

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 1 SC 1 P 1 L 1 # 24  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** Editorial  
 Comment applies to whole document.  
 Even/odd pages have a different font and fontsize for the page number.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 1 SC 4 P 20 L 16 # 189  
 Lukacs, Miklos Silicon Labs  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** Definitions  
 Terms PSE and PD should be defined prior to 1.4.241.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add the following definitons prior to 1.4.241.  
 1.4.xxx PSE: Power Sourcing Equipment optional power (non-data) entity, allowing devices to supply power using the same generic cabling as is used for data transmission.  
 1.4.xxx PD: Powered Device, optional power (non-data) entity, allowing devices to draw power using the same generic cabling as is used for data transmission.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED REJECT.  
 The definition section is in alphabetical order. We cannot control what terms come first.  
 EZ

Cl 30 SC 30.9.1.1.4 P 29 L 10 # 29  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** Editorial  
 "The enumeration "both" indicates that the PSE Pinout uses both Alternative A and Alternative B for detection and power."  
 Reword.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 "The enumeration "both" indicates that the PSE pinout comprises of both Alternative A and Alternative B and both are used for detection and power."  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 "The enumeration "both" indicates that the PSE pinout comprises both Alternative A and Alternative B and both are used for detection and power."  
 EZ

Cl 30 SC 30.9.1.1.4 P 29 L 10 # 28  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** Editorial  
 An ENUMERATED VALUE that has one of the following entries:  
 signal PSE Pinout Alternative A  
 spare PSE Pinout Alternative B  
 both PSE Pinouts on both Alternative A and B  
 We added 'both' to this in D1.4. A PSE does not have multiple pinouts.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change the 'both' line:  
 both PSE Pinout Alternative A and Alternative B  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.1.4.1 P 47 L 6 # 192

Lukacs, Miklos

Silicon Labs

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

Typo, comma not needed after the word: better.  
"Type 2 operation requires Class D, or better, cabling as specified"

SuggestedRemedy

Type 2 operation requires Class D, or better cabling as specified

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED REJECT.

The comma is needed as class D is the thing defined in ISO/IEC...

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33 P 1 L 1 # 30

Yseboodt, Lennart

Philips

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

General inconsistency, class is incorrectly using Capital letter at the following places.

- 33.2.4.4, page 64, line 52 and 53
- 33.2.4.4, page 65, line 31
- 33.2.4.5, page 57, line 34 and 35
- 33.2.6, page 86, line 5
- 33.2.6.1, page 90, line 17 and 20
- 33.2.6.2, page 91, line 35
- 33.2.6.2, page 92, line 5
- 33.2.7.10, page 109, line 13
- 33.3.2, page 115, line 37, 40, 43,48, 49, 52 and 53
- 33.3.3.3, page 116, line 52
- 33.3.3.3, page 117, line 1, 2, 38, 46 and 47
- 33.3.5, page 124, line 6
- 33.3.5.1, page 125, line 11
- 33.3.5.2, page 126, line 44
- 33.3.7.4, page 133, line 12

General rule: if we refer to a power Class (eg. Class 7), we capitalize.  
Otherwise (eg. class event, class signature) we don't.

SuggestedRemedy

Change Class to class.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.1.1 P 43 L 40 # 223

Dove, Daniel

Dove Networking Solut

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

The editor's instruction is incomplete

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "Delete section 33.1.1" with "Delete section 33.1.1 and renumber sections".

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.1.4 P 46 L 17 # 103

Yseboodt, Lennart

Philips

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

Table 33-1 title is "System power parameters Vs Maximum PSE Class"

Inconsistent capitalization.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "System power parameters vs maximum PSE Class"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.1.4 P 46 L 20 # 104

Yseboodt, Lennart

Philips

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

Table 33-1 uses Classes to indicate the maximum nominal power. The concept of Class is mentioned here for the first time.

