Project	**IEEE 802.16 Broadband Wireless Access Working Group <http://ieee802.org/16>**
Title	**Inconsistencies and Recommended Remedies for Document IEEE P802.16f/D1**
Date Submitted	**2004-11-17**
Source(s)	Rainer Ullmann Wavesat 1375 Trans-Canada Highway, Suite 300 Dorval, Quebec H9P 2W8, Canada Voice: (514) 684-0200 Ext 321 Fax: (514) 684-11 rullmann@wavesat.com
Re:	Contribution to support comment to IEEE 802.16 Working Group Letter Ballot #16
Abstract	The document under consideration in the letter ballot #16 contains discrepancies between the MIB description, listing and representation
Purpose	To correct inconsistencies in the document IEEE P802.16f/D1, October 2004
Notice	This document has been prepared to assist IEEE 802.16. It is offered as a basis for discussion and is not binding on the contributing individual(s) or organization(s). The material in this document is subject to change in form and content after further study. The contributor(s) reserve(s) the right to add, amend or withdraw material contained herein.
Release	The contributor grants a free, irrevocable license to the IEEE to incorporate material contained in this contribution, and any modifications thereof, in the creation of an IEEE Standards publication; to copyright in the IEEE's name any IEEE Standards publication even though it may include portions of this contribution; and at the IEEE's sole discretion to permit others to reproduce in whole or in part the resulting IEEE Standards publication. The contributor also acknowledges and accepts that this contribution may be made public by IEEE 802.16.
Patent Policy and Procedures	The contributor is familiar with the IEEE 802.16 Patent Policy and Procedures <http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/policy.html>, including the statement "IEEE standards may include the known use of patent(s), including patent applications, provided the IEEE receives assurance from the patent holder or applicant with respect to patents essential for compliance with both mandatory and optional portions of the standard." Early disclosure to the Working Group of patent information that might be relevant to the standard is essential to reduce the possibility for delays in the development process and increase the likelihood that the draft publication will be approved for publication. Please notify the Chair <mailto:chair@wirelessman.org> as early as possible, in written or electronic form, if patented technology (or technology under patent application) might be incorporated into a draft standard being developed within the IEEE 802.16 Working Group. The Chair will disclose this notification via the IEEE 802.16 web site <http://ieee802.org/16/ipr/patents/notices>.

Inconsistencies and Recommended Remedies for Document IEEE P802.16f/D1

Rainer Ullmann
Wavesat

1. Problem Statement

The implementation of the MIB as described in document IEEE P802.16f/D1 shows many inconsistencies between the graphic tree representation (figure 2), the structural description section 5 and the listing of the implementation of wmanIfMib inn section 6. This document lists all found inconsistencies and proposes fixes.

2. Problem Listing

1. Figure 2 does not describe the complete MIB structure but only to level 4 in the hierarchy. This should be stated. Furthermore, wmanIfBsObjects,wmanIfSsObjects and wmanIfCmnObjects no children of wmanIfMib. Intermediate level wmanIfMibObjects is missing.
2. `Section 5.1.1.4 describing wamIfBsSsPacketCounterTable in wmanIfBsCps is missing.`
3. Figure 2 refers to wmanIfBsChMeasurementTable in the third branch of wmanIfBsCps while section 5.1.2.3 refers to that branch as wmanIfBsStatisticsTable. Section 6 lists it as wmanIfBsStatisticCounter. Furthermore listing in 6 has two more statistics subsections (wmanIfBsChMeasurementTable & wmanIfBsFecCounterTable) which are not shown in Figure 2.
4. Figure 2 misses the subsections of wmanIfBsPkm (wmanIfBsPkmBaselineTable, wmanIfBsPkmAuthTable and wmanIfBsPkmTekTable). Furthermore in section 6, this branch is referred to as wmanIfBsPkmObjects. In section 6 wmanIfBsPkmTekTable is referred to as wmanIfBsPkmTEKTable. Convention seems to be to use only first letter capitalized. Hence, change all instances of TEK to Tek. Along this line change TLV to Tlv, DHCP to Dhcp, MAP to Map, EIRP to Eirp, TTG to Ttg, RTG to Rtg and RSS to Rss.
5. Figure 2 wmanIfBsNotification branch ends, so does section 5.1.4 listing. However, listing in section 6 includes branches wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions and wmanIfBsTrapControl. Furthermore wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions contains Trap responses and another branch with the definitions for those traps. It seems very confusing and maybe it would be simpler if a lower level branch wmanIfTrapBsEvents were created (same level as wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions and wmanIfBsTrapControl) and the trap reponses moved there. Furthermore, within wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions is a child wmanIfBsThresholdConfigTable which should be part of the wmanIfBsTrapControl branch – as it is already in the corresponding SS section.
6. WmanIfSsConfigurationTable lacks reference to p802.16REVd/D5.
7. In figure 2 the following groups losted in section 5 are missing:

