical link control entity layer at any station associated with one of those BSSs and at any station attached to one of those integrated LANs. The DSM of an ESS shall be comprised solely of 802 LAN segments (including wireless LAN segments), and any physical layer repeaters and/or 802.1d MAC Bridges	The current ESS concept is too broad, extending beyond that which can be reasonably provided by distribution system services appropriate for a set of interconnected BSSes in a local area, beyond what mangers of large-scale networks want a unified layer 2 entity to be, and beyond the charter of IEEE 802 (e.g. above layer 2).	

Seq. #	Sect. number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
					necessary to interconnect those LAN segments. *[add the following definition to retain a name for the broader extended service concept]* **More Extended Service Set (MESS).** An Extended Service Set in which the Distribution System operates above the data link layer and/or in which the DSM includes one or more routers, gateways, or non–LAN segments. Some distribution system services may be unavailable between arbitrary pairs of stations in a MESS, and some mobility transitions may be impossible between arbitrary BSSes in a MESS.	A more complete argument for this limitation to the extent of an ESS appears in document 95–188, Clause 1. By changing the definition of ESS in this manner, very few text changes are needed elsewhere in the document to avoid the problems with unrestricted service set extent (now called MESS).	
	1.1	FMi	t	N	**Independent Basic Service Set (IBSS).** A BSS which forms a self contained network, and in which no access to a Distribution System is available ~~independent of any other BSSs~~.	The use of "independent" in the definition is circular, as well as not mentioning the key characteristic of an IBSS, which is the lack of DS access.	
	1.1	FMi	t	N	**Infrastructure.** The infrastructure includes the ~~logical~~ Distribution System Medium, Access Point and Portal entities, as well as being the logical location of Distribution and Integration service functions of an ESS. An infrastructure contains one or more Access Points and zero or more Portals in addition to the Distribution System. ~~DS services are provided between pairs of 802.11 MACs.~~	Clarity — tie infrastructure to ESS (also, delete unrelated sentence which appears unnecessary and/or out of place)	
	1.1	KJ	t	N	Add new definition for Kmicroseconds Kmicroseconds. Units of 1024 microseconds.	This term is used in several time fields and should be made explicit as to its meaning/value	
	1.1	**SKy**	**t**	N	(i.e. no specialized 'technical skills' are required with little and/or no investment of time or additional resources required beyond the stations which are to participate in	**The Association and the Distribution System Service functions of an AP is not required for an ad hoc network.**	

Seq. #	Section number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
					the (ad-hoc) network. In particular, the Access Point is not required for ad hoc operation.	**Not requiring an AP for ad hoc is attractive in terms of cost as well.**	
	1.1	**SKy**	**t**	**N**	Add that ad hoc networks do not support all services/functionalities provided by infrastructure networks, including the Power Save mode, time bounded (TB) services and CF async data transfers.	**The definition should identify up front any functional limitations of ad hoc as opposed to infrastructure networks. The limitation comes from the fact that PCF operation is restricted to infrastructure networks (per para. 6.3) and the DS service is required in buffering and transferring of PS mode frames at AP.**	
	1.1, 1.2	**SKy**	**e**		Add definitions for the following: WDS, WDM, TIM, DTIM	**Completeness**	
	1.2	**BA**	**e**		~~PSNP = Power Save Non-Polling (mode)~~ ~~PSP = Power Save Polling (mode)~~	No longer applicable (I think)	
	1.2	**BA**	**e**		Add: IR = Infrared	Missing	
	1.2	BTh	e		**UNBOLD...** IF And Only IF Wireless Distribution System	consistency	
	1.2	BTh	e		**add...** CFP = Contention Free Period CP = Contention Period PC = Point Coordinator	Seems that these should be added to list of abbrev. as they can be confused with others in Chapter 6 that are close.	
	1.2	BTh	E		**add...** MLME = MAC Layer Management Entity PLME = PHY Layer Management Entity SM = Station Management Entity	Section 7.1 introduces these abbrev. that should be in 1.2. I don't know why the E shows up in the first two but not in the last one.	
	1.2	BTh	E		**Add...** TSF = Timing Synchronization Function TBTT = Target Beacon Transmission Time	Section 8 introduces these abbrev. that should be in 1.2	
	1.2	DM	e		All abbreviations should have a corresponding definition in section 1.1	Makes for a more readable and complete document.	
	1.2	DM	e		Change bold to normal type face for **IF And Only If** (IFF) and **Wireless Distribution System** (WDS)		
	1.2	**EG**	**E**		**PS = Power Save**	**PSNP and PSP are now just PS**	
	1.2	**EG**	**E**		**remove PSNP and PSP**	**have been replaced by PS**	