SuggestedRemedy

Add a Tablenote sign to the header of the first column.  
Note to read: "See Table 33-7 for a mapping of Class to PSE output power" below Table 33-1.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.1.4 P 46 L 23 # 105  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 Table 33-1:  
 "twisted-pair cabling per 14.4 and 14.5 (Class D or Category 5 recommended)"  
 twisted is not capitalized.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change to 'Twisted'.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.1.4.2 P 47 L 28 # 166  
 Maguire, Valerie Siemon  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Cabling  
 Include corresponding TIA reference.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace, "as specified in ISO/IEC 11801:2002" with "as specified in ISO/IEC 11801:2002  
 and ANSI/TIA-568-C.2"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.0a P 48 L 11 # 107  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 "Table 33-1a summarizes the permissible PSE Types along with supported parameters."  
 Table ref is not a hyperlink.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4 P 57 L 49 # 108  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 In the state diagrams variable list, the first value comes right after "Values:"  
 Example:  
 ovl\_d\_det\_b  
 A variable indicating ...  
 Values:False: The PSE has not detected an overload condition on Alternative B.  
 True: The PSE has detected an overload condition on Alternative B.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Readability would be greatly improved if we introduces a newline after "Values:" and start  
 the first value/data pair indented on a second line.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.1 P 58 L 15 # 110  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 "If the PSE cannot supply power within T pon , it initiates and successfully completes a  
 new detection cycle before applying power. See section 33.2.7.12 for details."  
 Wrong way to refer (don` t use word section).  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 "If the PSE cannot supply power within T pon , it initiates and successfully completes a  
 new detection cycle before applying power, see 33.2.7.12."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.4 P 1 L 1 # 101  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 No spaces between Variable and description.  
 33.2.4.4, page 61, line 38  
 33.2.4.4, page 62, line 17  
 33.2.4.4, page 63, line 44  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add spaces.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.4 P 59 L 20 # 111  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 PD\_4pair\_candidate should be gone, there is a PD\_4pair\_cand already.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove PD\_4pair\_candidate from editing instruction.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.4 P 60 L 3 # 112  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 "A variable indicating if the PSE output current over Alternative A has been in an overload condition (see 33.2.7.6) for at least T CUT-2P of a one second sliding time."  
 Reword.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 "A variable indicating if the PSE output current over Alternative A has been in an overload condition (see 33.2.7.6) for at least T CUT-2P within a one second sliding window."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.4 P 60 L 20 # 113  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D Editorial  
 Variable PSE\_avail\_pwr is off-by-one with the Class number, causing a reader of the class diagram a needless headache.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Do not use value 0 for PSE\_avail\_pwr and this matches Class no. with PSE\_avail\_pwr values.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.4 P 60 L 33 # 114  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 'ramp of voltage' is strange.  
 also on line 41  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change to 'ramp up of voltage'.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.4 P 63 L 40 # 115  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 'ramp of voltage' is strange.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 change to 'ramp up of voltage'.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.4 P 65 L 18 # 199  
 Johnson, Peter Sifos Technologies

Comment Type T Comment Status D PSE Class

Table 33-3 and the following paragraph state options for 'class\_num\_events' variable. These options are okay for Single Signature but not for Dual Signature case.

In order to resolve Type-3 Dual Signature, 3 events are required. A PSE could have capacity to deliver a total of 13W to dual Class 1 or Class 2 PD's. According to the table, 13W sets class\_num\_events to 1. But it will take 3 events for this PSE to determine that the PD is Type-3 whereupon, it can then furnish 4-pair power given the Class 1 or Class 2 per pairset signature.

SuggestedRemedy

For now, this may be just an editor note to update this table pending resolution of all PSE mutual ID behaviors with Dual Signature PD's.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Add:

"Editor's Note (to be removed before D2.0): Table 33-3 must be updated for DS PDs."

Below Table 33-3.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.5 P 67 L 14 # 116  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

"do\_cnx\_check: This function returns the following variables:"  
 Function only returns one variable.  
 also on line 28.

SuggestedRemedy

Change 'variables' to 'variable'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.5 P 68 L 18 # 117  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type E Comment Status D

Indentation below "Signature\_A" is incorrect.  
 also on line 19.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix ident.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.5 P 69 L 24 # 118  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

Indentation below parameter type is incorrect.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.7 P 72 L 6 # 224  
 Dove, Daniel Dove Networking Solut

Comment Type E Comment Status D PSE SD

Within the states, the assignments, "<=" is used. In other SDs, a "leftarrow" is used.

SuggestedRemedy

#GSAR (Global Search and Replace)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Consult IEEE style guide and be consistant.

EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.7 P72 L 12 # 209  
Schindler, Fred Seen Simply

Comment Type ER Comment Status D PSE SD

Exit conditions from TEST\_MODE are not formatted correctly.

All exits check the status of mr\_pse\_enable incorrectly. This is also the case for exits from TEST\_ERROR\_A and TEST\_ERROR\_B.

SuggestedRemedy

Use the constructs,

(mr\_pse\_enable = force\_power)  
Or  
(mr\_pse\_enable = force\_power)

Where appropriate. Use the proper case for mr\_ not Mr\_.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.7 P74 L 6 # 211  
Schindler, Fred Seen Simply

Comment Type ER Comment Status D PSE SD

Fix typo PSE\_avail\_pwr, used for checking entry to POWER\_UP.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace with pse\_avail\_pwr.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.7 P76 L 41 # 119  
Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

Figure 33-9b on page 76 is missing the word "(continued)" in the figure caption.

