Cl **0** *SC* **0** *P* *L* # R1-5

Berger, Catherine Editorial Coordination

Comment Type **G** *Comment Status* **X**

This draft meets all editorial requirements.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **0** *SC* **0** *P* **0** *L* **0** # R1-8

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **X**

While I recognize that the ship has already sailed on this particular decision and group consensus for change is unlikely, I persist in the view that PON with P2MP does not conform to or even align with the legacy Ethernet architecture. While clearly deserving of a standard, I don't believe it belongs within IEEE Std 802.3 Standard for Ethernet.

SuggestedRemedy

Move all clauses associated with P2MP into a separate standard with a consistent architectural description and approach which applies to the entire standard.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **141** *SC* **141.3.2** *P* **70** *L* **52** # R1-9

Thompson, Geoffrey Independent Consultant

Comment Type **ER** *Comment Status* **X**

The statement "these are not readily testable in a system implementation" addresses an aspect of implementation that is outside the scope of the standard. As stated, it would lead one to believe that making it testable would make an implementation not compliant. Such is definitely not the case. (The DoC for D3.0 doesn't seem to be posted as of 2020-02-15 so I can't check how my D3.0 comment was addressed.)

SuggestedRemedy

Change "are not" to "may not be" -OR- eliminate the parenthetical statement entirely.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **141** *SC* **141.7.4** *P* **83** *L* **34** # R1-1

Rolfe, Benjamin Blind Creek Associates

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **X**

A measurement may be made with the port transmitting any valid Nx25G-EPON signal.' probably is not what you meant. As 'may' is equivalent to 'may or may not', this would allow an invalid Nx25G-EPON signal to be used for the measurement. My guess is the intended meaning is that the measurement should be made with a valid Nx25G-EPON signal, any valid signal, but not an invalid signal.

SuggestedRemedy

Change to 'A measurement shall be made using a valid Nx25G-EPONsignal' which allows any valid Nx25G-EPON signal to be used, but an invalid signal would not be conformant. Editorial, 72,141.3.5.2,7,'may not' is always wrong in an IEEE standard. 'may'states an optinoal requirement

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **141** *SC* **141.7.13.2** *P* **85** *L* **35** # R1-2

Rolfe, Benjamin Blind Creek Associates

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **X**

I do not think this is what you really mean: 'The data transmitted may be any valid 256B/257B symbols' allows that invalid symbols may be used. What probably is meant is that a sequence of any valid signals is permisible.

SuggestedRemedy

For the purpose of this measurement any valid 256B/257B symbols are permisible.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **141** *SC* **141.7.14.1** *P* **87** *L* **11** # R1-3

Rolfe, Benjamin Blind Creek Associates

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **X**

Another case where the words don't mean what you think they mean. As stated allows that invalid symbols may be used. What probably is meant is that a sequence of any valid signals is permisible.

SuggestedRemedy

For the purpose of this measurement any valid 256B/257B symbols, (or a specific power synchronization sequence, are permisible.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**

Cl **141** *SC* **141.8.2** *P* **88** *L* **29** # R1-4

Rolfe, Benjamin Blind Creek Associates

Comment Type **T** *Comment Status* **X**

Conformance to additional laser safety standards may be required for operation within specific geographic regions.' is stating a requirement out of scope of this standard. The word may is used to indicate a course of action permissible within the limits of the standard (may equals is permitted to). This is an informative statement referring to requirments defined outside of this standard.

SuggestedRemedy

reword using correct language: Conformance to additional laser safety standards required for operation within specific geographic regions are the responsibility of the implementer of this standard.

Proposed Response *Response Status* **O**