Seq. #	Sect. number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition Rebuttal
	1.2	FMi	e		correct instances of **bold** text in the definitions column	visual consistency	
	1.2	FMi	E		remove entries for DCE, DTBS, PhL, and PhS	no longer used	
	1.2	FMi	e		**DSAP** = Destination Service Access Point	correctness	
	1.2	**MB**	**e**		**Should add the following abbreviations to the list:** **ACK = Acknowledge** **CTS = Clear to Send** **RTS = Request to Send** **DBPSK = Differential Binary Phase Shift Keying** **DQPSK = Differential Quadrature Phase Shift Keying**		
	1.2	**RJa**	**e**		~~**PSNP** = Power Save Non Polling (mode)~~ ~~**PSP** = Power Save Polling (mode)~~	No longer applicable (I think)	
	1.2	**RJa**	**e**		Add: IR = Infrared	Missing	
	1.2	**SKy**	**e**		**PHY** = Physical layer	**Clarity**	
	1.2	**SKy**	**e**		**DIFS** = Distributed Coordination Function (DCF) Inter-Frame Space	**Correction**	
	1.2	**SKy**	**e**		**PIFS** = Point Coordination Function (PCF) ~~Priority~~ Inter-Frame Space	**Correction**	
	1.2	**STh**	**e**		**CCA not listed**		
	1.2	**STh**	**e**		**ATIM not listed**		
	1.2	**STh**	**e**		**CCA not listed**		
	1.2	**STh**	**e**		**ATIM not listed**		
	1.2	TM	e		add the following to the abbreviations list as they are used in the document: BSSID = Basic Service Set IDentification FC = Frame Control IV= Integrity Value IR = InfraRed PPDU = PHY Protocol Data Unit RA = Receiver Address SFD = Start Frame Delimiter TA = Transmitter Address	document uniformity and completeness	
	1.2	TM	e		remove bold font on IFF and WDS	section uniformity	

Seq. #	Section number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
	1.2	TT	e		Add: TBTT = Target Beacon Transmission Time		
	1.2	ZJ	E		Add definitions for IFS and TBTT	Missing	
	1.2	BTh	t		**change...** DSAP = Destination Service Access Point	Without "Service" it would be DAP wouldn't it?	
	1.2	FMi	t		~~**PSNP = Power Save Non-Polling (mode)**~~ **PSMP** = Power Save ~~Polling (m~~Mode~~)~~	consistency with simplification of power save operation that eliminates the PSNP/PSP distinction	
	1.2	FMi	t		Add the following abbreviations: ACK = Acknowledgement CCA = Clear Channel Assessment CFP = Contention Free Period CID = Connection Identifier CTS = Clear To Send DBPSK = Differential Binary Phase Shift Keying DIFS = Distributed Inter–Frame Space DQPSK = Differential Quaternary Phase Shift Keying DTIM = Delivery Traffic Information Map FH = Frequency Hopping IBSS = Independent Basic Service Set IFS = Inter–Frame Space IV = Initialization Vector LME = Layer Management Entity MESS = More Extended Service Set MIB = Management Information Base PLCP = Physical Layer Convergence Procotol PLME = Physical Layer Management Entity PMD = Physical Medium Dependent PPM = Pulse Position Modulation RTS = Request To Send RX = receive or receiver SMT = Station Management TBTT = Target Beacon Transmission Time TIM = Traffic Information Map TX = transmit or transmitter	other acronyms widely used in the document	