SuggestedRemedy

Add 'continued'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.7 P79 L 1 # 232  
Dove, Daniel Dove Networking Solut

Comment Type E Comment Status X PSE SD

Assuming the Task Force agrees that the current classification state diagram only serves single-signature PD operation, move this diagram up in position with all other single-signature diagrams to make then contiguous. Do the same order of diagrams for dual-sig[a] and dual-sig[b] also.

SuggestedRemedy

Assuming the Task Force agrees that the current classification state diagram only serves single-signature PD operation, move this diagram up in position with all other single-signature diagrams to make then contiguous. Do the same order of diagrams for dual-sig[a] and dual-sig[b] also.

Proposed Response Response Status W

OBE by 234 (identical comment)

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.4.7 P79 L 13 # 231  
Dove, Daniel Dove Networking Solut

Comment Type E Comment Status D PSE SD

Within the logic for the arcs, the "<=" and or ">=" symbols are being used where the custom "lessthanorequalto" and or "greaterthanorequalto" symbols should be used.

SuggestedRemedy

#GSAR (Global Search and Replace)

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.2.5.0a P 81 L 6 # 121  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 "... of a PD as specified in clause 33.2.6."  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 "... of a PD as specified in 33.2.6."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.5.6 P 85 L 25 # 122  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 original text: "the result of connection check as described in 33.2.5.0, mutual identification,  
 and the results of other system..."  
 Reference is not correct  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to 33.2.5.0a  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.6 P 85 L 38 # 123  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D Editorial  
 "Additionally, mutual identification allows Type 2, Type 3 or Type 4 PSEs to differentiate  
 between Type 1, Type 2, Type 3 and Type 4 single-signature PDs (abbreviated Type 3/SS  
 and Type 4/SS respectively) and Type 3 and Type 4 dual-signature PDs (abbreviated Type  
 3/DS and Type 4/DS respectively)."  
 Since the 'signature' is a property of a PD and not part of the Type, we should not combine  
 them as such here.  
 SuggestedRemedy

"Additionally, mutual identification allows Type 2, Type 3 or Type 4 PSEs to differentiate  
 between Type 1, Type 2, Type 3 and Type 4 PDs."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.6 P 86 L 22 # 217  
 Schindler, Fred Seen Simply  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D Unbalance  
 Existing text, "n is a dimensionless factor. n = 1 when connected to a single-signature PD  
 or for Type 1 and Type 2 PSEs, n = 2 when connected to a dual-signature PD." Changes  
 legacy behavior.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace the text with,  
 "n is a dimensionless factor. n = 1 when connected to a single-signature PD or for Type 1  
 and Type 2 PSEs, n = 2 for Type 3 or Type 4 PSEs when connected to a dual-signature  
 PD."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.2.6 P 86 L 32 # 127  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial

"... the PSE may set its minimum power output based on the power drawn during Autoclass, ..."

This power is called P\_Autoclass.

SuggestedRemedy

"... the PSE may set its minimum power output based on P\_Autoclass, the power drawn during the Autoclass measurement window, ..."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.6 P 86 L 32 # 126  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial

"If the PD connected to the PSE performs Autoclass (see 33.3.5.3 and Annex 33C)..."

Missing reference to PSE Autoclass section.

SuggestedRemedy

"If the PD connected to the PSE performs Autoclass (see 33.2.6.3, 33.3.5.3, and Annex 33C)..."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.6 P 87 L 4 # 5  
 Darshan, Yair Microsemi

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial

There is missing links from the text in 33.2.6 to tables 33-7, 33-7a and 33-7b.

SuggestedRemedy

To add Editor Note prior to Table 33-7:  
 "Editor Note: To add missing links from the text in 33.2.6 to tables 33-7, 33-7a, and 33-7b."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.6 P 87 L 23 # 129  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial

Table 33-7 uses a formatting for Table notes which is inconsistent with other Tables in 33.

SuggestedRemedy

Make formatting consistent with eg. Table 33-1.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.6 P 89 L 4 # 130  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

Table 33-8  
 Table is center aligned, not consistent with other tables.  
 Also, contains redundant first row.

SuggestedRemedy

- Delete Row 1
- Left align where needed

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.6.2 P 92 L 23 # 131  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type T Comment Status D Editorial

Table 33-9 has an inconsistency in the Class signatures:  
 > 5.00 mA and < 8.00 mA May be class signature 0 or 1  
 > 13.0 mA and < 16.0 mA Either class signature 1 or 2

The other grey zones also use "Either"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace Column 2, Row 2 by "Either class signature 0 or 1"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ



IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.2.6.3 P94 L 12 # 132  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial

"PSEs implementing Autoclass shall measure the power consumption of the connected PD throughout the period bounded by T\_AUTO\_PSE1 and T\_AUTO\_PSE2 , defined in Table 33-10a measured from the transition of the POWER\_UP or SET\_PARAMETERS state to POWER\_ON state."

