

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 00 SC 0 P35 L3 # 128  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 For the following attributes add a 'UNITS "0.1 Watts"' clause and remove the "in units of 0.1 W" text from the description.  
 IldpV2Xdot3LocPDRRequestedPowerValue, IldpV2Xdot3LocPDRRequestedPowerValueA, IldpV2Xdot3LocPDRRequestedPowerValueB, IldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAllocatedPowerValue, IldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAllocatedPowerValueA, IldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAllocatedPowerValueB,  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P47 L23 # 129  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 Remove the following text from IldpV2Xdot3LocPowerPairsExt description.  
 For a PSE, this attribute contains the value of the aPSEPowerPairs attribute (see IEEE Std 802.3, 30.9.1.1.4).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P49 L11 # 130  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 For the following attributes change "local PD system" to "local PD"  
 IldpV2Xdot3LocPD4PID, IldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAutoclassSupport, IldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAutoclassCompleted, IldpV2Xdot3LocPSEAutoclassRequest, IldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownRequest,  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P50 L26 # 131  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 For the following attributes add a 'UNITS "Seconds"' clause and change the "number of seconds" to "time in the description."  
 IldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownTime  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P187 L52 # 104  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X  
 fix description and clause 30 reference for pethPsePortMPSAbsentCounter.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P188 L16 # 105  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X  
 Add missing class enums (5-8) to pethPsePortPowerClassifications, fix description and clause 30 pointer.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 00 SC 0 P188 L41 # 108

Jones, Peter Cisco  
Comment Type E Comment Status X

Fix descriptions and/or Clause 30 pointers for the following  
pethPsePortInvalidSignatureCounter  
pethPsePortPowerDeniedCounter  
pethPsePortActualPower  
pethPsePortPowerAccuracy  
pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy

SuggestedRemedy  
See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file  
Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 00 SC 0 P189 L16 # 106

Jones, Peter Cisco  
Comment Type ER Comment Status X

Add UNITS clause to pethPsePortActualPower, pethPsePortPowerAccuracy and  
pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy and rewrite description

SuggestedRemedy  
See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file  
Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 00 SC 0 P189 L16 # 107

Jones, Peter Cisco  
Comment Type ER Comment Status X

Add UNITS clause to pethMainPsePower and pethMainPseConsumptionPower and  
rewrite description

SuggestedRemedy  
See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file  
Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 00 SC 0 P193 L15 # 110

Jones, Peter Cisco  
Comment Type TR Comment Status X

remove obsolete pethPsePortShortCounter from pethPsePortGroup

SuggestedRemedy  
remove obsolete pethPsePortShortCounter from pethPsePortGroup  
Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 00 SC 0 P193 L53 # 109

Jones, Peter Cisco  
Comment Type T Comment Status X

Relocate pethPsePortShortCounter back into pethPsePortEntry at it's correct locaiton.

SuggestedRemedy  
See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file  
Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 00 SC 0 P285 L2 # 112

Jones, Peter Cisco  
Comment Type ER Comment Status X

Change "LLC (or other MAC user)" or "LLC" to "MAC client" in dot3StatsAlignmentErrors  
and dot3StatsFCSErrors as well as any other attributes in MIB.

SuggestedRemedy  
See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file  
Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 00 SC 0 P285 L2 # 120  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X  
 Change "LLC (or other MAC user)" or "LLC" to " MAC client" in dot3StatsAlignmentErrors and dot3StatsFCSErrors  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 00 SC 0 P299 L16 # 119  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 Delete empty line.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 00 SC 0 P287 L65 # 113  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status X  
 Remove " 7.2.4.6" and "dot3StatsSQETestErrors" from dot3StatsSQETestErrors REFERENCE.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 00 SC 0 P300 L48 # 118  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 Change "A count of " to "A 64 bit count" for dot3HCInPauseFrames & dot3HCOutPauseFrames  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 00 SC 0 P294 L7 # 114  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X  
 Change dot3StatsRateControlStatus to "read-write" to match clause 30  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 00 SC 0 P302 L38 # 122  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 For the following attributes change "A count" or "the count" to "A 64 bit count" or "the 64 bit count".  
 dot3HCStatsAlignmentErrors, dot3HCStatsFCSErrors,  
 dot3HCStatsInternalMacTransmitErrors, dot3HCStatsFrameTooLongs,  
 dot3HCStatsInternalMacReceiveErrors, dot3HCStatsSymbolErrors  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

