

Topology/Protection Comment Resolution Summary

Jason Fan, Section Editor
(jason@luminous.com)

Jim Kao, Technical Editor
(jkao@cisco.com)

Topology – Clause 10

- 40 comments
 - 36 technical
 - 4 editorial
- Adhoc group resolution (technicals)
 - 6 accepted
 - 2 accepted/clarified
 - 15 accepted/modified
 - 1 accepted/duplicate
 - 6 superceded
 - 2 withdrawn
 - 3 deferred
 - 1 rejected
- Editorial license requested

Summary of Resolutions

- 1463
 - Protection message to be used for discovery of station connectivity on ring; fast topology discovery message in D1.1 to be removed
 - Wrap capable bit to be added to protection message with justification as to why it is time critical
 - Topology extended status message to be renamed as topology message
- 234
 - Wrap status bit added to topology database
- 235
 - Topology informs protection that neighbor has changed for application of WTR
- 236, 237, 238
 - Definition of data reachability clarified

Summary of Resolutions cont.

- 240, 248, 249, 251
 - Clarifications on checks to be done on topology:
 - Duplicate MAC address checks across ring to be done by all stations
 - Maximum stations check
 - Removal of station capabilities check
- 243, 252, 253
 - State tables and flow charts to be updated based on combination of fast topology and protection messages into protection message
- 244, 250
 - Triggering and clearing conditions clarified for ringlet ID mismatch failure condition
 - Ringlet ID mismatch condition to be checked by neighbor stations

Summary of Resolutions cont.

- 257, 258, 260, 262, 267
 - Modifications to topology extended status message
 - Fields reporting reserved bandwidth reduced to 2 bytes with units and normalization equivalent to those used in fairness messages
 - Unknown bit modified to Mandatory bit
 - 4 bytes at front of each TLV have M bit, 10 bit type, 10 bit length, and 11 reserved bits
 - Multicast TLV removed
 - Station name TLV added as optional
 - All other TLVs other than vendor-specific TLVs are mandatory
- 266
 - Any topology extended status message received across a wrapped span will be stripped by the receiving station

Summary of Deferrals and Rejections

- 1477: Deferred
 - Request for topology bits for promiscuous mode proposal pending decision on bridging proposal
- 239: Deferred to PAH
 - Detailed definition of MAC address duplication checks needed
- 254: Deferred to PAH
 - Additional review needed of DVJ's dynamic bandwidth reservation contribution
- 1484: Rejected
 - Same as 254; rejected based on need for more detailed contribution

Protection – Clause 11

- 33 comments
 - 24 technical
 - 9 editorial
- Adhoc group resolution (technicals)
 - 2 accepted
 - 1 accepted/clarified
 - 1 accepted/duplicate
 - 11 accepted/modified
 - 7 superceded
 - 2 deferred
- Editorial license requested

Summary of Resolutions

- 269, 271
 - Clarifications on overview
- 274
 - Default value of fast timer for protection messages modified to 10 ms from 5 ms
- 275
 - WTR will be cleared based on higher priority condition elsewhere on ring
- 276
 - Loss of keepalive criteria to be configurable from 2 ms to 10 ms with 1 ms resolution and 3 ms default
- 278
 - Clarification in text to state that all stations report locally detected link status to the entire ring for both steering and wrapping

Summary of Resolutions cont.

- 281, 282
 - Clarifications on protection message field settings
 - Wrap status code set to 0 for steering rings
 - Editors to confirm bit ordering of protection message request type values
- 289, 290
 - Manual switch request will be rejected when there is an existing manual switch on ring
- 293
 - Any protection message received across a wrapped span will be stripped by the receiving station

Summary of Resolutions cont.

- 1504
 - Nonrevertive mode will have behavior corresponding to infinite WTR
 - Class of service or flow based control of revertive or nonrevertive behavior to be handled by client
- 1513
 - Wrapping and steering state diagrams to be combined
- 3596
 - Steering and wrapping will abide by rule on clearing of forced switch to prevent single-ended wraps

Summary of Deferrals and Rejections

- 287: Deferred to PAH
 - State diagrams to be further reviewed
- 1491: Deferred to PAH
 - Protection overview to be expanded for clarification

Annex J

- 1 comment (technical)
- Adhoc group resolution (technicals)
 - 1 accepted
- 347
 - Forced switch scenario to be added to Annex