Refer to variable P\_Autoclass.  
 Also, this shall is unconditional to the PD requesting Autoclass or not.

SuggestedRemedy

"If the PSE implements Autoclass and the connected PD performs Autoclass, the PSE shall measure P\_Autoclass.  
 P\_autoclass is the power consumption of a connected PD measured throughout the period bounded by T\_AUTO\_PSE1 and T\_AUTO\_PSE2, defined in Table 33-10a.  
 T\_AUTO\_PSE1 and T\_AUTO\_PSE2 timing is referenced from the transition of the POWER\_UP or SET\_PARAMETERS state to the POWER\_ON state."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.6.3 P94 L 17 # 133  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial

Unneeded underline on last character.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove underline.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.6.3 P94 L 47 # 6  
 Darshan, Yair Microsemi

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial

There is Typo in  
 "PAutoclass is the measured power during the Autoclass window between TAUTO\_PSE2 and TAUTO\_PSE27"

SuggestedRemedy

Change from:  
 "PAutoclass is the measured power during the Autoclass window between TAUTO\_PSE2 and TAUTO\_PSE27"  
 To:  
 "PAutoclass is the measured power during the Autoclass window between TAUTO\_PSE1 and TAUTO\_PSE2"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7 P96 L 33 # 137  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type TR Comment Status D PSE Power

Table 33-11, Item 4, Icon is defined as PClass / Vport\_PSE-2P.

Vport\_PSE-2P is the allowed PSE PI voltage RANGE.  
 V\_PSE is the actual voltage at the PSE PI.

Clearly, Icon = PClass / V\_PSE is what was intended.  
 Note: PSE Type = All, careful not to change legacy Type requirement.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to Icon = PClass / V\_PSE.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7 P 97 L 10 # 140  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Table 33-11, Add Info, Item 7, Font size jump for 33.2.7.6 reference.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7 P 97 L 37 # 142  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Table 33-11, Add Info, Item 18, Reference to 33.2.9 is not an XREF.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7 P 97 L 40 # 31  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Table 33-11, Add Info, Item 19, Reference to 33.2.9 is not an XREF.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.1 P 100 L 17 # 36  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D PSE Power  
 "A Type 3 or Type 4 PSE that is connected to a Class 0-4 single-signature PD and is in the POWER\_ON state may transition between 2-pair and 4-pair power at any time, including after the expiration of T pon."  
 We can now differentiate between assigned Class and requested Class to make things more clear.  
 (eg. If a Class 6 PD gets power demoted to Class 4, the PSE may still hop between 2P and 4P mode).  
 SuggestedRemedy