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
	1.2	BTh	E	N	**add...** TIM = Traffic Indication Map	Term used in 4.2.3.1 with no explanation. The reader will not find a reference to this acronym for many pages, therefore should put it in Table 1.2 at least.	
	1.2	BTh	E	N	**add...** CFP = Contention Free Period TBTT = Target Beacon Transmission Time	Acronyms used in 4.3.2.5 with no explanation. I am guessing at the meaning of CFP. Readability demands that either: an explanation of terms is entered in 4.3.2.5 or terms are put in Table 1.2.	
	1.2	BTh	E	N	**change...** ~~PSNP = Power Save Non-Polling (mode)~~ PSP = Power Save ~~Polling~~ (mode)	No longer a PSNP mode and the other has devolved to just PS mode	
	1.2	**BD**	**T**	**N**	~~**DTBS = Distributed Time Bounded Service**~~ ~~**PSNP = Power Save Non-Polling (mode)**~~ ~~**PSP = Power Save Polling (mode)**~~	**1) DTBS is no longer part of the draft, the term can be removed.** **2) PSNP and PSP are no longer used since the poser save modes were simplified.**	
	1.2	**BD**	**T**	**N**	~~**DSAP = Destination Access Point**~~	**This is a abbreviation that I do not think is used. It also is poorly formed, the tendency is to read it as "D SAP", which is not the meaning of the abbreviation. The cleanest action is to simply remove it.**	
	1.3	**BA**	**E**		Add references to ETS 300-328; ETS 300-339; RCR STD-33; GL36; CFR47,Part15, Sections 15.205, 15.209, 15.247.	Appropriate regulatory references for Europe, Japan and North America.	
	1.3	BTh	e		**missing tab...** 4.<tab>ISO...	typo	
	1.3	FMi	E		add references: IEEE Std 802.2–1994, IEEE Standards for Local and Metropolitan Area Networks: Logical Link Control (second edition).	completeness, usefulness of this section	

Seq. #	Section number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
					ISO/IEC 8824: 1990, Information Technology — Open Systems Interconnection — Specification of Abstract Syntax Notation One (ASN.1). ISO/IEC 8825: 1990, Information Technology — Open Systems Interconnection — Specification of Basic Encoding Rules for Abstract Syntax Notation One (ASN.1)		
	1.3	FMi	e		add references to the basic RF regulations for each of the enumerated regulatory domains	If regulatory domain information remains in the standard itself, these references should be cited. If the regulatory domain information is moved to an annex, the references should appear in that annex.	
	1.3	TM	e		add tab to 4. ISO/ ...	section uniformity	
	1.3	**RJa**	**E**	**N**	Add references to ETS 300-328; ETS 300-339; RCR STD-33; GL36; CFR47.Part15, Sections 15.205, 15.209, 15.247.	Appropriate regulatory references for Europe, Japan and North America. (Sorry, I don't have full citation available as I do this.)	
	1.4	**BD**	**T**	**N**	**Entire section missing.**	**D2 shall not be forwarded until the section on conformance requirements is complete and its contents proven to be meaningful.** **1) A standard w/o conformance tests is not useful from an interoperability standpoint.** **2) It would NOT be acceptable to split conformance testing into a separate clause as that would only entice companies to market non-Interoperable products while claiming 802.11 compatibility and pointing their finger at other manufacturers. The end users would**	

Seq. #	Sect. number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
						be caught in the middle, resulting in market death for 802.11 WLANs. **3) In general D2 is much improved over D1. However, as a practical matter it is impossible to know with any certainty if the 802.11 spec is sufficiently tight, to result in two different Interoperable implementations, until there is an existence proof. There is no substitute for the detailed insight gained by actually making two implementations of a spec interoperate.** **I consider the draft insufficiently proven until this minimal interoperability demonstration has been accomplished and will be unable to vote yes until that milestone is reached.**	
	1.4	DM	T	N	Need to define conformance requirements. Should include lockdown testing.	Interoperability amongst vendors is critical to the success of this standard. I accept that the standard can not be made so clear that there will be no differing interpretation among the various vendors. Therefore it is crucial that conformance requirements are specified.	
	1.4	WR	T	N	Must provide a conformance statement or provide a refernec to the appropriate Document.	The conformance clause is empty	
	1.5	BTh	E		**replace all existing text with...** 1. This standard represents fields as strings of one or more octets and fractions thereof. Each octet is represented with the most significant bit (MSB) on the left and the least significant bit (LSB) on the right. The MSB is defined as bit eight (8) and the LSB is defined as bit zero (0).	The two existing definitions say almost the same thing so they sould be combined.	
	1.5	**HV**	**T**	**N**	1. This standard represents information fields as octet strings of various lengths. Within fields, the bits are	**When we define a field, like a control field the bits have no significance in**	