CI 00 SC 0 P305 L52 # 121  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 Delete empty line.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P306 L55 # 123  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 For the following attributes change  
 000 -> thousand  
 000 000 -> million  
 dot3HCStatsTransmitLPIMicroseconds, dot3HCStatsTransmitLPITransitions,  
 dot3HCStatsReceiveLPITransitions,  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P308 L37 # 124  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3ExtensionEntry  
 attributes to dot3PauseTable .  
 Text shown below.  
 For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in  
 less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations  
 are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters.  
 Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the  
 management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of  
 ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P309 L34 # 125  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 dot3ExtensionMacCtrlStatus is incorrectly defined to be read-only. The matching clause 30  
 object (30.3.8.3.) is read-write.  
 Deprecate dot3ExtensionMacCtrlStatus and define new dot3ExtensionMacCtrlAdmin object.  
 Make equivalent change in etherExtensionMacCtrlGroup.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

CI 00 SC 0 P309 L47 # 126  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 "Move common text regarding Discontinuities from Dot3PFCEnter attributes to  
 dot3PFCTable.  
 Text shown below.  
 Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the  
 management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of  
 ifCounterDiscontinuityTime."  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 1 SC 1.3 P18 L27 # 94

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

Comment Type ER Comment Status X

per completed MEC, "A Word usage subclause shall appear in Clause 1 of the draft. It shall be either 1.3 after 1.2 Purpose; or, if the draft does not contain a Purpose subclause, as 1.2 after 1.1 Scope."

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a new subclause 1.3 entitled "Word usage" ahead of the existing subclause 1.3 and renumber all following subclauses.

The content is as follows:

The word shall indicates mandatory requirements strictly to be followed in order to conform to the standard and from which no deviation is permitted (shall equals is required to).1,2

The word should indicates that among several possibilities one is recommended as particularly suitable, without mentioning or excluding others; or that a certain course of action is preferred but not necessarily required (should equals is recommended that).

The word may is used to indicate a course of action permissible within the limits of the standard (may equals is permitted to).

The word can is used for statements of possibility and capability, whether material, physical, or causal (can equals is able to).

1The use of the word must is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, must is used only to describe unavoidable situations.

2The use of will is deprecated and cannot be used when stating mandatory requirements, will is only used in statements of fact

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.4.2 P43 L44 # 127

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Delete the following text for clarity.

For a PSE, this attribute contains a value derived from the aPSEPowerPairs attribute (see IEEE Std 802.3, 30.9.1.1.4).

For a PD, the contents of this attribute are undefined.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached LLDP-EXT-V2-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.4.2 P50 L20 # 97

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type T Comment Status X

I don't know how to interpret the lldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownRequest attribute or the lldpV2Xdot3LocPowerDownRequest clause 30 object it points too.

SuggestedRemedy

clarify description or deprecate object.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 5 SC 5.4.2 P74 L2 # 98

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type T Comment Status X

I don't know how to interpret the lldpV2Xdot3RemPowerDownRequest attribute or the aLldpXdot3RemPowerDownRequest clause 30 object it points to.