"A Type 3 or Type 4 PSE that has assigned Class 1-4 to a single-signature PD and is in the POWER\_ON state may transition between 2-pair and 4-pair power at any time, including after the expiration of T pon."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.3 P 100 L 39 # 37  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Reference to 33.4.6 is not an XREF.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.4 P 100 L 4 # 35  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Reference to 33.2.7.4.1 is not an XREF.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.4 P 100 L 47 # 38  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Equations 33-3c, 3d and 3e are missing:  
 - accolades and unit  
 - 'where' part that describes the variables  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add accolades and unit as well as variable description.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.4 P 100 L 48 # 39  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type TR Comment Status D PSE Power  
 Equation 33-3c says  $I_{con-2P} = P_{class-2P} / V_{pse}$ .  
 This is wrong and does not match the adopted baseline.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 $I_{con-2P} = P_{class} / V_{pse}$   
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.4.1 P 102 L 15 # 174  
 Stover, David Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 Class not capitalized in equation 33-4b  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Capitalize all instances of Class in equation 33-4b  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 This follows Lennart's Rule  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.4.2 P 102 L 33 # 42  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 Section 33.2.7.4.2 contains only: "See Annex 33B".  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove section but include text above as sentence with reference to Annex 33B.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.5 P 102 L 47 # 43  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Reference to 33.3.7.3 is not an XREF.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.5 P 103 L 1 # 185  
 Dwelley, David Linear Technology  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** *Inrush*  
 Inrush text is still broken  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Presumably Yair and I will have a consensus presentation prepared in time for the meeting...  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 No changes to draft result from accepting this comment.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.6 P 104 L 10 # 44  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** *Editorial*  
 Reference to Equation 33-4 is not a hyperlink.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.6 P 104 L 11 # 46  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** *Editorial*  
 Reference to Figure 33-14 is not a hyperlink.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.7 P 106 L 12 # 48  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** *Editorial Fix*  
 The Equations 33-7a, 33-7b and 33-7c for I\_PSELT-2P have a copy/paste error.  
 The bottom row, I\_LIM-2P min for T\_CUT-2P min <= t) is wrong.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Change (3x) bottom row to I\_Con-2P for (T\_CUT-2P min <= t).  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.7 P 108 L 5 # 49  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** *Editorial*  
 Equation 33-7 is garbled.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Redo equation shrinkwrap.  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.11a P 109 L 50 # 50  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** *PSE Power*  
 original text: "This equates to a maximum IPort-2P current ITBDNAME defined in Equation 33-7c."  
 I\_LPS seems a reasonable name.  
*SuggestedRemedy*  
 Change all occurrences of I\_TBDNAME to I\_LPS  
 Proposed Response Response Status **W**  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.11a P 109 L 53 # 51  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 Inner brackets are not needed in the unnumbered equation on I\_LPS.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Remove inner brackets.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.11a P 109 L 53 # 53  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Equation 33-7d (I\_tbdname) has no number.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Number and label as 33-7d.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.7.11a P 109 L 53 # 52  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D Editorial  
 Unit in equation (unnumbered I\_LPS) is missing.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add accolades, unit and where clause with variable description.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.2.9.1.2 P 113 L 10 # 54  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 "... PD shall monitor each pairset and use the appropriate I Hold level shown in Table 33-11."  
 Table ref is not a hyperlink.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.2 P 115 L 7 # 55  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Table 33-13a is new material, but is formatted as 'changed'.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 - Add editing instruction "Insert Table 33-13a as follows:"  
 - Remove underlines  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.2 P 115 L 28 # 57  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Reference to 33.3.8 is not an XREF.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.3.3.3 P 116 L 19 # 16  
 Darshan, Yair Microsemi

Comment Type TR Comment Status D PD SD

It looks that the PD state machine is not clearly defined the behaviour of SS PD and DS PD.

Example: It is possible that with dual-sig PD with different class signature, one of the modes will have MPS and the 2nd not. This case is not covered.

SuggestedRemedy

Add Editor Note at line 19 page 116:

"Editor Note: To review state machine that clearly specify behavior of single-signature and dual signature PDs regarding the detection , classification, powerup and power on requirements for each pairset/mode"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.4 P 122 L 9 # 59  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

original text: "Any PD may indicate the ability to accept power on both pairsets using TLV variable PD 4P-ID in Table 79-6b or TBD."

Clarify.

SuggestedRemedy

"Any PD may indicate the ability to accept power on both pairsets using TLV variable PD 4P-ID in Table 79-6b or other (TBD) means."

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.4 P 122 L 43 # 60  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

'V offset' has space in between.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to 'V\_offset'

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.4 P 123 L 6 # 61  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type T Comment Status D Editorial

'V < 10.1V' the first V is not descriptive. also on line 8.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to 'V\_PD < 10.1V' twice.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.5.1 P 125 L 22 # 64  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial

Table 33-16 Caption= "Classification signature, measured at PD PI" 'the' missing

SuggestedRemedy

"Classification signature, measured at the PD PI"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

CI 33 SC 33.3.6 P 128 L 34 # 159

Bennett, Ken

Sifos Technologies, In

Comment Type **TR** Comment Status **D** PSE Class

The statement:

"After a successful Multiple-Event Physical Layer classification has completed the pse\_power\_level is set to either 2, 3, or 4."

It should include the value of 1, because it has been noted that a single event with a Mark is a Multiple-Event.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Change the statement to:

After a successful Multiple-Event Physical Layer classification has completed the pse\_power\_level is set to either 1, 2, 3, or 4.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

CI 33 SC 33.3.7 P 129 L 1 # 65

Yseboodt, Lennart

Philips

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** Editorial

Table 33-18 belongs to section 33.3.7 and following sections should come after the table.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Make sure Table is in front of section 33.3.7.1

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

CI 33 SC 33.3.7 P 129 L 31 # 67

Yseboodt, Lennart

Philips

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** Editorial

Table 33-1 is not an XREF.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Fix.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

CI 33 SC 33.3.7 P 129 L 45 # 68

Yseboodt, Lennart

Philips

Comment Type **E** Comment Status **D** Editorial

Table 33-18, Item 5, parameter name is incorrectly split in the cell.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Fix.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

CI 33 SC 33.3.7 P 130 L 1 # 70

Yseboodt, Lennart

Philips

Comment Type **ER** Comment Status **D** Editorial

Table 33-18, Additional information column uses inconsistent font size.

