Project	**IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group <http://ieee802.org/16>**
Title	Maintenance Task Group Session #48 Minutes
Date Submitted	**2007-03-15**
Source(s)	Jonathan Labs Wavesat, Inc. 1375 Trans-Canada Hwy Dorval, Qc H9P 2W8 Canada	Voice: +1 514 684 0200 x325 Fax: +1 514 684 0211 mailto:jlabs@wavesat.com
Re:	Maintenance Task Group Session #48 Minutes
Abstract	Maintenance Task Group Session #48 Minutes
Purpose	Maintenance Task Group Session #48 Minutes
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.
Patent Policy and Procedures	The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy and Procedures <http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html>, including the statement "IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard." Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair <mailto:chair@wirelessman.org> as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technology under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.16 Working Group. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site <http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices>.

Maintenance Task Group Session #48 Minutes
Jonathan Labs
TG Chair
Wavesat, Inc.

Maintenance Task Group
Session #48, Orlando, FL, USA Caribe Royale Orlando

Editor: Joe Schumacher

Tuesday, March 12, 2007

Room: Grand Sierra H

8:08: Opened meeting of the Maintenance Task Group

Presented the agenda in IEEE 802.16maint-07/008.

8:13: Motion to approve the agenda (IEEE 802.16maint-06/008): Moved by Wonil Roh, seconded by Lei Wang.
Approved by unanimous voice vote.

Presented the remaining slides in IEEE 802.16maint-07/008.

8:22: Motion to approve minutes from Session 47 (IEEE 802.16maint-07/002): Moved by Ed Agis, seconded by Lei Wang.
Discussion on the motion followed. The TG chair pointed out that the title and the submission date needed to be corrected. IEEE 802.16maint-07/002r1 was generated to correct the errors and uploaded to Maintenance upload directory on the local server.

Motion amended to approve the minutes in IEEE 802.16maint-07/002r1: Accepted by unanimous voice vote.

Started resolving the comments in 80216-07_013r5.cmt, going through technical comments first.

9:00 Head count (to determine room requirements for Session #50 in San Franciso): 23 people

10:08 Break for coffee.

10:28 Resume after coffee.

12:05 Broke for lunch.

12:06 TG Editor generated 80216-07_013r5a.cmt, which contains the comment resolutions for LB #23a as of Tuesday noon.

13:25 Resumed meeting after lunch break.

Continued reviewing the comments in 80216-07_013r5a.cmt from LB #23a.

13:45 Head count (to determine room requirements for Session #50 in San Franciso): 26 people

15:10 Broke for coffee
15:28 Resumed after coffee break

16:00 Head count (to determine room requirements for Session #50 in San Franciso): 19 people

18:10 Broke for the evening

18:15 TG Chair generates 80216-07_013r5b.cmt, containing the comment resolutions as of 18:10, Tuesday and one late comment, and uploaded the file to the Temp directory.

Wednesday, March 14, 2007

Room: Grand Sierra H

0:36 WG Chair forwards two comments from a NesCom member, Jon Rosdahl, on the 802.16 Revision PAR draft:

8:10 Resumed meeting. Start addressing the two comments from Jon Rosdahl.

9:55 Finished the following draft letter in response to the comments from Jon Rosdahl:

"Dear Mr. Rosdahl,

Thank you for the comments regarding the IEEE 802.16 Revision PAR. Listed below are the responses to your comments from the Working Group:

1. "I believe that revisions have to be done in required times, i.e. after 4 amendments are done it is required. In the notes, it is indicated that '(and possible subsequent amendments)' so the standard may get more than the 4 listed."

   Regarding this comment, we cite Subclause 9.2 of the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual: "The Sponsor shall initiate revision of a standard whenever any of the material in the standard (including all amendments, corrigenda, etc.) becomes obsolete or incorrect, or if three or more amendments to a base standard exist three years after its approval or most recent reaffirmation." This allows for the possibility that additional amendments may be approved to the base standard up until the three-year deadline. The PAR recognizes the possibility that the revision may incorporate those additional amendments.

2. "Also I believe that while the corrigenda developed by the group is viable for the revision, I am uncertain why we have listed the group specific document rather than a P&P or IEEE process."

