26 **E / A / W**

The xref format "(see Table 63 on Page 81)" is non standard.

55 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 7.1 **T / X / W** Bourgeois, Monique

What if a device receives a primitive that it does not understand? How is this handled?

105 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** Table 68 **T / X / W** Bourgeois, Monique

Some of the MAC PIB objects are not referenced anywhere in the draft.

109 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** Table 64 **T / X / W** Bourgeois, Monique

This is the only mention of multicast/broadcast frames.

111 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 7.3 **T / X / W** Bourgeois, Monique

Do we really want to use CSMA for beacons, since they are responsible for synchronizing the network (what if GTS is supported)?

112 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 7.5.4.1 **T / X / W** Bourgeois, Monique

What happens if a network coordinator receives a GTS request while it has a previous request pending? How does it handle simultaneous

113 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 7.5.2.2.1 **T / X / W** Bourgeois, Monique

Does a network coordinator change its macFrameOrder to 15 when it enters snooze mode?

114 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 7.5.2.1 **T / X / W** Bourgeois, Monique

What if two networks do somehow choose the same network ID? How would this conflict be resolved?

115 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** Table 57 **T / X / W** Bourgeois, Monique

One bit for Address Type does not allow for future expansion of the protocol.

126 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 7.5.4 **T / X / W** Bourgeois, Monique

When does handshaking occur for GTS transmissions?

194 **Cl** 07 *MAC EDIT* **SC** 7.1.1.3.2 **T / X / W** Carmeli, Boaz

What happen to packet with Destantion Address not equal to the Destanation Address of the receiving device (a 'not-for-me' packet). Whicl

196 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 7.2.2.4.2 **T / X / W** Carmeli, Boaz

What if there are more then 16 addresses pending? Are they transmitted in cyclic order?

246 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 7.1.2.5.3 **TR / X / W** CYPHER, DAVID

An inconsistency with the value of the GTSlength description in table 38 of 7.1.2.6.1 and the text described here.

261 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 7.5.2.1 **TR / X / W** CYPHER, DAVID

Statement states that "a network coordinator shall ensure that any network coordinators ... are awake ..." and only gives an option on how

347 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 4 **TR / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL

Choose macBaseFrameDuration to be a power of 2. It eases the implementation of timers to be 'm' bit wide. Otherwise it depends on the 'm

366 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** **TR / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL

"Handles and maintains the GTS mechanism" is an overstatement for the description present in the draft

370 **Cl** 07 *MAC EDIT* **SC** 2.1.2 **E / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL

While this table is useful, it has to absolutely accompany text description of who uses which format. For example, a line "a non-NC DEV use

375 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.1 **TR / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL

While clause-5 (especially the FRAME format in figure-5) claimed to have been using slotted CSMA/CA, there is no such mention of it in 7.5.

376 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.1.1 **E / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL

Since backoff scheme is already well understood in 802-wireless community, why not use the already familiar terms to define it?<CR><CR>

CommentType | Comment Status | Response Status

377 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.1.1 **TR / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL
Why is backoff counter decrementing irrespective of channel conditions? Measuring CCA for a small time unit (phy-slot) and decrementing b

379 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.1.1 **TR / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL
if the backoff timer is arbitrary, how does the next transmission supposed to sync up with the slotted CSMA/CA timings

380 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.1.1 **TR / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL
These lines seem to provide a means to higher layers using which they can indicate tx-immediate or abort a packet. since this retry-limit is a

381 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.2.1 **TR / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL

382 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.2.2.1 **TR / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL
if NC is snoozing how do non-NC-capable DEVs detect the presence of NC

387 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.4 **TR / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL
this clause also assumes that there are no GTS-alloc/dealloc related transactions over the air initiated/terminated-at MAC. How do GTS re-a

388 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.5 **TR / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL
DCS: How does the NC know the channel condition at DEVs to decide to change the channel? How does it communicate the decision to the

389 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.5 **TR / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL
DCS: What is the timeout for DEVs to start searching for the missing NC? How does a DEV distinguish the conditoins among (a) bad chann

390 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.6 **TR / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL
How does the "macMAxHandshakeWaitDuration" work in GTS?

391 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.6.1 **TR / X / W** GUBBI, RAJUGOPAL
This clause does an attempt to describe the ack-timeout procedure. If what is needed already exists in an understood format, especially wit

447 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 7.1.2.15 **TI / A / W** Gutierrez, Jose
Page 70:<CR>Section 7.1.2.15.1: How does the MAC knows where to search? the network ID in the PIB -> then state it.<CR><CR>On line

451 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** Table 52 **TI / A / W** Gutierrez, Jose
Table 52: Why do I need to track the beacon? I mean it is good to know you are in sync (and when you are not) but this can be a function in

469 **Cl** 07 *MAC EDIT* **SC** 7.5.2 **ED / X / W** Gutierrez, Jose
Recommend to add a flow diagram for Sections 7.5.2.1 and 7.5.2.2

479 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** **TI / X / W** Gutierrez, Jose

480 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** **/** Gutierrez, Jose
HOW A SHORT ADDRESS IS ALLOCATED?

482 **TI / X / W**
Table 26: In TxOptions: What is the meaning of "transmit in the current GTS"?

483 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 7.1.2.6 **TI / X / W** Gutierrez, Jose
Page 63 and 64: The GTS Reallocation looks like garbage collection. I would like to eliminate this functionality and leave it for the upper laye

484 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 7.5.4.2 **TI / X / W** Gutierrez, Jose
Why the upper layers have to do a confirmation of the GTS reallocation?Can we leave the reallocation for the upper layers?

485 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 7.5.4.1 **TI / X / W** Gutierrez, Jose
What is the protocol for a NC to setup a GTS? How does a node request a GTS?

Comment Status

CommentType | Response Status

535 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** Table 44 **T / X / W** Jamieson, Phil

The ChannelList parameter talks about a list of channels from the list of available PHY channels. How will this be done? Do we refer to the

564 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 7.5.2.4 **T / X / W** Jamieson, Phil

Editorials - see remedy.<CR><CR>Paragraph 2, the synchronization "as described above" probably needs to be spelled out - synchronisatic

588 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 1.2.7 **TR / X / W** Kinney, Patrick

The reallocation of GTSs is a good idea but I cannot understand how the mechanism's stated in this section will work. Specifically how will

591 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.2.2 **TR / X / W** Kinney, Patrick

I did not find any description of the mechanism for resolving duplicate network id's. I understand the network search but it may not find a ne

592 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.5 **TR / X / W** Kinney, Patrick

Dynamic Channel Selection is a good feature (very good for coexistence) but is not described in detail

593 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.2.3 **TR / X / W** Kinney, Patrick

In Network Synchronization, there really is no description of the procedure to attach and join a network. Specifically I believe that logical ad

594 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.2.3 **TR / X / W** Kinney, Patrick

In Network Synchronization, there really is no description of the procedure to attach and join a network. Specifically, how is authorization c

642 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** Table 68 **T / A / W** Shepherd, Nick

macBeaconTxTime: What unit does this use, eg seconds? What time is returned? Absolute time from w hen? Who is responsible for keepi

644 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.4.1 **T / X / W** Shepherd, Nick

This explanation of allocating a GTS is not complete. Is it possible to allocate the complete frame to GTSs, leaving no contention period? Sh

646 **Cl** 07 *MAC TECH* **SC** 5.5 **T / X / W** Shepherd, Nick

This clause specifies that a clear channel is detected by use of the MLME-ED Energy Detection method, in conflict with clause 6.8.10