*SuggestedRemedy*

Fix.

Proposed Response Response Status **W**

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.1 P 129 L 30 # 66  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Table 33-18, Item 4, Add info, Font size inconsistency.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.2 P 131 L 5 # 72  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 "P Class\_PD in Table 33-16a is determined by the Class assigned by the PSE."  
 Further clarification is needed.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add after this sentence:  
 "The assigned PSE Class is determined by the number of classification events and the advertised Class by the PD, as shown in Table 33-7, Table 33-7a, and Table 33-7b".  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.3 P 132 L 6 # 73  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Reference to 33.2.7.4 is not an XREF.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.3 P 132 L 11 # 9  
 Darshan, Yair Microsemi  
 Comment Type T Comment Status D Inrush  
 This is the response to the remedy of comment # 150 in D1.3 which says:  
 To delete the text "See PSE-PD simplified Cport implementation model in Annex TBD."  
 From:  
 "Cport in Table 33-18 is the total PD input capacitance during POWER UP and POWER ON states that a PSE sees when connected to a single-signature PD over a pairset or both pairsets. When PSE is connected to dual-signature PDs, Cport value requirements are specified in 33.3.7.6."  
 "Yair is invited to provide figure and new text (no Annex)".  
 SuggestedRemedy

1. Change from:  
 "Cport in Table 33-18 is the total PD input capacitance during POWER UP and POWER ON states that a PSE sees when connected to a single-signature PD over a pairset or both pairsets. When PSE is connected to dual-signature PDs, Cport value requirements are specified in 33.3.7.6."  
 To:  
 Cport in Table 33-18 is the total PD input capacitance during POWER UP and POWER ON states that a PSE sees when connected to a single-signature PD over a pairset or both pairsets. When PSE is connected to dual-signature PDs, Cport value requirements are specified in 33.3.7.6."  
 See Figure 33-17.1 for PSE-PD simplified Cport interpretation model."  
 2. Add figure 33-17.1 after the above text as described in darashan\_02\_1115.pd.

Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED REJECT.  
 This comment has been replaced by comment 221.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.4 P 132 L 48 # 1  
 Darshan, Yair Microsemi  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 Editor's Note: "Item 4a still under investigation with respect to PD Vdiff no longer required"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Delete Editor Note.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ



IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.5 P 133 L 38 # 175  
 Stover, David Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 "A dual-signature PD shall not exceed 4.70mA/us in either polarity..." units should be expressed in mA/μs  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace mA/us with mA/μs  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.5 P 133 L 41 # 74  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Reference to Figure 33-18 is not a hyperlink.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.5 P 134 L 37 # 76  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Reference to Figure 33-18 is not a hyperlink.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.5 P 134 L 37 # 75  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Reference to Equation 33-13a is not a hyperlink.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.5 P 134 L 48 # 77  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 "Pclass<-----> is the minimum power output by the PSE, as defined in Table 33-7 and Section 33.2.6"  
 Both Table 33-7 and Section 33.2.6 are not proper cross references.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Make XREF, remove word Section.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.6 P 135 L 14 # 78  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 "A single-signature PD shall include C port as defined in Table 33-18 item 9."  
 We don't refer to specific items in a Table anywhere else.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 "A single-signature PD shall include C port as defined in Table 33-18."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.6 P 135 L 19 # 79  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 'single signature' is missing a dash.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to 'single-signature'.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.6 P 135 L 29 # 80  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 Type 1 description uses a dash to list the requirements, whereas following text uses a) and b) to list requirements.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Editor to check style guide and apply.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.6 P 135 L 50 # 81  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 Equation 33-14 has an italic 'mA' as unit at the end that should be non-italic.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Change to 'mA' to normal.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.6 P 136 L 3 # 82  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 Use spaces between number and units.  
 also on line 24  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Add spaces between numbers and units.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.6 P 136 L 7 # 83  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Reference to Figure 33-18 is not a hyperlink.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.6 P 136 L 7 # 176  
 Stover, David Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 "The PD mode input current spike shall not exceed ... During the test, both PD Modes voltages are driven from..." Capitalization of Modes is inconsistent and double plurality is ambiguous.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace text starting second line with "During the test, the voltage of both PD modes is driven..."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.6 P 136 L 12 # 84  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 "... the source impedance within 2.5% of R Ch (see Table 33-1),"  
 Fix hyperlink + change wording.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 "... the source impedance within 2.5% of R Ch as defined in Table 33-1,"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.6 P 136 L 13 # 85  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Reference to Equation 33-14 is not a hyperlink.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.6 P 136 L 18 # 86  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Reference to Figure 33-18 is not a hyperlink.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.6 P 136 L 18 # 177  
 Stover, David Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 "The PD mode input current spike shall not exceed ... During the test, both PD Modes  
 voltages are driven from..." Capitalization of Modes is inconsistent and double plurality is  
 ambiguous.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace text starting second line with "During the test, the voltage of both PD modes is  
 driven..."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.6 P 136 L 23 # 87  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 "... the source impedance within 2.5% of R Ch (see Table 33-1),"  
 Fix hyperlink + change wording.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 "... the source impedance within 2.5% of R Ch as defined in Table 33-1,"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.7.6 P 136 L 24 # 88  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Reference to Equation 33-14 is not a hyperlink.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.3.8 P 137 L 26 # 14  
 Darshan, Yair Microsemi