Seq. #	Section number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
					numbered. In all figures of this standard, the lowest numbered bit is represented to the right.. ~~The~~ least significant bit (LSB) of each numeric value~~octet~~ is defined as the lowest numbered bit~~bit zero (0) for that octet. All octets are represented in figures with the LSB on the right~~.	**relation to each other. Only if a filed describes a value, such as a counter, can one speak of a numeric value. In this subclause, I have defined the bit sequence.**	
	1.5	**HV**	**T**	**N**	2. This standard represents fields longer than a single octet as strings of octets and fractions thereof. The octets within a field are numbered. The octet with the lowest number is depicted in this standard to the right. ~~A field longer than a single octet is represented in figures with the most significant bit (MSB) on the left. Each octet to the right of the MSB is of correspondingly lesser significance.~~	**This definition is needed because else one would not know how the octets in section 4.2.3 would be represented**	
	1.5	FMi	T	N	PICS proforma for MAC and each PHY are needed. Recommendations which satisfy this "no" vote: • Adopt material from 95–202 for initial MAC conformance statement. • Adopt material from 95–200 for initial DS PHY conformance statement. • Adopt corresponding submissions, if available, for the other PHY conformance statements. However, if initial conformance statements, of comparable or better relative completeness, are unavailable for the FH PHY and/or IR PHY prior to the close of the November, 1995 Plenary Meeting, the corresponding PHY specification clause(s) should be removed from the draft until such time as both the specification and the conformance statement can be provided for concurrent review.	There is no benefit to forwarding for sponsor ballot a draft which lacks the minimal conformance statements required of a protocol standard.	

Seq. #	Section number	your initials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal
	1.6	**HV**	**T**	**N**	1.6 Order of bit transmission Unless otherwise specified (sections 4.1.2.7 and 4.1.2.4.1) the transmission is as follows: 1. The octets are transmitted starting with the leftmost octet 2. Within an octet, the bits are transmitted starting with the lowest numbered bit	**Need to be defined to make an interoperable standard**	
	1.X, 2.X, 3.X 4.X, 5.X, 6.X 7.X 8.X	**BD**	**E**	**N**	**My editorial comments are contained in the files D2lb_edx.doc (where x is the relevant major section number) which were submitted along with this ballot response.** **All comments in these files are purely 100% editorial in nature (incorrect fonts, extra blank lines, misformatting etc). Any change for which there was any question in my mind that anyone might think it other than editorial, I have included as separate comment in this table.**	**Doc D2 is of Insufficient quality.** **1) There are numerous editorial errors in the D2 draft which need to be corrected before the draft can be forwarded for sponsor ballot. The editorial errors range from incorrect fonts in the middle of sentences & page formatting to a dire need to have a spelling check run on the document.** **2) While no single item is enough to prevent forwarding of the draft, in aggregate they impact the draft quality to such an extent that it would be embarrassing to forward it in this state. I have forwarded to the editors a marked up copy of the draft showing the editorial errors I noticed during review (this was at the editors request, for various obscure reasons a hard copy was requested over an electronic copy as being easier to deal with in this instance).** **3) Additionally all the section X.X, Y.Y etc place holder in the text need to be found and changed to correct section references.**	

Seq. #	Section number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal

Seq. #	Section number	your ini-tials	Cmnt type E, e, T, t	Part of NO vote	Corrected Text/Comment	Rationale	Disposition/Rebuttal