In response to this comment, we propose to modify the wording as follows:

7.4 Additional Explanatory Notes: (Item Number and Explanation)

(5.2) The revision will consolidate IEEE Standards 802.16-2004, 802.16e-2005, 802.16-2004/Cor1-2005, and 802.16f-2005 (and possible subsequent amendments), incorporating ~~corrigenda as developed in the IEEE 802.16 Working Group Maintenance Process (as described in IEEE 802.16-06/046)~~ the P802.16-2004/Cor2 draft. No new functionality will be added.

We recognize that the document IEEE 802.16-06/046, describing the Working Group Maintenance Process, is an internal Working Group document. Therefore, we modify the text to explicitly reference the corrigendum draft (P802.16-2004/Cor2), rather than the WG Maintenance Process.

We hope these responses address your concerns.

Best regards,

The 802.16 Working Group"

The WG Chair suggested he let Jon Rosdahl see the letter and get his feedback before formally approving the letter and submitting it before 17:00. It is suggested that the letter be reviewed again after Jon Rosdahl's feedback after the lunch break. The TG agreed by silent consent to postpone the final vote on the comments until the afternoon meeting.

10:00 Broke for coffee.

10:25 Resumed meeting. Resumed comment resolution on LB #23a with database 80216-07_013r5b.cmt.

11:20 Head count (to determine room requirements for Session #50 in San Franciso): 25 people

12:10 Broke for lunch

13:25 TG Chair generate 80216-07_013r5c.cmt based on comment resolutions on LB #23a as of 12:10 Wednesday, including 7 late comments. The database is uploaded to the Temp upload directory on the local server.

13:37 Resumed session after lunch with comment resolution on database 80216-07_013r5c.cmt.
14:50 Head count (to determine room requirements for Session #50 in San Franciso): 20 people

15:18 Break for coffee.

15:25 Received from the WG Chair the feed back and suggested additional changes to the responses to the

comments from Jon Rosdahl. The proposed letter is the following:

"Dear Mr. Rosdahl,

Thank you for the comments regarding the IEEE 802.16 Revision PAR. Listed below are the responses to your comments from the Working Group:

3. "I believe that revisions have to be done in required times, i.e. after 4 amendments are done it is required. In the notes, it is indicated that '(and possible subsequent amendments)' so the standard may get more than the 4 listed."

Regarding this comment, we cite Subclause 9.2 of the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual: "The Sponsor shall initiate revision of a standard whenever any of the material in the standard (including all amendments, corrigenda, etc.) becomes obsolete or incorrect, or if three or more amendments to a base standard exist three years after its approval or most recent reaffirmation." This allows for the possibility that additional amendments may be approved to the base standard up until the three-year deadline. The PAR recognizes the possibility that the revision may incorporate those additional amendments.

In response to this comment, we propose to replace '(and possible subsequent amendments)' with '(and possibly 802.16g and 802.16i, if completed in time).'

4. "Also I believe that while the corrigenda developed by the group is viable for the revision, I am uncertain why we have listed the group specific document rather than a P&P or IEEE process."

In response to this comment, we propose to modify the wording as follows:

7.4 Additional Explanatory Notes: (Item Number and Explanation)
(5.2) The revision will consolidate IEEE Standards 802.16-2004, 802.16e-2005, 802.16-2004/Cor1-2005, and 802.16f-2005 (and possibl~~y~~ 802.16g and 802.16i, if completed in tim~~ee subsequent amendments~~), incorporating ~~corrigenda as developed in the IEEE 802.16 Working Group Maintenance Process (as described in IEEE 802.16-06/046)~~ the P802.16-2004/Cor2 draft. No new functionality will be added.

We recognize that the document IEEE 802.16-06/046, describing the Working Group Maintenance Process, is an internal Working Group document. Therefore, we modify the text to explicitly reference the corrigendum draft (P802.16-2004/Cor2), rather than the WG Maintenance Process.

We hope these responses address your concerns.

Best regards,

The 802.16 Working Group"

13:35 Resumed meeting

15:45 Motion: Accept the draft letter (included above) as the WG response to the comments from Jon Rosdahl on the 802.16 Revision PAR. Forwarded by Wonil Roh, seconded by Dov Andelman
In favor: 15
Opposed: 0
Abstentions: 0
Motion Passes.