Comment Type T Comment Status D Editorial

Table 33-1-PD Maintain Power Signature should be Table 33-19.  
 Same in page 138 Table 33-1a should be 33-19a

SuggestedRemedy

1. Change Table 33-1-PD Maintain Power Signature to Table 33-19.
2. Change in page 138 line 4 from Table 33-1a to Table 33-19a.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

OBE by 90, 91

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.8 P 138 L 26 # 90  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

original text: "Table 33-1 PD Maintain Power Signature"  
 table numbering broken (references are correct to 33-19 though)

SuggestedRemedy

Table 33-19 PD Maintain Power Signature.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.3.8 P 139 L 4 # 91  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

original text: "Table 33-1a PD DC Maintain Power Signature"  
 table numbering broken (references are correct to 33-19a though)

SuggestedRemedy

Table 33-19a PD DC Maintain Power Signature

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.4.1.9.4 P 151 L 19 # 165  
 Maguire, Valerie Siemon

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial

Typo in Standards reference ("586" should be "568").

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "ANSI/TIA/EIA-586-A:1995" with "ANSI/TIA/EIA-568-A:1995"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.4.9 P 147 L 35 # 167  
 Maguire, Valerie Siemon

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial

A newer edition of this Standard with an improved figure is available.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace, "ANSI/TIA-568-C.0, 4.2" with "ANSI/TIA-568.D-0, 5.1"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.4.9.1.4c P 151 L 36 # 92  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial

"Midspan PSEs intended for operation with 10GBASE-T (variants 5 and 6 in Clause 33.4.9.1)"

Not an XREF.

SuggestedRemedy

Fix XREF and remove word 'Clause'.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33.6.3.5 P 166 L 3 # 95

Yseboodt, Lennart

Philips

Comment Type T Comment Status D Editorial

Figure 33-27 nor Figure 33-28 implement new features like "Request power down" and "Autoclass" via LLDP.

SuggestedRemedy

Add editors note: "New Type 3 and Type 4 LLDP features Request power down and Autoclass need to be included in state diagrams"

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.8.2.3 P 171 L 11 # 178

Stover, David

Linear Technology Cor

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

In PD Major capabilities/options table, PDCL2 is defined as "Implementation supports 2-Event Class signature" but the rest of the text has migrated to "Multiple-event"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace 2-Event Class signature with Multiple-Event Class signature

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33.8.2.4 P 172 L 28 # 179

Stover, David

Linear Technology Cor

Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial

In PSE Major capabilities/options, 2EPLC is defined as "Implementation supports 2-Event Physical Layer classification" but the referenced subclause and the rest of the text has migrated to "Multiple-Event Physical Layer classification"

SuggestedRemedy

Replace 2-Event Physical Layer classification with Multiple-Event Physical Layer classification

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33 SC 33A.5 P 190 L 21 # 12

Darshan, Yair

Microsemi

Comment Type T Comment Status D Editorial

In the equations

"For PD Type 4 class 8:  $R_{Pair\_max\_PD} = 2.200 * R_{Pair\_min\_PD} + 0.125$ .

For PD Type 4 class 7:  $R_{Pair\_max\_PD} = 2.010 * R_{Pair\_min\_PD} + 0.105$ .

For PD Type 3 class 6:  $R_{Pair\_max\_PD} = 1.800 * R_{Pair\_min\_PD} + 0.080$ .

For PD Type 3 class 5:  $R_{Pair\_max\_PD} = 1.750 * R_{Pair\_min\_PD} + 0.080$ .

For PD power above the values shown in Table 33-18 and up to PClass, stringent requirement will be needed to not exceed ICon-2P\_unb by means of smaller constants  $\alpha$  and  $\beta$  in the equation  $R_{Pair\_max\_PD} = \alpha * R_{Pair\_min\_PD} + \beta$ . the "\*" for multiplication need to be "x".