SuggestedRemedy

clarify description or deprecate object.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 8 SC 8 P180 L1 # 133

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Change "Ethernet data terminal equipment (DTE) power via medium dependent interface (MDI)" to "Power over Ethernet" to match 802.3-2022

SuggestedRemedy

See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P43 L35 # 134  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 Remove the following text from lldpV2Xdot3LocPowerPairs description.  
 For a PSE, this attribute contains a value derived from the  
 aPSEPowerPairs attribute (see IEEE Std 802.3, 30.9.1.1.4).  
 For a PD, the contents of this attribute are undefined.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P185 L31 # 99  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type T Comment Status X  
 Indexing for pethPsePortEntry is wrong. It should be using InterfaceIndex for PortIndex  
 and entPhysicalIndex for Group Index  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 May not be worth adding them to clause 30.  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P186 L18 # 101  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X  
 The current definition of pethPsePortAdminEnable is wrong.  
 The table needs two two states, status(pethPsePortAdminState) and  
 control(pethPsePortAdminEnable). pethPsePortAdminEnable is control and should point to  
 acPSEAdminControl not  
 aPSEAdminState.  
 Simplify descriptions.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P186 L51 # 102  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status X  
 Add "both" to pethPsePortPowerPairs.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P187 L27 # 103  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type E Comment Status X  
 Move "A value of searching(2)- indicates the PSE State diagram is in a state other than  
 those listed above." so it's in numerical order.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 See attached POWER-ETHERNET-MIB.mib file  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 8 SC 8.5.2 P187 L35 # 100  
 Jones, Peter Cisco  
 Comment Type T Comment Status X  
 PortPowerPriority is not defined in 802.3. There are many other objects like this in the PoE  
 MI, e.g. pethPsePortType, pethMainPseTable  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Not sure what to do about this class of objects in the PoE MIB.  
 Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 9 SC 9.1.1.3 P196 L55 # 96

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

Comment Type ER Comment Status X

Sensitive language used in the draft: master and slave

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a note at the end of 9.1.1.3 with the following text

NOTE—IEEE Std 802.3, Annex K defines optional alternative terminology for “master” and “slave”.

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 10 SC 10.4.2 P284 L21 # 111

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type TR Comment Status X

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3StatsEntry attributes to dot3StatsTable definition. Text shown below. For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters. Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 10 SC 10.4.2 P284 L21 # 115

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type ER Comment Status X

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3CollEntry attributes to dot3CollTable definition. Text shown below. For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters. Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 10 SC 10.4.2 P295 L55 # 116

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type ER Comment Status X

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3ControlEntry attributes to dot3ControlTable definition. Text shown below. For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC'/64 bit versions of these counters. Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response Response Status O

Comments Received

IEEE P802.3.1b D1.2 MIB Rev Task Force 2nd Working Group recirculation ballot comments

Cl 10 SC 10.4.2 P297 L37 # 117

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status X

Move common text regarding counter rollover and Discontinuities from Dot3PauseEntry attributes to dot3PauseTable definition. Text shown below. For interfaces operating at 10 Gb/s or more, 32 bit frame based counters can roll over in less than 5 minutes if they are incrementing at their maximum rate. Management stations are advised to use the 'HC/64 bit versions of these counters. Discontinuities in the values of counters in this table can occur at re-initialization of the management system, and at other times as indicated by the value of ifCounterDiscontinuityTime.

SuggestedRemedy

See attached EtherLike-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 13 SC 13.5.2 P446 L31 # 132

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type TR Comment Status X

Remove the following deprecated objects from maulfGrpFEC. ifMauFECCorrectedBlocks, ifMauFECUnCorrectableBlocks

SuggestedRemedy

See attached MAU-MIB.mib file

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 15 SC 15 P189 L # 135

Jones, Peter Cisco

Comment Type E Comment Status X

For the following attributes add a 'UNITS "Milliwatts"' clause and change the description to add clarity pethPsePortActualPower, pethPsePortPowerAccuracy, pethPsePortCumulativeEnergy

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response Response Status O

Cl 21 SC 21 P2 L8 # 95

Hajduczenia, Marek Charter Communication

Comment Type ER Comment Status X

pre MEC, IETF RFC 2856, IETF RFC 3411 are not cited normatively in text

SuggestedRemedy

Remove these two entries from Clause 2

Proposed Response Response Status O