18:10 Break for the evening

Thursday, March 15, 2007
Room: Grand Sierra H

7:50 TG Chair generates 80216-07_013r5d.cmt, containing the comment resolutions as of 18:10, Wednesday and 7 late comments, and uploaded the file to the Temp directory.

8:15 Resumed meeting.

Listed the following editorial comments in 80216-07_013r5d.cmt for consideration for accepting in a block vote: 10, 24, 31, 39, 41, 46, 64, 70, 94L, 96L, 99L, 136, 146LL.

Resumed comment resolution on 80216-07_013r5d.cmt.

10:15 Broke for coffee

10:30 Resumed meeting.

11:40 Start resolving editorial comments in 80216-07_013r5d.cmt.

12:05 Break for lunch

13:20 Resumed meeting

14:55 Motion: To accept the editorial comments listed in contribution IEEE C802.16maint-07/032.
Forwarded by: Michael Wang

Seconded by: Jeff Harrang
In favor: 10
Opposed: 0
Abstains: 0
Motion Passes.

15:00 Break for coffee
15:18 Resume meeting

17:51 Finished comment resolution on 80216-07_013r5e.cmt and generated 80216-07_013r6.cmt and uploaded it to the WG directory on the local server.

17:53 Motion: to continue the Maintenance TG meeting until we complete our work. forwarded by Joe Schumacher, seconded by Wonil Roh.
In favor: 10
opposed: 0
absentions: 0
Motion passes.

17:55 Break for 10 minutes.

18:05 Resume meeting with the closing. Presented slides in IEEE 802.16maint-07/009.

Summary of IEEE 802.16-07/013r6:
- 162 comments (17 late comments)
    - 10 Technical binding
    - 98 Technical non-binding
    - 54 Editorial
- ~24 contributions
- Resolution summary:
    - 140 Accepted or Accepted-modified
    - 3 Rejected
    - 7 Withdrawn
    - 12 Superceded

18:05: Motion: To accept the database 80216-07_013r6.cmt as the comment resolutions for LB #23a.

Forwarded by: Wonil Roh
Seconded by: Giovanni Maggi
In favor: 9
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Motion passes

18:08: Motion: To authorize the editor to generate the draft P802.16-2004/Cor2/D3 according to the resolutions in 80216-07_013r6.cmt.

Forwarded by: Jose Puthenkulam

Seconded by: Michael Wang
In favor: 9
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Motion passes

18:13: Motion: To authorize the TG Chair to make the following motion at the IEEE 802.16 Working Group Session #48 Closing Plenary:

"To accept the database 80216-07_013r6.cmt as the comment resolutions for LB#23a on P802.16-2004/Cor2/D2, and to open a Working Group Confirmation Letter Ballot on P802.16-2004/Cor2/D3 as generated from P802.16-2004/Cor2/D2 modified by the comment resolutions in 80216-07_013r6.cmt."

Forwarded by: Michael Wang
Seconded by: Jose Puthenkulam
In favor: 8
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Motion passes

18:20: Motion: To authorize the TG Chair to make the following motion at the IEEE 802.16 Working Group Session #48 Closing Plenary:

"To accept the changes to the Revision PAR in IEEE 802.16-07/008r1, and to authorize the WG Chair to submit the modified PAR for EC approval."

Forwarded by: Lei Wang
Seconded by: John Humbert
In favor: 10
Against: 0
Abstain: 0
Motion passes

Consolidates 802.16-2004, 802.16e-2005, 802.16-2004/Cor1-2005, 802.16f-2005.
Itzik Kitroser to head a review group for the consolidation document.
Looking for volunteers:
    3-4 (PHY) people to look at section 8
    ~3 (MAC) people to look at section 6
    1-2 (security) people for section 7 and related issues in section 11
    1-2 people for section 11
Þ 8-10 people

Volunteers:
    Giovanni Maggi (MAC)
    Samsung (1 PHY, 1 MAC) (volunteered by Wonil Roh)
    Joe Schumacher
    Jon Labs
    Intel (1 MAC+PHY) (volunteered by Hassan Yaghoobi)

18:40 Motion to adjourn forwarded by John Humbert, seconded by Wonil Roh.
Motion passes by unanimous voice vote.