Need to fix in 5 locations lines 20,22,24,26 and 29.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "\*" with "x" in 5 locations:

Page 190 lines 20,22,24,26 and 29.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

Editor to consult style guide and make change if appropriate.

Yair, is changing the type of multiplication sign used really a technical comment?

EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33B.3 P 194 L 40 # 96  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 original text: "Verification of Icon-2P\_unb in step 6 confirms PSE conformance to Equation (33-4b)."  
 Wording is misleading to expect that Equation 33-4b would be about current.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 "Verification of Icon-2P\_unb in step 6 confirms PSE RPair\_max and RPair\_min are in conformance to Equation (33-4b)."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 Also, replace step 1) with:  
 1) Use Rload\_min and Rload\_max from Table 33B-1.  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33D.1 P 197 L 11 # 97  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 "The following table shows Single-Signature classification for Type 3 and Type 4 PSEs."  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 "Table 33D-1 shows single-signature classification for Type 3 and Type 4 PSEs."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 OBE by 151  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33D.1 P 197 L 17 # 98  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 Table is open at the bottom.  
 also on page 197 and 198.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Close Table.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 OBE by 151  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33D.1 P 197 L 50 # 99  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 Bottom line of table missing  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Draw bottom line.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 OBE by 151  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33D.1 P 198 L 37 # 100  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 Bottom line of table missing  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Draw bottom line.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 OBE by 151  
 EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33 SC 33D.1 P 199 L 39 # 143  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 "The following table shows Dual-Signature classification for Type 3 and Type 4 PSEs"  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 "Table 33D-2 shows dual-signature classification for Type 3 and Type 4 PSEs"  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 OBE by 151  
 EZ

Cl 33 SC 33D.1 P 200 L 4 # 198  
 Johnson, Peter Sifos Technologies  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D PSE Power  
 Table 33D-2 use the same terms, 'Max PSE Class' and 'Pclass(W)' as Table 33D-1. Yet in 33D-2, these terms are really referring to "per pairset". This should be clarified.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Re-name 'Max PSE Class' to 'Max PSE Class per pairset' and 'Pclass(W)' to 'Pclass(W) per pairset' or 'Pclass\_2p'.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.  
 OBE by 151  
 EZ

Cl 33A SC 33A.5 P 190 L 20 # 180  
 Stover, David Linear Technology Cor  
 Comment Type E Comment Status D Editorial  
 "class" not capitalized when referring to a PD Class.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Replace all 4 instances of class (5, 6, 7, 8) in 33A.5 with Class  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33B SC 33B P 191 L 10 # 145  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 "Current unbalance can occur in positive powered pairs, negative powered pairs, or both when a system uses all four pairs to 4-pair power when both PSE Alternatives provide power to both PD Modes."  
 Reword/shorter.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 "Current unbalance can occur in positive, negative, or all powered pairs, when a PSE uses all four pairs to deliver power to a PD."  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

Cl 33B SC 33B.2 P 193 L 27 # 149  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips  
 Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial  
 Currents I\_1 and I\_2 have inconsistent subscripting.  
 SuggestedRemedy  
 Fix.  
 Proposed Response Response Status W  
 PROPOSED ACCEPT.  
 EZ

IEEE P802.3bt D1.4 4-Pair Power over Ethernet 7th Task Force review comments

Cl 33D SC 33D P 193 L 47 # 150  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial

"The Effective resistance test method applies to the general case. If pair-to-pair balance is actively controlled in a manner that changes effective resistance to achieve balance, then the current unbalance measurement Method described in 33B.3 should be used."

Effective and Method should not be capitalized.

SuggestedRemedy

Decapitalize

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 33D SC 33D P 197 L 1 # 151  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial

The new Table 33-7 describes in a very nice way how power demotion works.  
 The colossal table 33D-1 in the Annex no longer seems needed.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete Annex 33D.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 79 SC 79.3 P 206 L 1 # 152  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type ER Comment Status D Editorial

Tables in Clause 79 have inconsistent formatting of the Tables.  
 (left/center alignment).

SuggestedRemedy

Find out what the right table format is and apply across Clause 79.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ

Cl 79 SC 79.3.2.4 P 209 L 6 # 154  
 Yseboodt, Lennart Philips

Comment Type T Comment Status D LLDP

original text: "A Type 3 or Type 4 device shall set the bits in power type to the highest Type the TLV generating device supports."  
 This sentence can be omitted, sentence in line 38 is more clear about what a Type 3 and Type 4 devices has to do with the fields.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove sentence.

Proposed Response Response Status W

PROPOSED ACCEPT.

EZ