   5.2.3 wmanIfSsPkmAuthTable

   5.2.3.1 wmanIfSsPkmTekTable

   5.2.3.2 wmanIfSsPkmCertificatesTable

   For consistency with the corresponding branch in the BS section they should branch off from 5.2.2. wmanIfSsPkm which is in section 6 referred to as wmanIfSsPkmObjects. The listing in section 6 is in fact according to the BS section. In section 6 but wmanIfSsPkmCertificatesTable is referred to as wmanIfSsDeviceCertTable
8. **5.2.4 wmanIfSsTraps** is referred to as wmanIfSsNotification in figure 2 and section 6. Taking 7. Into account the section has to be renumbered to 5.2.3
9. Entries in wmanIfCmnBsSsConfigurationTable lack reference to standard.
10. In Figure 2 in wmanIfCmnCps third subbranch is wmanIfCmnSsChMeasurementTable, in listing 6 wmanIfCmnStatCounter becomes it's mother (with another sibling wmanIfCmnSsFecCounterTable).
11. Figure 2 and 5.3.3. refer to wmanIfCmnPrivacy but listing in 6 uses wmanIfCmnPkmObjects. The latter is aligned to BS and SS sections. Branch wmanIfCmnCrypotSuiteTable is missing in figure 2

3. Proposed Remedies

To 1.)

p.13, l.7 add:
Figure 2 shows the first 5 levels of MIB structure of wmanIfMib for 802.16. The MIB structure is organized based on the reference model as defined in IEEE 802.16REVd/D5 standard.

l.61: Figure 2— First 5 levels of wmanIfMib Structure
In figure 2 add:

wmanIfMib ----- wmanIfMibObjects_____ wmanIfBsObjects
| _____ wmanIfSsObjects
| _____ wmanIfCmnObjects

To 2.)

At p.8 l.36 insert
5.1.1.4. wmanIfBsSsPacketCounterTable
This table contains counters to keep track of the number of packets or octets that have been received or transmitted on the per servie flow basis.

To 3.)

At p.8 l.56 change title:
5.1.2.3 wmanIfBsStatistic~~sTable~~Counter

in figure 2 modify:

---~~wmanIfBsChMeasurementTable~~ wmanIfBsStatisticCounter
|_____ wmanIfBsChMeasurementTable
|_____ wmanIfBsFecTable

To 4.)

In figure 2 add branches

--- wmanIfBsPkmObjects _____ wmanIfBsPkmBaseTable
|_____wmanIfBsPkmAuthTable
|_____wmanIfBsPkmTekTable

on p.9 l.1 and l.3 replace:
wmanIfBsPkmObjects

on p.9 l.7 modify:
wmanIfBsPkmBase~~line~~Table

on p.58 in lines 27,29,39,40,53,5456-65,
on p.59 in lines 1-13,17,27,30,45,48,60,62,
on p.60 in lines 8,10,22,25,38,40,51,54,65,
on p.61 in lines 2,10,13,26,37,48,58,61,
on p.62 in lines 4,21,34,37,50,52,63,
on p.80 in line 1,
on p.85 in lines 40-62:
on p.86 in lines 1,9,12,25,27,39,42,52,55,
on p.87 in lines 2,4,20,23,34,36,47,49,57,60,
on p.88 in lines 4,6,15,18,27,30,39,42,51,54,
on p.89 in lines 4,6,17,19,33,36,47

change T~~EK~~ek

on p.91 line 49
change T~~LV~~lv

on p.92 line 11
change D~~HCP~~hcp

on p.42 line 25 and p.55 l.29
change M~~AP~~ap

on p.121 line 23 and 39
change E~~IRP~~irp

on p.121 line 25 and p.122 l.1
change T~~TG~~tg

on p.121 line 26 and p.122 l.13
change R~~TG~~tg

on p.121 line 27 and p.122 l.25
change R~~SS~~ss

To 5.)

In figure 2 add branches:

--- wmanIfBsNotification _____ wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions
|_____wmanIfBsTrapControl
|_____wmanIfBsTrapEvents

p.9 l.27:
5.1.4 wmanIfBsNotification
The wmanIfBsNotification group contains BS traps information~~. to report fault events and exceptions, such as power status, RSSI threshold crossing.~~

5.1.4.1 wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions

This group contains trap threshold definitions for BS fault events and exceptions such as power status, RSSI threshold crossing.

5.1.4.2 wmanIfBsTrapControl
This object is used to enable Base Station traps.

5.1.4.3 wmanIfBsTrapEvents
This object is used to track Base Station trap events.

p.63 l.8 add :
wmanIfBsTrapEvents OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { wmanIfBsNotification 3 }
p. 63 l.41:
::= { ~~wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions~~ wmanIfBsTrapControl 1 }
Probably move table definition and table entries to p.63 l.9

p.63 l.27
```
::= { wmanIfBsTrapControl 2 }
```

p.65 l.25:
```
::= { wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions 1}
```

p.67 l.46
::= { ~~wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions 3~~ wmanIfBsTrapEvents 1}

p.67 l.63
::= { ~~wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions 4~~ wmanIfBsTrapEvents 2}

p.68 l.15
::= { ~~wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions 5~~ wmanIfBsTrapEvents 3}

p.68 l.24
::= { ~~wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions 6~~ wmanIfBsTrapEvents 4}

p.68 l.24
::= { wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions ~~7~~2 }

p.70 l.20
::= { ~~wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions 8~~ wmanIfBsTrapEvents 5}
p.70 l.31
::= { ~~wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions 9~~ wmanIfBsTrapEvents 6}
p.70 l.48
::= { ~~wmanIfBsTrapDefinitions 10~~ wmanIfBsTrapEvents 7}

To 6.)

p.72 l.58 insert:

REFERENCE
"Section 10.1 in IEEE 802.16REVd/D5-2004"

To 7.)

p.9 l.57:
5.2.2 wmanIfSsPkmObjects

p.9, l.63 add.:
5.2.2.1 wmanIfSsPkmBaseTable
This table describes the basic PKM attributes of each SS wireless interface

p.10 l.l.:
5.2.~~3~~2.2 wmanIfSsPkmAuthTable
p.10 l.l.:
5.2.~~3.1~~2.3 wmanIfSsPkmTekTable
p.10 l.l.:
5.2.~~3.2~~2.4 ~~wmanIfSsPkmCertificatesTable~~ wmanIfSsDeviceCertTable

To 8.)

In figure 2 add branches:

--- wmanIfSsNotification _____ wmanIfSsTrapDefinitions
|_____wmanIfSsTrapControl
|_____wmanIfSsTrapEvents

p.10 l.18 modify:

5.2.3~~4 wmanIfSsTraps~~ wmanIfSsNotification

The wmanIf~~B~~SsTraps group contains SS traps information.~~to report fault events and exceptions, such as power status, RSSI threshold crossing.~~

p.90 l.44 add :
wmanIfBsTrapEvents OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { wmanIfSsNotification 3 }

p.10 l.23 add
5.2.3.1 wmanIfSsTrapDefinitions
This group contains trap threshold definitions for SS fault events and exceptions such as RSSI threshold crossing.

5.2.3.2 wmanIfSsTrapControl
This object is used to enable SS traps.

5.2.3.3 wmanIfSsTrapEvents
This object is used to track SS trap events.

p.91 l.58
::= { ~~wmanIfSsTrapDefinitions 1~~ wmanIfSsTrapEvents 1}

p.92 l.8
::= { ~~wmanIfSsTrapDefinitions 2~~ wmanIfSsTrapEvents 2}

p.92 l.18
::= { ~~wmanIfSsTrapDefinitions 3~~ wmanIfSsTrapEvents 3}

p.92 l.32
::= { ~~wmanIfSsTrapDefinitions 4~~ wmanIfSsTrapEvents 4}

p.92 l.43
::= { wmanIfSsTrapDefinitions ~~5~~1}

To 9)

p.109 l.64 add:
REFERENCE
"Section 10.1 in IEEE 802.16REVd/D5-2004"

To 10)

p.10 l.51

5.3.2.3 ~~wmanIfCmnSsChMeasurementTable~~ wmanIfCmnSsStatCounterTable

in figure 2 modify:

---~~wmanIfCmnSsChMeasurementTable~~ wmanIfCmnSsStatCounterTable
|_____ wmanIfCmnSsChMeasurementTable
|_____ wmanIfCmnSsFecCounterTable

To 11)

p.10 l.56
5.3.3 ~~wmanIfCmnPrivacy~~ wmanIfCmnPkmObjects

in figure 2 modify:

---~~wmanIfCmnPrivacy~~ wmanIfCmnPkmObjectgs
|_____wmanIfCmnCryptoSuiteTable

.